



**CITY OF OAKLAND
OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION**

Meeting Minutes

Thursday, March 14, 2019

5:30 PM

City Hall, 1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, Council Chamber
Oakland, CA 94612

I. Call to Order
Regina Jackson

The meeting started at 5:36 p.m.

II. Roll Call and Determination of Quorum
Regina Jackson

Commissioners Present: Mubarak Ahmad, Tara Anderson, José Dorado, Ginale Harris, Regina Jackson, Edwin Prather, and Thomas Smith. Alternate Commissioner Anderson will participate as a voting member to meet quorum.

Counsel for this meeting: Sergio Rudin

THE OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION WILL ADJOURN TO CLOSED SESSION IN CITY HALL BUILDING BRIDGES ROOM, 3RD FLOOR AND WILL REPORT ON ANY FINAL DECISIONS IN THE CITY COUNCIL CHAMBER DURING THE POLICE COMMISSION'S OPEN SESSION MEETING AGENDA.

III. Closed Session
PUBLIC EMPLOYEE DISCIPLINE/DISMISSAL/RELEASE
Gov't Code § 54957(b)

Action – Report out of Closed Session

Regina Jackson stated there were no reportable items coming out of Closed Session.

Comments were provided by the following public speakers:

No public comment.

IV. Welcome, Purpose and Open Forum (2 minutes per speaker)

Regina Jackson will call public speakers. The purpose of the Oakland Police Commission is to oversee the Oakland Police Department's policies, practices, and customs to meet or exceed national standards of constitutional policing and to oversee the Community Police Review Agency that investigates police misconduct and recommends discipline.

Regina Jackson said there are many speakers and agenda items and it would be appreciated if speakers would keep to two minutes. She asked that Commissioners, wherever possible, keep their discussions to two minutes.

Comments were provided by the following public speakers:

Rashidah Grinage
Assata Olugbala
Gene Hazzard

Elise Bernstein
Nino Parker
Mary Vail
Saleem Bey

V. Selection of Alternate Commissioner to Fill Commission Vacancy

The Commission will select Alternate Police Commissioner Tara Anderson to fill the vacancy created by Maureen Benson's resignation.

Comments were provided by Commissioners Prather, Anderson and Harris.

Comments were provided by the following public speakers:

Elise Bernstein
Saleem Bey
Mary Vail

A motion was made by José Dorado, seconded by Thomas Smith, that the Commission select Alternate Commissioner Tara Anderson to fill the vacancy created by the resignation of Commissioner Maureen Benson. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Dorado, Harris, Jackson, Prather, and Smith

Abstain: Ahmad

VI. Reimbursement to former Commissioner Maureen Benson for the Cost of Replacement Laptop

The Commission will vote to use available funds to reimburse former Commissioner Benson for the laptop which was destroyed at an offsite meeting on June 14, 2018.

Discussion followed by Commissioners Harris, Prather (requested Counsel Rudin's opinion), and Anderson.

Sergio Rudin said he would prefer to discuss the issues confidentially versus in open session. Regina Jackson appreciated his request but asked that he share what he can. Sergio Rudin stated that the main concern is whether there is going to be a gift of public funds and whether the City, the Commission as a body of a public agency, can use public funds to reimburse the destruction of private property, primarily that depends on whether there could be a valid legal claim against the City. He could not speak to comments by Regina Jackson relating to the claim made by Maureen Benson which was denied. José Dorado provided clarification.

Regina Jackson checked with Karen Tom and a laptop could be provided/borrowed from CPRA so the Commissioners don't have to use their personal laptops/potential damage.

Regina Jackson asked Sergio Rudin if the matter is legal or not. Sergio Rudin stated that not having been there or not having reviewed the facts of what happened, he can't tell you for certain whether the Commissioner would have a valid legal claim against the City but based on his understanding of what he knows, discussions with Commissioners and the City Attorney's Office, he doesn't see a reason why the Commissioner could not file a Claim and if she can file a legal claim, then the Commission can act to reimburse her.

