



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

Regina Jackson: Thank you. So, welcome everyone to a special meeting of the Oakland Police Commission for October 22nd, 2020. It is 5:33PM. I am your chair, Regina Jackson, and I'd like to call this meeting to order.

Regina Jackson: Next, we will call for attendance to establish our quorum. Mr. Rus, can you update the slide please? Thank you. Commissioner Harbin-Forte.

Brenda Harbin-Forte.: I'm here.

Regina Jackson: Very good, thank you. Commissioner Gage.

Henry Gage, III: Present.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado.

Jose Dorado: Presente.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Smith?

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Present.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Present.

Regina Jackson: Excellent and welcome.

Sergio Garcia: Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Certainly. Alternate commissioner David Jordan said that he was going to be absent tonight, and hopefully commissioner Singleton will be able to join us later, but I am present and we do have a quorum. So, from here, we are going to call for a public comment on the closed session items. Mr. Rus, take it away.

John Alden: I can take that, Madame Chair. It's John Alden.

Regina Jackson: Sorry, Mr. Alden. My apologies. You just told me you were going to do it.

John Alden: Not a problem at all. Just so the public understands, Mr. Rus and I will switch off on this job a little bit tonight. It is a long meeting. So, for those of you who are members of the public who would like to speak on the closed session items that are agendized tonight, now is your opportunity. Make sure that you raise your hand in the queue and we'll call on you in the order in which you appear there. Madame Chair, it appears we have two speakers, so I will begin the clock. Give me just a moment. There we go. Our first speaker in the queue is calling in from a phone number that



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

ends with 0501. 0501, you are un-muted on our end. If you unmute your phone, you can begin wherever you'd like.

Gene Hazzard: Before you start my time, how many minutes we get? Five minutes?

John Alden: One.

Gene Hazzard: One? Wait a minute. Hold it. See, that is unconscionable. You got two speakers. We get one minute. We should at least have two minutes. See, that's the way you stifle public input.

Regina Jackson: Mr. Alden, since we have-

John Alden: Yes?

Regina Jackson: ... numbers of speakers, we can do two minutes tonight. Thank you.

John Alden: Okay.

Gene Hazzard: Thank you, Mr. Alden. Thank you, Madame Chair. This is Gene Hazzard. I'd like to express my displeasure with the two new commissioners, because that selection process was terrible. You got commissioners who've never been at a Commission meeting. And then, we also see the two additional members, Mr. Hall, and Mr. Jackson, and the mayor pull the item for their approval by the council Tuesday. Why? Because of the dark side of Mr. Hall. And Mr. Jackson is the chair of the Public Ethics Commission, where is he going to find the time? And you talk about the amount of work that's being required on this body. I don't think Mrs. Harris ever missed a meeting in the three years. And if she did, it may have been one or two. You got commissioners not being present as she continues to work way beyond what's required because she's dedicated.

Gene Hazzard: This is unconscionable. I really... And I don't know how much work you're all going to get done in the days and weeks and months, and you sit here with these four new persons. I hope the mayor should remove Mr. Jackson for consideration. Gosh, there's no way unless he's been removed from the Public Ethics Commission. And you got all these folks out here and you're going to get somebody who's already engaged with a high intensity commission. Come on. Unless it's designed to stop the work of the-

John Alden: Thank you, Mr. Hazzard. Your time's expired, I'll lower your hand in the queue. We'll go to our next speaker, which appears to be Ms. Assata Olugbala. Ms. Olugbala, you're unmuted on our end. Go ahead and start when you like.

Assata Olugbala: Yes. So, taking into consider the request that I'm going to ask questions, but I do not want answers from this body because I don't respect [inaudible 00:10:18]. But my question is to myself and to the public. How is it that Mr. Smith, whose term expired on October 16th of 2020, sitting tonight as a member of the commission? He is no longer a member of the commission. The same thing happened last year with another commissioner whose term expired October of 2019, and



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

that person sat on the commission until the Summer. So, there needs to be some order of correctness and legality to how you go about having commissioners seated.

- Assata Olugbala: Having said that, the fact that we have two supposed commissioners that are being seated, who did not go through a process that was legitimate, that targeted Ms. Harris, that sit on this body in a non-legitimate way and consciously they should be reflecting on the fact that they didn't get there in a proper manner. And anybody with any amount of credibility should want to say something about the fact that the system didn't work correctly, so I'm being seated in a way that didn't allow for credibility. Historically, October the 15th of 2019, the courts found that the city council committed voter fraud. Who participated in that legal action to stop the vote? The NACP and the Latino Education Network. What an embarrassment during this time of how we have the importance of voting if we have these-
- John Alden: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. I'm sorry but your time has expired. Madame Chair, I believe those are all of the speakers we have in the queue with regards to closed session items.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much, Mr. Alden. I want to say that during the public comment on the closed session, our newest commissioner Singleton was promoted to the panelist. So, I'd just like to, for the record, reflect her attendance. Commissioner Singleton, are you here?
- Tyfahra Singleton: Yes, I am.
- Regina Jackson: Excellent. Thank you very much. So, before we adjourn to closed session, we're going to announce the topics of the closed session and we've already gone to public comment, but the Commission's closed session topics this evening are as follows. First, conference with labor negotiator per government code 54957.6a. Second, public employees' discipline, dismissal, release per government code 54597. With that, commissioners, I invite you to join us in a closed session, and then once completed we will come back to the same link and report out and begin our Commission meeting. Are there any questions?
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. Hearing none, we will leave this Zoom link to go to our closed session meeting link and we will be back hopefully by 6:30. Thank you so much.
- Regina Jackson: Closed session report. There are no reportable items. So, we can move forward to the next agenda item, please?
- John Alden: Yes, ma'am. The next item is item six, welcome purpose and open forum/public comment.
- Regina Jackson: Correct. So, if you can go ahead and engage the public so that we can hear the comments, that would be terrific. At this five minutes, it looks like there are only two people. As long as it doesn't go over 10, I think it's fine to go ahead and do the two minutes that people have been asking for, especially when we have lower numbers of speakers.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- John Alden: Okay, very well. So, members of the public, we are back from closed session, as you just heard. Now's the time to provide comments during the open forum/public comment part of our meeting. If you'd like to speak, raise your hand and we'll call on you in the order in which you appear in our queue here in Zoom. It appears we still have those same four speakers. As the chair just mentioned, we'll be doing two minutes apiece. I'm going to prepare the clock.
- John Alden: Okay, our first speaker in the queue is calling in from a phone number listed as 0185. 0185, you're un-muted on our end. Go ahead and unmute yourself on your end. You can begin whenever you like.
- Michele Lazaneo: This is Michele Lazaneo, spokesperson for the van DiBella family. On the corner of 18th and Telegraph is a mural titled Where Have Our Children Gone, Bay Area's Missing Black Youth. It includes 34 names. Four are unsolved OPD missing persons cases, including Jonathan van DiBella. OPD's 2013 to 2019 annual reports show their Special Victims Unit has been continuously understaffed. In 2020, current staffing for missing persons is only two detectives. Can understaffing affect the outcomes of missing persons cases? Absolutely. The definition of dereliction of duty is the shameful failure to fulfill one's obligations. Various OPD chiefs, the Public Safety Committee and Mayor Schaaf will be held accountable for this dereliction of duty. They received these reports and have known for over seven years, but haven't added staffing. Commissioners, no excuses. Prioritize the missing persons unit and demand adequate staffing now. Otherwise, your inaction will lead to your names being added to the growing dereliction of duty list. Thank you.
- John Alden: Thank you, Ms. Lazaneo.
- John Alden: Our next speaker in the queue... Oh, I see we have some new speakers in the queue. Looks like we have a total of five more speakers now. Our next speaker in the queue is calling in from a phone number ending with 9997. 9997, you're un-muted on our end. You can go ahead and speak when you're ready.
- Speaker 1: Hello?
- John Alden: Hello, you're on.
- Speaker 1: Thank you. I'm calling in reference to the appointment or the attempted appointment of Brian Hawk as an alternate commissioner. In the report to the City Council for the Mayor's office, it was reported that commissioner Dorado and Chair Jackson participated in the bedding of Mr. Hawk. And I have to say I'm deeply troubled and offended as an American Muslim who has family in the middle East and who has lived in the middle East in areas that are the subject of US interests and acts of war and terror.
- Speaker 1: That someone with that history of defending the United States government's right to kill American citizens as long as they are in a country they've convinced people to hate, are Arab or Muslim, and that that didn't matter to the commissioners who helped Mayor Schaaf make that



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

choice. I don't know or care if it mattered to her, because she's not an honest person, but on this board it does matter. So, you either knew and didn't care, or you didn't know and didn't do your job. I'm really troubled. This shouldn't happen again. There shouldn't be a situation where people are so dazzled by someone's government qualifications or their proficiency as a lawyer that they don't do the due diligence and find out about the person. So, please do a better job. I'm very disappointed and I'm actually offended.

John Alden: Thanks for your comments. Our next speaker in the queue is Ms. Assata Olugbala. Ms. Olugbala, you're unmuted on our end. So, go ahead when you're ready.

Assata Olugbala: Yes, thank you. It is appalling that Brian Hawk has been considered for appointment to this body. [inaudible 00:33:15], he represented the Justice Department under the Obama administration. In 2011, three American citizens were murdered by drones. One of them, a teenager, 16 years old. And he has to be held accountable, just like the Obama administration and all other participants. I hope that Mr. Hawk will not be seated, and if he is, it's going to be very problematic. As it relates to Ginale Harris, you're going to do the same thing with Hawk like you're doing with Harris. Do nothing, say nothing. On August the third... Listen Garcia, listen Singleton. August the third, Ginale Harris was defamed by the Selection Committee and she was called abrasive. On August the 10th, August the 12th it was being denied that it was ever done. Garcia and Singleton, you sit there on the backs of someone who was defamed. You sit there based on the fact that Ms. Ginale Harris was not given a fair opportunity to be represented back on this commission. You will not be accepted by me and I will continue to address the unlawful way that Ms. Harris was taken away. And the fact that this commission says nothing about Hawk, says nothing about Harris, will not explain how Smith is sitting there tonight when his time has expired, and you'll go on and do your due diligence as if nothing is happening.

John Alden: Thank you, Miss Olugbala . Sorry but your time has expired. Our next speaker in the queue is Megan Steffen. Megan Steffen you're unmuted.

Megan Steffen: Hi, thank you so much. I'm calling to talk about... I forget which item it is, but the community policing policy. So first thanks to Commissioner Dorado for asking me to review it. I just wanted to bring a few... I'm not sure what actions are planned to be taken on this policy today, but before they are, I just wanted the... I don't think you've started my time, Mr Alden.

John Alden: Thank you. You're right. I missed that. Let's assume you've got a minute and a half left.

Megan Steffen: Okay. So, but basically I just wanted to say that from my time going to my own NCPC meeting, going to the CPAB meeting and going to the SSRC meetings, a common complaint that's heard from people who are working under the existing community policing policy is that CROs are not really present, are not really accountable to them, are frequently pulled onto other duties, such as crowd management, and what's troubling to me about this policy is that it seems that it would encourage that to continue. Crowd management is mentioned quite a few times. It seems really kind of out there for being in a community policing policy. The CROs obligations to his area commander are highlighted, but it's not clear at all that the community should be the pers... the



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

people in charge of setting long-term projects. And in fact, community is sort of written out of the community policing policy altogether.

Megan Steffen: Finally, one of the most deranged part of this policy is that it says the NSCs may only report positive stories about the neighborhood and about OPD. This is not something that's going to build the kind of trust or peer level relationship that the community policing policy intended to build. And I'm hoping that the commission is open to revising this policy substantially. And if you are, I'm happy to help. Thanks so much.

John Alden: Thank you, Ms. Steffen, and thank you for reminding me that I had not started the timer. Our next speaker in the queue is Kevin Cantu . Kevin Cantu, you're unmuted on our end, so whenever you're ready.

Kevin Cantu: Good evening, everybody. Primarily I'd like to mention again, as we today and incoming weeks consider candidates for a new police chief, that it's important that we look at candidates who will not merely be part of the blue wall. I urge you to favorably consider candidates who in fact have never even been police officers and indoctrinated into this system of what can only be called oppression today in America. And if you think about other parts of the world, you seen that EndSARS hashtag, like police impunity is a problem everywhere today. And I think we need to do a little here, a little there, everything that we can do to change that. And when looking at police chiefs, this is a big step. This is a big choice, a big decision. So we need to take it seriously. Thank you very much. Cheers.

John Alden: Thank you. Our next speaker in the queue is calling in from a phone number that ends with five eight zero two. Five eight zero two you're unmuted on our end. Go ahead.

Saleem Bey: Yes. Good evening. This is Saleem Bey . Myself and my family have been living under the oppression of the Oakland Police Department since 1958. I don't take or respect anybody's opinion that wants to reform the Oakland Police Department if they've never lived under the impression of the oppression of the Oakland Police Department. One of the things that has been most disrespectful to our community is the racist, selfish, and Islamophobic selection process and people that's so flawed that it produced Mr Hauck, a person that argued that it's okay to murder Muslim citizens. Why would a Muslim citizen in Oakland feel comfortable if you think that the best choice for the Oakland Police Commission, you're the person that would murder Muslims?

Saleem Bey: This doesn't make any sense. That means that the people who are on the selection committee are either ignorant, or they're selfish, because you're only ignorant if you don't know that a person that argues murdering Muslims is okay versus somebody who knows that that's what's going on and chooses that because they have a selfish interest that's outside of community's best interest. Is it in the commission's best interest to remove Janell Harris, the person who has the most experience person that helped this commission get on its feet, whereas you want to replace people who haven't... replace her with people who haven't even attempted one meeting? Does that even make any sense? If you're all, want the best for the community, you want the person that is... that best represents the community. Not somebody who just fell off a train and said all of



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

a sudden we want what's best for the community. If you do what's best for the community, you'd step down and make sure that Janell Harris was representing this community like she's been doing for the last two years on this community... on this commission.

John Alden: Thank you, Mr Bey. Our next speaker in the queue is Lorelei Bosserman. . Ms. Bosserman go ahead at your convenience.

Lorelei Bosserman: Thank you. I just wanted to ask if you could give instructions on how to raise your hand in a Zoom meeting. I know most of us know, but in case there's someone here who's not familiar with it, let them know that they have to scroll down to the bottom and click the little raise hand icon. Thanks.

John Alden: Thank you. I think you summarized that very well. It's my understanding that if you're on the phone, there's also an option for doing that, which I believe is star nine. Our last speaker in the queue is listed as Rachel Beck . Rachel Beck, you are unmuted. Go ahead.

Rachel Beck: Hi. Can you hear me?

John Alden: Yes, we can.

Rachel Beck: Thank you. I am speaking about item 11. I'm a District One resident. The description of a Community Resource Officer's tasks, I'm looking here at pages five through eight of Attachment 11, focus on the CROs enforcement capacities. And their capacity is public relations for the police department. As Megan Steffen said earlier, Community Resource Officers, aren't just responsible to OPD, they're also responsible to the public. Therefore the CRO policy should as clearly spell out officer's responsibility to the community, as it spells out their responsibility to the department. If strengthening community trust and relationships is a serious objective for OPD, clarify what room there is for CROs to advocate for community concerns, when those concerns might not be the, everything's great, we have no objections, message that the department maybe wants to hear. Thank you.

John Alden: Thank you so much for your comments. Madam Chair. I believe those are all of our speakers in the queue. I also believe that [Mr Russe 00:01:53:50] is back on the line and can take over the screen share from here to show our agenda and I'll return the meeting back to you Madam Chair.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. Thank you. So welcome Mr Russe. We are now moving to item seven, which is a welcome of our new commissioners, Commissioners, Sergio Garcia, and Tyfahra Singleton . I think I got that right. Anyway, what I'd like to do rather than read bios, is to have them speak on their own, to talk about their background, what encouraged them to come to do police commission work and perhaps what their particular interests are within the work. So commissioner Garcia, would you like to speak please?

Sergio Garcia: Thank you Madam Chair. It's an honor and a privilege to be joining the Police Commission at this time. I was born and raised in South Central Los Angeles. I worked for 35 years ago and I'm an



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

Attorney by profession. I'm also active on nonprofit boards that are working on social justice issues here in Oakland, in that area and throughout this great state of California. Commission is working on critical issues that affect all of us here in Oakland. In public the commission is... the commission's credibility, the respect that has to be changed in this great city when it comes to policing and public safety. I also know that this commission is dealing with pervasive race and equity matters, and that it's been clear and transparent that it's doing so, and that it's doing its best to measure those matters with within the OPD. As I told a lot of folks in the police department today we are working hard to advance race and equity matters.

Sergio Garcia: We're working hard to create opportunity for all. But I also know that there's a long way to go for this police department to adequately meet community's expectations. I vow that I will do my very best, I'll bring my professional experience and the community engagement that I've been involved in through the years to this commission to benefit all of Oakland. I also vow that I'll support and uphold the charter of the city of Oakland and the charter of this commission and will to the best of my ability perform the duties as a member of this commission. It's an honor and a pleasure to be here and I will not take that lightly. Thank you, Madam Chair.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much Commissioner Garcia. Commissioner Singleton. You've been unmuted.

Tyfahra Singleton: Hello and thank you Chair Jackson, commissioners and selection panel members. This is amazing honor and a great opportunity to enact my values of helping to improve the lives of black Oaklanders and of humanizing us all because all people deserve dignity, compassion, civic, representation, and a sense of belonging. And we have to work intentionally to make that real. I'm a long time Oakland resident living in East Oakland, District Seven with my partner and three children. I grew up in South Central Los Angeles, but my father grew up in LA and in Oakland where he attended Castlemont High School. I'm here today because like so many black people, I grew up dismayed by too many stories of police brutality. When I was a child, our next door neighbor, Eula Love, was shot eight times and killed by LAPD officers who were called when she refused to let the utility to turn off her gas.

Tyfahra Singleton: This event informed my dissertation on jazz, trauma and the legacy of chattel slavery, where I argued that police shootings of black people are modern day lynchings. After Academia, I shifted my focus from trauma to healing. I worked in education and served as a principal for a West Oakland high school for adults. And I now serve as the Executive Director for Camp Phoenix, a no cost sleep-away summer camp for Oakland middle school students, who otherwise would not get that opportunity to experience nature, a loving learning community and leadership growth. To the police commission, I bring experience in helping develop human centered organizational leadership and culture. I focus on healing trauma and a network of friends and colleagues in Oakland who like me, are deeply invested in ending mass incarceration and our long national history of policing as a core tool of the oppression of black communities and moving past that to a more joyful thriving future for us all. I have already delved into the trainings. Thank you so much for those excellent resources, and I am so eager to get to work with all of you. Thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much Commissioner Singleton. Did any other commissioners want to take a moment? It's not... certainly not required, but certainly on behalf of the commission, I welcome commissioners Garcia and Singleton. We will do our best to support you in getting up to speed, quite a few years of work that has been contributed to by some outstanding commissioners and certainly extraordinarily informed by community. If any other commissioner would like to speak, please raise your hand.
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Chair, I'll just say a couple of quick words.
- Regina Jackson: Okay, Commissioner Smith.
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: I just wanted to welcome both of you and I just also wanted to say that your qualifications, your passion, your desire to change things in Oakland is only reflective of the success that the police commission is having in getting a broadening awareness of our mission, and then also attracting people to achieve it. There were a lot of folks who questioned whether or not the police commission would still exist at this point in time. But I think if you look at the quality of these new commission members, you can see the future is brighter and stronger than ever. And we're excited to have you on board. Thank you so much for volunteering your time. We look forward to seeing your contributions.
- Regina Jackson: Thanks, Commissioner Smith. Okay. Seeing no other hands, I think that we can go to public comment.
- John Alden: Thank you, Madam Chair. At this time, if any member of the public would like to make comment on item seven, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you'll be called in the order in which your hands are raised. At this time I see three hands in the queue. The first speaker is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, five eight zero two. Good evening, five eight zero two. Can you hear us?
- Saleem Bey: Yes. Good evening. This is Saleem Bey. First of all, I want to address the fact that Mr Smith popped his hand up. And Mr Smith a mayoral appointee is on overtime. Not only is Mr Smith on overtime, but he's [inaudible 02:01:21] at this time right now, because Measure LL states that no commissioner can hold a position that defends police officers. Mr Smith is currently the city attorney [inaudible 02:01:36] he defends all [inaudible 02:01:37] police officers as a part of his job. So the fact that he'd been there and he's saying anything showed that there is a poison pill on this commission. That does... that goes and extends directly to the selection process and again, I don't know these two people and I have not seen anything personal to the new people, but I do know neither one of them have the same amount of experience or the fact that they put enough time and effort into building this commission to the point that it was as Ginale Harris. So the selection process that produced these, the last two commissioners is flawed.
- Saleem Bey: The fact that the chair who decided that she wanted to be the chair instead of Janell Harris being the chair and the CPA blocking that having said anything about a flawed selection committee, I mean, process. So right now the fact that Mr Smith is still on there and he's over his due date and



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

he was sabotaging the commission for all the time that he was the chair, that just says you're that you are a partisan in political operation, that kisses tail and if you can kiss tail, you can get there as long as the CPA and the Mayor like you.

