



**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(SPECIAL MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes

Monday, November 1, 2021
Via Teleconference

Redistricting Commissioners: Benjie Achtenberg, Amber Blackwell, Daniel Chesmore (Alternate), Gloria Crowell, Lilibeth Gangas, Shirley Gee, Stephanie Goode, Masoud Hamidi, Paul Marshall, Tracy Richmond McKnight, Diana Miller, Tejal Shah, Bharat Singh (Alternate) Jan Stevens, and Mary Velasco.

Commission website: www.oaklandca.gov/redistricting

1. Roll Call and Determination of Quorum

Quorum was determined and the meeting started at 5:02 pm.

Commissioners present: Benjie Achtenberg, Amber Blackwell, Gloria Crowell, Lilibeth Gangas, Shirley Gee, Stephanie Goode, Masoud Hamidi, Paul Marshall, Tracy Richmond McKnight, Diana Miller, Tejal Shah, Jan Stevens, and Mary Velasco.

Commissioners absent: none

Alternate Commissioners absent: Daniel Chesmore, Bharat Singh.

City staff present: Richard J. Luna, Corey Alvin.

City Attorney staff present: Mitesh Bhakta.

2. Open Forum

There were no public comments on this item.

3. Disclosure Requirements by Commissioners

Commissioner Tracy Richmond McKnight disclosed having a phone conversation with Council Member Carroll Fife to discuss redistricting outreach efforts. Additionally, Commissioner McKnight attended a Facebook Live event with Council Member Fife and demonstrated the website to the public including the current draft maps.

Chair Lilibeth Gangas stated she and Commissioner Stephanie Goode attended the Día de los Muertos event. It was also stated that Commissioner Diana Miller was in attendance.

There were no public comments on this item.

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(SPECIAL MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Monday, November 1, 2021
Via Teleconference

4. Approval of Meeting Minutes

The Commission reviewed the draft meeting minutes. A motion was made by Gloria Crowell, seconded by Paul Marshall to approve the minutes for the meeting of October 13, 2021. The motion passed with 13 ayes (Achtenberg, Blackwell, Crowell, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Hamidi, Marshall, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Stevens, Velasco).

There were no public comments on this item.

5. Commission Deadline & Meeting Schedule

City staff member Richard J. Luna reviewed the current meeting schedule for the Commission and the legislative requirement that the final map be posted for 14 days prior to final adoption by the Commission. Additionally, the Commission was briefed that the City Charter deadline to adopt the final map was December 31, 2021.

Commissioners engaged in a discussion of their deadline, the expedited time frame it had to adopt the final map given the delay in the U.S. Census data, and options for setting the final meeting date to comply with the City Charter deadline. Commissioners also requested changes to the existing maps, specifically in changing how the districts are labeled; however, City staff stated those requests should be taken under agenda item 7.

Commissioner Jan Stevens was excused from the meeting at 6:03 pm.

A motion was made by Stephanie Goode, seconded by Shirley Gee, to schedule additional meetings on December 13, 2021 and December 30, 2021. The motion passed with 13 ayes (Achtenberg, Crowell, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Hamidi, Marshall, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Velasco) one out of their seat (Blackwell) and one excused (Stevens).

Public comments were provided by the following speakers:

Joelle Crepsac
Elizabeth Stage
Rickisha Herron
Iris Merriouns
Dana Mills
Sylvia

Written comments were provided by the following individuals:

Casey Farmer

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(SPECIAL MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Monday, November 1, 2021
Via Teleconference

6. Outreach Efforts Updates

Elena Serrano provided outreach updates to the Commission, including organizations that were contacted, previous and upcoming in-person events where the public can learn about redistricting.

Commissioner Gloria Crowell exited the meeting at 7:00 pm.

Public comments were provided by the following speakers:

Joelle Crepsac
Briana Horton
Brooke Levin

7. Public Testimony Regarding Redistricting & Draft Map Discussion

Commissioners took public testimony prior to discussing the draft district map proposals.