Comments were provided by the following public speakers:

Saleem Bey
John Bey

A motion was made by José Dorado, seconded by Ginale Harris, that the Police Commission reimburse former Commissioner Maureen Benson for the cost of her laptop that was destroyed at one of our offsite meetings in the amount of \$1,303.33. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Anderson, Dorado, Harris, Jackson, and Prather
Abstain: Ahmad
Oppose: Smith

VII. Commissioner Meeting Attendance

The Commission will discuss, and possibly adopt a policy regarding, the requirements for attendance at meetings.

Discussion followed by Commissioners Harris, Jackson, Prather, and Ahmad.

Comments were provided by the following public speakers:
Mary Vail
Saleem Bey

Regina Jackson said that as she understands it, the current policy is in place, perhaps some folks want to consider changes to it but we can't do it right now. The policy is not in the packet. She thanked everyone for the discussion.

VIII. Election of Oakland Police Commission Vice Chairperson

The Commission will nominate and vote on the appointment of a Vice Chairperson to serve from March 2019 until the first regular meeting of January 2020.

Discussion followed by Commissioners Prather, Harris, Dorado, and Jackson.

Comments were provided by the following public speakers:
Gene Hazzard
Bruce Schmiechen
Saleem Bey
Mary Vail
Nino Parker

Further discussion followed by Commissioners Smith and Ahmad (community outreach announcement).

Sergio Rudin spoke on operational necessity. The adopted rules for the Commission state that the Vice Chair shall be the person who assumes the duties of Chair when that person is not present or unable to act. His recommendation would be that before the close of this item is that if there are two Vice Chairs that are selected, that issue be addressed as well.

A motion was made by José Dorado, seconded by Ginale Harris, whether to elect two Vice Chairs as opposed to one Vice Chair and the recommended Vice Chairs are Commissioner Dorado and Commissioner Harris.

The motion failed by the following vote:

Aye: Dorado and Harris
Abstain: Ahmad
Oppose: Anderson, Jackson, Prather, Smith

A motion was made by Regina Jackson, seconded by Mubarak Ahmad, to elect a singular Vice Chairperson.

Nominations for a singular Vice Chairperson:

Thomas Smith nominated Tara Anderson (Respectfully declined)

Ginale Harris nominated herself

The vote for Vice Chairperson (Harris) was as follows:

Aye: Ahmad, Anderson, Dorado, Harris, Jackson

Abstain: Prather

Oppose: Smith

The motion carried. Ginale Harris was re-elected as the Vice Chairperson.

IX. Meeting Minutes Approval

The Commission will vote to approve meeting minutes from February 28, 2019.

Comments were provided by the following public speakers:

No public comment.

A motion was made by José Dorado, seconded by Mubarak Ahmad, to approve the February 28, 2019 minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Anderson, Dorado, Harris, Jackson, and Smith

Abstain: Ahmad and Prather

X. Oakland Police Department (OPD) Report on Pawlik Investigation

Chief Anne Kirkpatrick will provide the Executive Force Review Board report, the Compliance Director's Report and Addendum related to the Joshua Pawlik shooting investigation.

Chief Kirkpatrick gave an update. She reported that she released the reports to the public before this meeting tonight. The first set of documents were released to the public on March 6 and posted on both the City and the Department websites. Since the release of those reports, there has been some misunderstanding regarding the process. She reviewed the process and will try to conclude with where they are at this stage in the process. Where they are today is that they still have steps left. The CPRA will come to their findings. Once that determination comes to findings then the next process begins. She closed by addressing police accountability and her record of discipline since being your Chief. She has been the Chief for 24 months. During this time, she terminated 30 employees – 12 were termination of police recruits while they were in the Academy; she didn't have the numbers of officers who were terminated (can bring that information at the next meeting); administered 63 suspensions that equates to 535 days which equates to 4,280 hours. That is something for you to know since they have not had an opportunity to speak about that.

Discussion/questions followed by Commissioners Anderson, Dorado, Jackson, Harris, Ahmad, and Prather.

Chief Kirkpatrick chose not to discuss the shooting or comment on the de-escalation training (the matter is still not over/in process). She stands on the report and the Monitor's Report stands right now.

