



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

Regina Jackson: Okay. Terrific. Thank you very much. Welcome to the City of Oakland's Oakland Police Commission Meeting of December 17th. We are calling the meeting to order at 6:33PM. I would like to move to call the role.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Excuse me, Madam Chair. Just point of order, who is on the screen? Is everybody on the screen supposed to be in on the screen?

Regina Jackson: Yes, everybody's in that's supposed to be in. Thank you.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Okay, then.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. So I'm ready to move to roll call. Commissioner Harbin-Forte.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Here.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Dorado.

Jose Dorado: Presente.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Garcia.

Sergio Garcia: Here.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Gage.

Henry Gage, III: Present.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Smith.

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Here.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. And I am here for myself. We have a quorum. I see a hand up from Commissioner Gage.

Henry Gage, III: Thank you, Chair. To the Chair, to staff, it looks like the slideshow has not started yet. If you could please start that.

Regina Jackson: The slide show? We have to go to welcome first.

Henry Gage, III: Slideshow meaning the screen we're all looking at right now that says Police Commission.

Regina Jackson: Yes. The Roll Call and Establishment of Quorum.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

- Henry Gage, III: Yes, we can see part of that, but the rest of it is PowerPoint. If you could start the slide show, so it's full screen.
- Regina Jackson: Oh, I see. Okay. My apologies. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: My apologies. It is. We actually can do it that way, but [crosstalk 00:05:43].
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you, Mr. Rus, can we move ahead to the next slide please? I'm sorry. I didn't see Alternate Commissioner Jordan when we were calling the role.
- David Jordan: That's okay. I literally just jumped on the call right as you were wrapping up.
- Regina Jackson: Oh, okay. All right. Thank you very much. And I was just alerted earlier this evening, that Commissioner Singletary is under the weather and will not be able to join us. So now we can actually go to the Welcome. I did say that we had established a quorum. And so even though this will be a training, we do have public comment at one point this evening. So Mr. Rus, if you will go ahead and call for public comment.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public would like to speak on the open forum, public comment portion of this meeting, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. We had received three written comments prior to the start of this meeting. The names of those individuals were Ryan Schultheiss, Jessica Schultheiss and Ryan Miller. Those comments will be entered into the record. Let me put up my clock, excuse me. The first hand I see in the queue tonight is Ms. Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala, can you hear us?
- Assata Olugbala: Yes. I can hear you.
- Juanito Rus: Whenever you're ready.
- Assata Olugbala: Okay. I want to reference the work of the Parks and Recreation Committee Advisory Board. On September 16th, the board produced a pilot program. The program dealt with the issue of Lake Merritt and it was supposed to be under the written document having to do with vending, but it had to do with the large number of African-Americans who were gathered around Lake Merritt. The Oakland Police Department was a part of the pilot program. I'm trying to find out how much money they spent. I know for patrol around Lake Merritt in 2019 \$6,000 was spent, in 2020 \$220,000 was spent. This commission or board did not have the authority to do anything around policing, vending, trafficking, or parking, but they did it.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Kevin Cantu. Good evening, Mr. Cantu, can you hear us?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

- Kevin Cantu: Good evening, everyone. I'd just like to remind you that this is a rough year. I just saw a tweet about an email the mayor had sent around earlier today, mentioning budget shortfalls. And if I remember correctly, the budget shortfall is comparable to the amount of money OPD is going to spend on overtime this year. So there's this task force going on that I have said some cynical things about in the past, and I think it might produce some interesting ideas, but I would urge this committee to continue doing the work, to reform the system and when there are opportunities to do so to clean up the budget in those system, without waiting for some final report from a committee of a committee that gives the perfect recipe.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Cantu. Your minute has expired. The last speaker in the queue on this item is Megan Steffen. Good evening, Ms. Steffen, can you hear us?
- Megan Steffen: Yes, I can. Thanks so much. Thank you all for having this meeting. Good luck with your training. I hope it's productive. I'm actually commenting in my capacity as an advisory board member for the Reimagine Public Safety Task Force. Hopefully you all and Mr. John Alden will have received a survey from our working group on leveraging existing structures to create more safety in which we hope to, despite all the budget things, lobby for more staff to support the police commission. It would be a great help to us if you could fill out that survey before December 21st, so that we can know from those of you who have experienced serving on the commission which staff members you think would help you do your jobs better on this commission. Thank you so much. Please fill out the survey, have a great training.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Steffen. One additional hand has been raised in the queue belonging to a telephone attendee with the last four digits, 0185. I believe that belongs to Miss Lazaneo. Good evening, 0185. Can you hear us?
- Michele Lazaneo: I can. This is Michele Lazaneo. Tonight's meeting has one item, race and equity, open to municipal code 2.29.170.1 States. The city of Oakland will intentionally integrate on a city-wide basis the principle of fair and just in all the city does in order to achieve equitable opportunities for all people in communities. Equity principle definition, be accountable to those most impacted by racial disparities. African-Americans represent 23.8% of Oakland's population, but 60.2% of OPDs current adult missing persons cases. African-Americans are clearly disproportionately impacted by missing persons cases. When OPD and the City Council made budget decisions that completely ignore safety issues to disproportionately affect a specific group of this community that is not equity or justice. OPD has the money to fully staff their missing persons unit, but instead they chose to spend \$718,000 on helicopters, spike strips, computers, and a boat. They prioritize equipment over human beings, buying more stuff instead of saving lives.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Miss Lazaneo. Your minute has expired. At this time, seeing no further hands in the queue, Madam Chair, I return the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. As part of the Welcome, I will say that we will need to agendize at our next meeting some of the budgetary memos that are going around. One that is just as one of the



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

community members mentioned, came out of about a couple of hours ago. So we will make sure that we agendaize that for our very next commission meeting. Thank you very much.

Regina Jackson: So, as we have mentioned over the course of the last three years, quite frankly, some of the biggest issues with policing have really been focused on racial profiling. And while we have seen a reduction in the numbers of people that have been stopped and pulled over the percentages remain the same, particularly as it relates to the African-American community. So I invited Ms. Darlene Flynn, who runs the Department of Race and Equity to provide us a presentation training and give us insight on her perspectives around what's going on inside the city. So at this point, I defer to you, Ms. Flynn, I believe you have been made a co-host and can begin your presentation when you are ready.

Darlene Flynn: Sure, Chair Jackson, I'm going to share my PowerPoint on the screen. This will stop other sharing. Okay. That's all right. Thank you so much for inviting me to be here tonight and thank you to all the commissioners for making time for an extra meeting so that this could happen. What I plan to do with you this evening is take you through some of the training slides that we use with city staff, because this is the easiest way for me to explain or illustrate, demonstrate what it is that we're doing, which is a little bit different than what people might expect, but it is no longer brand new and unusual. This approach to looking at creating greater equity from the inside of city government started about 15 years ago in Seattle, and it is spread across the country. And I was honored to be invited to come to Oakland from Seattle to start this work here.

Darlene Flynn: And so this is very much modeled after the work that began there, but it's going on nationally now. And I'm very lucky. I've been very blessed to be someone who was there at the beginning and who has been involved in this as it is developed over the last number of years. So I really appreciate you all spending some time with me this evening so I can share with you what we're doing. And this applies across the city, including the police department. I'll talk more about that as we go through. We are focusing on our ability to advance justice and racially just outcomes in the City of Oakland. But we know that we're not doing that in isolation. We know that as President Obama said, the Arc of the Moral Universe may bend toward justice, but it does not bend on its own.

Darlene Flynn: And we're walking in the footsteps of many, many greats who've come before us and many community organizations and community organizers who've been working for justice since forever, since things went wrong in the beginning. And so all of us that do this work are honored to be part of this continuum of a fight for realization of the promise of this nation. And so I feel humbled to be doing this work and to have had the opportunity to do it for so long. Glad to be here to share with you this evening. So in 2015, the City Council did pass an ordinance that established the municipal code. And we heard these words read into the record already. The City of Oakland will intentionally integrate on a city-wide basis the principle of fair and just in all the city does in order to achieve equitable opportunities for all people in all communities.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

- Darlene Flynn: And I joined the city in 2016, and we've been working in this direction on this mission since then, very actively. The challenge of this mission is that the truth of the matter is, and we're about speaking the truth about racial inequity, is that what holds this in place, what holds in equity in place is very deeply embedded in all of our systems, including government, including the city, et cetera. And it is not fast work to actually undo it and integrate into institutions, something different. It is a change initiative and it is change that is possible, but it is not the same as oftentimes the way we address racial inequity is with a program or with a training. And I know I'm doing a training tonight, but we know training is not the point.
- Darlene Flynn: Training prepares us to do something. So it's about action. And it's about action that is going to pay attention to a deeper change than a program or a service would be able to deliver. We need programs and services because of the damage that has been done. We were trying to focus on changing institutions so that they do less damage. So it's a slightly different approach.
- Darlene Flynn: We always begin these sessions by acknowledging that we're on occupied land and that California to this day has the largest population of indigenous people in the country. It's possible that it always has because of how easy it is to live on the land here in California because of the hospitality of the land. And we also know that indigenous people have been heavily impacted by these discovery and settlement and stealing of land that had always been theirs for millennia before the time of discovery and the populations shrank to very small numbers and are now beginning to come back here and nationally. And so it is good for us to remember that, although the numbers are relatively small and therefore often not reflected in disparity data or in data about equity because of the numbers of people to be measured, they are here, they are not gone. They are not disappeared. We have indigenous people among us and they too are fighting side-by-side with Black and Latino and other people of color for justice.
- Darlene Flynn: We always start these sessions as well by reminding everyone that for the sake of the work that we're doing to create greater justice in the City of Oakland, this is blame-free work. We don't need to find people to blame because we actually know how it happened. The history has now been revealed for many, many years. We didn't know as much, perhaps as we know now about how racial inequity became embedded in our society, unless we studied it, unless we lived it perhaps. In general, the general population was kept ignorant because of the public education that most of us received, unless we specialized in college in Black studies or Latino studies or something related to race, much of this history would have been outside of our consciousness. Now in this time of information and all the materials that are being produced and shared through all the various outlets, this is changing very quickly.
- Darlene Flynn: It hasn't changed the situation yet, but our understanding of how racial inequity became embedded in our systems and how it has been maintained and sustained up and through today is much less of a guessing game or a matter of opinion now that we have learned more of our history. So we don't have to find who did it, we have to figure out how to fix it. So we ask that city employees and anyone else who is interested in making a difference in the world, come to this with an open mind and a willingness to change their point of view as they have the opportunity to



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

absorb more information in a different framework. Now, I know that I'm speaking this evening to an audience that is potentially quite far ahead of a typical audience, but I don't make any assumptions. I start from the beginning with everyone, because even in a group like this, in a group that has been chosen to do this work, there's going to be a variation of knowledge.

Darlene Flynn: So we just share as much as we possibly can in the time that we have. We certainly don't share everything because we'd be here for a long time. If we really got into all that, but we try to bring everybody up to speed as quickly as possible with how we are approaching and thinking about this work in the City of Oakland, then we can work better together and more effectively together to move the work forward more quickly.

Darlene Flynn: It is also about taking responsibility. And the way we take responsibility is by recognizing that this is our page of history to write on. This is our moment. Other things happened before we were here, before we were on the stage, if you will, but this is our time on the stage. And we do have a responsibility as a member of society and serving in a city capacity to carry forward the mission of the code, but also the desire for greater justice in our city is embedded in our work now. And that's very exciting. So I actually consider it a privilege to be doing this work. Most people, as you all well know, do justice work in their spare time and they're not paid. So I always stress with city employees what a privilege it is to be paid to change the world in this meaningful way.

Darlene Flynn: We know that this is an evolution of response to race in relatively modern history. All of these phases that are on this slide have happened in my lifetime. I entered the workplace in the early days of diversification into a business environment at that time where white men had had all of the career upwardly, mobile jobs and women were secretaries and not intended to have advancing careers and people of color were not seen really at all during the daylight hours in the spaces. So there was a lot of work to be done as we attempted after the civil rights movement to diversify the workplace. And so we had to do intentional diversity work focused on differences of identity and culture, and also changing behaviors toward new arrivals in the workplace. Lots of behaviors had to be taken on and challenged. And then once we had looked at the quantity and the shifting demographics of the workplace, where that did happen, then we began to work on inclusion.