John Alden: Thank you, Mr Bey. The next speaker in the queue is Reisa. Evening, Reisa. Can you hear us?

Reisa Jaffe: Yes. Thank you. I welcome the new commissioners. I would like to ask Chair Jackson, the City Council has managed now to figure out how to have the agenda and a timer and video of council members available. I would like to ask you to do the same since I've been attending in the public. There's a lot of new commissioners. It would be nice to be able to see and relate to people the best that we can over Zoom and that helps when we actually get to see people. So I hope you will look into implementing that for the next meeting. Thanks so much.

John Alden: Thank you. Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is Kevin Cantu. Good evening Mr Cantu, can you hear us?

Kevin Cantu: Hi. I'd just like to say welcome aboard. And as you've heard, you have come aboard this organization in an interesting... at an interesting time with no shortage of argument and I wish you luck as you earn our respect. Thank you very much.

John Alden: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is Assata Olugbala . Good evening, Ms. Olugbala, can you hear us?

Assata Olugbala: Yes, sir. Thank you.

John Alden: Whenever you ready.

Assata Olugbala: It is so insulting that this is proceeding as if there's no issues. Singleton and Garcia, you know fully well, cause I'm sure you've been instructed on how to deal with this, that you did not earn in an honorable way getting on this commission because of what happened to Ms. Janell Harris. Thanks to the coalition for so-called police accountability, thanks to the silence of your fellow commissioners, you're being seated as if everything is... and don't forget all these white folks who are calling in saying, "Oh, welcome and we appreciate you." They're not standing up with Janell Harris. They started out, but they dropped the ball and now they acting like everything is okay. Where is the commitment all you white folks who originally talked about Janell Harris? As usual dropping off.

Assata Olugbala: Singleton and Garcia is going to be a rough ride. Buckle up. I'm going to be listening to everything you got to say. You better know what the hell you talking about. You better know what you talking about. And as often as I can, I am a disruptor. I disrupt things that are wrong and it's wrong that you're sitting there. I don't know how Smith is sitting there. I don't know how Mr Prather sat there for all those [inaudible 02:06:34] . But that's the... that's the way this commission is gone.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Assata Olugbala: Brian Hauck. I don't know how in the hell he got up to be nominated by the Mayor and the selection panel didn't even catch it. When I put his name up in the search engine, it comes up right away, his involvement with the Justice Department. But go ahead and play the game Singleton, Garcia as if everything is all right. You on the back of a black woman, Singleton a single sitting there. I hope you're proud of yourself. You're talking black this black that and you're stabbing a black woman in the back.
- John Alden: Thank you, Ms. Labella. Your time has expired. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, zero one eight five. Good evening, zero one eight five. Can you hear us?
- Michele Lazaneo: This is [Michele Lazaneo 00:22:35] To the two new commissioners, forgive me for my lack of excitement, but neither of you mentioned any of OPD's current issues that we're all aware of... well aware of that this commission has been challenged to fix for the past three years. I don't remember either of you attending a single meeting for the past 17 months that I've been there. And I would suggest that you go through and read three years' worth of agendas and transcripts to catch up on everything that we've been working on. I hope you're really invested to change because there's lots of work ahead. Thank you.
- John Alden: Thank you, Ms. Lazaneo. And the last speaker in the queue on this item is Mariano Contreras. Good evening, Mr Contreras. Can you hear us?
- Mariano Contreras: Yeah. Good evening. I would like to welcome the new commissioners, Commissioner Singleton and Commissioner Garcia to the police commission. I'm a proud member of the Latino taskforce here in Oakland. And I'm also a proud member of the coalition for police accountability. I, along with the commission... with the coalition for police accountability in 2014, began the discussion about putting a measure to the ballot. And that was called the measure IOWA. I remember walking precincts in East Oakland, making sure that people knew about the measure IOWA and what it meant for police accountability here in the city of Oakland. So, we've been doing this... I've been doing this for a long time and then once 83% of the voters decided to pass this measure, then there was a big fight in with the city council and the enabling ordinance. And we were there once again, we were there, we were there making sure that, you know, it was going to pass and the independence and the authority of the police commission was going to be recognized.
- Mariano Contreras: So I want to welcome the new commissioners and just let you know that we are going to be there. We're going to be there to support you and the support, the important work, but at the same time, we're also at times, going to be maybe, perhaps calling you to task on if you have any shortcomings. And I just would like to remind you that you need to keep your eyes on the task at hand. That's the new policy, use of force policy, the negotiate a settlement agreement, the compliances, the new chief, hiring a new chief, and perhaps most importantly, making a change in this department's culture and making sure that race is always put forth and then making sure that we knock down the systemic racism, not only this in this department, but in all departments throughout this country. Thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- John Alden: Thank you Mr Contreras. At this time, I see no further hands in the queue. Madam chair, I return the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. So our next item on the agenda, I'm sorry, if you can update this slide thank you, is an update from interim Police Chief Manheimer. Chief Manheimer. Are you there?
- Chief Manheimer: Yes ma'am. Can you hear me all right?
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Yes.
- Chief Manheimer: Thank you so much. Welcome to our new commissioners. I'm going to change it up just a little bit tonight Chair Jackson. I am going to go over a couple of items very briefly, but I would like to tonight give you a bit of a video presentation into a bit of a glimpse of what we're doing here in the department on a couple of different initiatives.
- Chief Manheimer: So if you would I'd first as I always do, I'm going to ask to bring up the... share the screen for Paul Chambers and he is going to bring up the ShotSpotter map. I did not give you stats this week. I thought what I'd like to do this week is give you more of a sort of organic street level community neighborhood view of what's going on within the city of Oakland the last couple of weeks since last we met. And so the reason why I'm starting with the ShotSpotter is, as we know, and we've talked about for quite a while, there has been really issues with in mostly parts of deep East Oakland, where we've seen in areas four and five, the majority of our shootings. The issue I think we're seeing now and I'm hoping that you can all see. Chair can you see the, the screen with the ShotSpotter map?
- Regina Jackson: Yes, I can.
- Chief Manheimer: Okay.
- Regina Jackson: I can identify where I work and where all the shots are. Thank you,
- Chief Manheimer: Right. There's people who are seeing and hearing them every single night in certain areas. So this map goes by area. It's put up and refreshed every Tuesday on all our social media platforms to include our website. And what we do with this is just what we're seeing now. If you can imagine in the past, obviously there were about half of the activations that we're seeing now, but it was really much more concentrated, sort of on one area, area five, a bit of area four, but we are seeing sort of the swath cutting across the city right now. And we are, I will tell you, within all of our areas, very, very focused on the violent gun and crime reduction. Our homicides this year are probably up about 85% from what we've seen last year. And I will say that having been on probably three different nationwide panels with major city chiefs over this last couple of months, we've really tried to dig deep into some of the causation.
- Chief Manheimer: As you know, it's a new phenomenon and we keep thinking that the pandemic will end soon and we will see things kind of go back to normal. But as we recognize these areas that are hard hit by



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

the violence and the crime, are also these areas that have been so challenged and hit by the pandemic and the fiscal and other challenges they face. So we will tonight really want to share with you from the ground level. I have Deputy Chief Leronne Armstrong here with me, and he has been focusing on the area where you see the majority of those triangles, exactly the area you've been talking about Chair Jackson. I'd like to turn it over to him now, and he is going to start the first of three brief presentations for you, giving you just a glimpse inside some of what we're doing, seeing, and experiencing here with our community, as we seek to eradicate the violence.

Regina Jackson: Thank you.

Deputy Chief Armstrong: Good evening Chair, good evening commissioners and also our new commissioners. So really what you see on the map is largely a huge concentration of ShotSpotter activity in the East end and a deep East end that really led to a call to action for the department, as well as the community. We are stretched thin, as you can see with all the activity we're at our bandwidth, right? And last week was a very challenging week for us. It started off with an incident that occurred on 85th [inaudible 02:15:10] where 60 rounds were fired in a residential community. It happened to be close to the residence of one of our former commissioners, police commissioners, who actually made contact with me and let me know that her and her son were at dinner and had to leave the table and get underneath the table for their own safety, and then the next day found bullets in cars and in residences around her area. So this has been a tremendous challenge for us.

Deputy Chief Armstrong: I decided the next day to go out on the ground and get into the community because I heard those gunshots from my own home. I could hear those gunshots. And so I had some serious concerns by the number of rounds that I heard fired myself. So my decision was the next day to go out into the community, to walk in that neighborhood and just reassure people that we were going to be focused on who was responsible for shooting those rounds in that area. But before I could get to that area to walk around, we had another triple shooting in the 1900 block of 84th Avenue, which happened to be only three to four blocks away from where the first shooting occurred. This shooting obviously had some devastating outcomes with two young men losing their lives.

Deputy Chief Armstrong: I went to that scene and that really for me, had an emotional impact, not only because of the level of violence in the fact that we had seen two young men lose their lives, I also witnessed the trauma that the community was facing. I saw kids inside of their homes, looking out the window. That trauma won't leave them. I could see their faces and knew that that was something that was starting the trauma that they would be experiencing for many years. And some parents even coming out and speaking to media and telling them that this was just the normal. Every day, that they experienced something like that. I felt at that point that was unacceptable and really called to action for us to collaborate with our community, to try to hold people accountable, identify who was responsible for that violence, and then bring them to justice. And I have to say today, just earlier today, we had a barricaded suspect in the 1500 block of High street today who took a hostage into a business and fired multiple rounds while he was barricaded.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

Deputy Chief Armstrong: This was the person responsible for the double homicide last week. We were able to safely rescue the hostage, but we were also able to safely take the person in custody without using force. And so this was just us again, practicing time and distance going about this the safest way we could, but also reassuring our community that we were focused on apprehending the people responsible for this. And it really goes to our initiative OPD cares. It really is us bringing resources to the community, reaching out to our partners and the Department of Violence Prevention, who you will have a presentation from tonight. They've been key in this strategy. They have also been right there with us, really relying on our community to work closely with us. So we're going to show you a video and it's just going to highlight sort of the emotion that was felt that day as we were going through the violence in our community and how I felt as somebody that felt responsible for East Oakland, but also somebody that lives in that community.

Deputy Chief Armstrong: These are people from our community that have lost their lives to senseless violence. This is a community that's dealing with trauma. That this doesn't end today, that the community members that live in this block and in this area have to live with the tragic scene that they seen today of bullets flying in their community, indiscriminately and putting everybody at risk. Feel terrible for the families of these victims, because it's senseless. But this is connected also to just the ongoing violence that we've seen in our community. Even last night, three blocks away from this location, 60 rounds fired in a residential neighborhood. I've heard from those community members about how frightened they were about the traumatic experience they had last night of listening to bullets, flying through their homes and into their cars. The violence in this community must stop.

Deputy Chief Armstrong: I hear people talking about guns. The Oakland Police Department has been working diligently to get the firearms off the streets. We've recovered 40% more firearms than we've recovered last year at this same time. But it's more than just the firearms. It's the individuals that are willing to pick up the firearms and use them in our community. They have to put the guns down. I hear the voices of those that are in our community and don't feel safe. We are here. Every lead that we get, we're going to follow up on so if there's information out there in our community that could help us solve these investigations, we need that information. This is going to take a collective effort by all of us to say that this violence is unacceptable. It is not acceptable for in broad daylight, in the middle of the day, for rounds to be fired in our community. Our children, our home, as a result of this pandemic, they're unsafe. We can't sit inside our homes and allow this to happen. And so I just asked our community to step forward and help us solve these cases.

Deputy Chief Armstrong: So, Chair [inaudible 02:20:47] I know that your actual location is about four or five blocks away from this shooting. So, I know this impacts even the young people that come to EOYDC, and so we know the call to action. We've seen six young people killed in 2020 compared to 2019 when we had no juveniles killed in our city. And so, it really shows how serious this issue around violence is. We went before our council on Tuesday, it was pushed forth a resolution to make gun violence our top priority. That is something again that we will be continued to be focused on. And we are calling everybody to come and help us as we put forth our OPD Cares Initiative. And we were also just approved by the council to purchase additional resource vehicles, to bring out in the community, not command posts, vehicles that are intended to provide support to our



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

community. And so, that is going to help bolster this initiative as we continue to support our community around reducing violence.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much.

Paul Chambers: Okay. Chair Jackson, good evening commissioners and our public that is listening. I'm Paul Chambers, a Strategic Communications Manager at OPD and talking about OPD Cares is all encompassing about how we return our service back to our community. Now, when I started, I saw ways that we can better inform our community by using our department's social media platforms and website. Since coming on board a little less than a year ago, I've stepped up our video messaging and posts. As a department we are willing to evolve with the times and we must do so. I'm using my 20 years of experience as a television reporter to now inform our community and the world via social media. A few months ago, after speaking with mothers and families who lost their loved ones to violence in Oakland, we began highlighting unsolved homicide cases we hear directly from the impacted families and loved ones.

Paul Chambers: The Jonathan Bandabaila case is the vision and inspiration we used to create a missing persons segment and post on the department's social media platforms, which began last week with Jonathan Bandabaila. I'll show you a video in a minute. However, every Saturday we highlight a particular missing persons case. And in the following Thursday, we push out a new additional post about that same case on all our platforms. The reason and I know personally, that the media can't make it out to every press conference. However, they do monitor our social media platforms. And we'll use that information often times to share it with our community. Every case is an important case. We want to keep our community informed. I will show you the video.

Paul Chambers: Each week The Oakland police department will highlight a missing person or an unsolved homicide. And you may have information that we need to help solve the case. On September 25th, 2020, around 10:30 PM, 16-year-old Gabriel Lazano packed his belongings and left the home in a 1600 block of Filbert Street. Lazano was last seen getting into a newer model gray sedan and was heading to Sacramento. If you have any information with this case contact OPD's Missing Persons Unit at (510) 238-3641.

Paul Chambers: Now, we've already created several more posts that will debut in the weeks ahead. Also I'm working with DC Lindsay and the Missing Persons Unit to make sure we continue this effort. Outside of that, we are working with the city's webmaster to create a dedicated section on the department's website for missing persons cases. The unit is also creating their own Twitter account, which will be actively working with every active case going on. Now also with our video messaging, we know it's very important of having a police department that reflects the community it serves. So, we're stepping up our recruiting efforts with a social media campaign where you'll hear why it's important to have a more diverse and inclusive department. I'll turn it over now on to Lieutenant Aaron Smith, who has more on what we're doing.

Lieutenant Smith: Good evening, Chair Jackson and the members of the commission. As we presented my last time being here, we talked about really leveraging social media and making that shift to social media as



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

a result of COVID-19 and our inability to get out and actually touch people. But we are committed to the hiring Oakland, the hiring of people from Oakland, and to really work to make our department a reflection of our community. This of course continues through partnerships with community groups, our faith community, the Merritt College Administration of Justice program, the Merritt College Pre-Academy, the Police Activities League. And then of course our embedded youth outreach unit. But I'd like to show you a video that highlights one of our police officer trainees, we will continue to push out videos much like this and highlight really just opportunities to get to know some of the folks who we'll be hiring and people who work here. So, a very short video now.

Lieutenant Smith: OPD's desire is to have a diverse and inclusive department. You'll hear from employees to explain why it's important to have an agency look like the community it serves.

Lieutenant Smith: I was born in Oakland, decided about maybe three years ago to get into law enforcement. Due to the fact of, for me I'm more of a person about representation. I didn't see that many women that looked like me in law enforcement, because I could just imagine if I'm going through a very stressful situation. And if I don't know or see somebody that may not look like me, I might not be as comfortable or open to get that support or help. We already know women are great right? We're strong, but for me, it's more of the representation of the color of my skin, because that is a very big thing that plays a factor in a lot of things in society. So, for me, yes I'm all about the empowerment for women, but I'm black first. We need more representation so we can continue to serve our community and for our community to be comfortable. And just for the future generations, you know, this is a really good career path. You get to serve your community.

Lieutenant Smith: So, be the difference you want to see join our team. Log on to opdjobs.com.

Lieutenant Smith: So, Chair Jackson, this is just an example of what we will continue to push out, working directly with Paul chambers, to identify those offices who can help us with our messaging to get the word out that this is what we want to see in our department and would like to see [inaudible 02:27:40] the department, that is reflected for the community we serve. So, I thank you for this opportunity, and I'll turn it back over to Chief Manheimer.

Regina Jackson: Thank you.

