# OAKLAND POLICE DEPARTMENT Office of Inspector General



## Variability in Academy and Field Training Program Outcomes

April 2022

#### **Executive Summary**

The below report provides details on the demographic breakdown of the Oakland Police Department's (Department) academy and Field Training Program for the  $183^{rd} - 188^{th}$  classes. It provides an update to the Hillard Heintze report which reviewed the  $172^{nd} - 182^{nd}$  academy classes.

Compared to the  $172^{nd} - 182^{nd}$  academy classes, the  $183^{rd} - 188^{th}$  classes are more diverse. There has been an increase in the proportion of attendees that are Black and Hispanic and a decrease in the proportion of attendees that identify as white or Asian. For the prior period, 27% of attendees were white compared to 15% in the current period. The proportion of recruits that are females has remained the same.

Looking at the graduation rates for each academy class, the overall graduation rate is 69% for the  $183^{rd} - 186^{th}$  ( $187^{th}$  and  $188^{th}$  have not yet graduated). The lowest rates are for males identifying as white or other (52% and 50% respectively) and Black females (57%). Although the initial study did not report graduation rates, a review of data provided by the Training Division for the  $172^{nd} - 182^{nd}$  classes revealed an overall 60% graduation rate for that period.

The most common reason for not graduating the academy was removal for failing a California POST learning objective outlined in the Training and Testing Specifications<sup>1</sup>. The second most common reason for not graduating was resignation for personal reasons. For the four academy classes that graduated during the current period, four recruits were removed for Manual of Rules<sup>2</sup> violations. The most common reason for a Black recruit to not graduate was failing a POST objective. The most common reason for a white recruit resigning was personal reasons.

In August 2021, the Department published new standards for placing recruits into subsequent academies. These new standards resulted in more recruits becoming eligible for joining a later class. The majority of those who were eligible, elected to join a later class and subsequently graduated the academy. An additional review of unique attendees, that is, counting attendees only once regardless of how many academies they attended, revealed an overall graduation rate of 81%. White males have the lowest graduation rate because they have the highest rate of resignations for personal reasons and are not likely to return to a future academy class.

In addition to the new standards for placement into a subsequent academy, the Training Division attributes the following to their increased graduation rates:

- Recruits are only tested on POST objectives. Previously, recruits were given additional exams which created additional opportunities to fail out of the academy. This was allowed by POST but was not a best practice.
- Standards have been adjusted to reflect POST passing scores. If no score is defined, 70% represents passing.
- Tests are not administered when fatigue may be a factor.
- The Training commander reviews testing forms for all failures to ensure no bias and to ensure the form provides sufficient articulation as to why the recruit did not meet the minimum standard.
- The Chief reviews all resignations, terminations, and removals for failure.
- Mentors are provided to recruits, especially those who are struggling.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> https://post.ca.gov/training-and-testing-specifications-for-peace-officer-basic-courses

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Standards of conduct officers are expected to abide by.

- Recruits are eased into the academy and can acclimate to the environment.
- If there is a gap between the completion of the background investigation and start of the academy, recruits are pre-hired which allows them brief exposure to the academy environment.

Recruits who successfully graduate from the academy are placed into a 16-week field training program. Since the report by Hillard Heintze, three recruit classes have completed the field training program (183<sup>rd</sup>, 184<sup>th</sup>, and 185<sup>th</sup>). Overall, there is an 89% completion rate with two officers pending completion because of injury. Out of the 74 trainee officers who began the field training program, six failed to complete it. Of those six, four officers resigned from the program and two were removed, one for a sustained Manual of Rules violation and another for performance issues. All 12 of the female officers completed the field training program. Asian and Hispanic males have an 85% completion rate while white and other male officers have a 100% completion rate. Black male officers currently have an 82% completion rate; however, that will increase to 94% if the two injured officers successfully complete the program.

The Training Division attributes their high field training program completion rate to some of the following:

- Prior to beginning the FTO Program, the Recruit Training Officers meet with the Field Training Officer coordinators to determine the best Field Training Officer to match the recruit.
- Trainee Officers are paired with an FTO that matches their adult learning style.
- If a trainee officer is struggling in the FTO Program, the coordinators intervene early, develop a performance improvement plan, and if applicable, pull the recruit offline for two weeks and provide in-house remedial training.
- FTO culture has changed from a sink or swim mentality to mentorship and teaching.

#### The OPD Academy

The Department's Academy Program is 24 weeks long and consists of 40+ hours of instruction per week. In order to be eligible for the academy, applicants must pass written, physical, oral, psychological, background, and medical exams. While in the academy, trainees receive instruction on several topics including criminal law, firearms, arrest and control techniques, community relations, vehicle operations, and more. Trainees must also complete a mandatory physical training program during the academy. To be eligible for graduation, trainees must pass the physical training program and all POST mandated written, practical, and scenario exams.