Regina Jackson asked about CPRA report from the Investigator. Karen Tom echoed that it is still an open investigation and she can't speak too much to the underlying issues in the case. She assured the Commissioners that they are working as

expeditiously as possible to complete the investigation. They understand the concerns from the community, importance of this case, but also understand to have a thorough and complete investigation and get it completed as soon as possible. She can't nail down specific dates/times. Regina Jackson asked if there is anything they can do to provide you additional resources to speed this up and if so, what is that? Karen Tom appreciates the Commission's efforts to support the work of CPRA. Now, she doesn't see anything specifically the Commission can help with but that the Investigator needs to continue working on the case and complete the case. Ginale Harris said that anytime you feel like you are not getting something from the Department to let the Commission know so you can move forward in your investigative processes. Regina Jackson said they understand that the staff is down but if there is anything you need, to let them know – the process needs to be completed.

Edwin Prather said they need something more concrete/demand more at this point. Maybe asking in closed session why they don't have a report in two weeks. They need a deadline and reportable at the next meeting, that they work with. Regina Jackson asked by the next meeting can they hone in on how much time it is going to take? Karen Tom will speak to her investigator about a timeline. She will speak with the Chair. Thomas Smith said they need to set a deadline – that it be done by a date.

Sergio Rudin said this agenda item is listed about OPD's Report on the Pawlik investigation and not the CPRA investigation. They can follow this up on a later agenda.

Comments were provided by the following public speakers:

Gene Hazzard
Henry Gage, III
Rashidah Grinage
Mary Vail
Saleem Bey
Oscar Fuentes
Lorelei Bosserman
John Bey
Assata Olugbala
Bruce Schmiechen
Nino Parker

XI. R-02: Searches of Individuals on Probation and Parole

The Commission will review an updated proposal for R-02: Searches of Individuals on Probation or Parole.

Regina Jackson asked Edwin Prather to provide an overview. He said the Ad Hoc Committee met with the OPD Committee on this document and had a good meeting. He referenced Attachment 11a (OPD's redline draft of their earlier policy); Attachment 11b (clean copy of that, which be ignored for the time being). He compared their current draft (Attachment 11a) to the version that was submitted to City Council by this body and argued by Commissioner Smith and others to the City Council for adoption. He raised/reviewed several points relating to the document. He will not make a motion to adopt this version or to sign off on this version this evening. He will be amending this document, circulating it to the Ad Hoc Committee, and proposing it again, hopefully for a vote at the next Commission meeting. He asked to table this item for one more meeting; not wait.

Discussion (Attachment 11a) by Ginale Harris (her edits, etc.), an outreach event announcement by Mubarak Ahmad, and comments by Tara Anderson. Regina Jackson asked Ginale Harris to work with José Dorado and Mubarak Ahmad since they are part

of the Outreach Committee, to facilitate that specialized audience to review the policy and get feedback and bring those groups to a meeting here. Mubarak Ahmad said he will not attend the next meeting; has a scheduled vacation.

Thomas Smith raised a question for Sergio Rudin – they have the Ad Hoc Committee engaged to do the work on it. Is there an issue with engaging a second committee which would be an outreach committee which would overlap with the same exact policy and be doing work on that at the same time? Sergio Rudin said that if there is more than a quorum of Commissioners talking back and forth outside of a noticed published meeting that could essentially be a Brown Act violation. Is one of those a standing committee that is required to have noticed public meetings? Regina Jackson said that is Outreach. Sergio Rudin said that as long as that discussion is happening at a properly noticed public meeting. He will recheck on that. He then reported that there is an exception to the Brown Act for meeting of Standing Committees and more than legislative body members who are not members of the Standing Committee can attend but only attend as observers so there is no issue of the Ad Hoc Committee members want to go to these meetings that are set up by the Standing Committee and to observe and participate and that they take some feedback from that – that is up to them – they can't participate in the discussion there. Another point of clarification, Mubarak Ahmad can provide his feedback only at a noticed meeting in public and can't contact the Ad Hoc Committee members directly to provide that feedback. Members of the Ad Hoc Committee can go to the Standing Committee meetings and witness the proceedings themselves, discussions of what happened at the Standing Committee meeting between more than a quorum of the Commissioners would need to happen at an open noticed meeting.

Comments were provided by the following public speakers:

Assata Olugbala
Lorelei Bosserman
Henry Gage, III
Mary Vail
Saleem Bey

XII. CPRA Prioritization of OPD Policies to Review

Karen Tom will provide a list of OPD policies that CPRA will review, in order of prioritization.