Chief Manheimer: Thank you. So, I'll just wrap it up but try to do something a little bit different than just hearing from a talking head as I give you information again, we're always trying to bring you a little bit of our challenges. Challenges this week would be our bandwidth and the continued frustration, intensity and focus around the violent crime and the relentless commitment to getting that down within our communities. The second piece of that I think was really looking at how it is that we're going to move forward with really diversifying this department. And then also to share with you a little bit about where we're going with, that really is truly, if you talk about anything about the lessons learned from the Bandabaila case and other cases in which we can leverage and must leverage the social media and other platforms that we have, it's really an indication of where we're going with the new social media policy that we have that is in ad hoc with you now.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Chief Manheimer: But as you know, while we take the time and ad hocs to get the policy right, that doesn't mean that we as a department are going to wait to innovate and to respond to the lessons learned and the ways in which we can do things better, always trying to improve. So, wanted to just share that with you. We intend to do more of that and any feedback is always welcome. Feel free to connect with me or email me on things you might like to hear from our update. And we're happy to agendize those. A quick ending for you, the social media policy is in ad hoc. I know you have an ad hoc on your community policing policy. I know that is in your packet, it's coming up tonight. Just to reinforce that policy was written by the Community Policing Advisory Board, as well as the Special Services Oversight Committee.
- Chief Manheimer: But I really want to reinforce that we would like to be a part of that ad hoc. There were things that we could contribute in terms of sort of the best practices and community policing evolution, and the fact that the NSCs are moving over to Joe DeVries and the interdepartmental initiatives at the city administrator's office. So, I think that's it I'll end there, open it up for any questions you might have for us, but we're excited about our diversity inclusion, outreach, and recruitment want to recognize Lieutenant Smith, Deputy Chief Lindsey for that, Paul Chambers, and really starting to dig deep in our video and social media capabilities. And of course, Chief Armstrong, who is really doing a lot of double duty out there as he and his folks are, I know there's a lot of fatigue, a lot of bandwidth stretching, but I know you'll hear from the Department of Violence Prevention and we are very grateful that they are working on a protocol to come out to these scenes.
- Chief Manheimer: As we see more and more increasing cumulative trauma within these communities that are also so fatigued by the violence and the gunfire every night. And so, their addition and response is helping to provide a level of care and concern to those individuals that are hit by that trauma. So, thank you Chair Jackson as always for the opportunity to get a glimpse into the department and I remain available for questions.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, chief Manheimer. It was a nice change to have the opportunity to look at the videos. So, thank you for that. Commissioners, are there any questions that you have regarding this presentation? This update? Okay, I see a hand from commissioner Dorado. You've been unmuted.
- Jose Dorado: Thank you Chair Jackson. Good evening Interim Chief Manheimer, it's really hopeful to hear that there's a move to have more police officers from the community that they serve here in Oakland. So, I'm glad to hear that there's that sort of movement. And certainly in terms of missing persons there seems to be some movement as well. So, it's something that we look to see if in fact it's sustained. So, that said two meetings back to touch on a subject that I had brought up back two meetings. I had asked you to look into putting together an effort to identify the connections within OPD with white supremacists, as well as identify the groups in and around Oakland that are connected with white supremacists. You mentioned that that was something that you had handed off to I believe DC Lindsey, Lindsey. So, I wanted an update because this is something that is a concern. We obviously have heard of the plot to actually kidnap a governor, actually two governors, Virginia and Michigan by these far right white supremacists.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Jose Dorado: And I don't suspect that this is going to be anything that's going to lessen. And in fact I think these kinds of activities are going to increase leading up to the election in November 3rd and beyond. So, it's becoming increasingly concerning to me. And I want to hear what you've been doing along those lines.
- Chief Manheimer: Thank you [inaudible 02:33:49] chair... Shall I restart?
- Regina Jackson: Yes, please.
- Chief Manheimer: Okay, great. All right. A couple of things. Yeah, absolutely I think anything we do it's important to get to your first two comments Commissioner Dorado about sustainability on both the social media platforms and as well as with our recruitment initiatives. These are individuals and systems that we're putting in place so that we both have the commitment level of the individuals that we put in the place, as well as the systems to ensure the infrastructure and sustainability. So, thank you for that and we will continue to do that. Our next sort of challenge will be around cold cases that we look to do in the near future, we're excited about that initiative as well. I think there's just a lot more that we're going to be able to do as we really tap into the video and social media age. And I think that Paul Chambers is well positioned to do that for us. So, thirdly, and to your final point, as I mentioned to you, we immediately checked into any connections between the boogaloo boys, any other supremacists or really extremist or violent hate groups.
- Chief Manheimer: And are very confident to this point that we have found no connection either to that incident with those individuals or to any other connections. So, if anyone has anything, we encourage both complaints. We have an integrity unit, we have a very robust IAD unit. We have a CPRA, that's an independent arm of the police commission that also investigates these. And we have a community that's a high level of scrutiny. So, any situation or complaint that we get, we immediately look into and we have our own internal checks and balances. So, I can assure you that we have looked into this and that we find no evidence of any connections. And we are always, always looking to ensure that we do not have any of that. Not only would that be zero tolerance, but that would be an absolute compromise of the ethics, integrity and commitment that we have to zero tolerance for hate speech clearly internally. And we just made a great arrest of someone for hate speech just recently. So, we released it last night that we did and we continue to reinforce that this department has absolute zero tolerance for hate speech.
- Chief Manheimer: In terms of any upcoming activity, I will give you something in about two weeks about what we're doing around the elections and debriefings that we're getting in terms of groups in the area, but you can rest assured we've stayed up to date on that. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. So, if I am hearing you correctly, those kinds of investigations will be ongoing so that we're not sleeping on any hatred anywhere is that correct.?
- Chief Manheimer: Absolutely. Internally, externally, and we are kept apprised of those.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you I see commissioner Dorado's hand up again so he may have a follow-up you've been unmuted.
- Jose Dorado: Thank you, Chair Jackson, let me... Interim Chief Manheimer let me be clear. I don't believe for a moment that one, there are no connections within OPD with white supremacist groups. And two, I don't believe for a moment that the officer in West Oakland was wearing the boogaloo shirt had no idea what that represented. So, this will be an ongoing conversation and yes, I would like to take it offline because it is something that needs to be discussed in greater depth so thank you.
- Chief Manheimer: Yes. I would welcome that because it is really troubling to continue to have this conversation with something that we have really explored and put to bed. And I think unfair to the officer. So, at this point we would definitely like to take that offline with you. One other thing of interest that I have found, because we have been very schooled on both the boogaloo boys, as you know, the Proud Boys actually came to San Francisco last weekend. I was surprised to see that there were people of color in those groups that they're not, well there may be branches of white supremacist groups are actually very, very right wing extremist violent groups. So, it's very interesting to me that there are a lot to learn about these groups. Not only do we keep up to date with them, but you can rest assured we are all over any expression of that and we do investigate it. So, thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Chief Manheimer. I would like to also follow up, I'm still waiting on that mentoring curriculum. Just a reminder to you based upon our last conversation. Commissioners, do you have any-
- Chief Manheimer: Yes ma'am. Thank you. Chair Jackson. We will get that for you our captain's on vacation this week, but we will get that for you and I can give it to you directly and you can choose to share it or not with the group. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. So, I don't see any more questions. So perhaps Mr. Rus, we can go to public comment then please?
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madame Chair. If any member of the public would like to make a comment on item eight on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you'll be called in the order in which your hands are raised. At this time I see six hands in the queue, starting with a phone attendee with the last four digits 5-8-0-2. Hello 5802 can you hear us?
- Saleem Bey: Yes. Good evening. This is Saleem Bey. First I'd like to comment on the police chief and actually OPD's overly rosy presentation with the video that covers over the fact that they are in 17 years of failure in the NSA. I didn't hear one mention of racism, racial profiling, nothing about the failure to comply with the NSA that you're still in, nothing about addressing racism in the department right now. This is a PR step without any substance, it's total crap. One of the things... And also what she said about, "Oh, the IAD and the Integrity Unit as the way to follow up." OPD has been in violation of the NSA for 17 years which was brought about discrimination. You're talking about something that if you're not talking about discrimination in the department, you're not talking about fixing the problem.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Saleem Bey: And you're talking about going out in the community and finding out why there's an increase in violence, but you're not talking about addressing the poverty that underlies the violence, you'll never address it. If there's a 30 or 40% [inaudible 02:41:07] dropout rate in the Oakland school district, that means 30 or 40 children go to the community every year and increase it every year. That would mean you would need more police officers every year. If you don't fix the fact that poverty is the source of what OPD feeds on. Right? So, right now, and all that stuff about there's no white supremacists, there's no nothing. OPD is "Oh, they're so clean." Nobody's even complained within OPD about racism when they know racism has been independently verified. That means that you have no credibility when it comes to outing racism amongst your own thing. So, Chief Manheimer please save it for other people who don't know that you're lying.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. The next speaker in the queue is Jasmine Fallstich. Good evening Ms. Fallstich. Can you hear us?
- Jasmine Fallstich: Hi. Yes, I can. Good evening. Thanks so much. Through the chair to the chief I have a similar question along the lines of what Saleem Bey was asking about. I'm very curious how you went about investigating any white supremacy connections within the department. Your answer tonight was incredibly vague and handwavy and doesn't instill any trust in me that this was a thorough or well thought through process. Especially if you yourself, didn't know about the Proud Boys or what they are like. I'm curious what level of detailed, like educational process that you went through in order to do a really robust investigation into any connections that might exist. So, just if you could detail for us, what was the process that you went through? Did you have someone check through all of the social media accounts to see what people on the force are sharing?
- Jasmine Fallstich: Can you give us an outline of what that process was? Also the election is 11 days away so if you're going to get back to us in two weeks, that's probably going to be a little bit late, so maybe we could bump the timeline up on that too. Thanks.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Fallstich. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, 0-1-8-5. I believe that's Michele Lazaneo. Good evening, Ms. Lazaneo can you hear us?
- Michele Lazaneo: This is Michele Lazaneo spokesman for the Bandabaila family. And I had a prepared statement, but I'm so angry after this PR campaign that I quickly jotted this down. So, after 17 months of requests from me from Commissioner Ginale Harris, from Jonathan Bandabaila's parents and some family members, you have still not posted any social media outreach, produced no video, telling parents, telling families about how to simply make a missing persons report and what the steps are that they should take to ensure that their family member comes home safely. October is Domestic Violence Awareness Month, but you posted nothing on social media about the process of reporting it, about restraining orders or anything else. Please stop using Jonathan Bandabaila's name in vain. You are still using your social media as a primarily public relations campaign. Your public information officers posted a missing French Bulldog on social media in two days and nothing for Jonathan for over 20 days. Let's remember that. Please stop grandstanding and get back to work and add staffing to your missing persons unit. Thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Lazaneo. The next speaker in the queue is Megan Steffen. Good evening, Ms. Steffen, can you hear us?
- Megan Steffen: Yes. Thanks so much, Mr. Rus. I am calling... I don't even know what to say. I unfortunately disagree with Chair Jackson. I don't think these videos were a nice change. I think they do several things. They allow the police to make a report without having to add anything into the agenda so there's no record of anything that's shared. I also think this seems to be like a push to pour more money into marketing, which I think is absurd. I mean I've been diligently watching the Oakland Police Department's social media and Mr. Chambers it's nice to meet you. The genius between this August 23rd tweet that says, "Guess what? Our police helicopter saw you on freeway 880 in Oakland stopping traffic so you could spin your tires." And then all caps "Toe time." This was tweeted in a string of other tweets under the hashtag, "OPD cares campaign."
- Megan Steffen: I mean, I don't want to tell someone with this much professional experience in marketing, how to do his job, but I'll make an exception. I mean this is not really consistent. And this is not really about building community trust. I think there's a lot going on, a lot of different voices within OPD, which makes sense there's a lot of people there. But none of this is sort of convincing me that it's worthwhile or worth investing in. I mean the missing persons video, get rid of the PowerPoint background, just show us the person's face. I saw that missing persons report earlier today and my number one thought was, "I can't enlarge this so that I can actually see what this person looks like." I think OPD should stop focusing on branding and making it look like they do their jobs and just actually do their jobs. You know, I hate to use this corporate language here, but I'm not really seeing the value added and I'm insulted as well. I hope we never have to watch another video in this meeting. Thank you very much.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Steffen. The next speaker in the queue is Assata Olugbala. Good evening Ms. Olugbala can you hear us?
- Assata Olugbala: Yes. Thank you. Chief I'm concerned about two things that were on the agenda of the city council this week. Number one was the item related to ending the relationship with the joint task force. At the same time, the Department of Homeland Security last week produced a document that says, "Violent white supremacists are the most lethal threat to Homeland Security in the United States." So, since you have had a reduction in the potential to deal with the issue of domestic and international terrorism, my question is how will you prevent, investigate and respond to terrorism with no longer having a relationship with the joint task force, terrorism task force? The second thing was the item for which you will receive a grant of \$1.3 million. Of that money, over \$900,000 went to the purchase of three resource safety vehicles. That grant was supposed to be used for COVID emergency funding issues. And I couldn't find anything in documentation that said, "What is a community resource safety vehicle?"
- Assata Olugbala: You spent over \$300,000 with each one of those. And so, no explanation was given how this would use for COVID-19 prevention or intervention. Lastly, I read the stop data, the stop data for 2019 reflects that 51% of African Americans were stopped in 2019. Even though the numbers of stops have been reduced. 14,000 African-Americans represent over 7,000, we still have a



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

disproportionately high rate of stops of African Americans. So, something needs to be done to eliminate that.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala] your time has expired. The next speaker in the queue is Jennifer Tu. Good evening, Ms. Tu, can you hear us?

Jennifer Tu : Yes. Thank you, Mr. Rus. This is Jennifer Tu from District 3. I want to echo the earlier speaker. I think that was Jasmine Fallstich, who was asking about how chief Manheimer is learning about white supremacy on her force. One thing that the chief said earlier was that she learned about the Proud Boys showing up in San Francisco last weekend and was surprised to learn that there were people of color in the Proud Boys. This has me very, very concerned because it doesn't take more than about five minutes of reading about the Proud Boys and doing a Google image search to know this information. And the fact that she learned about this this weekend when they showed up says to me that there's a lot that the chief does not know about white supremacy.

Jennifer Tu : This makes me very curious about how she plans to find white supremacy in the police force in Oakland Police Force, if she is learning about this kind of information today. So, I would like to encourage the commissioner, especially Commissioner Dorado to learn more about what it is that the chief is doing concretely to learn about white supremacy with an OPV. Thank you very much. I yield my time.

Juanito Rus: Thank you Ms. Tu. The next speaker in the queue is Kevin Cantu. Hello Mr. Cantu, can you hear us?

Kevin Cantu: Hello again. So, maybe when looking for white supremacist officers in the force instead of checking that nobody has receipts from Tommy Bahama, maybe go look at that stop data and find, for example, that officer who I saw in my neighborhood, menacingly tailgating a black driver. Anyways, I wanted to comment about the map of ShotSpotter data that you showed earlier. There was no time period listed with that data. So, I think it soundly fits in as a lie of omission. Maybe there's some other category of lie around lying with statistics of that is, but it seems kind of like BS. Might want to work on that a little bit better. Thanks.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Cantu. The next speaker in the queue is Reisa J. Good evening Reisa can you hear us?

Reisa Jaffe: Yes, thank you. Well, much of what I wanted to say has been said, so just, yes, I don't want videos. They're not helpful. I want the chief to focus on what she's doing to end racial profiling. That's what this is all about. What is she doing to get us out of the NSA? The crime statistics can go way down and the underlying problems of racism in the department will still exist. So, please, the police commission is about fixing the problems within the department and I come over and over again and we still don't get reports on that. I think Mr. Bey really said it well, so please no more PR thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Juanito Rus: Thank you Reisa. At this time, Madame Chair seeing no further hands in the queue and we turn the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. So, Interim Chief Manheimer, I've got a list of questions that are all totally appropriate that the community has posed that will not only be of interest to us, but obviously will probably help us learn about some of your processes. So, if you could highlight the process for your investigation or research around boogie boys, or Proud Boys that'd be helpful. It does sound like we probably need to stick with data. I do believe that from time to time, videos would be helpful, but I'm hearing that the community does not want that let's stick to the facts. So, maybe we ought to be working on that. The ShotSpotter in terms of identifying time periods, that is absolutely helpful so that you can compare and contrast to see how things are getting better or worse. The missing persons video, perhaps with some scenarios, we need to ask those that are subject matter experts of their own experience to share with us what it is that they'd like to see that would in fact be helpful to their particular course, which then might be helpful to all of the courses under that subject matter. Then finally, the conversation around the joint terrorism community is saying that I'm hearing and have been hearing about how are we going to protect our city in the wake of the election and all of the different scare tactics and trauma laid burdens that are out there, hearing about people with loaded guns waiting at voting precincts. So, there are about five or six things that I've written down and hopefully you can go in whatever order you'd like to inform us.
- Chief Manheimer: Thank you, Chair. Did you want that now or at the next presentation?
- Regina Jackson: Now will be good.
- Chief Manheimer: Okay, great. I jotted them down, I think, in some order. So, for the missing persons video, we just showed you a small snippet of one. We will have a tagline at the bottom of how to report that, and some of the items to take into account. We will also have that on the website, as the website gets finalized. This was really just a highlight for you. I'll go through the [crosstalk 00:01:40].
- Regina Jackson: Let me interrupt for a moment.
- Chief Manheimer: Sure.
- Regina Jackson: I believe that Michele who has been extremely involved in the subject matter would probably want to take some time to give us, meaning you, some feedback in advance so that what goes out there doesn't perhaps trigger people who are dealing with missing persons. So, I'd like to follow up with you tomorrow and I will double check with Michele to see if that assumption is accurate. Okay?
- Chief Manheimer: No, that's wonderful. We'd welcome that. I know we have reached out to Michele before through Deputy Chief Lindsey. So, we're absolutely open to that and appreciate that. Okay. All right. And then for the, I think, there was just some general comments about why social media. We have about 267,000 followers on our social media platforms. Why we do these things is to keep them



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

engaged so that when we need to alert them, say today, we had a hostage, we had a suspect who was firing, a barricaded suspect outside of a business on High Street. When we need to alert and make our community aware, the more followers we have, the better. In terms of marketing and outreach, that is exactly what we need to do with our young people to ensure that we're really hitting on all cylinders as we're doing outreach for the diverse local community, and really resonating with our young people. Really sort of selling our profession now in terms of the excitement, the challenge and other things so that we can incent people to want to join this profession. It's very tough, as you can imagine, right now.

Chief Manheimer: I hear what people are saying about the videos. It was something we tried tonight. If it's not something of interest, that's fine. I am expecting to bring, for another caller, one or two of them, talking about the NSA. I do have in fact, a report that we can bring to you and I was intending to do that before I leave with an update on where we are with all of our compliance. You and I have talked about that before, Chair, and that's something that we can start doing on a regular basis. To go a little bit into the JTTF and the whole issue around threats to our community and others up to the election, and then during the election period, that special operational mission, and then following that election period. As you know, there could be up to 30 days in which that election may be up in the air. So, we are taking all of those into operational planning. It will be much more of a challenge without the JTTF MOU. We are concerned about that.

Chief Manheimer: To the whole point of the proud boys and the Boogaloo Boys and all of the other extremist groups. I am not a terrorism liaison expert. I am not a terrorism liaison officer and I am not our intelligence unit. And all three of those are extremely well briefed as well as they should be. As the CEO of the organization here, I expect our people to stay up on that. I am happy to meet offline with Commissioner Dorado, but I don't believe it's appropriate to give out all of the personnel related investigations at this time over the public airwaves rest assured that we do that. And we do that on a regular basis and Commissioner Durado, I would like to meet with you, sir, and we can also put together sort of our process and our system for checks and balances and I can bring that back to you before I leave. I can commit to that. I think rounding it out. I think Ms. Olugbala you really caught on that a couple of weeks ago. You definitely do your homework. And I think you were the only one who probably read every page of the agenda.