Darlene Flynn: So you've got DNI, diversity and inclusion efforts, across the country. And most of us who have worked outside the home have been exposed to trainings around diversity and inclusion. When we do equity work which has just come onto the horizon for government and institutional settings, not for the community, but for institutions for the last 15 years, we're actually moving into the next phase of this developmental response to race. We are now focused on justice. We are now focused on policies, practices, and procedures. We're focused on the institutions themselves, how they operate, how they're designed, how they're structured and how they operate in ways that reproduce racial inequity. So we're becoming detectors of those specifics and then activated to take action to make changes in those institutions. So we wouldn't be able to do this equity work if we hadn't done diversity to inclusion. We need to have a diverse and inclusive environment in order to do real equity work.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

Darlene Flynn: So here we are, we've arrived. It has taken awhile. And we are still in the earlier stages of this kind of work as compared with diversity and inclusion, which has been around for awhile, but we're building on that and the progress that was made through that work that came before us. So this really is a continuation of work. It's a continuation that connects back to the civil rights movement and prior as well. So we always make sure that we define what equity is because it's one of those words, like equality, that we all might have a picture in our mind or an idea about that might not have had necessarily a need to apply it in a more technical or disciplined way.

Darlene Flynn: So we explain the difference between equality and equity, the civil rights movement strove for equality under the law. Prior to that overtly racist laws were regularly visited upon Black, indigenous and people of color in all kinds of forms for hundreds of years, and through the civil rights movement that was named, it was challenged and the actual, intentional and overt laws that treated people of color differently than White people were struck down. That did not mean that the impacts of systemic racism went away, however. So when we decided as a country that we're now treating everyone the same, we can see that what's happening there is treating everyone the same as not giving everyone the same opportunity because not everyone is starting in the same place because of the history of race and racism in this country, we're not all starting in the same place.

Darlene Flynn: So treating everyone the same does not get us equity. Equity means fair and just inclusion, true access to opportunity for all. Not just being born into a society that says we are free, but into a society where we can actually participate in that freedom. And that is different scenario. And we are still working for that. Civil rights movement made this possible. So what happened before made what we're doing now possible, it's continuation, but there is a big difference between equality and equity. Equity is outcome focused. Equality can be rather proforma and it might or might not get you the outcomes that are needed in communities that have been impacted by racial disparities. So we take that into consideration when we're thinking about resources. Not only how much resource, but what kind of resource, because the resources must be appropriate for the group's needs based on what has happened to them and what the result of that has been.

Darlene Flynn: So we have to become more refined in our ability to approach even our programs and services that we deliver to underserved communities and communities that are not thriving in the City of Oakland. We want to become better at that and more intentional and not equal, but equitable in how we think about distributing resources.

Darlene Flynn: The other thing is we get to mess with the fence. The fence represents institutional policies, practices, and procedures. Fences don't grow naturally. They're designed for a purpose in a particular way and installed and maintained by institutions. And so this represents things like the City of Oakland and its laws and practices. So we have an opportunity to also look at how this is designed, how the institution is designed in a way that serves some people very, very well and other people very, very poorly and change that. And you can see that's illustrated here by the slant of the fence is the metaphor for it. It doesn't impact everyone the same. Even though it may



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

be colorblind, it has a different impact. So we want to be sure that we're shifting people's thinking out of the quality mentality and into the equity focus.

Darlene Flynn:

We also have a written definition of equity. Just and fair access to opportunity. An equitable society is one in which all can participate and prosper. It means where the outcomes are not predictable based on race. And this is often said that your zip code determines your outcome because of racial segregation and these things would no longer matter to outcomes. That doesn't mean everyone's outcome would be exactly the same, but we wouldn't be able to predict these outcomes by race, the way that we can in our current condition. So the goals are to create different conditions or to change conditions and to create conditions that allow people to prosper. And that means addressing systemic racism, any barriers or any things that are not working for those marginalized groups. And what this means is that we as a city and those of us that work in the city in order for us to advance racial equity, we have to move beyond being just gatekeepers, which comes with the job where we're gate keeping city resources all the time in small ways in some cases, in big ways in others, depending on where you're located.

Darlene Flynn:

And that is a function of being a high functioning bureaucrat, but we are actually working to move our staff beyond gate keeping and into change agents so that they are not only keeping the institution working in the institution, performing their duties in the institution, but they're also refining their skills and their ability to see when the institution is not operating in a fair and just way and to work with others collectively to change that. So this is an inside out change effort, which runs in parallel with the work that's done in the community, which we wouldn't be here doing this work if it weren't for the community. This is us taking up our part of the work inside the city. And so we have to become different kinds of players. We have to show up differently in order to achieve this. We have principles that guide us. We're system focused. We're outcome and data driven. And our North star is the elimination of those racial disparities. That's the North star. It will take a minute, undoubtedly it's been 300 years in the making but that's how we'll know when we're making progress. And I'm sure Jackson already mentioned some of the policing data around stops. We can eliminate those disparities and when we have eliminated those disparities, yes, people will still be stopped for traffic violations or equipment violations or whatever the case might be but race will not determine the frequency of those stops. And so that's not just applicable to the police department, it has real meaning all across the city.

Darlene Flynn:

This is again in that repeating of shifting individuals from gatekeepers to agents of change. This is a very important principle, it's a very important activity. That's my job is, is firing that up, organizing people's thinking, training them up and providing technical support so that they can take action. And that's the next one, take action to identify and address institutional elements of systemic racism so things that are built into the institution that are perpetuating inequitable outcomes.

Darlene Flynn:

Oops, well, we have to stay grounded in history and root causes of racial inequity, if we don't our society, our socialization has given us rationalizations about inequity and outcomes that blames the black, indigenous, and people of color for their situation. Being grounded in history



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

contradicts that and helps us understand how it happened. And it takes some intentionality because we get, as you all know, we get so many messages every day that these people, whoever these people are, are the problem not the history and the institutions and the structures of our country which have been here for a long time and are still having an impact. So we want to shift that, that's called interrupting the narrative, there's more on that later.

Darlene Flynn: And then we must be more accountable to those who are impacted by racial disparities and these are the least likely people for government to be accountable to and that is part of the way that the inequities in government services and so on are held in place because we don't see ourselves as accountable to groups of people that have been socially, economically marginalized throughout the history of this country. So all of this is running against the norm.

Darlene Flynn: And the reason that we're doing that is because we have a vision, we've established that our work, our equity work is aimed at eliminating racial disparities and if we want to do that we have to change everything about how we think about it. And the goals that we focus on short-term, well, they're not all short-term goals but the things we start working on immediately, that we tackle immediately is learning to identify when a system is causing racial disparities. Because normally we don't check systems for that until recently data wasn't used that way, and so we have to start using data so we can tell by the outcomes where our systems are producing inequity. And that takes a minute to get people to look in a slightly different way at what's going on here. And we must promote inclusion and participation by those communities that we want to grow greater accountability to.

Darlene Flynn: If we're not participating with us, if we are not connected to them, if we are not in proximity with communities that have been impacted historically by racial disparities we will not be able to get the answer right, we will not focus on the right things, we will not understand the problem correctly. So more inclusion, better inclusion, full inclusion, ultimately would be the goal, is a goal. Then finally, we want to start learning to focus on closing racial disparities as being the measurement of our work over time and that we begin to commit ourselves to collecting better data and better ways and creating better mechanisms for tracking our outcomes. Again, not something government typically does around race or anything else.

Darlene Flynn: One of the tools that we draw on in doing this work is something called result-based accountability, which is an accountability approach that was developed for government and some government entities have embraced it separately from equity to make their government more effective. And it's a very good process and it fits really well with equity, all we do is just make sure that we're centering the voices in the result-based accountability work and the outcomes for the communities that have been left behind in our society.

Darlene Flynn: We have a whole set of working assumptions that were brought to us by the Annie E. Casey Foundation, you're going to find that I've drawn on a lot of different people who've been able to do research and work on this that I could not have done by myself. This is becoming a collective effort and organizations like the Annie E. Casey Foundation for a long time had a commitment to



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

equity and justice and they've done quite a bit of research. So they gave us some working assumptions to help us think outside the box. Because again, we come to this work with whatever socialization, whatever education and whatever assumptions we've absorbed around us, unless we have been an activist we tooled ourselves already. We don't assume that that anyone has so we need new assumptions.

Darlene Flynn: The first one is the grounding assumption, race matters, almost every indicator of wellbeing shows troubling disparities by race. And of course, a couple of years ago we released Oakland Equity Indicator Report and it is a collection of 72 indicators, that's all it is. And it's run through an algorithm that gives us a score, an equity score, and that equity score and those individual data points are things that we can track over time. They're population-level big data points that are not going to change overnight but we can keep checking in with them to see if we are doing things, to address them or if we're not doing things to address them, because it's very easy for this to slip off the radar if we don't have those numbers in that data in front of us. So as an institution, not necessarily as individuals, but as an institution we can lose track of it.

Darlene Flynn: Disparities are often created and maintained inadvertently through policies and practices that contain barriers to opportunity. It's baked into the systems and we don't even have to do anything to make it happen. In many cases it just keeps doing it, that's why we have to become detectives at routing it out. It's possible and only possible to close equity gaps by using strategies determined through an intentional focus on race. If race matters and if race is part of if not most of the problem then we must focus on race.

Darlene Flynn: We have to grow our skills and our abilities to do that and the ability to create strategies that have an impact racially. They don't have to be race-specific strategies but they need to be designed to have a racial equity impact and that's not the same thing so just hold on to that thought. It's not about race-specific programming, it's not even about race-specific hires, it's about designing systems and hiring people that can do work that has a different racial impact.

Darlene Flynn: If opportunities in all key areas of wellbeing are equitable then equitable results will follow. This is a simple logic statement but it connects the inputs to the outcomes. If we input equitable opportunities we will get more equity coming out. Given the right message, analysis, and tools people will work toward racial equity. This is the bullet that is really again about the Department of Race and Equity. It is our job, there are three of us and it is our job every day, all day to give people the right messages, the right analysis and the right tools so that they will begin to work on racial equity.

Darlene Flynn: Now, not everyone is as anxious to work on racial equity, we know that, and not everyone will necessarily ever activate but we know that we don't need everyone, we only need enough. Every tipping point of change that we have experienced as a nation around race or any other major issue has had enough momentum to get over to the other side that has had enough momentum but it has never been a unanimous situation. That's just always true and so we know we don't need everyone we just need enough, and that's how we work.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

Darlene Flynn: So race matters, this is that first and a little bit just a link for you to the Oakland Equity Indicators Report, I'm sure most of you who've seen it we are looking for a student again to help us update this report. We hope to have it updated by next spring if we can find a student coming from one of our surrounding universities to help us do the data analytics that need to be done to maintain this report. That is not a resource that is embedded in my department but we've been lucky to find people in the past and I'm sure we will again, and it is great to give young people that are majoring in public policy and that sort of thing an opportunity to have some real world experience around equity, so it's a great partnership, we're looking for a student right now.

Darlene Flynn: But I can tell you that we did do a review of the data in the interim and we were not able to get updated data for all of the data points so we didn't republish the report. And a few indicators have gone up a little bit and some indicators have gone down a little bit and the resulting overall score did not, was not going to shift dramatically based on the data that we had. We didn't have all the indicators and some of these indicators have changed dramatically because of COVID so I'm going to be very surprised if we don't see our scores going down as a result of the pandemic, because we see some of the indicators that we had in this report shifting in the wrong direction during this time. It's disheartening in some ways and it is life, we have to be prepared and strong enough to contend with this and I believe we are.

Darlene Flynn: I'm just going to mention here that six out of the 12 indicators with a score of one were public safety indicators, I'm sure some of you already know this. Some folks in the community have started calling this the dirty dozen. There are a range of indicators with a score of one which is the lowest score you can get. Some of the disparities were so big in these areas that if the algorithm had been written differently they would have probably had negative scores but this is as low as you can go. And there were 12 of them that had a score of one, and these scores of the individual indicator level is what rolls up to the overall score of 33. These 12 indicators had a huge impact in pulling our overall equity score down.

