



**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(SPECIAL MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes

Monday, November 15, 2021
Via Teleconference

Redistricting Commissioners: Benjie Achtenberg, Amber Blackwell, Daniel Chesmore (Alternate), Gloria Crowell, Lilibeth Gangas, Shirley Gee, Stephanie Goode, Masoud Hamidi, Paul Marshall, Tracy Richmond McKnight, Diana Miller, Tejal Shah, Bharat Singh (Alternate) Jan Stevens, and Mary Velasco.

Commission website: www.oaklandca.gov/redistricting

1. Roll Call and Determination of Quorum

Quorum was determined and the meeting started at 5:05 pm.

Commissioners present: Benjie Achtenberg, Amber Blackwell, Lilibeth Gangas, Shirley Gee, Stephanie Goode, Masoud Hamidi, Paul Marshall, Tracy Richmond McKnight (arrived at 5:09 pm), Diana Miller, Tejal Shah, Jan Stevens, and Mary Velasco.

Commissioners excused: Gloria Crowell.

Alternate Commissioners present: Daniel Chesmore, Bharat Singh.

City staff present: Richard J. Luna, Corey Alvin.

City Attorney staff present: Mitesh Bhakta.

2. Open Forum

Public comments were provided by the following speakers:

Susan Shawl
Liz Suk

3. Disclosure Requirements by Commissioners

Commissioner Shirley Gee stated she sent the new draft district map proposals via email to the City Council Members, School Board Directors and various organizations.

There were no public comments on this item.

4. Approval of Meeting Minutes

The Commission reviewed the draft meeting minutes. A motion was made by Shirley Gee, seconded by Amber Blackwell, to approve the minutes for the meeting of November

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(SPECIAL MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Monday, November 15, 2021
Via Teleconference

1, 2021. The motion passed with 12 ayes (Achtenberg, Blackwell, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Hamidi, Marshall, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Stevens, Velasco) and one excused (Crowell).

There were no public comments on this item.

No action was taken on the draft meeting minutes for October 27, 2021, as those minutes were approved at the meeting on November 10, 2021.

5. Resolution to Continue Teleconference Meetings

This item was not discussed, as the resolution was previously adopted at the meeting on November 10, 2021.

There were not public comments on this item.

6. Outreach Efforts Updates

Charisma Acey and Elena Serrano provided outreach updates to the Commission, including organizations that were contacted, previous and upcoming in-person events where the public can learn about redistricting. Commissioners discussed various outreach strategies.

Public comments were provided by the following speakers:

Karely Ordaz
Sue Feinstein
Liz Suk
Susan Shawl
Joan Iinha
To Niya M. Scott-Smith
Tracy W
Victor Flores
Doug Blacksher
Steven Koerner
Dana Mims

7. Baseline Criteria

Commissioner Stephanie Goode recommended tabling the item but asked the Commissioners to consider other data sources in their decision-making process. Commissioner Masoud Hamidi recommended some publicly available online data

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(SPECIAL MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Monday, November 15, 2021
Via Teleconference

sources. Commissioners also requested that the next agenda include an update from the Ad Hoc Committees.

Public comments were provided by the following speakers:

Oscar Yassin
Liz Suk
Karely Ordaz
To Niya M. Scott-Smith
Stanley

No action was taken on this item.

8. Public Testimony Regarding Redistricting & Draft Map Discussion

Commissioners took public testimony prior to discussing the draft district map proposals.