Chief Manheimer: And yes, ma'am the resource vehicles are part of the outreach for COVID. What we have found in this last several months, seven almost to be precise, we have not been able to conduct our call-outs conduct on-scene investigations, go out there and reach out into the community with resources. During the pandemic, we had a great challenge and these resource funds will enable us to get out to every one of the districts and ensure almost as if we have a small police, we will have three interview positions within the vans. We will be able to call in individuals as we're doing either investigations, or interventions with violence preventers. We have given out over 20,000 masks through the one command post vehicle we already have. Chair Jackson, you actually kind of put it in our heads that, you know, that's great to come out in the command post vehicle and try and use that for outreach and education, and do our call-ins and some of the ceasefire interrupt or tactics. But if all they see is the OPD command post van, they don't know that it is for that community resource.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Chief Manheimer: And so these vans will be used specifically for that community resource, for that outreach, for doing the call ins for interviewing victims of trauma in the field and ensuring that we have additional PPEs and handing out all of the types of precautions that we can within our community as we know that both the violence and the pandemic are hitting in the areas we need to most engage with our community. Additionally, you saw in that grant that we have a decontamination vans, and we have had to, in fact, as we have brought individuals back to the department, shut down entire units of the department for decontamination, and it has severely impacted our operations. So, these are important measures that we're taking so that we have washed down stations, decontamination vans, and the outreach we need. I think that handled all of the questions to date ma'am.
- Regina Jackson: Okay, actually it didn't, what I'd like to do is kind of direct you in terms of that whole social media thing, explaining what those vehicles are for and what they do in posts, or what have you, would probably be very helpful to people so that they correlate and picture with the services that you're saying you're providing. But what I did not hear when you were mentioning that you weren't an expert on this and you weren't an expert on that, what I didn't hear was a perhaps high-level process for what investigation has been done into the Boogaloo Boys that has given you reason to believe that there's no connection, because that is a big statement to make, and it is not unreasonable for a community, or even us, as commissioners, to ask for you to identify what are some of the processes that you've gone through. I'm not expecting everything in full detail, but something that helps us understand that there's more going on than just observations.
- Chief Manheimer: Okay, thank you so much. So, I mean, obviously we investigated that and as we investigate any accusation or allegation or complaint. So, that was fully investigated. What I said is we are not aware of any connections to this department and any type of hate speech, hate group, a violent extremist group or other activity, which would be wholly inappropriate and against our general orders. If, and when we come up with any issues or allegations, we would fully investigate them. We also do our own integrity checks and do those on a regular basis, and I would not go further into what it is that we do, but looking at social media, just looking at any aberrant behavior, anything that we see or hear of, or have reason to believe. So, I encourage anyone who has any specifics has anything that we look at. And in fact, not only do we look at it, but we have several independent entities that would also do an investigation of that.
- Chief Manheimer: So, as you may or may not know, an allegation of any type of involvement with hate group, hate speech or other discrimination or allegation is a level one violation that is up to and including termination, and taken very seriously and investigated, not only officially but independently.
- Regina Jackson: So, Commissioner Manheimer, for those people that are experts in that field, can we have them perhaps present at the next meeting?
- Chief Manheimer: And present on what? Are you asking for a brief on the Boogaloo Boys and other heat associated violent extremists?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Yes, because the position is this. Sometimes we know how to look. We research hard, our fingers are to the ground. We've got contacts in lots of different spaces. So, it's not just about Googling, or going to places and making observations. And I realize, or I would at least expect that there is a far deeper set of processes, some that maybe you cannot share, but that would help direct us that you're turning over all kinds of leaves for this, as opposed to expecting kind of somebody to walk up and say, "I know exactly where they are."
- Chief Manheimer: So, okay. I'm hearing two things. Yes, we absolutely investigate and do integrity checks on any and all behavior that would be seen as questionable, abhorrent or in any way connected to that type of behavior. Secondly, I think what I'm hearing from you is that you would like, and I absolutely can do that, we have high level briefings on a regular basis. I probably would not bring in someone from our intelligence or terrorism liaison officer, but would bring in Mike Senna who's the director of our national crime regional intelligence center, and he could give a high level briefing for all of us on what we're seeing locally, on what we're seeing in terms of the upcoming election and what some of the issues are with our violent extremist groups. Now, if you'd like that, I can absolutely arrange that.
- Regina Jackson: Yes, let's please arrange that.
- Chief Manheimer: Great.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much.
- Chief Manheimer: Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Mr. Russo, if you can advance the slide? So, we have been looking forward to a presentation from the department of violence prevention. We're glad that this day has come. Chief Cespedes, you have the floor.
- Guillermo Cespedes: Thank you, Madame chair and commissioners. This is our first time in front of the police commission. I'm very honored to be here. I came with a leadership team to make them available to answer questions as well. My name is Guillermo Cespedes and I am the chief of violence prevention and worked in Oakland from '81, 1981 to 1999, primarily in the nonprofit sector. Primarily in East Oakland, working with families that were undergoing the results of the war on drugs across urban America, and did a fair amount of work with families and with members that had chronic illness, primarily a sickle cell disease. In '99, I went to Los Angeles, California and became the deputy mayor of gang reduction of youth and youth development in that city. Conceptualized and develop the strategy that was very successful in reducing violence, and in 2014, went to DC, did some work generating funding for some of those strategies in central America. The connection between LA and central America is that LA had in part exported the problem of violence associated with groups to the Northern triangle of Central America.
- Guillermo Cespedes: I moved to Central America developed programs throughout Central America, primarily in the Northern triangle, three countries in the Eastern Caribbean and Tunisia, and North Africa. And



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

then was very honored to be recruited to come back to Oakland, the only place in my life that I've ever gone back to. Personally, I'm a native of Havana, Cuba. My daughter was born and raised here during my time in Oakland. Besides my direct work with families, I spent 11 years doing primary prevention work with youth only that the medium of working within mostly ensemble music. And it was ensemble music where they got taught music, but they also got taught African history throughout the Americas. So, I say all that experience because coming back to Oakland to lead this department is a great honor, and it's probably one of the most challenging positions that I've ever had. So, what we're going to do, we're going to present some slides that are going to cover four areas.

Guillermo Cespedes: One, how the department got here, where we're at now, where we're going. And then we were asked to highlight a little bit, the coordination that we are doing that is connected to Oakland police department. The two people that I want to introduce is the deputy chief of violence prevention, Sariah Crane, and she could tell us just briefly a little bit about herself.

Sarai Crain: Hello, everyone. Good evening. Pleasure to be with you all this evening and to be representing the department of violence prevention. For those who are not familiar with me, I bring 17 years of work with survivors of gender-based violence to the work. And so, I'm coming out of an extensive nonprofit background, having worked with survivors for a number of years. So, really excited to be a part of this department and in this conversation tonight. Thank you.

Guillermo Cespedes: Thank you. And then the other member of the leadership team is Peter Kim who's our manager, and Peter, tell us a little bit, maybe members of the commission already know you, but share a little bit about you.

Peter Kim: Yes, good evening. This is Peter Kim, manager for the department of loss prevention. Good to be here with you all tonight. I've been with the department now, or out of the city of Oakland for about six and a half years prior to being manager for the DVP, I was a manager for Oakland Unite, which is the violence prevention intervention division in the human services department. Prior to my time in the city of Oakland, I worked in East Oakland in the non-profit community organization called [inaudible 00:03:12:20]. I was there for about 15 years. And so, I'm spent most of my adult life working in East Oakland, in San Antonio. Tonight, we're going to be talking to you all about the work we do, and I'm going to kick us off by walking us through slides. So, I'm not sure who has control over the slide show, but if you can advance them, please.

Regina Jackson: Mr. Russo, are you able advance?

Peter Kim: Yes, thank you.

Guillermo Cespedes: Do you want to go to the next one, please? Great.

Peter Kim: All right. So, far our DVP team, currently we're about 18 staff. We are growing and hoping to go more. Currently we have three planners who kind of oversee our planning and oversight work [inaudible 03:13:12] with the executive team, the three of us on here. We have a number of



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

grants managers or program officers that oversee our grants and contracts that we have with community based organizations, which we will be talking more about in a second. We also have folks who oversee our administration work, including data analysis support, evaluation efforts. And then of course, all of the processing of payments and invoices to our community-based contracts, as well as our consultants. Then we also have a direct service and delivery team. This is mostly our life coaches, which is the term we'll use to talk about case management, and we also have folks that oversee our violence, interruption of Violence Intervention, work in the community, and they help coordinate the work of those efforts. And by our community based providers.

Peter Kim: We also have a community engagement specialist on the team as well. And then finally, we have operations and management support staff who serve with administrative and executive functions. Next slide please. Okay. So, let's talk a little bit about what our department of violence prevention entails. Next slide. So, getting here in creating the department of violence prevention, just often a little bit of context. Back in 2017, the city council approved the creation of the new department of violence prevention. There had not been one prior. And this was really meant to amplify and lift up efforts to prevent and reduce violence in Oakland, and to really draw attention to the need to amplify efforts and to kind of raise it's stature due to the urgency of the violence crisis, and really the violence epidemic in our city. It was about two years later in September of 2019, just last year, that the city of Oakland hired its first chief of as prevention, Guillermo Cespedes. And so he joined the DVP back in September. About a year ago now.

Peter Kim: And it was just in June of this past summer, so just a few months, and then Dr. Sariah Crane joined us as our first deputy chief of violence prevention. And then shortly thereafter, in July of this year, Oakland Unite, the division that was in the human services department that oversaw violence prevention intervention services for Oakland, our entire unit, so all of our team, as well as of our funded programs and all of our funding officially transitions into and becomes the DVP. So, Oakland Unite is no longer the name or the brand that we go by. We are strictly the department of violence prevention. Next slide. Sariah or Guillermo, I think one of you might [crosstalk 00:21:08].

Sarai Crain: [crosstalk 03:16:08] Take over from here. So, the department violence prevention was established to address five specific areas of need, and that would be the reduction of gun violence, the reduction of intimate partner violence, the reduction of commercial sexual exploitation, the reduction of unsolved cold cases, specifically the impact on families and to reduce the level of community trauma. And so, that's broad and obviously can be appropriated in a variety of different contexts. So, those of us that are currently serving in the department of violence prevention have expertise and oversight in all of these particular areas, and are prioritizing strategies that would highlight the reduction of these specific times, the reduction and the intervention of all of these particular types of harm and/or trauma. Next slide.

Sarai Crain: And the department was established to embody models of public health, or public health model, which means that the approach is to improve health and safety by addressing risk factors that increase the likelihood that an individual will become a victim or a perpetrator of violence. And in



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

addition to this public health idea, these particular principles is looking at levels of risks. So, identifying primary, secondary, and tertiary levels of risk, also addressing interventions to specific levels of risks. So, looking at those levels and then assigning a particular medicine or treatment that we would like to see of those particular levels of risk, and also that the interventions truly embodying a public health model do look at individuals, families, peers, and community. So, looking at those as different levels and also the principles of this public health model, specifically embodied by the DVP is that there is an emphasis on asset building rather than simply looking at what's lacking and where the actual deficits are. So, really looking at a strength based approach to addressing some of these issues.

Sarai Crain:

Next slide. And the DVP has a strong value of being community driven, and community driven. A term that kind of gets tossed around in a lot of different ways. And I think people identify or define community in a variety of different ways, but we wanted to make sure that it was clear that the DVP communicates how we objectively define community driven within the context of the department, and that would be that the community actively participates in the identification of problems and implementation of solutions. So, having rich dialogue with individuals that are on the ground floor doing work, and also those who are impacted. Also that we're building capacity in a formal and informal community systems in identification and problem solving process. So, not simply looking for us to dictate solutions or look at dictating what the actual issues are, but actually engaging in a formal and informal process.

Sarai Crain:

And so, so far, we've had community updates. We've had public kind of forums where we're actively engaging community members and stakeholders, and also smaller groups that engaged some of the individuals that are part of our granting network, or those who have been funded by the city of Oakland that are actually doing the work and internally within the actual department where we have individuals that are providing direct service. So, there's just multiple levels of community-driven as defined by us, but also finally that we define all community members as valid stakeholders, including those that have been victims and perpetrators of violence. So, not only looking at individuals that have only been advocating for and community organizing, but actually individuals that have been impacted by trauma and those that have caused harm, and still have some sense of buy-in to the reduction in the intervention of harm as we move forward. Next slide.

Guillermo Cespedes: Peter?

Peter Kim:

Yeah. So, as Dr. Crane had mentioned, we really do believe in a community driven process, and I want to just review you our efforts in those two years between the establishment of the DVP, to where we are today. Where we really try to tap into the knowledge and the wisdom of the folks in the community to inform our efforts. In 2018, we actually had to inform our spending plan, which we put in place, and it actually not constitutes our current interventions. And that year we actually held nine community listening sessions with anywhere between 15 to 30 folks in each sessions, really focused on the communities that are most impacted by violence. So, one session might have been with the mothers and other sorts of the people who've lost loved ones to



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

homicide. We have one with, two actually, with participants from programming, particularly those who've formerly incarcerated, or who have been victims of violence.

Peter Kim: We had another one with activism organizers, and advocates in the community around violence prevention and healthy communities. So, those are the kinds of populations. We also had one that was focused on victims of gender based violence as well. We also then produced an additional review of national best practices, looked at all the different cities and communities around the country that were really kind of at the forefront of violence prevention, intervention practices and collected that information to glean from those, to learn from those and to reflect upon on them. And then we also conducted multiple interviews with system partners and community stakeholders. Also in 2018 into 2019 urban strategies council was consulted to lead a participatory research process that would help inform the creation of a DVP. This included hiring 20 community research fellows. Again, people who reflected the communities that we are serving, the communities that are most impacted, trained them in a participatory research process, and they interviewed or surveyed 500 plus community members.

Peter Kim: Again, those who come from the communities that are hit hardest by violence. They also produce a violence prevention landscape analysis for both locally and the region. And then it culminated in a safe Oakland summit with about 300 folks that attended to kind of help us devise all of the information that was collected and then develop recommendations for the city of Oakland around how the DVP should look [inaudible 03:23:20]. And then in 2019/20, after the Chief Cespedes has arrived, he continued this listening campaign and just sat down personally with multiple stakeholder groups and leadership coalitions, including the violence prevention, coalition, Brotherhood of Elders, our Oakland Frontline Healers, again, mothers and family members of homicide victims, gender-based violence prevention leaders, Oakland Fund for Children and Youth partners, the ceasefire partnership, and other local regional and national partners. Next slide, please.

Guillermo Cespedes: There. Every department has to rely on data and theory and all of that, but there are values that drive what we do, and we're very proud of those values, and one of them is that people, families, communities, despite the underlying conditions that create that the levels of violence and other vulnerabilities that we're all familiar with, that they're capable of healing and transformation. And with the right tools, the right support, the right level of accompanying them, if you will, working hand in hand that, that healing and that transformation is possible. We believe that collaborative partnerships with families in all of the diverse forms that families look like. My field I'm, by training, a social worker often has bypass this idea of strengthening families regardless of what that structure looks like. We feel that a partnership with those families are essential to all prevention and intervention efforts. Even when I think back over my days teaching ensemble music to youth, those youth that were most successful were the youth that we also work with the parents around basic music education. The DVP believes in investing and supporting those most impacted by the pain and trauma.

Guillermo Cespedes: Those are the two experts that tell us not only the scope of a problem, but what those solutions might look like, and specifically, those who have been impacted by the pain and trauma violence,



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

specifically black and Brown families throughout Oakland. And we also believe that violence is systemic in structural relations and must be addressed as a public health crisis. And just as a side note, for many years, most of us were attempting to get the world to look at violence through a public health lens, and I think one of the unintended side effects that have been exposed by COVID is that the same communities that are highest risk, or have underlying conditions that make people at risk for violence are the same communities that have high rates of COVID infection. In other words, this public health issue, it generates violence, it generates health disparities, it generates disparate educational outcomes, and all of the other community vulnerabilities that we're familiar with.

Guillermo Cespedes: They are I'm going to talk a little bit about our current efforts and the five results, and we'll start with blond violence, and we'll go through these results. And then we'll end up with what are the sort of the priority areas that we are coordinating with law enforcement efforts. Peter, can you move us through this?

Peter Kim: Sorry. I was on mute. Sorry about that. So, our first area, or mandate is around gun violence, and this actually contains many different programmatic elements. So, first is the final incident and crisis response strategy. This includes our homicide response teams, folks that support families of homicide victims around funeral planning, and also connecting them with a VOC, or victim of crime funding, and then just also plugging them into grief counseling or mental health support services. This also includes our hospital-based intervention work with folks going directly to Highland Hospital and meet with victims of violence at the bedside, and help try to plug them into supports and services. This also includes violence interruption, and these are folks who are organically with communities, often come from a street life and have been active in violence at one point in their lives, but it may personal transformations, and now on the other side, trying to interrupt violence as occurs in our communities through conflict mediation, as well as just community disruption of violence.

Peter Kim: Our intensive life coaching is another strategy, which is really, again, our model around intensive case management. We also here are really choose to invest in peer professionals. Folks who have stared similar lived experiences, who come from the same communities to serve as mentors as well as navigators, system navigators, brokers of resources, as well as advocates in the courtroom or in school systems on other social service systems. We include our employment and education support systems that are really meant to try to increase job skills, strengthen other kind of soft and hard skills around education and career outcomes, and help them be ready to pursue long-term goals, which would include short term transitional employment to permanent employment and career placement. And then we also have diversion alternatives and reentry support. The diversion alternatives, particularly for young people, diversion support for folks who are coming home after having sort of top particular for violent offenses.

Peter Kim: And really our goal here is to try to help them get to a point where they no longer have to engage with, or have contact with the justice system to successfully, actually to graduate from there. Our community ambassadors, which is part of our community healing strategy, which we'll talk a little



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

bit more in a second. They also help respond to crisis and trauma as it occurs in our communities through healing centered activities. Next slide.

Sarai Crain: I'll share a little bit about the intimate partner and domestic violence strategy. So, currently we oversee the funding of the nonprofit or the community-based organization that works specifically to address family violence and intimate partner violence and response. That's legal advocacy and consulting services. Oftentimes, if an individual has experienced harm or injury and they need to pursue any kind of law enforcement or legal justice, they are able to get confidential services and advocacy services through the Family Violence Law Center, which is co-located at the Alameda County Family Justice Center. There's also a 24-hour crisis line and emergency housing referral sources. Typically, when folks are accessing the crisis line, particularly if they've experienced domestic or family violence, having safe shelter options is definitely a high need. Accessing the crisis line can link folks to those types of resources.

Sarai Crain: Through this particular agency, a thousand... Actually, that's pretty conservative given COVID, but at least a thousand family violence victims annually receive crisis and stabilization support through that particular agency. I would also say that there are other agencies that are at the intersections of intimate partner violence that do offer that type of support as well. We'll go to the next slide. If you go back to... Back another. There you go. Looking specifically at commercial sexual exploitation, which there is a lot of overlap between these types of violence between intimate partner violence and commercial sexual exploitation, primarily because the majority of individuals that find themselves becoming sexually exploited have been exploited at the hands of a romantic or intimate partner.

Sarai Crain: That kind of crisis response for individuals that have experienced that typically involve intensive life coaching, systems advocacy. Folks that have been systems involved, be it through the probation department or incarceration and other ways, having drop-in centers group, and actually individual counseling as well, and also emergency shelter and housing. As you can imagine, that's a critical need for individuals that have been commercially sexually exploited. Also, again, these numbers are conservative, but especially in the wake of COVID but over 250 commercially sexually exploited youth and transitional-aged youth up to the age of 25 have received crisis stabilization and case management wraparound support services through our programs.

Guillermo Cespedes: The cold cases and family support cold cases that we are the only violence prevention platform in the country that is civilian led, that it uses a public health approach, but it has a specific mandate to do work that lead to the reduction in cold cases. Cold cases is an ugly term. These are unsolved deaths, families that have lost members, and there's been no resolution as to who caused that death. One of the policy areas that were intensely in collaboration with several other cities, including LA and Chicago, Newark, New Jersey is the issue of policy change around the eligibility criteria for victims' assistance. Most of you may know that victims' assistance, it's really done through a criminal lens, criminal justice lens. Meaning that for families to be eligible, they have to prove that they had... They're contributing or cooperating with the investigation. Not all family members. Even though a homicide impacts everyone in the family, only certain family members that are eligible.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Guillermo Cespedes: It excludes those who are on probation, on parole, those that are incarcerated. At a policy level, that's one of the areas that we are focused on very intensely. This is something that was really to some degree is not... It's led by the Department of Violence Prevention, but it's really promoted by very powerful group of mothers in Oakland that have really been steering us in the direction. These are mothers that have lost loved ones. There are homicide response teams, mental health support, grief counseling, funeral support. Those are the things the victims of assistance pays for. However, the amount of money that the state provides, a large portion of that money stays on the table because the eligibility criteria excludes many family members. We have made recommendations to OPD and we have worked jointly with them on trauma informed practices that prioritize victims' families report. We'll go to the next one. Next slide, please.
- Peter Kim: Okay. Our final strategy area is community healing, but this is our newer strategy that we just put into place about a year ago. This really is focused on tapping to the resilience side, the strength that exists within communities and really trying to support organic efforts that already exist. Just trying to support both folks who are already doing grassroots efforts around healing, around supporting one another in their communities and also building up community leadership. We do this by supporting efforts on our community outreach and engagement. After moments of crisis and trauma, our data organization team strategy will often reach out and tap into other networks to support them in those moments. We also had a grassroots mini grants program. This actually provided about \$400,000 a year in direct mini grants to grassroots individuals and groups, deliver and bring healing central activities to communities at the Center of Violence and Trauma.
- Peter Kim: This actually gotten a lot of interest and actually more than what we had capacity for, but we had about almost 200 folks over the course of the year, respond to two rounds of mini grant applications and ultimately we're able to fund about 60 of them. In addition, we have coordinated citywide response building upon the community resiliency. I was talking about building on that organic leadership with an intentional focus on healing the trauma and pain from violence. These are often manifests in a form of healing circles, which they've gone virtual now since [inaudible 03:37:05] place. Restorative events, public placing events. Before COVID, they would like block part these or just public events where they were coming and celebrate the community and to build relationships.
- Peter Kim: Now, since COVID, we've had to then shift to different virtual formats, although it has slowed down quite a bit because of the lack of ability to come together. These agencies in the community healing strategy also provide a lot of community organizing and advocacy at the grassroots level by building on community power to push for change and transformation, and also hold our systems accountable. Before we move on to the next slide, all of the work that we just presented to you all, it's not provided directly just by the 18 staff that we went over earlier but there's actually the work of our collaboration with our partners.
- Peter Kim: Our grantees, we fund about 21 community-based organizations, plus two public system partners across 26 contracts. It actually forms the bulk of our DVP network and the community healing has done 70 events in the first year across five grants that were funded. Our gun violence response work with adults served about 700 annually. Then, across nine grants, our youth diversion and



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

reentry strategies served about 220 folks annually with over across eight grants. Then finally, agenda-based violence response work across four grants served about 770 folks annually.