Darlene Flynn: They're also very, very particularly the public safety and the education, some of them were education indicators also had a score of one, have incredible life impacts. They're very serious, very, very serious outcomes. Some of the indicators are more serious than others, there's a mix of them. These are all, I'd say all 12 of the dozen are pretty serious indicators. I point that out to you because this is the area where you all get to focus on making a difference and that's exciting. Someone said to me once, "Well, on these indicators that are particularly poor, that means we have a lot of room for improvement and we have a lot of opportunity to make a difference in people's lives." And so that is the more positive way to think about it. These are things we can do something about and it will matter when we do.

Darlene Flynn: I just pulled out one of the specific dataset visualizations and it's for homicides. And the reason that I did homicides is because what is happening right now with our homicide rate and I know it's on everyone's mind. And at this time which was 2017 we experienced 54 when we did the report, it was afterwards so we used 2017 data and we're down to 54 homicides in 2017 and I believe that the numbers actually dropped a few in the subsequent years until this year. And now like



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

COVID 19 infections this data point seems to be going straight up and we have not seen a tapering off.

Darlene Flynn: This is a very serious problem. It was highly racialized in 2017 and is completely racialized now. There is one group that is bearing, one group and one community that is bearing the majority of this impact. We know that but it is important for us to say that, and that is the African-American or black community. This is where we're at and when we update the report next year we will be able to use 2020 data and this is going to not look better, we're not going to move from one on this one but it is not too late for us to be working on it, it's never too late. We want to move it.

Darlene Flynn: Oh, gosh, this might or might not play right. I don't think I clicked the buttons. This is a really short video about institutional systemic racism. We share this with new employees in the new employee orientation because we know a lot of people coming into the city from elsewhere have never had a chance to think about systemic racism. Most people get taught about or learn something about individual racism but systemic racism is a little bit of a different framework.

Darlene Flynn: I'd like to share this video because it's really short and it explains it really well to people that are new to the concept. I'm going to try to play it and we'll see if it works, I may not have done it right. Playing a video on Zoom is a little bit tricky. It can be moody but it's not absolutely essential that we see it because I think you all probably know what I'm talking about. Let me try. Sometimes if I go out to this view I can get it on. Let's see.

Jay Smooth: Oh, hey, I didn't see you there. If you're like most Americans you probably say to yourself all the time, "Systemic racism, is that really a thing?" But what would you call it after lifetimes of legal segregation followed by decades of pervasive racist housing policies? Still to this day disadvantaged black people in every aspect of life because where you live can help decide what foods you eat, what sort of jobs you can get, how safe you are, what sort of healthcare you can get, and the quality of your children's education. Do you know what that's called? That's called systemic racism, and yes, it's really a thing.

Darlene Flynn: In three minutes or less, two minutes or less, a very short video, Jay Smooth there lays out for us what it is we're talking about when we talk about systemic racism. We're talking about this cumulative impact of differences in treatment that is persistent into the current time. And we can see it more easily when we look at those big things and we will look at those big things that he ticked off. But sometimes it is harder to see embedded in city programs that it doesn't present itself quite as obviously, that doesn't mean that it's not there.

Darlene Flynn: What we're looking for is a pattern in social institutions such as government organizations, schools, banks, courts of law, it's pervasive throughout our society, perpetuating negative treatment toward a group of people based on their race. Institutional racism leads inequity in opportunity and inequity in life outcomes. So we connect the systemic impact of our communities of color to the systems that have impacted them and then we turn the lens on ourselves, then we have to look at ourselves.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

- Darlene Flynn: One of the ways that we've come to be able to understand this as it operates in our own geography and in our own city is to reflect on and understand how redlining worked. And most of us now know what redlining is but again, this is not a topic that was generally taught in school. I think it's changing now but even in planning school, and even this was not something that was centered as a major impact on urban areas but it obviously is when you just look at the map, this is the redlining map that would have been created for Oakland back in the '30s, maybe early '40s. There was a period of time where this survey was done across the country and building inspectors in cities helped the federal government map out cities with regard to the desirability of different areas in the city.
- Darlene Flynn: And these maps were used for many, many purposes or resulted in many, many impacts. But the primary when they got really activated was upon the invention of a 40-year mortgage, 10% down in the '40s and '50s, and that is when that particular program and the subsidy of mortgages particularly for veterans, for VA, eligible people who were white then built the white middle-class. Because prior to that there were wealthy people, usually land-owning people, and there were working people and poor people. There wasn't really a middle class, that didn't exist in the U.S. until very recently, really. And it was built through home ownership and building of wealth, and equity, and then passing on that wealth and equity. But black indigenous and people of color were shut out of those markets.
- Darlene Flynn: In excess of 95% of the mortgages that were given out in those early days in the '50s and in the '60s and in the '70s particularly went to white people, a very small percentages of them went to people of color. And that was accomplished through covenants in the land that kept people of color out of the blue and the green areas. And by the way that mortgages were viewed and handled in redlined and yellow areas that were adjacent to the redlines, got higher interest rates and you'll know that if you get a higher interest rate you might not be able to afford to buy your house. So it kept a lot of people out of home ownership, and it didn't have anything to do with the rate of default on mortgages, it wasn't based on anything factual, it was based on race, it was based on country of origin.
- Darlene Flynn: In the paperwork that you can see for mapping out our city and all the cities, there are almost 300 of them that were mapped in this way is a reference to Negroes and a reference to foreign-born people and sometimes a reference to low-class whites. It led with race and bled over into economics, but there were no statistics available at that time that proved that these people were any more likely to default on their mortgages if they could qualify for them. There was no reason for that except viewing of certain people as being less than worthy of participating in this option to own a home.
- Darlene Flynn: This has a profound and lingering impact to this day. It led to all kinds of other actions and inactions on the part of local government and it has become the roadmap for all kinds of destruction that has been visited upon these communities. I know most of you probably already know that but if you want to know more, there's an excellent book now called The Color of Law.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

it's a few years old, it is a deep dive into the long-ranging impacts of redlining by Richard Rothstein.

Darlene Flynn: It's very referencing because he... I don't know if he's from here originally but he's certainly been a professor here and he has lived here so it has a lot of reference. It's really a worth while book to read, I recommend that all city staff if they're in any way, shape or form involved in policy-making or program design or anything, that they get The Color of Law under their belt so that they have a solid understanding about why we're grappling with what we're grappling with and how it came to be this whole way. So The Forgotten History of How Governments Segregated America.

Darlene Flynn: I think since my audio is difficult I probably won't play this but I will share this out to you. This is a nice code switch video about redlining. I don't think we need to take the time to do it today but when you get this deck you will have that link and you can watch it on your own. It opens just a little bit of Chris Rock at the beginning, and there is a little bit of cursing in it but it's very short and then it goes over into the regular programming. So it's worth watching, it's a nice overview of how redlining worked that's shorter and quicker than The Color of Law.

Darlene Flynn: What I want to focus on now is the reason that this is a very useful teaching tool and a very motivating teaching tool. Is this, the way I use that information it's not only that wrong things got done to black indigenous and people of color, but it's not just that, it's the impacts that we want to understand and there's a couple of layers of impacts. One layer is that basically what those green and blue areas on the map represent are high-opportunity workshops where the people who historically have lived in those communities and who still live in those communities to this day, because we're still quite segregated, they basically hit the jackpot with regard to being able to raise their children or grow up in high-opportunity workshops and this is where people build their lives.

Darlene Flynn: Now, obviously the workshop doesn't actually build your life for you, you still have to show up and you still have to do the work. And some of us are going to be, this happens to be a woodworking shop, so some of us are going to be better at woodworking than others are and are going to do much fancier projects. And some of us are going to do simple projects, straightforward projects, that would be me, that don't require too much woodworking skill or even interest, honestly. But I would be able to in a workshop like this with a culturally-appropriate well-qualified coach, I would be able to build something because everything I need to build something is there.

Darlene Flynn: I could build my life here and all lives aren't going to come out the same. And if you just think about it that way, this high-opportunity workshop is where we are socialized, it is where we develop as human beings, it is where we try things out, it is where we discover who we are and who we are likely to be for the rest of our lives. So this workshop quality is very, very important. It's more important than character, it's more important than inherent talent. And we're not all equally talented in all areas but it's more important because this is where you get to make the most out of what you've got, whatever you bring, whatever you wish for, or whatever you long



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

for whatever you're motivated toward, this is where you get to put it together and that is a huge adaptive factor.

Darlene Flynn: On the other hand, we have the other parts of our city that were redlined and yellow-lined where we have workshops that are more like this. And these are the workshops that are waiting for children and families that arrive in those areas. Those are the areas where we are more likely to live even if we're not from Oakland because these are the areas we're most likely to be able to afford. And these low opportunity workshops are not only not set up to provide everything we need to build something successfully, they are actually dangerous. They have become vectors of harm for our communities and it is really important, which is why I stress this, that we grapple with this, we get into our heads that this was not created by the people who are there now, this was created by the history of this country.

Darlene Flynn: And then the people who are there now respond to this and do the best that they can. And some of us have come from these circumstances and we are the outliers or the exceptions to the rule because this kind of environment is going to harm more people than it's going to help. So it tends to invert or reverse the probability of the people in this environment building a successful life. This is very important in unpacking the dominant narrative. The dominant narrative and the dominant frame has told us for our entire lives and many people have absorbed it, even people of color, the idea that it's about individualism, it's winners and losers. That's why the statistics are different for white people than they are for black, brown and Asian people.

Darlene Flynn: That it's about personal merit or deficit, poor choices, didn't try hard enough, all those kinds of things, and so therefore people get what they deserve. And all of this is backed up and explained by racist ideas about black, indigenous, and people of color, they're basically stereotypes about people of color. And the truth of the matter is that we know that genetically we are not different. There is no difference except that environment, there is no difference except that environment, but that is not what we're taught. We now know because of science that there is no difference so it's got to be something else. Even though we would all land in a different place on the spectrum of success, in life if we all had the same conditions things would look a lot different, so we're trying to really get that in as many ways as we can.

Darlene Flynn: And the problem with this narrative is not only that it's untrue, harmful, hurtful, and unacceptable to people who are fighting for justice, but it's also doesn't lead us or motivate us to change anything because there's nothing for us to change, there are only individuals who need to change and so there's no work for us to do. And John Powell, who's now here in Berkeley at the Othering & Belonging Institute, and has been long doing this work about the relationship between opportunity and outcomes. This is his quote, "This narrative will always produce durable, persistent and racialized poverty, built around just accepting and tolerating this societal problem by framing it as an individual issue." I've been drawing on John Powell's work for years now and it has really shaped my thinking about advancing racial equity.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

- Darlene Flynn: In order to not have that dominant narrative run us, because again it's been put in us, from the time we got here we've been dipped in it. If you were raised and socialized in this country you could not have missed it. And in fact, it still comes at us in waves on a day-to-day basis, now, because it's still the dominant narrative. We want to replace the dominant narrative with an equity frame. Individuals develop in the context of access to opportunity. Merit is currently determined on a profoundly uneven playing field. So whenever we see someone as particularly meritorious we're also seeing the conditions that they had an opportunity to access in their developmental time, we're seeing that as well as their effort so it's not an even playing field.
- Darlene Flynn: What people get is influence by many factors outside of their control. We also have control over some things but there are many factors that are game changers, and we're all experiencing that right now with COVID-19. And if you want to know if that's not your story, where there were things outside of your control, COVID is a great illustrative opportunity to see how things can go terribly wrong, terribly quickly if the conditions are right or if the conditions are wrong.
- Darlene Flynn: We're aiming for transformation and the reason we're aiming for transformation is that we're not satisfied with the way things are. But the transformation we're looking for is just liberty and justice for all. Now, suddenly this has become a radical idea, this is now radical to actually expect and demand liberty and justice for all but in fact it is an idea that goes back to the very foundation of this nation. And we recognize now that liberty and justice for all when those words were originally pinned did not actually include all. And we know that now, but nonetheless, this is what we've been taught, this is what we've come to expect and this is what we should expect from our nation. So that's what we're working for, liberty and justice and this time and for all.
- Darlene Flynn: In order to work on our policies, I'm going to shift gears a little bit, that's all background, that's all foundation, that's all framework. It gets everybody thinking about equity in the same way or at least understanding how we're thinking about equity so we can all work together on it in the same way. Which brings us to this, we use tool-specific structured approaches to getting people to practice different thinking, to get people to practice different thinking and to get people to drive their work toward different outcomes. So the key tool is called a racial equity impact analysis. Most of the cities that are doing this work have a tool or a tool kit, sometimes they call it, that includes a racial equity impact analysis. The first one was designed in Seattle. Ours is very, very similar in content but looks different, partially because I wanted to emphasize different things in its presentation. It also hasn't been fancied up graphically. We're not that fancy in Oakland. And so it's just a guide, it's just a document. It's a Word document that steps people through a different set of considerations and in a different order in order to arrive at improved, more equitable, different conclusions.
- Darlene Flynn: This is a high-level overview of the steps of that process. The steps at the implementation level always have to be customized to the item that we're applying it to, but they can be done on anything. Anything from a program to a law or regulation to... What else could it apply to? A policy, an internal policy, an HR policy that affects city employees, perhaps, equitably or not equitably. It can be applied to a lot of different things.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

Darlene Flynn: The first thing, and this is what's different, before we know how we're going to get there, we name the desired future condition. One of the ways that these disparities and outcomes have been held in place is by having rationales about why we can't change them or why there's nothing we can do about it or why all of the... We might call them excuses and rationales. We have decided in doing equity work that we're never going to change the destination of the train, we're never going to lay new tracks to a different destination, by focusing on what we can't do. We've all probably been taught this at some point in our life. If we only focus on what we can't do, we're not going to get what we could get.