The following public speakers provided public testimony:

Otto Peppindure
Elizabeth Stage
Leonora Sea
Dana Mims
Iris Merriouns
Joelle Crepsac

Written comments were submitted by the following individuals or groups:

Nancy Safford
Elise Bernstein
Penny Righthand
Shayne Del Cohen

Commissioners then engaged in a discussion of the draft maps.

A motion was made by Shirley Gee, seconded by Lilibeth Gangas, to bring back draft district map A for consideration. The motion passed with 11 ayes (Achtenberg, Blackwell, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Hamidi, Marshall, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Velasco) one absent (Crowell) and one excused (Stevens).

Commissioners then discussed having an all-hills district and the need to have more evenly balanced districts based on total population.

Commissioner Amber Blackwell exited the meeting at 7:39 pm.

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(SPECIAL MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Monday, November 1, 2021
Via Teleconference

Commissioner Masoud Hamidi exited the meeting at 8:00 pm.

A second motion was made by Benjie Achtenberg, seconded by Tejal Shah, to create a new map that begins with the current district lines adjusting for new population shifts and factors economic and business district distribution. A friendly amendment made by Tejal Shah was accepted to keep the Rockridge, Glenview and current District 2 neighborhoods intact and to not have a hill-only district. A friendly amendment made by Stephanie Goode was accepted to include and distribute environmental areas and parks in the new map. A friendly amendment made by Shirley Gee was accepted to create the new map without diluting the relative voting strength of communities of interest.

A third motion was made by Lilibeth Gangas, seconded by Benjie Achtenberg, to extend the meeting to 9:00 pm. The motion passed with nine ayes (Achtenberg, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Marshall, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Velasco) three absent (Blackwell, Crowell, Hamidi) and one excused (Stevens).

The Commission then continued discussion on the second motion and corresponding friendly amendments.

A friendly amendment made by Diana Miller was accepted to keep Dimond, Lake Merritt, Piedmont Pines, West Oakland, and all neighborhoods intact as possible. A friendly amendment made by Tracy Richmond McKnight was accepted to place keeping neighborhoods intact in the final motion as a higher priority and grouped together. A friendly amendment made by Tejal Shah was accepted to list the top priority in the motion to not have a hills-only district. A friendly amendment made by Shirley Gee was accepted to keep an influence level of 30%. A friendly amendment made by Mary Velasco was accepted to group the neighborhoods in a single request. A friendly amendment made by Tracy Richmond McKnight was accepted to add the area around Lake Merritt shore.

The final second motion was stated as follows: Request a new map (E) that includes:

- 1) Do not have a “hills-only” district.
- 2) Keep other neighborhoods intact as requested, including:
 - a. Glenview (see submitted map)
 - b. District 2 (see current district lines)
 - c. Rockridge (see submitted map)
 - d. West Oakland
 - e. Dimond
 - f. Lake Merritt (around the Lake Merritt shore)
 - g. Piedmont Pines (see submitted map)

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(SPECIAL MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Monday, November 1, 2021
Via Teleconference

- 3) Make the density of each district closer to average (closer than allowed deviation), adjusted for economic, racial diversity, includes business districts, environmental areas/parks without diluting the relative voting strength of communities of interest.
 - a. Keep an influence level of 30%.

The second motion passed with nine ayes (Achtenberg, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Marshall, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Velasco) three absent (Blackwell, Crowell, Hamidi) and one excused (Stevens).

A fourth motion was made by Lilibeth Gangas, seconded by Tejal Shah, requesting a new draft district map F that uses draft district map A as a guideline, does not have a hills-only district, makes the density of each district closer to average (closer than allowed deviation), adjusted for economic, racial diversity, includes business districts, environmental areas/parks without diluting the relative voting strength of communities of interest, with an influence level of 50%, and to do a systemwide change where the draft district maps would use numbers instead of letters. A friendly amendment made by Lilibeth Gangas was accepted to withdraw the systemwide change for district labels and to label the districts in draft district map F using the format: A=A1, B=B2, C=C3, D=D4, E=E5, F=F6, and G=G7.