Peter Kim: Moving onto the next slide, and [Dr. Crain 03:38:47] will... Oh, no. Sorry. This is me too. To do that work with all of the providers and to really develop and sustain the work, a lot of our effort is on producing a city-wide network of services that is aligned and coordinated. Our \$9.8 million annually is where our [inaudible 03:39:11] to Measure Z. We have an additional about \$4 million in state and federal funds. Then, we provide these mass funding across the 23 organizations and public partners that I described. We also provide in-house direct service provision of our life coaches and our violence prevention coordinators. We provide our service provider network with coordination and alignment as well as capacity building and technical assistance.

Peter Kim: We bring people and convene them in regular meetings, whether it's kids conferences with our life coaches once a month, or it's once a week, we get all of our intervention and conventional workers and actually do our own shooting homicide review. We coordinate their efforts there. We also bring together a gender-based violence prevention providers by once every two months.

Peter Kim: Then, we also provide capacity building and technical assistance to our network through workshops, trainings. We invest over \$300,000 a year just on capacity building and technical assistance efforts. There's a lot of effort into building our public system partnerships. This is with [inaudible 03:40:18] hospital, with county departments like behavioral health and probation. We work with our justice system partners in the public defender's office and the DA's office. We partner with our schools particularly by developing referral pipeline from kids who were coming out of juvenile hall and back into schools. Of course, we work with law enforcement partners like probation as well as parole and OPD. We also partnered with faith communities and other organic community leadership. Again, finally, overall, we provide about 3100 individuals a year with intensive services and about 9000 people we connect with through community outreach and events. Next slide.

Sarai Crain: We put this slide together just to make sure that we were able to communicate who our network of providers are. We've mentioned them multiple times on this call or in this presentation. We refer to them all the time because they are the lifeblood of the department. They are an extension of the department, and we are very grateful for their work and advocacy. You'll notice multiple... I'm not going to go through them, but I do want to point out just the diversity of the group. There's larger established nonprofits that have been around for a long time, some that have truly evolved over the last decade or so. Building capacity for them has been an honor. There are some new people that have been added to the network of providers. It's not just one group. When RFPs are released, it is going to competitive process.

Sarai Crain: Folks do need to adequately demonstrate what it is that they want to be doing programmatically and why the city needs to get behind it. Then, you'll also notice some system partners there, the probation department, and also, I wouldn't consider the school district a system, but it is a part of a larger body of folks who are engaging with individuals that are vulnerable to some of the levels or issues in terms of experiencing harm and causing harm. It's a really robust list of service



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

providers and really look forward to seeing this expand as funding and capacity grows for the department.

Guillermo Cespedes: Dr. Crain, one comment about that is that that list does not include the large numbers of volunteers to work with brand new organizations. All the volunteers who work with the violence prevention coalition, some of the members that work with the coalition for police accountability, the frontline healers, and many other just advocates, community advocates that we consider them kind of our advisory group. The list is longer than what's there. Can we go to the next slide, please? We're going to do two things. I know slides can get a little bit much. We're going to cover a few more slides about what it looks like moving ahead, and then give attention to the strategies that are closely coordinated with law enforcement.

Guillermo Cespedes: Moving ahead, if we could go to the next slide, please? We are focused on a place-based approach. We are now doing our strategic plan, and disbanding plan that will fund activities for the next three years. That emphasis is going to be on specific places, specific people, specific months, days and times of the year and specific behaviors, not identity. I'll start with the bottom one. Specific behaviors means we don't focus on whether somebody is a group member or a gang member. We focus on the behavior of the person. We don't focus on any identity issue that may be defined as problematic. Our concern is behavior. Our concern is also that we know from data, for example, we've identified 10 areas of the city and they include 10 police feeds, but they're actually larger than the police feeds that we know in years 2018 and 2019, two years consecutively accounted for 50% central shootings with injuries and 34% of intimate partner violence.

Guillermo Cespedes: Those are the specific places that we have identified moving towards... Directing our investment towards and specific strategy towards. This also happened to be the areas that have the highest rates of COVID infection. These are five areas in East Oakland, three in West Oakland and one in Central Oakland. Geographic areas, we'll provide at a later briefing, specific mapping and cross streets and all of that for the commission. Specific people, can we go to the next slide?

Guillermo Cespedes: As Dr. Crain mentioned before, we're really thinking levels of vulnerability of promise. We know that in every community, not even the communities with the highest levels of violence, not every young person, not every young adult is necessarily one that requires law enforcement intervention. We know from this data from lots of different cities and parts of the world that there is such a thing as a primary population. Those youth between ages 10 to 17. They will actually do very, very well with youth development approaches, whether it be afterschool programs, music, classes, mentoring done in a group. These are youth that despite the fact they live in high-risk communities, will actually do very well with the proper support.

Guillermo Cespedes: Many of us that work in this field came out of those communities. Then, there's a group also in that same age range that we want to divert. Primary youth, we think of those who have not had yet significant contact with law enforcement. The community is too, but they haven't. Secondary of those that we're concerned about because slightly they're involved in lower level. They live in communities with underlying conditions that promote certain behaviors. Those behaviors in that



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

group are beginning to show to catch the attention of law enforcement. The tertiary group are those who already affiliated and involved in groups or gangs.

Guillermo Cespedes: The Department of Violence Prevention will not be dealing with all of these levels. For example, there are other city-funded services departments that deal primarily with primary and secondary. Our role in those place, those areas, those priority areas will be to align the tertiary work of the Department of Violence Prevention with primary and secondary programs already funded by the city. We do not have the resources to cover all of these populations, but we do have the interdepartmental agreement that we will collaborate in these areas. Then, at the community level, obviously the entire population of residents living in this target communities, including young children, elders, and we are very much emphasizing what we're calling ancestrally informed family work, which is really building on this idea that black and brown families have, for lots of different reasons, become a bit disconnected from their multi-generational history as a result of trauma and institutional racism and economic devastation.

Guillermo Cespedes: We are looking to capture that work that uses customs and traditions and celebrations to reignite the sense of pride and resilience in that culturally relevant ancestral traditions. We go to the next slide, please. 2021, this year is a year of planning and development. We've been refining and developing risk assessment and evaluation. Our strategic plan and release with RFQ will be in early 2021. Of course, we are doing a lot of work at fund development, applying for state and federal grants as well as dealing with philanthropy. Next slide please.

Guillermo Cespedes: The strategic vision of the department is divided into three sections. One, I talked about the place-based strategy of these nine geographic locations where actually, we just extended it to 10 using existing DVP resources, Measure Z, grants and private sector. Phase two is basically doing more of that, but this time, in combination with resources of primary and secondary prevention of city departments, and the third phase is the multi-sectoral strategy that combined city and county. These are not necessarily sequential. Meaning that for example, we're already in collaboration with elements of the county, particularly youth and adult probation, developing specific pilots with them around working with families at the highest levels of risk that are coming out of juvenile detention facilities. That's our strategic vision moving forward. If we could go to the next slide, we would look at what are the strategies that require coordination with OPD? Peter, can you kind of... Peter [inaudible 03:51:18] for this.

Peter Kim: [inaudible 03:51:20].

Guillermo Cespedes: Okay.

Peter Kim: Yeah. I think a request from the police commissioner was to talk specifically about what kind of coordination efforts we have with OPD. Right now, our principal partnership effort with OPD is the ceasefire strategy really in that stretch. I'll talk more about it in the next line, but looking forward, we want to increase our partnership around training, particularly around relational policing. I know that in the past, several folks within our unit and team have contributed to partner with different planning modules with OPD. I think moving forward to focus more on



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

relation policing is going to definitely be something that we can invest a lot more time into. Triangle response...

Guillermo Cespedes: Hello?

Peter Kim: Hi. Can you hear me?

Guillermo Cespedes: Yeah. Go ahead, Pete.

Peter Kim: Then, the triangle response that Chief Cespedes is talking about, he's mentioned, and I think we'll talk a little bit more about. We're at field testing right now, but that is something that I think Chief [Manheimer 00:03:52:20] alluded to is really looking to see how we can have more of a presence and be a more of a consistent response partner at moments in crime scenes, in homicides or shootings. Chief Cespedes talked about the cold cases. Then, of course, MACRO, which is on a lot of people's minds right now, DVP has been given the task of trying to steward that process with our community partners. That is also going to include partnership and coordination with law enforcement. Since right now, they are currently generating all the calls for those types of issues that MACRO will be absorbing. Next slide.

Peter Kim: To talk specifically about ceasefire, this is a partnership that [Open 03:53:07] has been... Or a strategy that Steve Open has been doing for quite some time now, about seven plus years. Our role, the DVP's role on ceasefire really is as the support services partner, and we receive referrals through very intentional referral pathways. We then take those referrals. We perform assessment and we also intake folks according to protocols of ours. Then, we also built in accountability metrics to [inaudible 00:23:39]. What are the efforts that we're doing and are they effective?

Peter Kim: On our own, I alluded to this earlier, we have weekly shooting review and crisis response coordination meeting. This is outside and separate from what OPD does, but this is our way of also aligning our service efforts and making sure that we are coordinating how we're responding to incidents and supporting individuals and families with those services. We also do temporary emergency relocation support.

Peter Kim: For those folks who are actually experiencing great danger and their lives are literally threatened, we do have services, and we fund supports that allow us to get people out of Oakland temporarily because this isn't like a permanent relocation program, but it has ways to get people out of Oakland from anywhere between a couple of weeks to being several months to get them out. We can help cool down the situation and look for opportunities where our interventional workers, our [inaudible 03:54:35] can look for mediation and make it safe for someone to come back home.

Peter Kim: We also have our monthly live coaching case conferences and trainings. Again, our life coaches are working specifically to those [inaudible 03:54:47] violence, whether they are victims of that violence or they are creating the harm. Then, we also ultimately serve as a liaison and a buffer between law enforcement and our service providers. We have to ensure that our service



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

providers are able to maintain their credibility as community workers, and to also maintain the trust of their participants. We do this by establishing protocols. Again, the DVP is the buffer. We're the main conduit of information, and that's that one way flow of information coming from law enforcement to us, so that we can help inform our efforts in the communities around reducing intervening violence, but we don't provide any identifying information back to law enforcement that may compromise the integrity of our service providers as trusted intervention workers. The DVP plays a large role at trying to facilitate that and make sure that that happens. Okay.

Sarai Crain: Yeah. I'll speak briefly to this. Then, I think it'll actually be appropriate for Chief [inaudible 03:55:53] to speak more just to provide a bit more context around relational policing, but we just wanted to make sure that it was communicated that the department does not necessarily conduct relational policing because we're not OPD. We would consider ourselves a partner and consultant. Now, I think that could go both ways in terms of the relationship that we are continuing to build out with Oakland police.

Sarai Crain: Just to, again, objectively define it within the context of the department that we're looking to coordinate activities designed to develop non-transactional relationships with communities. Wanting to really help support those efforts to build and forge and concretize relationships between Oakland police as well as other community providers and community members and also, serve as a resource for training. Looking to build capacity for trainings. We're looking at funding options. We're looking at a grant and trying to just exploit opportunities to build capacity for police as appropriate. I don't know if chief or Peter, if you'd like to add anything else to this?

Guillermo Cespedes: No. I think that's about it. We consider relation policing again, something that we do have a commitment to building like Dr. Crain said, non-transactional relationships, relationships that do not require community members to help necessarily solve criminal investigations. Let's go to the next slide. One of the things that we have begun dusting off the shelves and looking to inform a more effective way of responding to incidents of shootings with serious injuries and homicides. It's something where we're using.... I'm not very familiar with it because I was able to conceptualize it and implement it as one component of a comprehensive strategy in LA. It's been field tested. My team and I went between September 2009 and September 2012, over 2,500 responses, field responses that men responding to crime scenes, either in the community or at the hospital. When I said my team, that included me. We responded 24/7, 365 days a year.

Guillermo Cespedes: This became critically important in shaping community perceptions of city government because as a deputy mayor, I spend most of my time or bulk of my time going to crime scenes. There's been evaluation by the Urban Institute in 2012. One that showed that it improves relationship between city government, including the police and marginalized communities. Then, equally as important, one by UCLA in 2017, that using network analysis shows that this kind of approach, the way we refer to as the triangle response, reduces retaliatory shootings by 41% in target areas.

Guillermo Cespedes: The triangle response, we started implementing it in LA in 2009. It is still a part of the LA strategy. In fact, in 2016, I believe it was or '15, maybe a little bit earlier, some members of OPD. Then, I



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

believe she was director of public safety for the mayor. Oakland came to LA to shadow the triangle response. If we could go to the next slide, please. What it is, is basically it's a 24/7 response to shootings with serious injuries and homicides. Three entities respond simultaneously, social workers advocate types training, crisis intervention, training intervention workers, and law enforcement response simultaneously.

Guillermo Cespedes: It's got a geographic focus. It could include crime scenes or hospitals and DVP will provide oversight and coordination of the triangle response. There are five of us, four of us that are part of the department that will be deploying to crime scenes, physically deploying to crime scenes. Let's go to the next one. What are the next steps in this triangle response? Well, outreach, training and development. A Lot of training and development and identifying the triangle roles from the concept, the conceptual framework underneath it. This is actually that it's not being informed by criminal justice paradigms or procedural justice paradigms, the conceptual framework underneath upon which the protocols were built.

Guillermo Cespedes: It's actually a family systems theory called the theory of relational triangles applied to this kind of work. This was done in LA. We wanted to stay out of using criminal justice lens to implement a protocol that is really in the interest of community and families. Although there are elements that show clearly that it impacts positively on the relationship between city government and marginalized communities and police and marginalized communities. We're going to field test this in areas responsible for 50% of shootings with injuries and 34% intimate partner violence. At this point, we are rolling this out without making a financial request of the city, in other words, we're moving resources around because we think given the situation that we're in, the department has to do something that it's a lot more rigorous. As you all know, the city is in a significant financial strait.

Guillermo Cespedes: This will be the next steps for phase one. Okay? We'll keep settling, checking back in with you all on this. If we could go to the next one, please? Cold cases, we don't know the number and I believe OPD is figuring that out. The following number, how we got involved in this was to a report by the Berkeley Law Center, which they reported the 70% of homicides over the last decade in Oakland have been African-Americans and the 40% lead to an arrest versus 80% with white victims.

Guillermo Cespedes: Our policy work, as I mentioned before, is around victims of crime, but the reason we are very intently involved in this is because these cold cases in black and brown communities generate an enormous amount of trauma because we know that every time there is a shooting, it triggers those memories and that trauma that other families have gone through. One of our stated goals is to reduce family trauma. We're collaborating with... The investigation of cold cases, that is the lane of law enforcement. We're looking at the trauma associated with cold cases. This is the area of work that we're looking at. Let's go to the next one, please. Then, Dr. Crain will provide a brief update on MACRO, and then we'll take questions from the commissioners.

Sarai Crain: You got it. For those of you who are not aware of MACRO, it is the Mobile Assistance Crisis Response of Oakland. This has been a highly anticipated pilot that the city of Oakland is really



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

excited to be a part of the implementation of, and our department has been overseeing the administrative end of its implementation. Right now, we're at the phase of identifying and specifying the community-based partner. That will actually be the vendor who would be in partnership with folks-with the city of Oakland to be an alternative response. The goal is to limit and minimize the footprint of law enforcement responding to certain calls that may exacerbate harm or injury. And as we know that OPD is constantly tapped out, and regularly at capacity, especially as it pertains to responding to some lesser crimes, and oftentimes that ends up being the call that they have to make in terms of who gets to respond to what. And so that has become a tremendous pinch on them, as well as with community members, and those that are perceived that the intervention that they have received hasn't been helpful. And so we're looking to see how this pilot can actually minimize or reduce responses that would be most appropriate for peer led and community-based advocates.

Sarai Crain: So, the request for qualification will be released next week, next Friday, October the 30th. Yeah, that's been a tedious but also really important and educational process for the DVP and for community members that have been engaged in this. And I just want to say that there has been a lot of community engagement, enthusiasm and input in this process, and real community activism around this process and looking at the model, which mostly is aligned with the Cahoots Model from Eugene, Oregon, but definitely wanting to make sure that the macro pilot is appropriate for Oakland, as we see some of the differences that exist in Eugene, but ultimately the [RFIC RQ 00:02:08] will be released next week. I mean, yes, next Friday, and we're looking for the pilot to begin, or the selection process after, that will take place between November and December.

Sarai Crain: We're looking for that contractor to and go live in January. Yeah, we have already started hosting community meetings and community updates with folks. So please feel free to contact our office for notification for those community updates. They are welcome to the public, and we would definitely want feedback and buy-in as we're moving forward with the pilot, and... Yeah, we're excited about where we are so far, and finally seeing things moving and getting off the ground.