Darlene Flynn: So built into this model is a lot of psychology and a lot of intentionality about how to get, again, out of the box that constrains us. And when I say constrains us, I'm talking about the good ones, the good folks. The folks who would like to see it be different, the folks who care. And we've always had plenty of those people in city government and outside the city government. We have plenty. But we are also stuck on the same track. So we start by naming the desired future outcome that we're trying to get to. And I provided an example here. They all are kind of the same, but you might insert some different words in a couple of places to focus on what the item is.

Darlene Flynn: In this case, I took a high level desired future outcome. All residents of the City of Oakland are economically secure and living in thriving, healthy communities. That is where we want to go. That is where we are going. And you can see it's stated in present tense. That's typical too. If we can get ourselves to do it. It can be hard because it causes a lot of cognitive dissonance. Why does it? Because we know that this isn't true now. We know that all residents of Oakland are not living economically secure in thriving, healthy communities. That's where we want to get. We want to get right to that point of dissonance. We want to go right there because that's where the motivation for action is. Then we start looking for disparity data that helps us understand the current conditions in juxtaposition to this future outcome. And what we know is that African-Americans, Latinos, and some Asian groups are overrepresented in poverty, unemployment, underemployment, and living with poor health outcomes and shorter life expectancies in the City of Oakland and in the United States of America.

Darlene Flynn: So now we've got that nailed down. We got our data. And we can use the equity indicator report as a model, but sometimes we have to go find other data that is related specifically to the thing we're working on. Sometimes we can pull data from that or from other reports that have been done by other people. If you're working on health, there's a lot of health reporting out there. There's a lot of information we can draw on.

Darlene Flynn: And then once we understand that, then we work with the impacted communities. Again, we work with the impacted communities. This is a big stretch for the city. You know it is. We don't do this very well. No city government that I'm aware of has got it down perfectly and a lot of us have a lot of work left to do. But this is what we aspire to. To work with the impacted community, to complete a root cause analysis, to deepen understanding of the problem before we start solving it, and to determine what partnerships might be needed to respond comprehensively.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

Because as the problem blows out, as the problem gets more well exposed through our conversations with the community, we will also probably come into contact with elements of the problem that are not within our jurisdiction or that we haven't figured out how to work on yet. It's not in anybody's jurisdiction. Nobody's doing it. We'll start seeing those things as well. So this is where we can start to imagine, so what are we going to do about that?

Darlene Flynn: And then it's not until step four that we begin to design responses, solutions, programs, changes in the law, changes in the policy, changes in how we do things. Step four. And this is really counter to city culture, and most institutional culture through school, really. We've all been taught that in order to succeed and in order to be recognized, we need to have the first best answer. We need to rush to the answer as quickly as we possibly can. That hand needs to go up. I know, I know, I've got the solution. And we are smart people. We are smart people. We have wisdom. We often have education and expertise, and we're very, very excited to apply it.

Darlene Flynn: But if city staff and others in decision making authority positions start to problem solve before steps one through three, we can fall off the rail quite early on and end up in a destination we didn't intend to end up in. We can just simply not get where we're trying to go. So we ask people to put all those great ideas they already have on the parking lot until we do more interrogation or more investigation with the community about the problem itself. It sometimes takes a while to do that and sometimes it can be done very quickly. It doesn't have to be a super long process, it just needs to be adequately deep. And then we start problem-solving. And as we're designing equity approaches, we are also co-designing at the same time, what are our performance measures going to be? How will we know whether or not this actually works? And that's a commonplace thing in manufacturing or in a lot of practices. They have to do quality assurance throughout the process because otherwise, people won't keep buying their product.

Darlene Flynn: The problem with government is, and government has a lot of good things, I'm not anti-government, I'm in government on purpose. I came to it accidentally, but I'm still here on purpose. I believe in government. But the problem with the way government has been designed is we don't have that quality control. We don't have stockholders. We don't have a profit motive built into our environment that requires us to do quality assurance. That if we want to get it right, if we want to change it and get it right, we want to shift that too. And that's where result-based accountability and the theoretical framework there is very useful. And so we put the two together and put an equity angle on result-based accountability when it comes to performance measures and that sort of thing. It's result-based, it's accountability. It's both of those things.

Darlene Flynn: And then I just added a step five, which is not really in the tool. There's actually more steps in the tool. That some of these are broken into a couple of steps, but this is a simple overview. I put here a step five. Plan to repeat steps two through five as needed. It's a continuous improvement loop. We are not likely to get it right the first time. So I'm going to use the traffic stops as an example. Because of the work that was done with Dr. Everhart and Stanford and the examination of that data and how stops were being done, a new policy was introduced to the police department. And I sometimes know the name of it. I think it's something based policing.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

- Darlene Flynn: The officers have to go through a different process as they're making a stop. They have to interrogate themselves about why they're stopping, what the indicators are for this stop. And it slows down their decision-making about stopping people. And the number of stops in the City of Oakland have plummeted as a result of that. They haven't just gone down a little bit, they have plummeted. It's really true. And that is how the police department, it was through looking at the data and through looking at how the stops were being done, what the existing practice was at that time, changing that practice. They have shrunk the footprint, that's how they describe it. They shrunk the footprint, and they have therefore stopped black people less as well as a result.
- Darlene Flynn: And as Tara Jackson pointed out, the disparity still exists. So we're not done. We have done something, and that something has made a difference. And so now we need to repeat steps two through five so that we can get to the next place. And oftentimes, that's how change happens in government, because government tends to be very incremental. It's not a radical change kind of environment. I think it was designed that way by the founding people. Founding fathers designed it that way so that craziness couldn't happen, or we thought craziness couldn't happen, quickly.
- Darlene Flynn: And so this is what we do. This is how we do it. This is what we prepare people to do and teach people to do. And at every step of this, people are learning also to think about the world differently. They're learning to see the world differently. They're in proximity with people that they're not typically in proximity with, and they are changing, they are growing, they are becoming different, and so is the institution. And that kind of developmental process is also not an overnight process, so we might have to keep looping. We're not, probably in most cases, going to get it all done in one swipe if it's complex and is deeply rooted, as something like traffic stops. We should prepare ourselves to need to do that work more than once.
- Darlene Flynn: We also have an Inclusive Outreach and Engagement Planning Guide that we ask employees to use to plan their outreach, because the way that cities and institutions and government in general does outreach is not particularly inclusive. We all know that. And so we have to bring some real intentionality to being inclusive if we want to hit the mark. And not only with regard to the outreach and inclusion, but with regard to getting the answer right, closer to right, getting further along the way, not having to redo it so many times.
- Darlene Flynn: This is the key ingredient. It's very important that people closest to the impacts are closest to the solutions because they understand the problem differently. And we need their wisdom, and we need to treat and go into those relationships differently. And we talk about this explicitly. I'm not saying anything here that I don't say to city staff. We need to recognize that we have treated our residents as merely, I'm going to use that word, merely service recipients as opposed to true partners in solving these problems. And that's part of the reason that the problems are so stuck. So we're also changing around that. The way it's always been done will not suffice if we hope to get where we want to go. I'm very close to the end.
- Darlene Flynn: This is the result-based accountability chart for doing measurements. I don't even know how to get rid of this. Oh, it looks like it has a little X. I have an awful lot covered up here. What it says up



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

there at the top is how much did we do and how well did we do it? So these two things, because when the city is on it's A game about a program particularly, we will evaluate the program for these two things almost always, particularly social service programs. We don't analyze everything in this way, but particularly our service programs, we tend to do this. How much did we do? How well did we do it? And usually, that work is being done by a contractor too. It's not always being done by the city. Or often, it's done by a contractor.

Darlene Flynn:

But we track that stuff because I would consider that a minimal level of accountability that we are spending the money the way we said we were going to spend the money, that it's being spent on the right things, and that the practices that are being used are high quality. And the staff that's delivering them are competent and all those sorts of things. So these two boxes, we're a bit more familiar with, even though we don't always do those either. It's the bottom box that is bigger on purpose that we don't measure very well and that we haven't historically disaggregated the data on. And that is, is anyone better off and how do we know? And who is better off? And so we have this... We are working hard to expand out how we're measuring impacts to include this deeper level of information about whether or not we're actually changing people's lives. And if we are actually changing people's lives, then eventually, those population level measures, like incarceration and homicides and violence in the community, will be impacted if we make people's lives different.

Darlene Flynn:

But if we just keep serving up things and not measuring whether or not we're making people's lives differently, we're not really making progress. So this is really important. And it's also very hard. It is not an easy thing for an institution to do, it's not something we've required of our contractors in the past, so a lot of people are going to have to change and grow in order for us to get here. But it is very, very important to the accountability piece. And so we lean into it and we are trying to build these systems out right now.

Darlene Flynn:

And that is the end of the slide presentation. Now, this was really truncated. We normally cover this and more. Each of these slides would have several slides behind it over a four module series that is about 15 hours of training. And so we get deep enough into it that we feel like when people have gone through that academy, that we can then go in and do technical assistance with them and they will be able to apply these tools. This is the foundational material that we give to people, this and more than you have seen tonight, is the foundational information we give them before we start walking the path together.

Darlene Flynn:

And this work began with the police department earlier this year. I never had a chance to do this work, to train people up inside the police department in Seattle. When I left there four years ago, they were still barring the door pretty hard. So it felt like progress to have the opportunity to do some training and some work inside the police department. Unfortunately, right as we were getting traction, we basically had a pandemic, we had some staffing changes and some leadership changes, so we're not as active on it right now. But I think that as we see the light at the end of the tunnel and as we get through some of the worst of this pandemic and things begin to normalize a little bit, I think we'll have the commitment to bring it back.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

- Darlene Flynn: We also, I think, need the leadership of the permanent chief, because leadership can't do this all by themselves. They can't do this work all by themselves. Staff must be engaged. It must be working with them on it. It's just the way it works. Like working with the commit community. We must work with the community. We must work across the staff because we're trying to do transformational work. And not having a permanent chief, I think, also makes a difference. But we're looking forward to that changing too. So we know that we will pick this work up again in the police department. And there's still some conversations going on around it, it's just not as active as it was before the pandemic and before the staffing changes.
- Darlene Flynn: So I'll stop there and just open it up to questions. And I will stop sharing my screen. So if you want to turn on your cameras, you don't have to, but if you would like to, we can look at each other while we're talking.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Darlene. I have so many questions. And you know me, I can sometimes get very direct on the questions.
- Darlene Flynn: That's okay.
- Regina Jackson: I know that public safety got a total score of 33 when you did the racial equity report card.
- Darlene Flynn: The whole city got a score... Everything together got a score of 33.
- Regina Jackson: Oh, okay. Okay, thank you.
- Darlene Flynn: That's everything together. But those public safety areas that I put up on the screen, they are in the report, they are among the 12 areas that got the very low numbers that pulled that score down. So it had an impact, yeah.
- Regina Jackson: Yeah, no. And I remember that the public safety department got a one on racial profiling. I'd like to request, quite frankly, for the benefit of so many of the new commissioners, if you wouldn't mind emailing us that 2017 report.
- Darlene Flynn: Oh, yeah. I can send you the link. It's actually on our website, but I'll put the link over to you. Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Great. So my question, since the entire city has failed, is was there a department that had, I don't know, more racial equity or seemed like it was more or less problematic, I guess I'd like to ask?
- Darlene Flynn: I think when we started the work, I think all departments have have blind spots and have not done justice work in this intentional way. So because of our history and because of the way institutions are built, it takes a lot of intentionality to get to that place where you feel that tipping point of change and that you've created a multicultural anti-racist organization. And none of the departments, and no city that I know of, has yet achieved that tipping point. We're working



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

toward it and we look at other benchmarks along the way. And we do have some departments that are more active than others, so I can tell you that. Because we know no one has arrived and wouldn't have expected anyone to have arrived or to have already arrived when we began the work, but we are monitoring how departments are engaging.