Regina Jackson took a point of privilege and requested that Agenda Item XVI (Budget Ad Hoc Committee Update) be moved prior to Item XIII (Recess) since Maureen Benson is here and helped work on the budget with Ginale Harris. Commissioners agreed to taking this Item out of order.

Karen Tom gave comments relating to Attachment 12 (Report prepared by the CPRA Analyst) relating to input that we have under the OPD policies that are currently under revision. She highlighted two items that are most important from the Director's perspective which are listed on Page 1.

Discussion followed by Commissioners Anderson, Jackson, Prather, and Harris.

Karen Tom added that whatever you would like the Policy Analyst to research to let her know and she will have Juanito Rus look into the policies you want clarification or additional information about. The Policy Analyst will be out of the office for several weeks – leaving next week (paternity leave).

Regina Jackson clarified - Presuming that he will be at work tomorrow, what we they asking Karen Tom to do is direct Juanito Rus to focus on identifying, perhaps

competing policies, as it relates to PDRD and vehicle pursuit of suspects fleeing on foot or bicycle and then to make any additional suggestions for places that one might look that someone else can do to pull some research down so we can start with some information.

Juanito Rus said he understands the ask – his role within the CPRB and now within the CPRA as a Policy Analyst, is policy analysis and support of things that our investigators find during their investigations and is not general background policy analysis.

Edwin Prather - Looking on Page 1 (the two items listed – highest priority policies); focus on those policies.

Regina Jackson said she is working on getting a graduate intern in public policy (not an impact the budget). She asked if there are other Policy Analysts anywhere that could be loaned. Nonprofits work on policies. Think bigger around options - short term.

Ginale Harris said that they can reorganize the CPRA. If they need a Policy Analyst, they can get one. Regina Jackson suggested drafting another job description for a Policy Analyst where research is required.

Comments were provided by the following public speakers:
No public comment.

XIII. Budget Ad Hoc Committee Update (Moved here from Item XVI on the Agenda)
The Budget Ad Hoc Committee will provide an update.

Regina Jackson stated that Ginale Harris will provide an overview. Maureen Benson will provide some context.

Ginale Harris asked Maureen Benson to step up. She clarified it with the City Attorney's Office that this was okay. Maureen Benson gave a brief overview. She reviewed documents in the attachment. Regina Jackson – what are you asking is to understand, know or act upon. Ginale Harris referenced the outline on the first page (On Page 1 – positions were moved around – there are expenditures that they didn't touch and foolish to give up/cut \$163,000 in the budget directive). Maureen Benson said these are the most recent numbers – numbers of what has been encumbered has not been shown yet – counsel fees haven't been listed, etc.

Regina Jackson requested from City Administrator's Office that the Finance Department can give an updated/accurate number and she will follow up when they will receive them. Start process of a CPRA Policy Analyst – affirm with HR so they can recruit for it. Bring up in the Personnel Committee a contractor opportunity for policy. Karen Tom thanked them for the hard work that was put into this budget. She shared that she has concerns about the shuffling of some of the responsibilities to CPRA admin and the director given that Measure LL they have a lot of responsibilities – putting some of these tasks on the Director and admin – be respectful of these tasks. Regina Jackson suggested a meeting to understand what these are and support that. Karen Tom agreed. Regina Jackson said that this will come back to them for about two more times. She asked if there are other questions. Tara Anderson inquired about the deadlines for submitting final budget to make sure they are on track with the City Process. She appreciated the hard work put in to this document which was done by two individuals as part of the Commission (Ad Hoc Committee) and thanked them. Ginale Harris said they are past the deadline. They need to rap this up or they will lose this money. Regina Jackson will send an email to Finance tomorrow and copy Commissioners; she will schedule a meeting with Karen Tom. Engaging with people who can audit the

Intake Technician position so that they can identify if they can bring in another person. Follow up with Karen Tom to see about nailing down her opinions and recommendations. She will ask for an extension of the budget (with City Administrator).