Guillermo Cespedes: Thank you. We'll take questions, and do our best to answer them. And thank you Madam chair for this opportunity to at least introduce some of the work that we're doing, and we'll take questions.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Chief. This is a great overview. I appreciate it very much, and I'm hoping that maybe their department will be able to give us updates, maybe a couple of times a year, so we can stay in alignment with what excellent work is going on, particularly around Macro. But I do have one question. I was struck by... I think it was two slides ago, where you mentioned that only 40% of the homicides or criminals actually lead to arrest, versus 80% for white victims. I know that this is information that you're reporting from the Berkeley law center, but do you have some insights as to why that is? I'm struck by Brianna Taylor, and the fact that the message that is communicated is that we're not a value, that the black folks just are not... Their lives aren't valuable, but I don't want to just go out on a tangent like that. If you have some insights that are actually rooted in data or facts.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Guillermo Cespedes: I don't. I think what we did is that, we were in close contact with a group of mothers, the family support network, and this report came out, and we recorded on the report, and usually each time we report it, we place the notice where the data came from, because it is not our job to sort of develop hypothesis as to why this is going on. These are the numbers that they came up with. We're interested in the trauma lens. We're interested in the fact that, whether it's 40%, 30%, 50%, whatever percent it is, in black and brown communities, we do know that the [inaudible 04:10:11] the rest, the issue of cold cases, trigger when somebody else gets shot. So that's sort of the way we're approaching it. We haven't answered the question why, we know the what, and that's what we're addressing, but I think that is a question that requires a little bit more digging as to what are the dynamics underlying that.
- Regina Jackson: Absolutely, and I'm hoping that at some point you can get to that because, to not know why, means that we can't really set about ways in which to reduce those numbers, because when we talk about race and equity, we've got some serious challenges in the city of Oakland, but anyway... Another question; So, what do your wraparound services entail?
- Guillermo Cespedes: Life coaching, and I'll let Peter get more specific about numbers around that. We do life coaching for adults and for youth, and they include employment, counseling. Peter, do you want to answer this a little bit more in detail?
- Peter Kim: Sure. I think our principal mode of... I'm not trying to support folks with a wrap around, comprehensive support is through our life coaching strategy. Like I mentioned earlier, life coaching really serve as kind of brokers of resources, and they connect them to the employment, career exploration, education supports, also provide them with connection to mental health supports, medical support, and they also then link them with housing. We actually have a partnership right now with the community housing services. [inaudible 04:12:08] human service department through their OPRE program, that allows about 24, 25 folks. That's not a huge group for us but it provides them with subsidized housing for up to two years, so housing is also another resource that we try to wrap people [inaudible 04:12:26] with. And then also we plug in where it depends on what the individual needs. What our life coaches do is they create life maps, which are informed by the individual.
- Peter Kim: It's really meeting them where they're at, and then letting them define for themselves, what are their goals? And where do they see themselves? So sometimes some folks might want to try to engage in a small entrepreneurial business. So then we try to connect them with folks that can help mentor them to create that business for them. Sometimes it's people who want to help improve their relationships with their family members, with their children, with their significant other, or with their nuclear family, and so then we provide support that way. Some folks also are interested in a more kind of traditional clinical supports of mental health, mental health therapy, counseling, things of that nature. So really whatever the individual needs, our life coaches are trained to really seek out those resources to help navigate them to those supports.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Thank you. I have one more question, which is a follow-up to that. And how are you distinguishing differently between justice involved young people, or justice involved people, as it relates to life coaching?
- Peter Kim: Also, if I understand the question correctly, we have life coaches that support young people. So generally, that age range is about 15 years old to 18 years old. And then we have folks that are like coaches for adults, that's from 18 to 35. That age range, that transitional age youth range from 18 to about 24, that you can [inaudible 04:14:04] some of them might fall under the youth life coaching preview, some of them might fall under the adult, but essentially it's from 16 to 35, 15 years old to 35 years old. We do separate youth from adult, because for the youth, we focus a lot more on education supports, trying to transition them back into schools, back into classroom seats, when there were actually classes being held, and trying to have placements that stick, placements that work, and we work with all USD on that, for adults, it's... Okay. I'm sorry. Did you want to-
- Regina Jackson: Yeah. I'm sorry. I get the age stuff, but what I'm trying to determine is, is there a different protocol for justice involved? And then how do you measure success? How long does life coaching happen? With however many people. I'm looking from the perspective of mentoring since that's my work, and I'm just trying to get a little deeper on what your indices around success and outcomes look like, and how long does the trajectory of support go for?
- Peter Kim: So currently, what we do is we allow life coaches [inaudible 04:15:19] 18 months of service. At one point is 12 months for exhibiting more time, the age [inaudible 04:15:26] is probably... A lot of people's minds, not long enough, but we've allowed people to have up to 18 months of service. The thing about life coaching is we really focus on intensive engagement. So we require that folks are having numerous contacts, face-to-face at least three times a week, and then text messages, phone calls, and other kinds of virtual communication more than that. Of course it tapers off over time. Person that is younger, is able to kind of get on their feet, then that might taper off, but in the beginning, it's very intensive in terms of time, and communication. In terms of looking...
- Regina Jackson: I'm sorry. I'm just trying to follow. So three times a week, even during the pandemic, face-to-face engagement?
- Peter Kim: So that was before the pandemic. During the pandemic, it kind of differs in various from organization to organization. Some organizations have quickly made quick adjustments, and we're able to continue their face to face engagement, particularly for people who have urgent needs. Other agencies really took the shelter in place on protocols, who want more vision about that in protection of their own staff. So it's kind of very... But across the board, every agency has said, "Look, in general practice during the shelter in place, we're trying to do as much virtual connection as possible, but because of the clientele and because of the need, that folks have had to actually get people by delivering grocery bags, food packs, prepared meals, hygiene packs that include toilet paper, deodorant, shampoo, toothpaste, toothbrushes, and then also provide stipends. We also provide folks with incentive, [inaudible 04:17:08] milestones.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Peter Kim: We've had to actually... During the shelter in place, adjust those milestones [inaudible 00:12:12]. Now, if folks are staying home, and being in some... And doing exercise regimens, writing in journals, doing things with their young people, with their kids or their family members, then we would incentivize them by providing the stipends, those stipends often have to be delivered hand by hand. That is an opportunity to get a face to face interaction. So the majority of our people serve are justice involved. I mean, that is the criteria that we use. We are focused on those people who have been impacted either by violence, either as victims, or by perpetrating the violence, which means that they are just as involved.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. That's excellent. Thank you for clarifying that. Now, have you actually gone through an 18 month period? I mean, how many people have gotten jobs, or moved into housing, based upon this protocol?
- Peter Kim: So I don't have the hard numbers, that turns that how many people actually that employment or housing. For employment, we do have an evaluation that is [inaudible 04:18:16] around the success of the employment numbers. Housing though, I think the majority of our folks are currently housed, but it's a mixture. Some of them might be independent housing, some that might be living with family members, but homelessness is an issue that we deal with, and I got to say, that is one area that we often don't have resources readily available for the most extreme cases. Housing is a very difficult nut to crack, for the people who are literally or chronically homeless. 73% of all our folks are just as involved though. I do know that number off the top of my head.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. That's great. I definitely want to see an update soon because, to help us understand how successful this process is, you actually have to have some real numbers. How long have you been in service to this process? Have you completed an 18 month period, or are you still in the midst of one?
- Peter Kim: No. We've been allowing folks to have an 18 month service period for... I want to say at least five years or so. We have a life coaching evaluation. I'll be honest. I don't know if the evaluators look specifically at duration, but the average time that we have seen actually though, is across the board around nine months. So we do know that there are some folks who are well above that, and some people who are much shorter than that, but around nine months is the time that kind of at that average sweet spot for when folks have exited the programming.
- Peter Kim: Sometimes it's because of successful exit, because they feel like they are self-sustaining, they don't need the support, others because of lack of engagement. I mean, it goes both ways. But nine months is what we're looking at. And that's really important in forming our ability to understand, what is the right dosage of service. 18 months was kind of this number that we had heard from our providers saying, "We need more time. We need more time." But we're trying to look closely at what does that nine month average really... What does it really mean in terms of appropriate dosage.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Yeah, so I appreciate this and I realized that I've been doing most of the questions, so I want to open it up to my fellow commissioners. But when you come back, I would really like to see the different channels of service. The person that's trying to get the job may not be also trying to get housing, or the person might need to get housing job, and something else. And I definitely want to see as it relates to the... Whether it's a nine month or 18 month, how are you measuring success?
- Regina Jackson: How are you ensuring that people aren't going to jail, or returning to jail? And what is that trajectory? So, getting real hard data is very important. I recognize that setting these processes up takes time, but when you talk about the storyline of a person, or like the profile of a person, and use that to kind of provide an overview of the context, I recognize that people are going to be different in terms of their onboarding, and whoever was victimized or whoever was the victimizer, and they may have different tracks. But I think that will be very helpful to fully frame those out, so that we can understand what success looks like.
- Peter Kim: Yeah. I appreciate that, Gena. Thank you. I agree with you. I don't know if it's still to you or someone else. What we'll do is, we'll send you the evaluations that have already been produced. We do have evaluations that have shown that one and two years out after program participation. We've seen a decrease and arrest for violent offenses. There're other things that those evaluations have surfaced. I want to send those to you, and then you can look at those. And then if there are other questions that aren't answered in the evaluations, let us know, and then that help inform our evaluation efforts moving forward.
- Regina Jackson: Sure. And one last question from me anyway, have you been able to track how much money has been invested per person? I recognize that it's not always the same based upon the need, but that would also be a really important indicator.
- Peter Kim: I have numbers, but I can tell you tonight about how much is invested in each strategy overall, in terms of a cost analysis per person. That is something that we've been talking to our evaluators with. That's something that Chief Cespedes is very interested in. So I think your question is an important one. We don't have that individual cost thesis yet.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Well that as you all know is going to be incredibly important as you go after funding, to provide supports to that. And obviously, I want to lend my support however I can. This is not directly my work, but it's just directly my work. So I want to support you however I can, but having those trued up data pieces is just so incredibly important. So again, forgive me for taking so much time. Commissioners if you have any questions, please raise your hand, and if not, we can go to public comment. I am not seeing any hands raised. Oh one, excuse me. Commissioner Dorado you've been unmuted.
- Jose Dorado: Thank you chair Jackson. Well, one question was hopefully that slide presentation's available. I certainly would like a copy, but my question is, I fully expect that once we get into march and the re-imagining police task force comes out with its recommendations to the council, that there'll be a few million dollars that will be identified from the OPD budget. So given that assumption, if you



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

had... Let's just put a number on it, \$5 million that came out of OPDs budget, directed toward community needs, and it landed in your lap, where would you put that money primarily?

Guillermo Cespedes: Commissioner Dorado. I think at this point, what we have done is that we put together a budget for the type of programming that we would like to develop in the areas, in the geographic areas that we have identified. And it's a substantial increase. It is actually doubling the amount of resources that the department of violence prevention has. Keep in mind that this is all measure [inaudible 04:25:16] funding that allows us to focus on a particular population.

Guillermo Cespedes: So we certainly present that budget, and what that would look like to this party. So we're expecting that we may be asked to present it at the task force, but it's something that we have developed kind of in a broad way. So right now I have to be honest with you; we are very, very much around the clock caught up with this historical moment of violence throughout the city, and while we don't sleep, and our staff is in the field and we're doing it weekend to weekend, we're sharing the frustration that we need to get this under control.

Guillermo Cespedes: So we haven't really spent a lot of time looking at that budget that we created, I believe we presented just the general numbers to the task force, that we can come back and lay out what it would look like if we actually had what we think are the required resources to do this kind of work. We don't feel like we can present that, and this is what Peter Kim was talking about. Do we have a better idea of not just a cost per participant, the cost benefit analysis? So what is the cost of violence for the city of Oakland? All of the work that I did in LA was based on using numbers, that were attached to nine different categories of crime. So that cost benefit analysis, we haven't done yet, and that will be required for us to be able to present it to policy makers.

Regina Jackson: Yes.

Guillermo Cespedes: Again, I think one of the challenges for the department of violence prevention is that we are a direct practice shop, we're an administrative shop, a policy arm is almost non-existent, and we need a more robust internal data collection, to inform public policy arm. So part of the growth that we're looking at, is to have the resources to answer these questions. Even for us to get data, is massively complex. So we're growing and there's some things that we know really well. And I don't mind sharing with this body that this is a lot more things that we're learning. So I will gladly come back, and kind of share what our... Not our dream budget. Well, we think it's a realistic budget, given the need. But I wouldn't want to speculate, at least not in public, about what we would do with an extra \$5 million, without really thinking it through. And that I look forward to coming back and having that conversation.

Jose Dorado: I can appreciate that. These slides will be available, is that correct?

Guillermo Cespedes: Absolutely. No. Everything that we do, it's public. We work for the city and everything we do, every thought we have, every... All of these always belongs to the city, so we will gladly share it. We expect this is the first of...



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Regina Jackson: [inaudible 04:29:08].
- Guillermo Cespedes: [inaudible 04:29:02] to the...
- Regina Jackson: And that's correct. That's correct, because we know that it costs \$350,000 per person to jail someone.
- Guillermo Cespedes: Absolutely. Yeah. Yeah.
- Regina Jackson: We should know what the cost is to keep people out of jail.
- Guillermo Cespedes: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: [Inaudible 04:29:26]to help them towards success. So I'm expecting that you and I will have several conversations and I can try to support however I can, so that you will be able to tell the story in a way that will encourage more investments.
- Guillermo Cespedes: Thank you. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: So I see no more questions, so I think we're going to go to public comment. There may be some more questions that come up there, but thank you very much for your presentation.
- Guillermo Cespedes: Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam chair. At this time, any member of the public that wishes to speak on item nine, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue, and you'll be called in the order in which your hands are faced. This time I see seven hands in the queue. The first speaker is a telephone attendee with the last four digits; 3787. Good evening, exemption 3787. Can you hear us?
- Ms. Bandabaila: Hello. I've been waiting for over an hour and a half to speak. So I would like to make it known, please do not cut me off. I am the older sister of Jonathan Bandabaila. He's been missing since May 3rd, 2019. I want to make it very clear, that no one on the commissions besides former commissioner Ginalel Harris, has been involved in helping my family in Johnson's case. No one but her. After 17 months, OPD still has no leads, still is not in constant contact with my family regarding Jonathan's case. Jonathan's 21st birthday just passed on October 19th, which was Monday. It was not until our family and Michele, our family spokesperson, who's OPD to put something on social media regarding his case. To say I am furious is an understatement, do not use my brother's case. Do not use his name in vain. Do not use his name as if you guys have been helping our family. Do not use Johnson's names for your agenda.
- Ms. Bandabaila: No one wants to get on the commissions besides former commissioner Janell Harris has pushed OPD to do their job, in Jonathan's case, and to bring this for our family. Our family has gone through hell since May 3rd, 2019. My father has been to almost every commission's meeting since May 3rd, 2019, fighting for OPD to help us, crying and pleading in front of everyone, and we are



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

met with little help. Do not act as if you have been making his case known on social media. It was not until last week a video was put out, and that wasn't because once again, my family and Michele, Chris OPD after multiple, multiple email attempts, especially since his birthday was quickly approaching. Where was social media when my brother's case first happened? Where was the media when Jonathan first went missing? Where was OPD when we reached out to them when Jonathan first went missing? I will not sit here and tolerate my brother Jonathan's name being used-

Juanito Rus: Thank you Ms. Bandabaila.

Ms. Bandabaila: I will not tolerate...

Juanito Rus: Your two minutes have expired.

Ms. Bandabaila: I will not tolerate the name to be used for politics, or for anyone...

Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Rashidah Grinage. Good evening, Ms. Grinage. Can you hear us?

Rashidah Grinage: I don't think I had my [inaudible 04:33:08] enraged. Thank you [inaudible 00:28:09].

Juanito Rus: Thank you. My apologies. I muted myself accidentally. The next speaker in the queue is Lorelei Bosserman.

Lorelei Bosserman: Hi.

Juanito Rus: Good evening, Ms. Bosserman. Can you hear us?

Lorelei Bosserman: Thank you very much. I want to thank the department of violence prevention for this presentation. You guys are doing some really great work. And violence prevention is such a big, hairy bear, and I've been trying lately to sort of, figure out what it's all about. But I'm particularly interested in Macro, because I've been sort of following the discussion and the designing work from the beginning. I was at the hearing that the police commission held, where homeless people first raised the issue of wanting an alternative to calling the police in. And there've been a lot of meetings with the community, and there are a few things came up a lot that community members really cared about, and I want to make sure that those things are protected.

Lorelei Bosserman: One thing that people really cared about was, creating something that was specifically for Oakland, that it wasn't just what they used in Eugene, but did it took into account the specific needs and talents of Oakland, and the importance of hiring responders from the communities that they're going to serve. I think that's really important for a lot of reasons. And one of the things that I'm concerned about is that we don't demand a lot of specific credentials or advanced degrees, that we get people from the communities who are really going to be able to do the job well, and that we pay them really well. I don't know if you can tell me if that's budgeted, that we give them really good salaries because we want to be able to attract good people. We want to be



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

able to retain good people, and that money is an investment in a vulnerable community. And I think employment is really key to a lot of violence issues, although you guys would know that better than I would. Thanks.

Juanito Rus: Thank you miss. Bosserman. The next speaker in the queue is Kevin Cantu. Good evening, Mr. Cantu. Can you hear us?

Kevin Cantu: Hi again. So the last couple of callers have made some excellent points, and I'd just like to say that I love the sound of a lot of this violence prevention effort, and I think it's worth pursuing in a lot of different ways, even if there's not... It doesn't turn out that there is an immediate, obvious, like dollars and cents. We spend this much when a person is sent to jail, or we spend this much when they're not, or even if there's not some... Something like that. We're trying over and over and over again in America, to see if more police violence, or a different kind of police violence, can be used to solve problems. And we need to try just as hard, just as stubbornly, to see if other kinds of solutions can stick. And I think there are many different kinds of solutions that can be good, and that we should pursue. And I love hearing from people who lead with empathy like this, and I look forward to hearing more. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Cantu. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits; 9997. Good evening, extension 99-97. Can you hear us?

9997: Yeah. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Yeah, join us whenever you're ready.

9997: All right. First of all, I think it was really poor taste to cut off the older sister of somebody who's disappeared. They should have just given her 30 seconds, and I'm very ashamed and embarrassed that you didn't. The point I want to make, or the question I want to ask, and I hope through the chair, I can ask Mr. Cespedes to explain in a much tighter form, what the triangle thing is, because it was mentioned by a council person during a recent discussion about oversight, to the police as something that needed to wait until the conversation about oversight from the council's point of view had to wait until this was rolled out better by DVP and the police.

9997: And so it seems like this would be a very necessary target of inquiry from the commission. I'm disappointed that no one has followed up on that. And I'm hoping that Mr. Cespedes gets another chance. So can I ask of the chair for Mr. Cespedes to give a more capsule version of what this is, the Triangle... I don't know the second part of it; Triangle something. Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Chief Cespedes, can you follow the request?

Guillermo Cespedes: Absolutely. Absolutely.

Regina Jackson: Thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Guillermo Cespedes: The Triangle response is basically shifting the relationship of responding to crime scenes through a dyad, through just say intervention and community, or police and community, and it's building a more robust, sustainable system, of three entities at once, especially during times of stress at a crime scene. I think we all are in agreement that in case of a crime scene, the job of the police should be exclusively the investigation, not dealing with families, not dealing with necessarily the associates of the victim, not dealing with community trauma. So that's one leg of the Triangle; dealing with families, dealing with community, dealing with the associates of the victim. And then there's another piece to it, which has to do with the presence of other city departments in times of crisis, besides the police. So in the case of LA, we recommended, it started from a value system. The city should not be asleep while a family is losing its member in the middle of the night. And by the city, that mean more than the police. So the triangle is basically a three way response and there's a conceptual theory behind it and there's data holding it up that means it's more effective to respond with three entities than with one. And those three entities are social workers, advocate types trained in crisis intervention, violence intervention workers, or known in Oakland as violence interrupters, and of course, OPD. One word of caution. Since I have worked all over the world, I know that it's impossible to transfer models from one place to another. So what we're doing with the triangle response, it's basically using the data, using the model to adapt and contextualize that to Oakland, the same way that we're going through that process between CAHOOTS and MACRO. So I've transferred models from LA to all kinds of countries, and so I know that it's nearly impossible. So I hope that helps.
- Regina Jackson: I think that it's certainly much more clear to me. So I'm hopefully that he understood as well. I know that we have a few more speakers, so we may have more questions. I'm going to try and have us handle them all at one time at the end of their...
- Guillermo Cespedes: Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Uh-huh (affirmative). Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Madam Chair. The next speaker in the queue is Assata Olugbala. Good evening Miss Olugbala, can you hear us?
- Assata Olugbala: Yes. I'm not interested in anybody answering questions. I have questions, but I don't want answers. I was very encouraged six years ago, when then Attorney General Kamala Harris decided to put emphasis on childhood trauma. I hear the conversation around community and family trauma. At that time, she recognized a sincere and necessary need to deal with children who were being traumatized due to abuse, neglect and community violence. Soon after that, I read a report that said during the course of children in all USD's experience from kindergarten to 12th grade, 50% of those children would be involved in some form of violence, trauma related violence, and would need the services of social workers and in some cases, psychologists. I also read a report that 90% of the youth who are currently in the juvenile Alameda County hole had been diagnosed with post-traumatic stress syndrome. Children who are traumatized need intervention. I would also like to mention that I have a lot of hope for the group known as Youth A lot, their intervention in interruption of violence, particularly in the hospitals where they go to the beds of



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

individuals who have been the victims of trauma, it's been going on for years and has been very successful. I'm also encouraged with the Roots Community Health Center. Mr. Kim, I'm concerned with the fact that the meetings, that the violence prevention community prevention department goes to life enrichment, and doesn't go to public safety.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Miss Olugbala, your two minutes have expired. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, five eight zero two. Good evening five eight zero two, can you hear us?

Saleem Bey: Yes, I can hear you. This is Saleem Bey and I've got like 12 pages of notes off of what was presented so I'm going to try and boil this down. Number one, I want to bear witness to what the truth of what Jonathan's older sister said about OPD and their performance for the public and Oakland Police Commission. That has nothing to do with the truth of how they've dropped this case, nor have they put the attention on the policy that's needed to fix this. It was also that it was Police Commissioner Harris that was holding OPDs feet to the fire on the Jonathan Bandabaila case. The selection committee made sure that they sabotaged that type of justice.

Saleem Bey: Now I want to go to poverty. Poverty is at the root of violence. Everything that you just said, everything is a symptom of poverty. If you do not address poverty, violence going to increase. Look at the violence trends in Piedmont. Tell me why the violence trends in Piedmont are so low, it's because there's not a lot of poverty there. So everything that you're doing is putting a BAND-AID on it if you don't do poverty. I want you to write down these cold cases because there is a lot of trauma in cold cases. And my brother's cold case when he was murdered in 2004, they lost all the files for his case. And OPD hasn't said anything nor found any files since they told us five years ago. So that means every police chief, including this police chief, wringing her hands and saying she's doing so much, has ignored this.