Darlene Flynn: And this year, we stood up four new equity teams. So part of the infrastructure of doing this work is having equity teams embedded in every department. And we've been standing them up all during this time that I've been here and we are down to the last couple. And I know that it seems like it took a long time, but it takes quite a bit of technical assistance to stand these up. And honestly, if they'd all launched on day one, I would have not been able to provide the level of technical assistance that we want to provide. So it's been okay, but we have now gotten to the point where everybody's going to have a team by the end of the year is what we're aiming for. And then we go in with those teams and we really invest more support in those teams and in their ability to lead this work in the department. So we monitor those benchmarks. And there are definitely departments that are ahead because they started earlier.

Regina Jackson: Okay. So question. You mentioned that this training is really usually more like about 15 hours.

Darlene Flynn: Yes. And I wouldn't subject y'all to that.

Regina Jackson: No, no, no. That's fine. I would probably decide to sign up for it.

Darlene Flynn: Anyone who wants to come, absolutely. You are welcome to join. Yes.

Regina Jackson: But my question to you is in terms of city leadership, has the mayor, city council, city administrator, have they all completed their 15 hours?

Darlene Flynn: Have they all completed their 15 hours? I probably only have maybe three directors that have completed their 15 hours, but we didn't actually require that of them. What we did, we have done specialized trainings for the leadership, and they have all had training. And partly that's because being able to sustain a series like that as a director, if you're not the one leading the training, it's very hard for us to take half day chunks and show up consistently. You have to show up four times, you've got to block it out, and so we haven't required it of them. I think more of them are likely to take it because honestly, the departments that are more ahead are the ones whose directors have taken it.

Darlene Flynn: So we use a little bit of carrot and stick. I'm just going to be completely transparent. It's like community organizing. We keep knocking on the doors and we get our early folks going, and they help us create more momentum. And that is starting to happen. But we did not let them not have training, so we took training to them because we do meet regularly. And that's the beauty of being a director too. We're the only city I know of that has a Department of Race and Equity. Usually this function, if a city has one, is buried in another department. Desley Brooks did a very progressive thing by elevating this activity to a departmental level. And so I get to actually talk



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

with my colleagues about race and equity, about this work, every week. We hardly ever have a senior staff meeting where I don't get to bring up what they need to be thinking about and what skills we're working on building. And then we also have had training sessions with them that were specifically skill building and understanding.

Darlene Flynn: Again, not everybody starts in the same place and not everybody is in the same place at this moment, but it is definitely picking up momentum. I feel very optimistic about the momentum that is being built. Because as we put more pressure on this year to say everybody's going to get on board this year, it has not been the same. It hasn't taken a lot of arm twisting, and four years ago, it would've been brute force. And we all know that adults don't necessarily change that way. And so we use a theory of change that is motivational, I'll just put it that way. It's got a lot of little pieces to it, but it's motivational.

Regina Jackson: Sure. Well, the reason that I asked that question about leadership is because one of the pieces of your presentation also talks about accountability, and recognize that if people really want something to change, leaders model what they expect to see.

Darlene Flynn: [inaudible 01:25:38].

Regina Jackson: Right. So as it relates to the accountability, I'd like to ask, within the implementation process, what step are we, as a city, on?

Darlene Flynn: Well, I think where we are is that we are doing this process of building up the capacity across the city and building up to critical mass. So the whole idea of critical mass and tipping point of changes, when you get 25% to 30% in any environment pulling together in the same direction actively, not just head-nodding, but doing the actions, using the tools, interrogating problems with a racial equity lens, when you hit that tipping point of change, that is the point at which you can feel the change coming. It's that sense of a roller coaster grinding up and over the top. It doesn't mean you're done with the ride, it just means that it starts to feel different.

Darlene Flynn: We have not hit that point yet in the City of Oakland. We have not hit that point yet. We feel the momentum building. I think that the COVID has been a real test. And while we haven't gotten it right in every way, we don't have a meeting talking about COVID response that we don't talk about justice. And it's not even strained anymore. When I first came... See if I can describe to you what it's like. When you come in with this idea and this work and these approaches, it feels a little bit like you're just rubbing everyone the wrong way. Not that they're mad at you or that things blow up, but you're an irritant. You're an irritant. And that's what you're supposed to be. You're basically agitating. That's what community organizers would call it. You're agitating for change when you first come in.

Darlene Flynn: I no longer have to agitate with the leadership to have the conversation that we need to have. They are having those conversations when I'm not in the room. And not just them, but other people besides them, because the leaders can't do it by themselves either. We have got enough



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

seeds planted across the city that we are beginning to see this work emerge, what I would call spontaneously. And it's not really spontaneous, people are making it happen, but it's not happening just because I'm in the room agitating at the moment. And that's our goal. That is our goal, to have this start popping like popcorn. I have all kinds of metaphors. That at first, it's just a kernel here and a kernel there and a kernel over there. And pretty soon, it's popping, popping, popping. And we're looking for that point where everything is going at a faster pace and at a smoother, more satisfying, I guess, environment. And we are getting there.

Darlene Flynn: We're having a celebration this Friday, a recognition celebration with our equity team leads. And we put together a little slide deck about the work that they've been doing in their departments. And so much of the work is not work that DRE even ask them to do directly. It is work that has flowed out of this framework and flowed out of the work of those equity teams and others in their department. Some of the people that are being recognized aren't even on equity teams, they're just people that picked up the baton and walked with it or ran with it. And these are not all big things, but some of them are quite big and some of them are smaller. But the point is they happened and they happened without us driving it hard. We were there and available and worked on most of it with people, but as technical support, not as the instigators. Whereas at first, you always have to be making these things happen harder, which is why I was such an irritant.

Darlene Flynn: I think now people are beginning to value the work. They're beginning to see the value of the work. They're beginning to see some of the products of the work and understand it differently. Some people need to see it to understand it. And we're starting to see that synergy start to pop off around the city. We've got cross departmental teams spontaneously coming together around some issues. One that might be of most interest to you is inclusive engagement. All the departments have responsibility for doing engagement with the communities that we want to serve better in some format or another. Most departments. We have a few, a small handful of departments, that are internally focused, but most departments have some responsibility for that.

Darlene Flynn: And somehow or another, last year now... Well, yeah, I think it was toward the end of last year. A group of people spontaneously came together and said, we've got to get better at this and start talking cross departmentally about how we're doing it, how we can do it better, learning from each other, researching resources that would help us do it better. And it doesn't even have a home. It's not owned by any leadership. That's more valuable than almost anything, because that is the buy-in and the motivation and activism within the city making itself known. It's very catchy when that starts to happen, because then people are like, whoa, let me get over there and see what's going on.

Regina Jackson: So to that point, last week, we had a presentation on reimagining public safety. Some of the conversation, I know that I had spoke to the fact that while the task force may have been organized around reducing the police budget, that in fact, when you highlighted the vision for all people that live in the City of Oakland to have equity and housing all those kinds of things, that in fact, if the most overpoliced part of the population in the City of Oakland isn't, in fact, made safe



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

through this task force and reimagining public safety makes no sense. Now, that's my opinion. But I wanted to have you comment a little bit on your race and equity lens at the table of the task force. How do you see progress? And am I interpreting the outcome wrong? You mentioned that you have to identify where it is that you want to be in order to create your path toward it.

Darlene Flynn:

Right. Well, that particular effort, they did not use my technical assistance. And that's just the authority of government. So this is what's interesting about doing this work in a governmental environment, that we do have branches of government, and the branches of government are independent. And while this got started by the city council, it is not part of the city council. It's not. I don't work on a day to day basis with the city council. Now, the resolution that they passed that started that work did talk about racial equity. I'm sure it did. I haven't read it in a long time, but I'm sure that it talked about race, which is a good start. But there is this gap between saying racial equity and doing racial equity, and I think this is what people underestimate. And I'm not picking on any council members. I don't want it to be interpreted that way, but people underestimate what it takes to go from the idea of creating racial equity and the doing of racial equity. And so, that's where my value is. Right? It's in there. Because I've had all this practice, and we've tried different things and we've made mistakes and we've pulled out the stuff that helps. And we're there now.

Darlene Flynn:

And I wasn't on the ground level of that, and I didn't have to be. That wasn't a requirement. I think that the community is bringing the right conversation in. It is a community-engaged project, and I do think that the folks that are leading it are committed to that. I really do. Both the council members and the consultants that are working with them are committed to engaging the community well, and through that engagement with the community, the community is elevating these issues and concerns.

Darlene Flynn:

And honestly, when it comes to electeds, and council members... And I don't know if I've told you this, but I worked for eight years for a city council member so I understand the process that's going on over there because I worked in that environment too. I think they're going to get there. They're just going to get there differently. They didn't use me to get there. But they're going to get there because they're engaging the community, and the community is going to help them get there. And they may end up engaging me. I mean, I have actually, I've gone and done a little mini training for one of the work groups, so I've gotten engaged by the community. And so, it's happening. It can happen in different ways. It doesn't have to always start in the same place.

Regina Jackson:

Well, I will say that it is a disappointment to me that as a subject matter expert, that you weren't engaged from the ground floor. Having said that, I have more questions, but I want to defer to Commissioner Garcia, who does have his hand up. You've been unmuted, Commissioner Garcia. Or at least I'm thinking that I'm unmuting you.

Darlene Flynn:

It looks like he's still muted on the screen.

Sergio Garcia:

Okay. Thank you, Chair Jackson.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

Darlene Flynn:

There we go.

Sergio Garcia:

And thank you, Ms. Flynn for an excellent presentation. I really liked that you and your office recognize the difference between saying racial equity and doing racial equity. It reminds me of what Dr. Ibram Kendi said in his writing, said, "You could say you're not a racist, but that's not the same as doing anti-racist work."

Darlene Flynn:

That's right.

Sergio Garcia:

And that's really the challenge and the challenge that you face day in, day out, so kudos to you and your team. My question is around the performance measurements that you mentioned in your presentation. It's great to know that your office aims to build equity into every city, department, and program, and that you're doing that to ensure equity outcomes in each of those departments and programs. And you're measuring and analyzing for equity. And you mentioned that you've designed equity approaches, have developed rigorous performance measurements, and I'm wondering here, if you could provide us with an example. Because as I think about performance measurements, that that could run the gamut between numerical measurements to other, perhaps, not quantitative measurements. So, I wonder if you could provide some examples of performance measurements that some departments have adopted. And my question there is, how often are those performance measures looked at, analyzed, et cetera? How do you define success around those? I'll stop right there.

Darlene Flynn:

Yeah. I think that this is our... We've worked our way up to this learning edge. I think that in the beginning, we were trying to get people to think about their processes, decision-making, and analysis differently, and now that we have done some things that are different, and we now have to think about how are we going to measure the impacts of it. So, it's very developmental, and so I don't have any great examples, but I do know that our next thinking about that is that we're probably going to try and set up some mechanism that will follow up activities with a way for people to tell us how things are going.