This analysis of race and gender in the OPD Academy includes academy classes that graduated after completion of the 2020 discipline disparity study conducted by consulting firm Hillard Heintze. The 2020 study included the 172<sup>nd</sup> through the 182<sup>nd</sup> academy classes. The current study begins with the 183<sup>rd</sup> academy class (graduated in February 2020) and includes through the 188<sup>th</sup> academy class. Graduation rates for the 187<sup>th</sup> and 188<sup>th</sup> academy classes are not included because these classes are still in progress. The Training Division keeps a running list of all individuals that attend the Department's Academy which includes external recruits from other agencies. This list, with the external recruits removed, was utilized for the current analyses.

Table 1 displays the gender and race breakdown of academy attendees from the 183<sup>rd</sup> to the 188<sup>th</sup> academies. Some individuals are counted more than once if they entered multiple academies<sup>3</sup>. Charts 1 and 2 provide gender and race comparisons to the academies reviewed in the initial study. Broken down by gender, overall, the percentage of attendees which are male has stayed the same during the two periods (82%). When broken down by race, there has been an increase in the proportion of attendees that are Black and Hispanic and a decrease in the proportion of attendees that identify as white or Asian.

	183	3	184	Ļ	185	5	186	5	187	,	188	3	Tot	al
	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n
Female	14%	6	26%	9	19%	7	22%	7	17%	6	13%	5	18%	40
Asian	2%	1	9%	3	3%	1	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	2%	5
Black	0%	0	6%	2	8%	3	6%	2	6%	2	5%	2	5%	11
Hispanic	10%	4	6%	2	8%	3	16%	5	11%	4	5%	2	9%	20
White	2%	1	6%	2	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	3%	1	2%	4
Male	86%	36	74%	25	81%	29	78%	25	83%	30	88%	35	82%	180
Asian	19%	8	6%	2	19%	7	16%	5	11%	4	8%	3	13%	29
Black	24%	10	21%	7	25%	9	16%	5	22%	8	20%	8	21%	47
Hispanic	24%	10	24%	8	19%	7	38%	12	33%	12	40%	16	30%	65
Other	0%	0	9%	3	3%	1	0%	0	6%	2	8%	З	4%	9
White	19%	8	15%	5	14%	5	9%	3	11%	4	13%	5	14%	30
Total	100%	42	100%	34	100%	36	100%	32	100%	36	100%	40	100%	220

Table 1: Gender and Race Breakdown of Academy Attendees

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Individuals who are unable to complete the academy are often rescheduled to attend a subsequent academy. This can be due to injury, personal reasons, or when trainees need additional time to remediate a learning domain.









Table 2 displays the graduation rate of attendees broken down by race and gender. This table includes individuals who entered multiple academies. Based on this table, males that identify as "other" and white males have the lowest completion rates for the period. Asian female recruits have the highest success rate in the academy with 80% (4 of 5) succeeding followed by Hispanic and Black males (78% and 74% respectively).

	Y	es	N	Total	
	%	n	%	n	n
Female	66%	19	34%	10	29
Asian	80%	4	20%	1	5
Black	57%	4	43%	3	7
Hispanic	64%	9	36%	5	14
White	67%	2	33%	1	3
Male	70%	81	30%	34	115
Asian	73%	16	27%	6	22
Black	74%	23	26%	8	31
Hispanic	78%	29	22%	8	37
Other	50%	2	50%	2	4
White	52%	11	48%	10	21
Grand Total	69%	100	31%	44	144

Table 2: Graduation Rate of Academy Attendees for the 183<sup>rd</sup> – 186<sup>th</sup> Classes

Although the prior study did not determine graduation rates for the academy classes they studied, a review based on the data provided by the Training Division indicates an overall 60% graduation rate for the  $172^{nd} - 182^{nd}$  Academy classes. The graduation rate for female recruits was 46%. Hispanic males had a graduation rate of 65% and Black males a graduation rate of 49%.

The initial study included a review of 11 academies, however, it only focused on the 17 individuals who were removed or resigned with a termination pending. It did not review those who left the academy for other reasons. The current analyses include four academies and reviewed all reasons why a recruit may not graduate from the academy. For the 183<sup>rd</sup> to 186<sup>th</sup> academy classes, four of the 44 individuals were removed for Manual of Rules<sup>4</sup> (MOR) Violations. Table 3 provides the reasons why individuals failed to graduate from the academy. Unique to academies during this period was that five individuals were removed from the academy because they were absent for more than 5% due to COVID. All were offered the option to attend a later academy and four of five accepted. The most common reason for not graduating was removal for failing to meet the California POST learning objectives outlined in the Training and Testing Training Specifications<sup>5</sup>. The second most common reason was resignation for personal reasons. For Black recruits, the most common reason for not graduating was failing a POST learning objective. For white recruits, the most common reason was resignation for personal reasons.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Standards of conduct officers are expected to abide by.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> https://post.ca.gov/training-and-testing-specifications-for-peace-officer-basic-courses