Saleem Bey: 04065105, that's [inaudible 04:46:15] and he was murdered. And the people who murdered him had a relationship with OPD. So make sure that when you follow up on these type of cases where there are trauma and people will never, ever give up on justice for their family members, that's why I'm here today. Listening to all of the bull crap, all the spin, all OPD and everything because there's no justice in OPD. So if OPD was fixed, if OPD had an integrity unit, [inaudible 00:06:42], that was worth anything or did anything in the past that-

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. Your two minutes have expired. The next speaker in the queue is Megan Steffen. Good evening, Miss Steffen. Can you hear us?

Megan Steffen: Yes. Hi. If she's still on the line, I'd like to give my time to the elder sister of Jonathan Bandabaila. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Miss Steffen, under the Brown Act, a speaker gets two minutes and you cannot share time under the rules of this agenda, unless the Chair would like to intercede. I'm sorry.

Regina Jackson: Have we completed all of the hands that are up?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Juanito Rus: We still have two more hands after Miss Steffen.
- Regina Jackson: Oh, I see. Okay. Okay. Please continue.
- Juanito Rus: Very well. The next speaker in the queue is Bruce Schmiechen. Good evening, Mr. Schmiechen. Can you hear us?
- Bruce Schmiechen: Yeah. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: Yeah.
- Bruce Schmiechen: Bruce Schmiechen, I'm with Faith in Action East Bay and the Coalition for Police Accountability. And two things. One is, yeah, we were the MACRO program, the cons that came out of community meetings, community consultation, and we do want to make sure that as this proceeds, the original concept is held to, that these are jobs that are for people who are community-based, come from communities where these things are happening, have relevant experience and that there not be some kind of credentialed, professionalized gateway to creating these jobs. And there'll need to be good training and all of that, and that can all be done, but we want to bring people with real skills and experience who can do the job right, and we want them paid well. We do want professionalization, the sense that these need to be good jobs and just be given a very high level standard, but that it not be credentialed.
- Bruce Schmiechen: And we don't want social workers, we don't want psychologists coming out onto the street. That's not the basis for this. So please, please, please stick with it. The other thing is, I just want to mention, Faith in Action, [inaudible 00:09:31], we brought ceasefire about eight, nine years ago to Oakland. And I've heard over time that in Richmond, they had far more resources per individual they were dealing with in the ceasefire program, and had some real success. They were doing some real interesting, innovative things. So I'm just wondering that if the department, the people working on ceasefire, if there's need for more budget resources under this re-imagining, bring that to people's attention and let's get that money so we can make this as successful as possible.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Schmiechen. The last speaker in the queue on this item is Omar Farmer. Good evening, Mr. Farmer. Can you hear us?
- Omar Farmer: I can hear you, can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready.
- Omar Farmer: Good evening. I'm just curious, what's the main difference between the MACRO and the MET program? I understand that the MACRO program is an Oakland entity, it may have a wider scope than the MET program. I believe that the MET program is under the Alameda department of Public Health and that they work jointly with OPD out of the Eastmont station. If anyone from the office of violence prevention has the answer to that, that would be great. Thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

Regina Jackson: Chief, can you clarify the distinction please?

Guillermo Cespedes: Dr. Crain?

Regina Jackson: Between the MET program and the MACRO?

Guillermo Cespedes: Correct. I'm calling on Dr. Crane to-

Regina Jackson: Oh, I'm sorry. Okay, thank you.

Sarai Crain: Were you calling on me?

Guillermo Cespedes: Yes, yes.

Sarai Crain: Okay. I'm sorry. Can you repeat the question?

Guillermo Cespedes: The difference between the MACRO program and the County program, the Alameda County-

Sarai Crain: Oh, I mean, that's essentially the answer right there, that the MACRO is a pilot program that's based in Oakland and the MET program, I think it's the mobile emergency team that is a County funded program,

Guillermo Cespedes: But there's a difference also in personnel.

Sarai Crain: Primarily because theirs is mental health focused. They're specifically through the department of behavioral health, through the County.

Guillermo Cespedes: So they tend to lean more in the direction of hiring clinicians and focusing on clinical [inaudible 00:11:52], which is why community members... I mean, since the MACRO needs to be staffed by community members-

Sarai Crain: Yes.

Guillermo Cespedes: ... Not clinical social workers, not psychologists, but community members that can be trained up to do the work. So that's a huge difference between the two programs.

Sarai Crain: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Okay, great.

Chief Manheimer: Chair Jackson?

Regina Jackson: Yes.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Chief Manheimer: Oh, I just wanted to articulate that the MET program generally has a clinician embedded with an officer. So there's really three tiers of mental health response. And that's why we're so excited that MACRO would be a tier that would be independent of the police department, through DVP, and be more community and clinician partner-based. Then we have the tier of the officers themselves who are trained for mental health response. And then we have that hybrid program where a County clinician is embedded with an officer for those responses, which do require the safety sworn response. So at the end of the day, there may be three different tiers or levels, but that MACRO would be a tremendous addition without needing the safety response.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. So again, to the department of violence prevention, I want to thank you very much for coming. We're hoping to see you on a fairly regular basis, maybe every four to five months or a couple of times a year. So we'll talk offline in order to ensure that the next time we can see much more data in connection to success.
- Guillermo Cespedes: Absolutely.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you.
- Guillermo Cespedes: Madam Chair, thank you commissioners.
- Regina Jackson: So Mr. Rus, if we can advance the slide. Thank you very much. So now is the time for the office of the city attorney's report. I believe that Ryan Richardson is here to present that.
- Ryan Richardson: I am. Can you hear me?
- Regina Jackson: Yes.
- Ryan Richardson: Good evening. Madam Chair, members of the police commission, I'm Ryan Richardson with the City Attorney's office. And I head up the unit in our office that oversees labor and employment, which includes our work on police accountability issues and many police policies. And what I'm here to present tonight is the first of our reports to the police commission regarding our office's efforts to help the city in its efforts to reform police accountability, and as part of that, a kind of close look at arbitration outcomes and results.
- Regina Jackson: You know what, Ryan?
- Ryan Richardson: Yes?
- Regina Jackson: Excuse me for interrupting you, I realize it's 10:24. We're going to need to extend the meeting. So rather than interrupt you mid presentation, I'd rather us go ahead and extend the meeting right now so that we make sure you're not interrupted. Okay?
- Ryan Richardson: Thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

Regina Jackson: Mm-hmm (affirmative). Thank you. So can I get a motion to extend the meeting for an hour, please?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Harbin-Forte so moves.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. I will second. It has been moved and seconded. Can we get a vote on extending the meeting an hour? Harbin-Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Singleton.

Tyfahra Singleton: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Smith?

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Garcia? Commissioner Garcia? Commissioner Garcia? Okay. Aye, for myself, maybe there's a challenge there. So it has been properly moved and seconded and the vote is at least-

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Did you get Commissioner Singleton?

Regina Jackson: Yes. Didn't I?

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Oh I don't know.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Singleton, didn't I call you?

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes, you did. And I said yes.

Regina Jackson: Oh, terrific. Thank you. I thought so. Sometimes it gets late and I start... Okay. But I didn't hear from Commissioner Garcia. Are you still on, Commissioner? Okay. I see his name, but I just don't hear his voice. No problem. We-



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Sergio Garcia: I'm on, I'm on.
- Regina Jackson: Okay, thank you. Would you vote to extend the meeting an hour?
- Sergio Garcia: Absolutely.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. So, seven zero. So it has been approved to extend. So we'll back to you now, Ryan. Thank you.
- Ryan Richardson: Thank you, Chair. So I guess I would start by saying we included a written report in the packet, and what we tried to do is include as many tables as we thought would be helpful in that packet so that you all would have them in advance and that they would be part of the record. What I'll do now is go over the report that we submitted and go over the highlights with the understanding that you all may have questions at the end that I'd be happy to answer. So starting with our reforms, and for this first report, we took a look five years back to bring the commissioners up to speed on where things stand today and the reforms that we've undertaken in the last five years, many of which the police commission has been in existence.
- Ryan Richardson: Those changes fall into a number of categories. The first category is, we've been able to marshal more resources to put toward police accountability. That started with the re-establishment of a labor and employment unit, which had been disbanded in the office and didn't exist as a result of the great recession. Once the budget started coming back, we were able to hire several new attorneys. One of whom is exclusively assigned to work on investigations and police discipline matters, and the other of whom works on those matters as well as matters of police accountability policy and other higher level issues. We also created a dedicated position to advise OPD generally on legal issues and risk management issues outside of discipline and accountability and labor and employment issues. This extra bandwidth has allowed us to do a number of things. One of the things we've been able to do is to provide regular trainings to investigators. Those trainings focus on investigation techniques and interrogation techniques and interview techniques, as well as report writing techniques. And since we've been able to start doing that regularly, we've also extended invitations to both ID investigators and CPRA investigators. And we were pleased, when Director Aldean arrived, he took us up on that offer, and in our most recent training, it included both IAD investigators and CPR investigators.
- Ryan Richardson: The second category of reforms, in addition to just having more resources, is we have better protocols and more better memorialized protocols as well. So one of them is within our shop, and that's when a case is going to arbitration, we now have a formal protocol that dictates how an attorney is to handle that case, including if they're handling it in-house or if it's going to outside counsel. And when it's going to outside counsel, the protocol essentially requires that it be closely managed by a attorney inside the office, typically the attorney who has worked on that case the longest and from its inception. The other protocols are from outside the office. So before a case gets to our shop, there are protocols. One is at IAD that ensures that for the most serious cases, class one cases or other high profile cases, that our office is looped in early on, at the beginning of



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

the case before interviews even take place, so that we can help with the planning of the case and the strategy of the investigation.

Ryan Richardson: And the other policy is from the city administrator's level, and that ensures that once the case leaves IAD and it's in the discipline phases at OPD, or it's in the review phases at employee relations, where it's [inaudible 05:01:10] grieved under the OPOA MOU, that we're also kept in the loop at those phases, so that we don't find out about significant issues in a case for the first time when we're noticed for arbitration.

Ryan Richardson: Another thing I wanted to mention from the report that we're particularly proud of, is we're currently fighting to overturn a case out of Southern California that in police accountability circles is colloquially known as the Santa Ana decision. That's a decision that has to do with the peace officer's bill of rights. And it's a case that, in our opinion, is misinterpreted [inaudible 05:01:57] and has held that if a subject officer has been interrogated once, that they cannot be interrogated a second time unless they are provided extensive discovery from the agency's investigative file. That's obviously a huge problem in general, but it's particularly a problem for cities like Oakland, where we have redundancy of investigations built into our system, namely the CPRA. So what was happening was, anytime the CPRA wanted to interview an officer that IAD had already interviewed, the attorneys for those officers were demanding extensive discovery. On our advice, the CPRA in a particular case denied that demand, and we predictably wound up in court. The Superior Court Judge there also somewhat predictably said that he's bound by the one and only appellate court case on this, but noted that he recognized the conflict and the seeming contradiction that the city had pointed out, and we're now going to appeal. So I will keep the commission updated on that, but as far as I'm aware, we're the first city to challenge that, and it's, again, in partnership with the CPRA.

Ryan Richardson: I also want to talk about arbitrations because that's one of the places where our office has the biggest footprint on police discipline and where we have some of the most responsibility. I do want to preface this discussion by saying, the numbers that I'm going to present, I am not suggesting that there is a finish line or that we've somehow reached it, this is really just data that I think is helpful so that we can all kind of consider where we're at, whether certain reforms we've undertaken are working or not. And then from there, start to identify other areas of improvement and potentially other reforms. So that's the framework in which I want to present these numbers. So since 2015, the city has gone through arbitration hearings with police officers 19 times. To give us a sense of what that is in the larger scheme of OPD discipline, for cases where an officer's suspended, about one in seven cases go to arbitration and for cases where an officer's terminated, that number is about one in three. At least over the last five years, those have been the rates.

Ryan Richardson: One thing we could look at is, is how have the city's numbers just internally trended for the last five years, as opposed to the previous five years before that. And we have that data. And so in arbitration over the last five years, the city has been fully upheld, meaning the arbitrators completely sided with the city and didn't overturn the discipline or even reduce the discipline. 47% of the time, the city has been fully upheld. In the five years prior, through 2014, that number



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

is 27%. So that does represent an improvement, at least in terms of that raw number. The other thing we can look at... Sorry, the other thing we can look at... I'm getting a little bit of feedback on my end, but the other thing we can look at is how does the city compare nationally? And national data is hard to get. There are only a few studies that have even attempted it, and that has a lot to do with police privacy rules. There are similar privacy rules that exist in a lot of different states, so it can sometimes be hard to get that data.

Ryan Richardson: One data point that we look at is a study that was done by the Wall Street Journal in 2014 that found that at the national level, police discipline placed cases are fully upheld at arbitration 40% of the time. I think, or our office thinks, it's particularly important to look at termination cases, really. And as far as arbitration goes, it's of the utmost importance. It goes without saying that what we're talking about is a decision by the city that a certain police officer should no longer patrol our streets and carry a gun. And so the idea that a single arbitrator who may not even live in California, much less in Oakland, can overturn the decision that's gone through a process of dozens of city analysts and executives and leaders, is an important thing to look at.

Ryan Richardson: Since 2015, OPD has terminated 12 officers, and of those 12, four have gone to arbitration and three were reinstated. So that rate is 25%, meaning of the officers that OPD has terminated, 25% were reinstated by arbitrators. One thing we were curious about, and we asked IAD just for their raw data and were able to pull some other numbers out, is that we're aware in the city attorney's office that it's not uncommon that an officer who is facing termination or that presumptively is facing termination will resign or quit. And so we wanted to look at that too. And we determined that there were 11 officers. So roughly another, almost half the officers that were sustained for misconduct that was potentially going to lead to termination resigned before they were terminated. So the 12 officers that were terminated may not really represent the entire universe of officers that OPD was really seeking to hold accountable. But nevertheless, that 25% is a significant number.

Ryan Richardson: In terms of how that compares into other agencies, there was a very comprehensive study done by the Washington Post that looked at how officers being reinstated to some of the nation's largest police departments. And what they found was, they found 24% of officers who were terminated were reinstated. I want to note for the commission and members of the public that in our report, we provided links to these studies and articles, as well as a very interesting law review article that expanded on the Washington Post's analysis and included the city by city results. And so you can kind of see not only how often different cities have officers reinstated, but also how often are they even terminating officers. Because that's the other thing, obviously, that can impact that number and can make it hard to compare, for example, Oakland to other cities, is one can't assume that other cities, that their discipline is as rigorous or not as Oakland's.