Comments were provided by the following public speakers:

Rashidah Grinage

Saleem Bey

Assata Olugbala

A motion was made by Regina Jackson, seconded by Ginale Harris, to resist, refute, negate, decline the \$163,000 cut for our budget. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Anderson, Dorado, Harris, Jackson, Prather, and Smith

XIV. Recess (8 minutes) (This Item was XIII on the Agenda)

Regina Jackson called the meeting back to order at 10:25 p.m.

Mubarak Ahmad and Thomas Smith had to leave but there was still a quorum.

Counsel Rudin stated you have to adjourn by 10:30 p.m. unless you vote to extend the meeting time.

MOTION to continue this meeting until 11:00 p.m. was made by Edwin Prather and seconded by Regina Jackson. The vote was Aye: 5 (Anderson, Dorado, Harris, Jackson, and Prather). The motion passed.

XV. Quarterly Informational Progress Report (This Item was XIV on the Agenda)

The Commission will review the Quarterly Informational Progress Report scheduled for the March 19, 2019 Public Safety Committee meeting.

Regina Jackson said that they are reviewing a report that was previously developed, edits made, those edits were added into the report.

Discussion followed by Edwin Prather and Ginale Harris. Regina Jackson said that she would like Edwin Prather to present the report at the Public Safety Committee meeting next Tuesday at 6:00 p.m.

Comments were provided by the following public speaker:

Rashidah Grinage

A motion was made by José Dorado, seconded by Ginale Harris, to approve the Quarterly Informational Progress Report which will be delivered by Edwin Prather to the Public Safety Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Anderson, Dorado, Harris, Jackson, and Prather

XVI. Standing and Ad Hoc Committee Assignments (This Item was XV on the Agenda)

The Commission will work on assigning Commissioners to serve on at least one standing committee or ad hoc committee.

Sergio Rudin suggested tabling this Item since there are only five Commissioners present.

Comments were provided by the following public speakers:

No public comment.

A motion was made by Edwin Prather, seconded by José Dorado, to table Item XV to the next meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Anderson, Dorado, Harris, Jackson, and Prather

XVII. Appeals Plan /New Evidence Discovery on Bey Case Ad Hoc Committee Update (Moved here from Item XVIII on the Agenda)

The Appeals Plan/New Evidence Discovery on Bey Case Ad Hoc Committee will provide an update.

Ginale Harris provided an update. She asked Saleem Bey to come forward and speak. He provided the Commission with the bare minimum that racial profiling was discovered in the case, etc. He also read from the NSA and this is online (a Judge's Order). He provided information relating to the case.

Regina Jackson asked Sergio Rudin for advice relating to official legal noticing documents. With respect to passing off the information, she can get the address to mail Mr. Bey's packet but she would need to connect with him on Monday to get his packet. Mr. Bey said he would give the packet directly to the Defendant, which is the City Attorney's Office, to deliver to because as soon as the Court is noticed, the City Attorney's Office has to be involved. Send it off and not give it to the City Attorney's Office only, but also to the Council, and notice the Court all separately. Sergio Rudin said he would need to look into exactly what might be required; not quite sure whether this needs to have additional notice to City Council or whether there some other steps that might need to be taken. Certainly, the Commission can indicate its intent that it wants to go down this path.

Regina Jackson asked Sergio Rudin to look into that and she will follow up with him Monday to figure out the course of action, how to do it, framing of the notice letter, how to get the documents from Mr. Bey to the City Attorney's office and whoever else, etc. She should probably not receive the documents based upon the potential of any escalation. Sergio Rudin said he certainly does not see a problem with Mr. Bey handing those documents to the City Attorney's Office. He will find out if there is any conflict issue. Regina Jackson said that we make sure that there is more than one packet (because of the issue with City Attorney's Office previously).

Ginale Harris suggested Mr. Bey giving them the packet in a sealed envelope and signed over the seal. Sergio Rudin suggested that another option is for Mr. Bey to deliver that to our office – he can look into whether there is any issue with the Police Commission receiving those documents before he hands them over to them otherwise he will return them to Mr. Bey.

Regina Jackson recommended to Mr. Bey that he deliver two sealed packets and that way one can go (we can walk it over or mail it for you) and the other might need to be delivered to the City Attorney's Office can be sent by Sergio Rudin.

Edwin Prather gave comments. He asked if they are skipping the appellate process, etc. If they don't have this, how are they dealing with procedure? Regina Jackson said she did not see an appeal plan in the attachment.