Commissioner Gloria Crowell returned to the meeting at 8:50 pm.

A fifth motion was made by Shirley Gee, seconded by Stephanie Goode, to extend the meeting to 9:30 pm. The motion passed with 10 ayes (Achtenberg, Crowell, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Marshall, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Velasco) two absent (Blackwell, Hamidi) and one excused (Stevens).

The Commission then continued discussion on the fourth motion and corresponding friendly amendments.

A friendly amendment made by Shirley Gee was accepted to adjust the influence level to 30%.

Commissioner Tracy Richmond McKnight exited the meeting at 9:08 pm.

The final fourth motion was stated as follows: Request a new draft district map F that includes:

- 1) Uses draft district map A as a guideline.
- 2) Does not have a “hills-only” district.
- 3) Make the density of each district closer to average (closer than allowed deviation), adjusted for economic, racial diversity, includes business districts,

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(SPECIAL MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Monday, November 1, 2021
Via Teleconference

environmental areas/parks without diluting the relative voting strength of communities of interest.

- 4) Change the map identification from letters to a letter + number format.
 - a. A=A1, B=B2, C=C3, D=D4, E=E5, F=F6, G=G7

The fourth motion passed with seven ayes (Achtenberg, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Marshall, Miller, Shah) two abstentions (Crowell, Velasco), three absent (Blackwell, Hamidi, McKnight) and one excused (Stevens).

Commissioners then discussed requesting a breakdown of the other category in all draft district maps. After discussion, Commissioner Benjie Achtenberg requested staff add a disclaimer on the website explaining what the other category represents.

A sixth motion was made by Stephanie Goode, seconded by Lilibeth Gangas, to extend the meeting to 10:00 pm. The motion passed with nine ayes (Achtenberg, Crowell, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Marshall, Miller, Shah, Velasco), three absent (Blackwell, Hamidi, McKnight) and one excused (Stevens).

A seventh motion was made by Stephanie Goode, seconded by Shirley Gee, to request a draft district map G and draft district map H that uses draft district maps B and D as the baselines, allows for a hills-only district, makes the density of each district closer to average (closer than allowed deviation), adjusted for economic, racial diversity, includes business districts, environmental areas/parks without diluting the relative voting strength of communities of interest, keeps other neighborhoods intact as requesting, including: Glenview, District 2, Rockridge, West Oakland, Dimond, Lake Merritt (around Lake Merritt shore), and Piedmont Pines, to add notes on the new maps that use others as a baseline where they are coming from, and to not include number labels on the new maps. A friendly amendment made by Shirley Gee was accepted to use the labeling format: A=A1, B=B2, C=C3, D=D4, E=E5, F=F6, and G=G7, on the new draft district maps and to update draft district maps A, B and D to use the same labeling format.

The final seventh motion was stated as follows: Create two new draft district maps G and H utilizing draft district maps B and D as baselines, and include:

- 1) Make the density of each district closer to average (closer than allowed deviation), adjusted for economic, racial diversity, includes business districts, environmental areas/parks without diluting the relative voting strength of communities of interest.
- 2) Keep other neighborhoods intact as requested, including:
 - a. Glenview (see submitted map)
 - b. District 2 (see current district lines)
 - c. Rockridge (see submitted map)

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(SPECIAL MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Monday, November 1, 2021

Via Teleconference

- d. West Oakland
 - e. Dimond
 - f. Lake Merritt (around the Lake Merritt shore)
 - g. Piedmont Pines (see submitted map)
- 3) Note on new maps that use others as a baseline where they are coming from
- 4) Use same key as previous maps
- a. Change the map identification from letters to a letter + number format.
 - i. A=A1, B=B2, C=C3, D=D4, E=E5, F=F6, G=G7
 - ii. Systemwide change to all previously produced maps (A, B, D)

The seventh motion passed with five ayes (Gee, Goode, Marshall, Miller, Shah) one no (Crowell), three abstentions (Achtenberg, Gangas, Velasco), three absent (Blackwell, Hamidi, McKnight) and one excused (Stevens).

8. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 9:56 pm.