Darlene Flynn:

There's one platform I'm investigating that is phone-based that permits people to give us inputs where we would be able to gather inputs, and I think a lot of what we need is qualitative information. That's what we don't have. It's easier to measure things that can be measured quantitatively, in some ways, but I think it's about... People's lives aren't better until they say their lives are better. It's not us deciding that their lives are better. It's them being able to demonstrate that their lives are better through their stories and through their progression in their lives. And this is the hardest kind of data to gather and to analyze. And right now, in COVID, it's particularly difficult. But even when we didn't have these constraints, it's very hard to get people who are all ready impacted by the struggles that come along with racial disparities to participate in town halls and the kinds of processes that we normally do, or even surveys, online surveys, and that kind of thing.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

- Darlene Flynn: But there are some more user-friendly tools that are coming online that are intentionally designed, where you actually engage community members in designing the questions, and then there's a platform in place for that data to go, and then the data can be analyzed. So, we're thinking that that's what departments need, because most of them don't have the capacity, right now, to follow up on all their actions. If it's a program, like a service program, human services program, they'll be able to build that kind of information gathering into the RFPs and RFQs, and we're working on doing that.
- Darlene Flynn: So, right now, we're looking at the Oakland Fund for Children and Youth. They're going to be going out with their new RFP next year for providers to provide children and youth services. Violence prevention is one of the platforms of that voter initiative. And so, we're looking at these areas, we're looking at the disparities that go with them, and we're going to work to design an RFP that drives better data collection about what the outcomes were. So, those are the easier places to do it, where we have captive audiences and we have agencies that can collect the data for us.
- Darlene Flynn: But for a lot of our things like the pavement plan, the equity payment plan, and the capital improvement plan, where the city has made extraordinary process in centering equity and decision-making and prioritization of projects, just in the last two years. It's a recent change, but it's completely different process now and completely different analytics used to decide. It's amazing. No other city has done anything like it, that I know of. But now, how do we go back and ascertain whether or not people's lives are better because of those investments that are being made in communities that have been historically disinvested? We don't have the tools for doing that. So, we're looking at some technology and tools that'll be user-friendly and user-driven, more user-driven, not so institutionally compatible, not what the institution doing it the way that would work for us, but having the community help us figure out what would work for them, which is also a hallmark of doing equity work is centering the community at every step of the way.
- Sergio Garcia: Thank you for that.
- Regina Jackson: So, I'd like to open it up to any of the other commissioners who might have questions before I jump back in. Thus far, I don't see hands raised. All right. Well, while we wait on those hands to be raised, is it okay to identify the three directors who have completed that training?
- Darlene Flynn: Yeah.
- Regina Jackson: Or at least the departments that they lead. Let me put it that way.
- Darlene Flynn: Yeah. Well, transportation, planning, and I added one because I was sure there was a third one but didn't have the director in my head [inaudible 00:09:33]. Because most of them that did it, did it a while ago. They did it early on. They hit the ground running with it. And so, I haven't seen any directors in there. And it has not been required of them. I have to say, for better or for worse, we didn't say, "You guys have to do this." We have brought it to them because we recognized that



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

that was the way to make sure they get it. Probably not the same as going through the longer training with other city staff. There's a real value to...

Darlene Flynn: I don't know that we're getting that value out of it now that we're doing it on Zoom. We resumed our trainings on Zoom. They don't feel the same to me. People are giving us good feedback on it, but it doesn't feel like we get the same level of engagement and interaction and learning from each other. It's just hard to do on Zoom. And we shortened it down, also. We've shortened the hours a little bit so that people don't have to sit on the Zoom so long. So, it's a little bit different.

Darlene Flynn: But yeah, I think we're going to see... Like we just hired a new director in animal control. I don't know what they call it. That's not probably the right word. Takes care of our pets. And she's super amped, and I think she wants to come to the training. We're going to see more directors coming into it. She's new to the city. I think, oftentimes, when directors come in new, they're especially open to finding the time before they get too crazy busy.

Regina Jackson: Yes. But it does seem challenging that, how can you create accountability if the training is not required?

Darlene Flynn: Well, because I'm there and because I do train them and I call them in all the time, and I'm a persistent irritant. I feel like I have good supportive relationships at this point with all the directors, and so they listened to me. And I can call them up, and I can say, "Look, you need to listen to your people." Because the model is that these equity teams will become their content experts in the department, so if they're not going to become experts, then they need to listen to the experts that were growing in their department. And most all the departments are doing that, that have equity teams, they're working quite well with their equity teams, I just have to say.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Well, that's-

Darlene Flynn: Surprisingly good. Yeah. That's why they have those teams. Those are their content experts.

Regina Jackson: Okay. So, we have another hand up by Commissioner Dorado, and I'm trying to unmute you Commissioner Dorado. There we go.

Jose Dorado: All right. Thank you, Chair Jackson. Good seeing you, Darlene.

Darlene Flynn: Good to hear you. Yeah. It's been awhile.

Jose Dorado: Yeah. Thank you for all your work, you and your team. You're doing just wonderful. Wonderful, hard work that absolutely needs to be done, as you well know. One of the things that I... or a number of things that I heard you say in the presentation was some words that are near and dear to my heart: community organizing. Having the community determine what resources are needed, having the community determine what success looks like, et cetera. So, as I see things, and with a number of hats, number of lenses, one of them is community policing, and by that I



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

mean, and you were kind enough to come and present to our neighbor council back some time ago and we appreciated that, but looking it through the community policing lens and a neighborhood council lens. To me, there's a direct correlation between what you just presented and having that go out to the community via the neighborhood services coordinators that are going to be soon to be under the city administrator's office, and the community resource officers, so that you're directly impacting the neighbor councils that have been around for now over 24 years.

Jose Dorado: And I'm not going to go into a rant about the failure of community policing, but that's a long time for that structure and that potential networking, down to the block level, to exist without having a real education around these issues via the city. Obviously, you're a city department and a city resource. So, it's a long way of saying that along with the department violence prevention and, shall I dare say, the more progressive neighborhood councils, there can and should be a real nexus between your department and presentation of the important issues that you bring up and, obviously, the work that Director [inaudible 01:47:18] is doing in DVP to have that go down, if I could use that word, down to the neighborhood and block level in a real substantive way, again, via the neighborhood services coordinators and the community resource officers. So, I guess my question really is, has that begun to happen, or have you formulated a strategy for doing that? Because that's certainly inside, outside-

Darlene Flynn: Definitely.

Jose Dorado: ... inside, outside strategy that you've been talking about. So, I wanted to make that connection. It also, we've got a dynamic new chair of the community policing advisory board that would be-

Darlene Flynn: Yes, I've heard. Yeah.

Jose Dorado: ... that would be another, can and should be, and will be I think, another part of this whole effort to really bring these connections together. So, it's a long way of saying, have you thought about doing this, and if so, what are your thoughts?

Darlene Flynn: So much. There is a natural connection, and where these natural connections occur, there is more spontaneous momentum and connecting. And so, I've had a great time getting to know Guillermo [inaudible 00:01:48:49], and he's... I just so believe in his work, and I think it is so connected to all the concerns of the commission and across the city. And he brings some amazing technology and frameworks of his own, and so I've really gotten a connection with him and have.... We've done a little bit of strategizing together. He's trying to stand his department up, and I know it's been about a year now, that first year for a new department is super crazy, I know, because it's not that long ago that I went through it. And I think he's just beginning to get his traction now. Not that he hasn't done things, but really get the traction, because he should have a city-wide impact.

Darlene Flynn: The thing about safety and violence prevention is that it's so much more than policing. It has to be more than policing. If policing was the solution, all of the resources that we've poured into the flat



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

lands would have made more of a difference. I'm just going to say that. And so, it's got to be more than policing, and it's also got to be about policing differently, which is where community policing comes in. And I think the NCPCs are holding up the community and of that, but I'm not sure we've done all the transformation work that we need to do internally around community policings. And most departments haven't because it just has not been a completely welcomed concept in the traditional policing environments.

Darlene Flynn: So, this is really an area that, I probably said this when I was there, that I really think the city, and in this case it does mean the Police Department, has to let community policing shape its policing model much more profoundly than it has to date. And we'll get success from that. I believe that the model will work. The model does work where it has been tried. It's a total culture shift, and that doesn't happen overnight, so that's where the equity work in the Police Department could help figure out how to get that culture shift to happen in a Police Department.

Darlene Flynn: And then, of course the whole support staff for the NCPCs being shifted to another place, and we're in transition and there's a lot of internal, right now, focusing on the technicalities of moving employees from one department to another department and working with the unions and all the things that go along with that right now. And that's good. Those are the steps we go through when we do these things. So, I don't think we're going to really get in more deeply into that until after the first of the year, when I think that change will be effected, sometime in January. But I've already met with them, with Joe DeVries about what we can do to bring...

Darlene Flynn: I think the way we'll introduce this is to do a racial equity impact analysis of the program and actually talk to people about it and actually figure out where it needs to grow and how it needs to change and how it can support and further community policing in a more active way. And all of those things will be on the table after the first of the year. And Joe signed on, he said, "Yeah, let's do it." So, we know that's going to be a discussion, and I'm really looking forward to it.

Jose Dorado: If I can just follow up, Chair Jackson. As always, I think that the key word in the community policing resolution 79235 is the empowerment of the neighborhoods, and I interpret that to being grassroots organizing at a block level. So, if in fact folks began to understand not only should they be organized at a block level, but it should be anti-racist, it should be disaster preparedness, it should be.

Darlene Flynn: Inclusive.

Jose Dorado: ... et cetera.

Darlene Flynn: It needs be included. You haven't done a job until you've got all the sectors of a neighborhood represented. That's right.

Jose Dorado: From that will come the measurements you're talking about, the successes that we're all going to see, but it has to go back down to, and this is where I've been disappointed in OPD and the city



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

over the years, is that they haven't done enough block by block organizing. Absolutely has to be done to empower the neighborhoods.

Darlene Flynn: Yeah. And the reason for that is that that's not what police departments see is their job, so that's why there needs to be a culture shift in the Police Department, too, because it is certainly the block by block organizing, but it's also the way, then, the Police Department, the officers themselves, interface with that. So, it's again, it's inside, outside.

Jose Dorado: Indeed. So, I'll be real interested to see and to hear how your sessions go in OPD, and I personally will be taking a real keen interest in how that affects the culture shift that needs to happen so, in fact, they are the guardians of the community, as they should be. So, thanks again for your work. It's really appreciated.

Darlene Flynn: Thank you for your support.

Regina Jackson: So, Darlene, I wanted to ask a question. You mentioned that the flood gates start taking flight when you have 20 to 30% of the leadership population actually investing time and work, what would you consider the percentages at right now?

Darlene Flynn: I knew you were going to ask me for a number. I don't know.

Regina Jackson: You knew I was going to do it.

Darlene Flynn: I know you were going to do it. And that's the thing about that kind of science. So, that's system change theory, that comes out of actually studying, retrospectively studying, where a tipping point has happened, where tipping point of change has happened. It's really hard to measure it while you're doing it, but I do think that as long as we keep striving for these benchmarks, as long as we keep pushing it forward, oftentimes we don't know exactly when that tipping point of change is going to happen because what's a little like exponential growth with the pandemic. It has to do with the conditions around the pandemic, whether or not we're wearing a mask, how often we're going out. I mean, it has to do with all of these things. And while we can predict the pattern that the pandemic will follow, because actually the theory is based on, believe it or not, public health and infectious disease, the thinking was modeled after that.