The following public speakers provided public testimony:

Liz Suk
Elijah Chhum
Sakim Huitt
Tiffany Chu
Jazlynn S
Matthew Wong
Dong Suh
Barilio Mendoza Juachon
Rhummanee Hong
Karely Ordaz
Sophal Yin
Dana Mims
Otto
Oscar Yassin
To Niya M. Scott-Smith
Tracy W
Joelle Crepsac
Joan Iinha
Doug Blacksher

Written comments were submitted by the following individuals or groups:

To Niya M. Scott-Smith
Tayo Lanlehin
Elaine Ginnold
EC Brandon

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(SPECIAL MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Monday, November 15, 2021
Via Teleconference

F. Matt Hummel
Tayo Lanlehin
Mary Vail
Mailisha Chesney, Kate Chaitin, Lisa Zemelman, Abe Ruelas, and Margurite Fuller
Tracy Wilson
Theresa Nelson
Jasper Wilson
Merideth Marschak
Alice Wilson
Miya Saika Chen
Stuart Flashman
Jonathan Gabel
B.Y. Kwong
To Niya M. Scott-Smith

Following testimony, Commissioners discussed and asked questions about the draft district map proposals, about when the publicly submitted maps can be considered and discussed, and if outreach efforts could be organized by district. Commissioners then discussed what happens when a current elected official no longer resides in the district they represent when the new map is issued.

A motion was made by Benjie Achtenberg, seconded by Tejal Shah, to direct the City Attorney to provide a legal analysis on what happens if the Commission re-draws the district boundaries and a City Council Member or School Board Director no longer resides in their district, what happens if the new map has more than one elected official in a new district, and what happens if a current district is left with no representative. Friendly amendments made by Lilibeth Gangas were accepted for the analysis to include scenarios for both the City Council and School Board and to answer what happens immediately in those scenarios and if the elected official can complete their term.

Deputy City Attorney Mitesh Bhakta and Chis Chaffee of Redistricting Partners provided responses to the questions, stating the incumbent completes the term for which they were elected to serve and that the new district map would not remove someone from office if they reside in a new district. After discussion, Commissioner Benjie Achtenberg withdrew his motion.

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(SPECIAL MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Monday, November 15, 2021
Via Teleconference

Commissioners then returned to discussion on the draft district maps, including stating preferences for which maps should be prioritized, no longer considered, and that more time is needed to decide which maps should be prioritized or eliminated.

A motion was made by Benjie Achtenberg, seconded by Stephanie Goode, to extend the meeting until 9:00 pm. The motion passed with 12 ayes (Achtenberg, Blackwell, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Hamidi, Marshall, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Stevens, Velasco) and one excused (Crowell).

Commissioner Benjie Achtenberg requested the Commission hold a discussion on including a hills-only district in the final map options.

Alternate Commissioner Bharat Singh exited the meeting at 8:10 pm.

Commissioners discussed the need to include economic hubs in the draft district map proposals. Chair Lilibeth Gangas announced Commissioner Paul Marshall and Alternate Commissioner Daniel Chesmore were tasked to work on mapping economic hubs.

Commissioners then discussed the publicly submitted maps. Commissioner Stephanie Goode recommended reviewing map #73408. Commissioner Tracy Richmond McKnight stated the Commission received written comments recommending Commissioners consider several publicly submitted maps.

A motion was made by Tracy Richmond McKnight, seconded by Mary Velasco, to consider publicly submitted maps #72058, #74523, #73408, and #76738. However, after discussion, Commissioner McKnight withdrew her motion.

Commissioner Amber Blackwell exited the meeting at 8:49 pm.

A second motion was made by Diana Miller, seconded by Tracy Richmond McKnight, to extend the meeting until 10:00 pm. The motion passed with nine ayes (Achtenberg, Gangas, Goode, Hamidi, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Stevens, Velasco), one no (Gee), one abstention (Marshall), one absent (Blackwell) and one excused (Crowell).

A third motion was made by Diana Miller, seconded by Tracy Richmond McKnight, to create two new maps – Draft Map I and Draft Map J – that uses Draft Map E as a baseline, keeps the Black Cultural Zone intact, unifies Dimond, Laurel, Allendale, and Bartlett into one district which could be either a hills district or flats district. The motion

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(SPECIAL MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Monday, November 15, 2021

Via Teleconference

passed with 10 ayes (Achtenberg, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Hamidi, Marshall, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Stevens, Velasco) and one absent (Blackwell) and one excused (Crowell).

9. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 9:25 pm.