	Removed: MOR Violation		Removed: Failed Post Objective		COVID/Injury		Resigned: Personal Reasons		Total
	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	n
Female	0%	0	60%	6	30%	3	10%	1	10
Asian	0%	0	100%	1	0%	0	0%	0	1
Black	0%	0	100%	3	0%	0	0%	0	3
Hispanic	0%	0	40%	2	40%	2	20%	1	5
White	0%	0	0%	0	100%	1	0%	0	1
Male	12%	4	41%	14	12%	4	35%	12	34
Asian	0%	0	50%	3	17%	1	33%	2	6
Black	25%	2	63%	5	13%	1	0%	0	8
Hispanic	13%	1	25%	2	25%	2	38%	3	8
Other	0%	0	50%	1	0%	0	50%	1	2
White	10%	1	30%	3	0%	0	60%	6	10
Grand Total	9%	4	45%	20	16%	7	30%	13	44

Table 3: Reasons for Not Graduating the Academy: 183<sup>rd</sup> – 186<sup>th</sup> Classes

In the August 2021 updated Academy Policy Manual<sup>6</sup>, the Department published new standards for placing recruits into subsequent academies (pg. 59-60). Recruits who do not graduate from an academy class may join a subsequent academy class if the recruits have an overall academic performance of 70% or better. The prior manual required an overall academic performance of 85% or better to be considered for a subsequent academy. Table 4 provides a breakdown of whether an individual was placed into a later academy. The majority of those eligible were placed into later academies. There were only three individuals ineligible beyond the four that were removed for policy violations. The majority of those who did not participate in another academy had resigned for personal reasons. Of the 20 individuals who were placed into a new academy during the period of the 183<sup>rd</sup>-186<sup>th</sup> classes, all but one graduated. One was removed for a MOR violation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> https://public.powerdms.com/oakland/tree/documents/1888097

			Offered bu	t Declined			
	Ye	es	Resigned f	or or Personal sons	Not E	Total	
	% n		%	n	%	n	n
Female	90%	9	10%	1	0%	0	10
Asian	100%	1	0%	0	0%	0	1
Black	100%	3	0%	0	0%	0	3
Hispanic	80%	4	20%	1	0%	0	5
White	100%	1	0%	0	0%	0	1
Male	38%	13	41%	14	21%	7	34
Asian	33%	2	50%	3	17%	1	6
Black	75%	6	0%	0	25%	2	8
Hispanic	38%	3	50%	4	13%	1	8
Other	50%	1	50%	1	0%	0	2
White	10%	1	60%	6	30%	3	10
Grand Total	50%	22	34%	15	16%	7	44

#### Table 4: Placed into a Subsequent Academy: 183<sup>rd</sup>-186<sup>th</sup> Classes

Finally, Table 5 provides the graduation rate based on unique attendees; each recruit is counted once regardless of how many academies they attended. If a recruit was in more than one academy, only the last academy they attended was counted. For the  $183^{rd}$ - $186^{th}$  academy classes, the overall graduation rate was 81%. Some recruits who did not initially graduate joined subsequent academies and are currently in the  $187^{th}$  or  $188^{th}$  academy classes. This will likely increase the overall graduation rate in the future. Despite low overall numbers, female recruits graduate 90% of the time. The lowest rate is for white women (67%) although there were only three recruits during the period. For men, white recruits have the lowest overall graduation rate (55%), likely because they also have the highest rate of resignations and those who resign are very unlikely to be placed into later academy classes.

	Y	es	N	Total	
	%	n	%	n	n
Female	90%	19	10%	2	21
Asian	100%	4	0%	0	4
Black	100%	4	0%	0	4
Hispanic	90%	9	10%	1	10
White	67%	2	33%	1	3
Male	79%	81	21%	21	102
Asian	80%	16	20%	4	20
Black	92%	23	8%	2	25
Hispanic	85%	29	15%	5	34
Other	67%	2	33%	1	3
White	55%	11	45%	9	20
Grand Total	81%	100	19%	23	123

Table 5: Unique Attendee Graduation Rate: 183<sup>rd</sup> – 186<sup>th</sup> Classes

The increased graduation rate is likely due to several changes that have been implemented in the academy:

- Recruits are only tested on POST objectives. Previously, recruits were given additional exams which created additional opportunities to fail out of the academy. This was allowed by POST but was not a best practice.
- Standards have been adjusted to reflect POST passing scores. If no score is defined, 70% represents passing.
- Tests are not administered when fatigue may be a factor.
- The Training commander reviews testing forms for all failures to ensure no bias and to ensure the form provides sufficient articulation as to why the recruit did not meet the minimum standard.
- The Chief reviews all resignations, terminations, and removals for failure.
- Mentors are provided to recruits, especially those who are struggling.
- Recruits are eased into the academy and can acclimate to the environment.
- If there is a gap between the completion of the background investigation and start of the academy, recruits are pre-hired which allows them brief exposure to the academy environment.