Darlene Flynn: So, we can't predict the exact moment that we're going to hit these benchmarks. We can see that we are moving toward, in the case of a real pandemic, these crisis points. And in the case of this kind of work where we can see ourselves moving toward these events that show us that we've got activity going on in every department, this activity is resulting in product, actual outputs... We don't know if the outputs are great yet, but we know we're doing something different. And we are getting close to the place where we're going to have that be the true story for all of our departments. I think that's going to be a major milestone for us, and that energy is and does feed off of each other, at the leadership level, and also, like I said, at the peer level. People are finding each other and get together in the ranks. And I think that we will keep our eye on that.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

- Darlene Flynn: I mean, I just don't even know how to put a number on it, but I can tell you the difference between when I got here and now is profoundly different, the tone of my work. My biggest challenge now is that I have a snowball chasing me, and it's going to run over the top of me. The demand is just skyrocketing. In Lean, they call it pull. So, Lean has a similar theory, Lean management systems... management theory. I have a good friend who's a Lean practitioner, and she calls it pull. And when you start to have pull, you start to actually be overwhelmed with the amount of activity that's going on, and it gets a little chaotic for a minute, and we're in that phase now. That is not zero. That is somewhere on its way to 30%, for sure. I'm certain of it.
- Darlene Flynn: I think the big question for me right now... I mean, I think that tipping point could be quite close for the city of Oakland. And again, when we hit the tipping point, that doesn't mean we're done doing the work. That's just when people, I think on the outside, will be able to feel it more, and people on the inside will definitely be able to feel it. We'll definitely feel it. It'll be like instead of swimming against the current, we're swimming with the current, and we'll be able to point to the things that exemplify that. And like I've already mentioned a few, these projects and these tools are being applied spontaneously without us being there to instigate it. That is a very important benchmark, when the kernels start popping on their own, and that is starting to happen. And once that starts to happen, it does cost more to happen. It heats up the environment, and it picks up speed.
- Darlene Flynn: So, I think that I have good indicators that we are well along the way. We have traction, and each bit of traction that we get exponentially impacts the momentum. So, I just feel like Oakland's going to get there. I think the thing that I'm worried about right now is what this economic downturn is going to do to our ability to sustain the same pace. And we just don't know yet. I mean, we really just don't know what the impacts are going to be on our city, but we do know and have shared with the public that we're looking down a very hard road. And we don't know how it's going to play out.
- Darlene Flynn: It could turn out not to be so hard if the new administration at the federal level can come through in a different way. I mean, there could be things that could turn it around quickly, I think, or relatively quickly, and not set us back too much. But if we go into a full-blown recession of the magnitude and impacts of the last one, which came on more slowly but went deep, if this goes deep like that, it's going to slow down a little. It just is. It's extra work. It's extra work while we're learning to do it. It will cut our work in the future. It will make less work in the future, but on the front end, it is extra work.
- Regina Jackson: Yes. And to your point, Oakland has a history of being racially unequal and inequitable, and we still see it in some of our hiring practices and promotions. I mean, we see [inaudible 01:59:39] and I don't think that we're all going to see the kind of traction and movement just via invitation. I mean, literally, there's got to be a paradigm shift, a culture, if that is... Mandatory is the best way I can think about it, that people need to not have a choice to opt out.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

Darlene Flynn: Yeah. And ultimately, they won't, and we're putting more and more things in place to pull people in. So, in the beginning, we were working with the willing and those who are ready to change, or ready to learn, a new way. And now we're starting to put in what I call prompts in some of our infrastructure. So, this year... And we haven't completely gotten everybody working through it in the way we want them to, but we will, we're tracking it. We put a new prompt in the city council report that says that in the analysis section, people need to address what kind of equity analysis they did in order to come into the recommendation that they're bringing to the city council, and if they didn't, they need to explain why they didn't and that sort of thing.

Darlene Flynn: And before, it was just like a little two sentence thing at the bottom, there wasn't any need to share your analytical work or how you approached it, or what your equity thinking was. You just had to say whether or not it had an impact or something like that toward the end of the report. We've pulled it up to the analysis section, and we've just trained people on it. And what it's doing is causing people to realize that they're not doing their equity work, and they get to the point where they have to take something to council and they have a problem, at least a tension. We haven't put a big stick over the top of that yet, but what the job is, is to keep track of how people are doing> We will bring it back up again if it doesn't start happening.

Darlene Flynn: So, that's a prompt. That's a hard prompt. That's like a, "Right here, your work is supposed to show up right here." And it's causing some consternation in those areas that are not as far along, but we're there to help them come along. So, now, we'll give them a chance to come along, and we'll... It's push, pull. It's a little bit of this, a little bit of that. And the other thing we're doing right now is we're working on a budget equity tool. The CIP equity tool has all ready been developed, and it's being refined, and we're staying with it and doing it again. We're going to use it again. The work has all ready started [inaudible 00:02:02:04], not the community outreach has all ready started. They've got many more inputs from the community, and they focused on the areas of the city that didn't participate last time. They did targeted outreach, and it has worked.

Darlene Flynn: So, we're doing the CIP now, we're going to try and bring some equity analysis to the general fund. And that's not as easy as the CIP. The CIP has these categories of assets and so on. It's easy to put them in buckets. It's just easier to work with those kinds of projects. There aren't as many of them. The operating budget, or the general fund budget, is much more complicated. So, it's a different approach. We can't just replicate what we did on the CIP, but we're doing three trainings, we're going to have drop-in hours, and we've given them a... or we're about to roll out a toolkit.

Darlene Flynn: This is really a heavy lift in the current environment because people are not in good shape about finance to start with and about budgeting. We're not in the same enviable position we were in a year or two where our financial situation had changed for the better, really. I mean, we weren't rolling in it, but we were no longer in a financial crisis. And now we're back in a financial crisis. So, it's going to be tough, but we're doing it anyway because we must try to pay attention to equity, and maybe even more so when we're tightening our belts. So, we're working hard, we've got good infrastructure set up to support people to do it, and we will see how far we get. But we're



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

starting to do those more tangible, universal actions that are strong signals that we're all in this, people.

- Regina Jackson: Well, to that point, Darlene, given the stretch, then you still only have three people, I was hoping that your department might double given how much work is necessary inside the city of Oakland. And obviously, with the budget downfall, can't do that.
- Darlene Flynn: They actually added a position. I don't know if you know this, but I did get a position.
- Regina Jackson: A fourth?
- Darlene Flynn: Yeah, I got a fourth, but the position's been frozen.
- Regina Jackson: A fourth?
- Darlene Flynn: Yeah, I got a fourth, but the position has been frozen, because of the budget crisis. So, I'm probably not going to get it now. We were just about to start the hiring process, when COVID hit us. And I kind of knew it was a possibility we were going to end up in this situation. What this does is it gives me a budget cut that won't cut into my existing staff. We'll be able to give back that money to help balance the budget in the short term. And it doesn't mean the position will go away though. They're going to let me keep the FTE, but I won't keep the funding for now.
- Regina Jackson: No, I get it. So, let me ask another question. You mentioned that you are looking for, I presume it's a graduate student to deal with the data, so that you can update the report card. Is that correct?
- Darlene Flynn: That's right. They [inaudible 02:04:50] need to have data analytics.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. I want to try and help find that person. I could send some feelers, if you have a narrative of the "Project".
- Darlene Flynn: We do.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. So, if you would email that to me, then I can send it to a few people, and see what we can do, because at the very least that does need to be updated, even if we're going backwards. I mean, what we certainly know in the pandemic-
- Darlene Flynn: We want to know.
- Regina Jackson: And people when they're vulnerable, they are uglier than they might normally be. So, look, I see a commissioner Smith's hand is up. So, I want to give him an opportunity to ask his question. Commissioner Smith, you've been un-muted.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Hi, Darlene. Pleasure to meet you. I was actually going to say the same thing. The chair just stole my thunder. I was going to say clear earlier this year I was elected to the Harvard Kennedy school of government, their global alumni board. And I think I can probably help to connect you, if you're interested, with maybe a master's in public policy student. I think I can try to connect you maybe with someone over there. So, I-
- Regina Jackson: You got it Thomas.
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: No, no, we can do it together and see.-
- Regina Jackson: No, no, no. You go ahead. Thank you.
- Darlene Flynn: The more the merrier, because here's the tricky thing. We like to have somebody who's interested in public policy, and getting the combination of public policy and data analytics can be hard, because a lot of people that go on to get a master's to be in public policy don't necessarily have deep analytics, the data, you know ...
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: The Harvard program is super quantitative.
- Darlene Flynn: Is it? Okay. We were supposed to work with Goldman school in Berkeley. So, they're different, it's true.
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: I will reach out to you and make sure that I can get the information and then both Regina and I can look out. Who knows, maybe you'll end up with more resources than you need.
- Regina Jackson: How about that?
- Darlene Flynn: Nothing wrong with that.
- Regina Jackson: Yeah. That's awesome. Thomas, thank you for offering, and again, kudos on that leadership responsibility. So, while I'm waiting for any other questions to come from other commissioners, I have one key question of you. Another one. How receptive is the police department to the training?
- Darlene Flynn: Well, it depends on who's in the room. Just like any place else. I mean, the police department is a subset of our society, and there are people who are very open to it. And there are people that find it very, very difficult to grapple with.
- Regina Jackson: How about leadership? Because-
- Darlene Flynn: Yeah, it varies as well. And you know, that 25-30% for the tipping point. We hope to have that across the organization. So, some of it will be in leadership and some of it will be in the rank and



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

file. And some of it will be in the non-sworn areas of the department. We want a good mix in that activated quadrat. And I am confident we're going to be able to find it in the police department.

Darlene Flynn: There are plenty of people in there, who have been waiting for space to have this conversation. Then, what we do is we leverage, their relationships and their influence within the organization to find more. And my biggest success story, and I'm sure he gets tired of me talking about him. But a big key to getting this, which started in the police department was Fred Dorado.

Darlene Flynn: Lieutenant Shavies came to the Academy, and after one of the classes, he came up to me, he was in the training department at the time, he's now over at homicide. But at the time he was in the training department and he came to me and he said, "I want to bring these training into the police department." And I said, "I want to bring this training into the police department too. Would you train it with me?" Fully expecting him to say "Hecks no." And Fred said, "Of course I will." And he was my training partner.

Darlene Flynn: And that made all the difference. Even with the skeptical folks, to have a uniformed officer co-training with me. That is something that's particular to that culture. I respect it. They know that I don't know what it means to try to do the work that they do, and they're right.

Darlene Flynn: And I actually have that attitude toward any department. I don't know how to run a transportation department, and how to build transportation infrastructure. I don't know that. My expertise is equity. So, that's why I need those equity teams, and I need leadership in the department besides the director, helping to lead this work. And he stepped into that position and is an incredible trainer, it turns out, and is quite comfortable with these concepts. He's amazing. And he's a natural leader and I've come to find out that that's just, that's who he is in the department.

Darlene Flynn: So, I was very lucky. It would not have gone as well without him. It would have been much more difficult, because I have a legitimacy problem in the department. And it's born out of facts. And that is that I do not in fact know what it means to do that work.

Regina Jackson: I totally agree with you. Lieutenant Shavies is one of a kind and pretty outstanding, and we're fortunate to have him inside the police department, especially in a leadership capacity. So, I'm glad that you have found your partner, your co-host in this work, because-

Darlene Flynn: To his credit, he found me. And he brought it in back to the leadership. He brought it back to the leadership and so on and so forth, and that's how it unfolded. So, and that really that's the same model we use everywhere. I try to get people in the department standing up for this work, advocating for this work, advancing this work. So that I can step back, because those folks inside do have more legitimacy and more knowledge about how to apply this to their work. So, he helped convene the equity team. There was a small group that came out of that training and said, "Yes, we will be the first members of the team." And then the plan was to continue to build that



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

team out. So, that's where we are. I think that's where we'll pick it up, once we get our feet back on the ground.

Regina Jackson: Excellent. I have another hand up from Commissioner Dorado, Commissioner Dorado. You've been un-muted.

Jose Dorado: Thank you, Chair Jackson. Just a quick FYI. Yeah, we do have some really wonderful people in OPD, but we have some that are not so wonderful. So, just an FYI, we're having an ongoing conversation and including our chair with the chief, the interim chief around white supremacy, white supremacists within OPD. We made it clear that we do believe that they are there.

Darlene Flynn: I think they're in every police department. I think that was [inaudible 02:11:37].

Jose Dorado: Yes. I think that's absolutely true. And we also want to know what connections there are with those inside the department with a white supremacists that are in and around Oakland, individuals and groups. So, that's an ongoing conversation, just an FYI to you. So, that's just part of my interest in the progress of the training that you'll have with OPD.