Ginale Harris said this case is unique. They were trying to come up with a plan but the plans did not work. They can't have the investigator do the investigation with the CPRA, they can't have the police department investigate the investigation that they just investigated. They had a dilemma so our conclusion was to come up with the Inspector

General and can't get the position filled (to be the outside evaluator – our appeals person for this case). That was their due process. Regina Jackson said they still must have an appeals plan. Edwin Prather suggested hiring folks on the interim - to do the appeals plan since they don't have an IG and this would be an IG task. They must have a process. If they can direct hire an investigator into that slot – it is a slippery slope too. Once they create an appeal's process, might everyone appeal their CPRA determination. Regina Jackson stated that this is something to go on the next Agenda.

Comments were provided by the following public speakers:
Rashidah Grinage
Assata Olugbala

Further discussion followed by Commissioners, Mr. Bey and Counsel Rudin.

A motion was made by Edwin Prather, there was not a second, to convene a Discipline Committee to review this case in more detail and make a recommendation. The motion failed.

A motion was made by Ginale Harris, seconded by José Dorado, to request officially noticing the NSA Court. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Dorado, Harris, and Jackson
Abstain: Anderson
Oppose: Prather

A motion was made by Edwin Prather, seconded by José Dorado, to table Item XV on the Agenda to the next meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Anderson, Dorado, Harris, Jackson, and Prather

Chair Jackson stated that it is 11:15 p.m. and the meeting can only go to 11:30 p.m.

XVIII. Chief's Goals Ad Hoc Committee Update (This was Item XVII on the Agenda)
The Chief's Goals Ad Hoc Committee will provide an update.

A motion was made by José Dorado, seconded by Tara Anderson, to table Item XVII to the next meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Anderson, Dorado, Harris, Jackson, and Prather

XIX. Creation of Racial Equity Statement Ad Hoc Committee
Tara Anderson will discuss the creation of a Racial Equity Statement Ad Hoc Committee.

A motion was made by José Dorado, seconded by Tara Anderson, to table this Item to the next meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Anderson, Dorado, Harris, Jackson, and Prather

XX. Agenda Setting and Prioritization of Upcoming Agenda Items
The Commission will engage in a working session to discuss and determine agenda items for the upcoming Commission meeting and to agree on a list of agenda items to be discussed on future agendas.

Comments were provided by the following public speakers:

No public comment.

Tara Anderson asked to Support of AB392 that California Act to Save Lives by Shirley Weber on the next Agenda. She will prepare the letter of support for the Item. Ginale Harris spoke about the process regarding submitting Agenda Items. They need to share that with the new Commissioner. Tara Anderson said that she is not on the form that would be completed so it will need to be modified to include her as a Commissioner and she would like to recommend that there be some nimbleness to set agendas so that we are not having to wait several meetings to hear an Item. Regina Jackson will reach out to Chrissie to see that she is added.

Edwin Prather said urgent items can be added to the Agenda and the Chair has the discretion to add items with agreement by three members. Even though they haven't filled out the form, if this is of a time sensitive nature, they can add it to the next meeting. Is it time sensitive to forego the process? Tara Anderson said it is not currently slated for assembly, public safety for the upcoming March hearings but expected to be heard early April.

Tara Anderson stated that the Pending Agenda Matters List is Item 20 in the Agenda Packet.

Regina Jackson:

- Agenda Items from meeting on March 14 that were Tabled – XV, XVII, and XIX

Edwin Prather:

- Parole and Probation Search Policy.
- Need 3304 deadline reports come back (Should be on every Agenda).
- Annual Report due April 17 on the Agenda (give them two meetings before report is due).
- Regular updates on the Pawlik investigation from CPRA (whether in Closed Session or Open Session). Karen Ms. Tom and the Investigator appear; if it is not ready, explain why it is not ready.
- Subject matters need to go first on the Agenda.

Regina Jackson:

- Proposed budget, specifically around job related stress.

XXI. Adjournment

A motion was made by José Dorado, seconded by Edwin Prather, to adjourn. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Anderson, Dorado, Harris, Jackson, and Prather

The Commission adjourned the meeting at 11:26 p.m.