Overall, the recent academy data shows that unless resigning for personal reasons or removed for MOR violations, most recruits graduate from the academy. Recent changes to the standards allowing recruits who did not complete a previously enrolled academy the chance to attend subsequent academies have provided additional opportunities for recruits, and the Department's current graduation rate has benefited from those changes. Of some concern, however, is the high resignation rate for white recruits. Although no recruit should be pushed to continue a career they have decided is not for them, the racial disparity in resignations deserves additional attention. On a positive note, the overall graduation rate for females and for Asian, Black, and Hispanic males is 80% or higher. The OPD has made a concerted effort to have a diverse police force and these results show that the Department is recruiting diverse academy attendees and is successfully graduating these recruits into the Field Training Program.

### **Field Training Program**

Recruits who successfully graduate the from academy are placed into a 16-week Field Training Program<sup>7</sup> as a trainee officer. There are four phases that last four weeks each. During the first and last phase, trainee officers typically work with the same Field Training Officer (FTO). Trainee officers that are having trouble successfully completing the Field Training Program will be given a remedial training plan. These plans are initiated when FTOs identify consistent or repeated deficiencies in certain standardized evaluation guidelines. There are currently 35 evaluated guidelines in the Field Training Program. Trainee officers can also be kept in the Field Training Program for an extended period if they are making progress in their identified deficiencies. Extensions can last for up to three additional phases and trainee officers may be removed from the program if they have demonstrated an inability to overcome their identified deficiencies.

The current analysis includes the 183<sup>rd</sup>, 184<sup>th</sup>, and 185<sup>th</sup> recruit classes. The 186<sup>th</sup> is still in the Field Training Program. Table 6 provides a breakdown of the completion rate for the Field Training Program.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The General Order for the Field Training Program is B-08.

	Ye	es	N	0	Pen	Total	
	%	n	%	n	%	n	n
Female	100%	12	0%	0	0%	0	12
Asian	100%	3	0%	0	0%	0	3
Black	100%	2	0%	0	0%	0	2
Hispanic	100%	5	0%	0	0%	0	5
White	100%	2	0%	0	0%	0	2
Male	87%	54	10%	6	3%	2	62
Asian	85%	11	15%	2	0%	0	13
Black	82%	14	6%	1	12%	2	17
Hispanic	85%	17	15%	3	0%	0	20
Other	100%	2	0%	0	0%	0	2
White	100%	10	0%	0	0%	0	10
Grand Total	89%	66	8%	6	3%	2	74

Table 6: Field Training Program Completion Rate: 183<sup>rd</sup> – 185<sup>th</sup> Classes

For the three academy classes combined, the overall completion rate for the FTO Program is 89%. The status is pending for two trainee officers because they are injured and have not yet completed the program. Out of the 74 trainee officers who began the field training program, six failed to complete it. Four of the trainee officers resigned from the program with reasons such as law enforcement is not a good fit, Oakland is not a good fit, and family. Two trainee officers were removed from the program. One for a sustained MOR violation and another for performance issues. Both of those removed were Hispanic males.

The initial study identified a 95% completion rate for women while the current analyses identified a 100% completion rate although the total number women in the FTO Program is low. Regardless, women have continued to do well in the program. Black male trainee officers currently have the lowest completion rate although that will likely increase once the injured trainee officers complete their program. Still, the overall 89% completion rate is an increase from the initial study which found an 83% completion rate.

While it currently cannot be said what directly caused the increase in the completion rate, the Lieutenant of the Training Division identified the following changes that have been made to the FTO Program:

- Prior to beginning the FTO Program, the Recruit Training Officers meet with the Field Training Officer coordinators to determine the best Field Training Officer to match the recruit.
- Trainee Officers are paired with an FTO that matches their adult learning style.
- If a trainee officer is struggling in the FTO Program, the coordinators intervene early, develop a performance improvement plan, and if applicable, pull the recruit offline for two weeks and provide in-house remedial training.
- FTO culture has changed from a sink or swim mentality to mentorship and teaching.

Though the current analysis only represents three academy classes, it indicates that the Department is heading in the right direction in terms of completion rates. Coupled with the diverse recruits in the academy, the Department has positioned itself well to become representative of the community it serves.