Darlene Flynn: And that's an important conversation. I mean, it's important that we look at those things and that we think about them and figure out what to do about that in the interim. The goal ultimately is to have a culture where people that actually ascribed to those worldviews would fit in so poorly that they would just not be there. We're not there yet, but that's what we're working for, because obviously there's the whole ... People talk a lot about the bad apples and we could be talking about the bad apples right now. Maybe that's what we're referring to. But I always say, "Yeah, but a system that is healthy and is grounded in justice will spit out a bad apple. It will spit it out." And that doesn't mean it'll necessarily fire them, but it will spit it out one way or another. So, we want to definitely get to the place where it would not be the dynamic in a department, but it'll take a while. So, in the meanwhile, the questions that you're asking are important ones.

Jose Dorado: Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Terrific. Well, Darlene, I don't see any more questions from the commissioners. I know that we do have one hand up for public comments. So, if you will hold tight, we will go to that. Actually we have a couple of hands now. I so appreciate your time with us and hope that you will come back again and again, so that we can understand how best to support you, as you tackle this ominous, ominous job, that we know that you will be successful in.

Darlene Flynn: Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Certainly. So Mr. Rus.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam chair.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Certainly, thank you.
- Juanito Rus: If any member of the public would like to make comment on this item, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue, and you'll be called in the order in which your hands are raised. The first-hand in the queue is Kevin Cantu. Evening Mr. Cantu, can you hear us?
- Kevin Cantu: Yup. Hello again. I just wanted to say that this has been a spectacular session. I've loved every minute of it. It's been a pleasure to be able to listen in. Thank you for coming.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Cantu. I apologize. I didn't start the timer, but thank you for taking the time. The next speaker in the queue is Rashidah Grinage. Good evening, Ms. Grinage can you hear us?
- Rashidah Grinage: Yes. Thank you. Darlene, thank you very much for the presentation. I know that the last federal court conference, there was a discussion about your role with Chief Manheimer and Mayor Shell in addressing the grievances about racial discrimination within the police department, based on the black police officers, letter of grievance. I'm wondering if you can enlighten us as to what the progress is on your work with that team, and what you will be reporting to Judge Orrick in February. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Grinage.
- Darlene Flynn: Is it okay for me to just respond a little?
- Regina Jackson: Yeah. If you will, that will be great. And then we'll go back to public comment. Thank you.
- Darlene Flynn: Well, the work that was done by the police department by OPD. So, what happened, for the rest of the audience, is that black police officers, through the plaintiff's attorney, under the negotiated settlement, encouraged the court to require the department to do a disparity study about discipline outcomes in OPD. My role in that was relatively small. What I did was, and what I am still doing is, serving on a steering committee for that study. So, I'm not leading it through my methodology. I didn't frame it. What we did was we did your typical RFP process. We hired a consulting group to do the study. We scoped their work. We worked on them with the scope, and then they went off and did their work, and then they brought back a report. The report was revealing and did tell us some things that we were not surprised to hear, but documented some concerns, but didn't necessarily have everything that we would have liked, because we couldn't actually find a consultant that had done this kind of study before. So they were feeling their way into it too. I think their intentions were good, but ...
- Darlene Flynn: So now we're trying to figure out how to implement their recommendations, and simultaneously fill in some of the gaps with some further exploration. So, that steering committee has continued to convene. It is convened under the chief's office supervision, and is led by one of her deputy chiefs. And it was led by a different one before, and he has gone on to be a police chief



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

somewhere else. So, it's been handed off. And I'm serving as an advisor, and I'm on the steering committee.

Darlene Flynn: And what they're looking at now is implementation of the recommendations. I believe that what they're going to do is be able to report, and again, I'm not the one reporting back. This is the police chiefs. This is the police chief's project, responding to the court. And I'm there as an advisor, and did get to speak my mind, but I didn't lead it.

Darlene Flynn: So, I have to defer to her about what she's going to report in February. I do know that we have another meeting coming. It's been a while since our last meeting. We meet periodically, but not super frequently. And in the meanwhile they're working on their implementation steps. And the goal for me, ... I'll tell you what I advised them. Implement the low-hanging fruit, implement the recommendations that the consultants gave you. None of them are beyond our ability to implement, in my opinion. There may be people inside the department that disagree with me. So let's get busy implementing them. Then let's go deeper on the, on what's behind it, the cultural pieces that are behind it, and figure out what else needs to happen. Because I don't think that that, that report or those recommendations are the end-all and be-all. But they're a start. And we should, we should definitely capitalize on what we learned through that study.

Darlene Flynn: Then we will also be able to pull it apart a little bit and look at some different pieces of it through a different lens. It would be more of the approach I would recommend. But that's not what was asked for it. What was asked for was a disparity study. So, that's what we got. That's what we did. But I want to circle back on it with the equity team, and look at, so what does this mean at the culture level? And what other things can we do besides just fiddling with the discipline process? Because I think there's more to it than that. That's what I know, and, and we'll have to wait for the teacher to find out what she's going to report.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Darlene.

Darlene Flynn: It's good work.

Regina Jackson: That's very helpful. Back to you Mr. Rus.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. Madam Chair. The next speaker in the queue is Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?

Assata Olugbala: Yes, I can. Thank you. All right. I'm trying to get to the bottom of what went on with the parks and rec advisory board, developing a plan that dealt with the African-Americans around the Lake, and you were called in miss, to determine some strategies around the issue of race. I couldn't understand from reading the minutes, what was the issue, and I'm questioning why this was done behind closed doors. Why this issue around Lake Merritt didn't come to council, rather than having it being done by an advisory board who did not have any jurisdiction over policing, over vending, over parking, over trafficking. It was like they wanted to hide the fact that they had an



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

issue concerning African-Americans around Lake Merritt. You were called in. What was your role around supposedly solving this problem? And why was it done behind closed doors, and not publicly at council?

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala.

Darlene Flynn: Well, it was public. It wasn't before council, at least my role, my part in it was public. I came to a meeting when there was a flashpoint, and a lot of ... I'm not sure exactly why I was called in. I didn't have a major role. It was in the parks department's jurisdiction, because it was at Lake Merritt. So, that's why it went to the PRAC, and the PRAC are members of the public. But what had happened in the community was there had been some conversation that was highly tinged with some lack of, what sounded to me like lack of awareness about the equity issues that were at play at Lake Merritt. So, I came in and spoke for probably five minutes about how African-Americans access to Lake Merritt was an equity issue, and how I wanted to ... And I was asked to say that to the PRAC, to the park advisory committee, I'm sure I don't have that ... Parks and recreation advisory committee, probably.

Darlene Flynn: And they wanted me to come in and frame up the equity issues. So, I did it in a very high level way. There was not an equity analysis done. This was a fast moving. It was weekend to weekend, right? The city was managing the situations and the interfaces at Lake Merritt. So, my involvement was limited to come in and say, "Look, people, you need to think about the history of race and racism and displacement and public spaces." So, I got to tell them that this is an important equity issue, and the problem needed to be solved in a way that took into consideration, the history of the treatment of black people around Lake Merritt, and in the city in general. And the history of access to usable high quality open space. Which is much different at Lake Merritt, than it is in [inaudible 02:22:31].

Darlene Flynn: So I made those kinds of remarks. That was my involvement. And I can't tell you exactly why it never went to city council, except I think it was handled more as a management, park management issue. That of course did involve the police department, but also the parks department making some decisions. The parts department was having to make decisions, and special events was involved, and the city administrator's office. All the right players were at the table. And I was there saying "We can't disenfranchise ... It's important that we work to not, once again, disenfranchise African-Americans from this space."

Darlene Flynn: And I held that space. And in fact, not everything that went down was great, at all, but some meaningful compromises and programmatic responses were put together. But I can't really take credit for them. I just held that space. And you can't just act like there's not something else going on. That was my role. And I think it helped, but we have a lot more work to do. And I acknowledge that. So, does everybody who was working on it.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Darlene. Mr. Rus.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

- Juanito Rus: Thank you Madam Chair. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee, with the last four digits, zero one eight five. Good evening, zero one eight five. Can you hear us?
- Michele Lazaneo: I'm the spokesperson for the Bandabaila family. Last week, Chief Manheimer's response to us was "Our missing persons, and all of our investigative units are woefully understaffed. We've had to shift around a lot of our positions over to homicide, and the types of significant and complex investigation, so that we can do due justice, for those who've lost their lives."
- Michele Lazaneo: Missing persons deserve due justice. As much as homicide victims. In missing persons cases, there is the opportunity to save a life, whereas in a homicide investigation, you're solving a crime, bringing justice for a family for the loss of a life, and making the city safer. 100 homicides, 16 staff, including seven officers, 1,523 missing persons, only two police officers.
- Michele Lazaneo: Further disparity data. An uptown walking detail to protect shoppers, receives \$800,000 a year, yet missing persons gets 400,000. Spending twice as much protecting shoppers as investigating missing persons, that is not equity. Seven years of under staffing-
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Ms. [crosstalk 02:25:07]-
- Michele Lazaneo: Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Your time has expired. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Natasha. Good evening. Natasha, can you hear us?
- Natasha Baker: Hi. Yes. I'm Natasha Baker, a resident of Oakland. I have two points. I wanted to first mention that since the equity factors that were worse, or many of them, sorry, six of the worst factors were related to law enforcement. I don't think it should come as a surprise to anyone when [inaudible 02:25:41] budget goes to policing, and less than 1% goes to race and equity. So, that shouldn't be surprising to any of us, right? What we fund is what we get. And related to that, I wanted to alert the commission to data that just came out from the prison policy initiative, regarding the impact of our policing nature on COVID rates, and that as a result of our failure to decarcerate and our penchant for incarceration, there have been an additional 2,500 confirmed cases among the general population, because of our penchant for incarceration. So, that's an equity issue as well. And I wanted to alert the commission to that data that just came out.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Natasha. The next speaker in the queue is Mr. John Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. Can you hear us?
- John Bey: Yes, sir. I can. Are you able to hear me? We can hear you. Whenever you're ready. Thank you. It's just another example of data supporting the fact that OPD is falling down on the job continuously. What I like to refer to as the "Triumvirate of debauchery", the mayor's office, and city administrator, with the city attorney's office, supporting the wrongdoing of OPD, Oakland will never get out of the situation it's in. We have a police commission, we have this race and equity,



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

yet OPD still can't satisfy coming up on 18 years of federal oversight through the NSA that they supposedly agreed to go into for reform. So, they can't meet NSA from 2003. How are they going to police equitably in 2020? And what Michelle said about the missing persons is disgusting. It's despicable. So, there's no way they needed an additional \$15 million, over the allotted \$15 million of overtime.-

Juanito Rus: Thank you. Mr Bey, your time has expired.

John Bey: Thank you. I'm finished. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: At this time, seeing no further hands in the queue, Madam Chair, I return the meeting to you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. On behalf of the entire police commission and the community, I have to echo one of the first citizens who said that this was an outstanding presentation, from beginning to end. And thank you for taking all of our questions. Like I said, I want to have you back, and really want to be so much more supportive of your work. We have a lot to do. And I hope that the leadership of Oakland understands it. And, I'm expecting that measurements and outcomes will show up in performance evaluations one day, so that people understand it's really serious business. But having said that, Darlene, thank you so much for your subject matter expertise and your commitment to Oakland. It is absolutely a shining example of what Oakland deserves and what Oakland should be all about all the time.

Darlene Flynn: Thank you for your service, all of you. And it's my privilege to have been here with you this evening. So, I'm happy to come back.

Regina Jackson: Absolutely. Thank you so much. Happy holidays to you.

Darlene Flynn: Likewise.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. So, with that outstanding training and presentation, I will be happy to receive a motion to adjourn this meeting.

Regina Jackson: Okay. So, I think I heard Commissioner Smith move, and then maybe Commissioner Harbin Forte second. Is that-

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Correct.

Regina Jackson: Okay, excellent. I'm getting good at the voices. Okay. So, it has been moved and seconded. We've already taken public comment. May we vote please? Commissioner Harbin Forte.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 17, 2020

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia.

Sergio Garcia: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Gage.

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Smith.

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.

Regina Jackson: And yes, for myself. It is now 08:59. Thank you all. Happy holidays to you all. And we will see you in the new year.

Jose Dorado: Stay safe everybody.

Juanito Rus: Enjoy.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Rus. Thank you Mr. Alden. Everybody, you guys be safe.