Ryan Richardson: So again, before I conclude and take questions, I just want to clarify once again, the numbers we're talking about here, we really think of here as a means of diagnosing issues that continue to exist and coming up with cures, not to suggest that, again, that there's no more room for improvement in the system. So with that, I welcome questions.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Ryan. I think that thing that was striking to me was the arbitrations and the numbers of them that were upheld. And although you're reporting a 47%, which is up from 27% just a few years ago, I'm wondering, it seems like a pitifully poor percentage. What is your plan to get up over 60%, and by when?
- Ryan Richardson: Well, it's a good question. I think it's not as simple as the city attorney's office, for example, just doing something differently at this point, at least in as far as I can tell. I think we really have to look at whether there are structural issues outside of just the handling of the cases that are making it harder to get different results. One thing I'm cognizant of, and I'll preface this as well, and this was noted in one of the court appointed investigators reports is, it's difficult to say what a magic number looks like. Because again, there are cities who have not had officers reinstated from termination, for example, for years on end. But when you look at how many officers they actually terminated, it's very few. So one of the things about arbitration is, the cases that tend to go to arbitration are the cases that tend to be the most difficult for the city to prove. And just because of the evidence that was available, the witnesses that were available, those tend to be the cases that officers will take to arbitration.
- Ryan Richardson: But the other thing to consider, like I said, there are other structural issues that we recommend, including the court appointed investigators recommended that the city look at, such as transparency. We've found that one of the things that helps the system work better in general is for the public, for researchers, for reporters to be able to see what's happening, including for the arbitrators themselves to know that the decisions they're making, the monumental decisions that they're making, are going to be scrutinized and aren't going to be completely confidential and private. There's the Peace Officer's Bill of Rights, as I mentioned. The Santa Ana case, something like that could be clarified in the legislation without the need for the city to have to go to court, and removing that barrier would increase the CPRA's ability and the IAD's ability to do much more thorough investigations. And that would probably in and of itself lead to better arbitration results.
- Ryan Richardson: And then lastly, the arbitration process itself is prescribed in the MOU, in the OPOA's MOU. And so I think it's important that the city periodically revisit the arbitration provisions and see if it is still state-of-the-art and see if it's still comports with Oakland's values. Right now, for example, as I mentioned, there's every chance that the arbitrator that we're stuck with, because we don't get to choose them unilaterally, may not live in California and almost certainly won't live in Oakland. Is that something the city wants to revisit? So not to dodge the question, but I think that we have to look at it holistically. We continue to look at ways that just through individual efforts, we can move the needle, but we think we're running up against bigger structural policy issues at this point.
- Regina Jackson: So let me clarify, because it sounds like there might be some room for more critical analysis on what needs to be done in order to increase those percentages. But you did mention briefly POBAR are you, I know that we think, or I think that POBAR needs to be reformed are you [inaudible 05:15:24] that out as well?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Ryan Richardson: Yeah, I'm suggesting that the city's policy makers such as the police commission, such as the task force for re imagining public safety, that these are things that I know you guys are considering. I know that the CPRA director Alden looks at critically and that we would be more than happy to help assist in that analysis and coming up with proposals that the city might make to the state legislature, for example. I don't have specific, well, I think it's a little bit outside of my lane to say how specifically I might change the policy. That's not really my role in the city as policy makers, but that's absolutely something we would collaborate with anybody who's interested in helping them formulate their proposals.
- Regina Jackson: Okay.
- Ryan Richardson: The other thing I'm cognizant of though and I will throw out there is, I think that in light of the Hillard Heintze study that it did, for me anyway, cast it added a new complication and wrinkle to the way I look at these issues and kind of starting with the question of not, how do we get the number up to a 100% for example, or how do we remove all procedural barriers, but are there right procedural safeguards and wrong ones? Because it does occur to me that for, if we know that, for example, black officers are more likely to be sustained, then removing, we need to be very careful about how we remove the ways in which officers can grieve and arbitrary discipline, because there could be a point at which it's too much. So I would also encourage folks to look at and think about what is the right level of review if there is one.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. I have Mr. Alden and Commissioner Garcia I saw your hand up. So in that order, Mr. Alden, and then Commissioner Garcia. Okay.
- John Alden: Thanks, Madam chair. Can you hear me okay?
- Regina Jackson: Yep.
- John Alden: Great. I really appreciated Mr. Richardson's presentation there. I think in addition to appreciating the training that he's been offering our office, I appreciate that he's suggesting some ways we could think carefully about how to improve this process moving forward. And I have to say, I agree with them that the improvement that we see from 2010 to 2014 and then 2015 forward in comparison is really substantial. And I think puts opened in a place where our success rate at arbitration is equal to or better than pretty much any other jurisdiction I've seen.
- John Alden: And I think we are hard pressed at this point to come up with ways to move that success rate at arbitration higher. I mean, I think we probably could have it a little higher, but I think it's also important to understand that that national rate that he cited to probably is a pretty accurate read on how arbitration works out in most cities, at least as to police arbitration. And I think in that regard, it's important to remember that this whole arbitration system we have was designed back in the early to mid 20th century, it was designed really for the industrial workplace where say workers and in a factory or an office setting needed to be able to find a neutral person to resolve disputes that occurred in the workplace. And it really is designed to, in some ways, find a middle path between the employer and the employee when there's a disconnect between the two.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- John Alden: And I think there are many reasons why that's an extremely useful tool to have in a lot of labor settings, but I do think there are good arguments to be made that policing is fundamentally different than the situations that mediation, sorry, arbitration was really designed to address. And increasingly I think the national conversation is starting to direct some attention to whether traditional styles of arbitration are even quite right in policing. And I don't say that lightly, it's a controversial and pretty new, I think, position for people to take. And it's one worth thinking about.
- John Alden: The New York Times editorial board had an opinion piece earlier this month, advocating elimination of arbitration altogether, at least as to police officers, that's a position I don't think many have taken. I think in California that would be a very, I underscore a very dramatic change and at a minimum would require renegotiation of labor agreements and or state legislation, both of which are very challenging to accomplish, but and it may be time for us to start thinking at the state and at the local level about ways, perhaps some of the fundamentals of arbitration could change.
- John Alden: As Mr. Richardson was saying, the selection of the arbitrator can be very important. And we sometimes have people that really have no connection to California or California law about these issues, making these decisions that can be an improvement we could make. I am often concerned. I look at arbitration across the state, that is not always the case that the arbitrator selected for these matters really have experience specific to policing, which I think is a highly specialized field. And perhaps some requirements in that regard might be worth considering.
- John Alden: Even those changes as modest as they might seem, would require renegotiation of our cities agreements with the POA. And again, that is not a small task, would have to be done at a time when the rest of the contract is up for negotiation. And of course at that point, there are many things in the contract that all then start leveraging against each other. So this is a very, very complicated process to change. I don't want people to shy away from it, but I would hesitate to say anything that might cause people to think it's an easy or quick fix, but I think it's a great long-term project for us to continue to think about, particularly as the contract comes back around for re-negotiation.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Mr. Alden, Commissioner Garcia. I see that your hand was dropped, but I don't know if you still wanted to ask a question. You're un-muted. Okay. Well perhaps not. Does any other commissioner have a question, Commissioner Singleton? You are un-muted.
- Tyfahra Singleton: I was wondering, is it possible to get data about other sectors, public sectors and arbitration information?
- Ryan Richardson: Yes. The question, when you say other sectors, do you mean other sectors of the city, like other unions in the city or other police departments?
- Tyfahra Singleton: Specifically I mean, non police department, so perhaps fire departments or other public service departments to get an idea of how arbitration works across.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Ryan Richardson: Yeah. Through the chair. So I'm not aware of widespread data for other jurisdictions on their arbitration outcomes. I think we could look at within the city what the outcomes are for other unions and other sectors within the city. For example, firefighters and the like. That's certainly something we could look at. It's an interesting question. There are just, there are stark differences off the bat in how arbitrations are handled. Police arbitrations are tend to be like mini trials. They always involve, the lawyers are involved from the beginning of the investigation all the way to the end. And there's a lot of resources put in to them on both sides. Because naturally we have to match the resources that are being marshaled on the other side. But yeah, we could certainly look at that.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, commissioner Singleton. Did anyone else have a question of Mr. Richardson? I saw a hand go up. Okay. Commissioner Dorado. You've been un-muted
- Jose Dorado: Thank you, Chair Jackson. I'm having a bit of a problem squaring that you can... What I'm asking is where the discrepancy is between what I'm reading and maybe I'm just missing it. Table four says terminations of the separations and it has terminations upheld by arbitrator. This is 2015 to the present. One was upheld and three were reinstated. So that's only a 25% win rate. If you can call it that.
- Jose Dorado: And then you go over to the table five and it says, City of Oakland in [inaudible 05:25:27] percentages of police discipline cases fully upheld at arbitration. And this says 47%. So where, what am I missing? Because down below it also says that record show Oakland's terminated 12 police officers since in 2015 and three of those offers 25% reinstated by arbitrators. Well that squares with table four, but not with table five. So, I'm a little confused. Can you explain that?
- Ryan Richardson: Yeah, absolutely. Through the chair. So, and yeah, there's a lot of, I know I threw a lot of percentages in there, but I'll start with table five. When we say that the city has been fully upheld at arbitration, 40% of the time that's for the total universe of arbitrations and terminations and suspensions. So that's why that number differs.
- Jose Dorado: Well, terminations and suspensions.
- Ryan Richardson: And suspension cases. Yeah. So that's for the total universe. What we tried to do though is not just look at that number because not every case is created equal and determination cases, I think most people would agree are they're the most important. So we tried to look at those individually. You're correct that of the four cases that were arbitrated, three officers were reinstated. But when we say that only 25% of officers were reinstated, we're also considering the other eight officers who were terminated during that same time period, that did not take their case to arbitration. They just, they took their termination and moved on. And so that's how we get to the 25%.
- Jose Dorado: Okay. Thank you. Yes.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Okay. Commissioners, if there are no more questions, we can go to public comment. There may be some more questions there. Mr. Ruse.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. Madame chair.
- Regina Jackson: And given the lateness of the hour, we are going to go back to one minute comments.
- Juanito Rus: Very well. Madam chair. If any member of the public would like to make comment on item 10, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you'll be called in the order in which your hands are raised. The first name in the queue is Chuck. Good evening, Chuck. Can you hear us?
- Anne Janks: Sorry. I forgot to change the name.
- Juanito Rus: Good, evening Anne.
- Anne Janks: This is Anne Janks on the family computer. So, okay. Let me see if I can do this in a minute. So this is going back to the agenda item before, but this question was not answered. There were three County programs to do emergency response, MET, MAT and a new one called cat C A T T. They all correspond with police. So when you're getting, if it's a mental health call, the police show up and they clear the scene before you see anybody else to respond.
- Anne Janks: And unfortunately that can be both traumatizing and it can escalate the situation. All three of those programs also use licensed clinicians as responders. And it's one of the reasons that they have a lot of trouble expanding because they have trouble recruiting and retaining, and the clinicians tend not to look like the communities that they're responding to. And since I only have a minute, I don't get to rant about arbitration. Have a good evening.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Janks. The next speaker in the queue is Lorelei Bosserman. Good evening, Ms. Bosserman. Can you hear us?
- Lorelei Bosserman: Yes, I can. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you.
- Lorelei Bosserman: Thank you. I actually put up my hand to talk about the same thing that Anne just talked about. I specifically wanted to say macro folks will go out without police and that's a key difference. That's all. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Bosserman. The next speaker in the queue is Rashidah Grinage. Good evening, Ms. Grenache. Can you hear us?
- Rashidah Grinage: Yes, I can. Thank you. I just want to say that several of our coalition members are participating in the advisory boards and task force that's re-imagining public safety. And one of the issues that we are looking at are the legal barriers to reform and to re-imagining public safety and arbitration is



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

certainly one of them that impacts a lot of what we're looking at. So I would welcome any input from the commissioners and from Mr. Alden, to inform the discussions that we will be having on that subject. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Grenache. The next speaker in the queue is Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?

Assata Olugbala: Yes. I wish the coalition for police accountability, stop acting like what you did to Janell Harris is of no significance. You try to move on, like it doesn't matter. It matters. You have no credibility. The letter that was written on March the 15th from the black officers think that there was unfair and bias internal affairs investigation and discipline. This issue is not being dealt with enough because not only in Oakland, in Philadelphia, Los Angeles, Chicago, Boston, black police officers are more likely to be disciplined, suspended, and fired than non-black officers. You've given little attention to this. Janell Harris would have made this more of a conversation tonight. Are you looking at the decision makers for internal affairs all the way up to the chief, as it relates to black officers being unfairly disciplined in this police department?

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits 5802. I believe that is Mr. Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. Can you hear us?

Saleem Bey: Yes. Good evening. I'm Mr. Bey. Well, first of all, let's not let the city, let's not anybody forget that it was a city attorney that was sabotaging this Oakland police commission and how long it took for the Oakland police commission to get over the sabotage of this same city attorney's office. This is the same city attorney's office that in 2014 by the federal government, I've seen reports, was found that they were purposely throwing these arbitration cases.

Saleem Bey: So this is the same city attorney's office, this is the same city attorney's office that fought myself and my family for five years in civil court to stop an independent investigation only to produce enough to discovery to show that they were covering up murders in the black community. So they're just as complicit in obstruction of justice and keeping dirty cops on the streets as the administration, until we change that, we won't have any justice.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. At this time, I see no further hands raised in the queue. Madame chair I return the meeting to you.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. So we will... Thank you very much, Mr. Richardson. We are going to move forward with the next item on the agenda. So it's the review of the OPD policy on community resource officer deployment. Commissioner Dorado has had a particular interest in this. Commissioner, do you want to start the conversation?

Jose Dorado: Yes. Thank you, Chair Jackson. Yeah, I do have a great interest in this and my copy of 15-01 is covered with additions and deletions that I'd like to make. But let me particularly for the benefit of our two newest members talk briefly about that, in my opinion, this is really the core of what needs to happen in terms of the public, or I should say our community really taking charge of its



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

own safety. And by that, I mean, it's really a question of something, a word that's used in the first page of the basis of community policing policy in Oakland in resolution 79235 and that is empowerment of the neighborhoods.

Jose Dorado: So I'm seeing community policing policy as being exactly that. The real empowerment of the neighborhoods. So what is so important about this policy of 15-01 is to ensure that it's written in such a way that in fact, that is the result. So there's any number of things that, that I could talk for hours about this policy and the kinds of things I'd like to see change. But we do have an ad hoc committee composed of chair Jackson, Commissioner Brenda and myself to look, take a deep dive into this policy and bring back recommendations to the full commission. So we can hammer this out and hopefully give a full fledged package of reform to this policy to the city council for their adoption.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Commissioner Dorado. I think that we have several policies. I've got to coordinate a calendar because I know that we've got several ad hocs that are working. We had kind of suspended while the use of force ad hoc was working so that we can move forward on this one as well. And in between now and the next meeting, I will talk with the new commissioners as well to see what ad hocs that they might like to join, because we have lots and lots of work to do. Commissioner Dorado, did you have any questions of, let's say Chief Manheimer or does anybody else have any questions as it relates to really the first presentation of this policy?

Jose Dorado: I really don't have any questions of the chief. I'm more focused on the conversation we're going to have within the ad hoc and also the question of how we are going to handle the incorporation of public input into the discussion. So those are the two things that I think are the most important for us to focus on.

Regina Jackson: Okay. That sounds great. And if in the meantime, you can scan that document with all of your corrections, then we can create them as track changes that people can all follow. Because I'm afraid of your rainbow color document.

Jose Dorado: I will definitely do that. I will produce a 15-01 with my suggested modifications and get it out to the ad hoc members.

Regina Jackson: Okay.

Jose Dorado: Actually the whole, the entire commission.

Regina Jackson: Okay. That sounds excellent. Chief Manheimer has her hand up, you've been on muted.

Chief Manheimer: Thank you so much. Commissioner Dorado, I wondered if we might be able to meet you if not be included on the ad hoc as we have some interests. And I know you've worked with Captain Bolton in the past, you know the NSCs are now transitioning over to another department as well. I think it's really critical time for us all to ensure that the community policing officers, the [inaudible 05:38:48] stay very close to the NSCs and to the CPAB.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Chief Manheimer: So either could we have some opportunity to discuss that with you or be a part of the ad hoc? And I think the NSC incorporation, as well as some other best practices that we have an interested in might be something you might be interested in as well.
- Jose Dorado: No. I think it's important that we have an ongoing conversation. One area that I would flag is the fact that the community resource officers are taken off out of their beats without any sort of reporting back as to what is the criteria by which they were taken out of their beats and for how long. So that's just I could say a preview of coming attractions because it makes no sense for them to be spending a great deal of time outside of their beats when in fact that is their primary responsibility.
- Jose Dorado: So yes, I would invite the OPD to give their input. There's a great deal here that really needs to be looked at very, very closely.
- Chief Manheimer: Great. And in our experience, it's been so appreciated and successful to be a part of that ad hoc is I think we all share those same interests. So I think the way in which we help to incorporate some of those within the ongoing dialogue is really important and provides a great opportunity to come to some better policy.
- Regina Jackson: Sounds great. Thank you very much. Since there are no other questions, let's go to public comment and see if some come up there. Mr. Ruse.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madame chair. If any member of the public would like to make comment on item 11, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you'll be called in the order in which your hands are raised. The first hand that I see in the queue belongs to Megan Steffen. Good evening, Ms. Steffen, can you hear us?
- Megan Steffen: Yes, I can. Thanks so much. Thank you again to commissioner Dorado for sending me this policy and the resolution to review. I think one of the main things that I want to highlight since I only have a minute, I've sent many more thoughts to you, is that the logic of creating the community policing policy in the first place was to create community resource officers that would have a separate purpose and be distinct from normal police officers. It's in fact, the same logic that interim chief Manheimer used earlier in this meeting justify buying the community resource vehicles.
- Megan Steffen: They're necessary because they are separate and distinct and should not be confused by community members for normal police officers. Obviously, we've seen them the implementation of this community policing policy that those purposes have bled and community resource officers are in fact used as normal officers. So I'd like to see the policy strengthened so that its original purpose can be implemented. Thanks.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Steffen. The next speaker in the queue is Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Assata Olugbala: Yes, I can. I really have been spending a lot of time on this CRO's community resource offices, as well as the crime prevention offices. And has not been able to get a clear understanding of the effectiveness of those two groups. I think community policing in Oakland works for a very small segment of the open community. Most of their work deals with low level crimes. There is very liberal work that works with severe crimes as far as how they work to solve those severe crimes. There is very little interaction with the impacted criminal communities that are impacted by high criminal activity. I do not propose to go forward of any policy until you look into what is going on with these officers.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is Jasmine Fallstich. Good evening, Ms. Fallstich. Can you hear us?
- Jasmine Fallstich: Hi, good evening. Thanks so much. Let's see. Just a couple of things about the policy. So I think if the right now appeals a little bit one-sided in terms of the obligations that the CRO has to the community and what the obligations the community has back to the CRO. And so I think in order to sort of improve this policy and for the program overall to actually be successful, the policies should reflect an equal partnership between the CRS and the community members. I think that's one place to look into to making changes and then sort of further in that vein of building trust between the community members and CROs is the SARA net. The community members don't currently have access to it, which again creates sort of an unequal balance of power. And then crowd management is also mentioned, and CRO should obviously be used for either.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Fallstich. Madam chair at this time, I see no further hands in the queue. I return the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. So I appreciate that feedback. We will get a calendar together for meeting because a community has some really outstanding suggestions. So moving on to item 12, this is the report on a CPRA pending cases. Mr. Alden.
- John Alden: Thank you, Madam chair, if it's all right, I'll share the screen here and briefly, Mr. Ruse, I'll hand it back to you when it's time for the speakers if that's all right.
- Regina Jackson: Sounds-
- John Alden: Give me just a moment and I'll put the report out. Assuming I can get zoom to cooperate. Just one more second here. There we go. Okay. Hopefully you're able to see here our statistical report. I'll talk about that a little bit. And I'll talk about some staff developments we've had at CPRA since we reported to you last. The last couple of times, we've had our reports on, we haven't had always necessarily time to talk about them a whole lot. I'm not going to do a whole lot tonight either, because it's pretty late, but I do want to stress each time we come on, we give you a fresh report since the last report.
- John Alden: So this doesn't necessarily cover the last six months, this only covers time since our last report back in September. What we have here queued up at the beginning are our cases from the public



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

demonstrations in late May and early June. We've been separating these out because there's been a lot of public interest in them and also because these particular cases we've had to separate out from the rest of the case load. As you can see here at the top, there are 41 cases altogether, just from the four days that the George Floyd protests went on back in late May and early June.

John Alden: We're working as aggressively as we can on these. We did get some additional funding from the city council to work on them. And so we have a contract investigator working on those and we're happy for that. And we will have to, I think, for some of these cases, take only a very modest look at them. Some of them are extremely complicated. And so we're trying to focus in particular on issues relating to crowd control policy and mutual aid policy. How decisions came to be made about those two issues over the course of those four nights as our highest priority item.

John Alden: So we continue to move forward on those. I should tell you that we feel that the information sharing we've gotten from OPD has been very good on those and I appreciate the cooperation we've been getting from the police department in that regard. The second thing I wanted to point out is here at the beginning of our ordinary pending cases case list, you'll see up here at the total pending number that we have 87 pending right now. That number has been fairly stable over the last six months or so consistently between 80 and 90 cases pending. That's definitely an improvement over a year ago and over two years ago. It is still not quite where we want to be. I know the print on these reports is quite small, just because there's so much material to convey here. But if one, hopefully my Zoom function work such that you can see the zooming in that I'm doing here.

John Alden: We have what we call the 180 day goal for each case. Ultimately, we want to make sure our staffing and internal procedures are such that we're getting cases done usually within the 180 day goal. Now, there are some cases where that might not happen because of complexity or because officers are unavailable due to illness or the like, but if we were actually getting our cases done within the one 180 day goal, as you can see here, there's about 25 to 30 cases on this first page that are past the one 80 day goal. It's not a legal limit. It's a policy goal of ours to get to completing cases within 180 days, because we think that provides plenty of time for the concurrence process and also to bring cases to the commission if there isn't concurrence and then to make sure all the other steps and discipline process are finished before the one year deadline mandated by state law.

John Alden: So our goal would be to have roughly 25 to 30 fewer cases on this list. So then you'd be around 60 pending cases at any one time. I think we are going to get there. We continue to staff up and improve our processes. And as we do, I think I do see a light at the end of the tunnel there, but that's our ongoing goal. Another issue you'll notice here is if you were to take a look at the cases that are on the later part of the chart here-

PART 10 OF 11 ENDS [05:50:04]



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

John Alden: ... that are on the later part of the chart here, and I'll zoom out a little bit more again. You'll notice a lot of our cases are still in the intake stage. This is an unusually high number of cases in the intake stage, and that's because we had several intake technicians that needed to take leave over the summer. Their individual reasons are all personnel related, so I can't get into the details, but they all had legitimate reasons why they needed to take some time over the summer. And as a result, we actually at one point where for a couple of weeks, we had no intake technicians on board. Now, city HR and our budget system has been really cooperative in helping us get some temporary intake technicians on board.

John Alden: We have two that are helping us fill this gap. One is Frida Caro , we're really excited to have Frida onboard for a couple reasons. She has a strong history in activism, and I think is really interested in police reform in general. She's also been a really solid intake technician since we brought her on over the summer. She's also a fluent Spanish speaker, which is a skill so important for us to have in the intake process. We're really thrilled she's on board with us. Our other temporary intake technician is Diane Carroll, who comes to us with a background in social work and I think her style of interacting with members of the public is just fantastic, and we're really looking forward to how she can help us out with this intake backlog we've developed as well. Because they're both temporary short-term employees we might not be able to keep them as long as we might like, but they are just fantastic additions and are very pleased to have them helping us out for a while.

John Alden: Now that we have them on board, and we have one of our full-time intake technicians back from her leave. We now have got a full complement of three and so we expect that we're going to be able to significantly improve those intake numbers. And that's going to really help out too, I think with getting our total pending case list to a place where we're getting cases on a timely fashion. And it got the dimension earlier that a contract complaint investigator we brought on the protest cases, bears mentioning too. His name's Jason Wecter. He comes to us from our sister agency in San Francisco, the department of police accountability from our early opposite citizen complaints. He has couple of decades of experience with investigating police misconduct cases, and he's willing to come on, on a part-time basis with us to help with protest cases. He actually has looked at protest issues before, which is a hard specialization to find in our field.

John Alden: So we're really excited to have him on too, great additions to our staff. I'll turn next to our recently completed investigations, which should be showing on your screen here. This is a nine-page report. I can't show you the whole thing at once on this screen, but as you page through it, I think there are a couple of things that bear mentioning. One of them is that we've got 14 cases here total, four of them had sustained findings. Now I'm always cautious about talking about sustained rate because really every case is different, and it's important to judge each case based on the facts of that case but I think it is still sometimes useful to think a little bit about what the sustained rate might tell us about how our cases are going. Here with four out of our 14 cases sustained, we have a sustained rate of just on this report of 28%. That's higher than we normally see, and that also... you could interpret that to mean that we're doing a really thorough job on our cases, and we are in fact identifying cases that need to be sustained.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- John Alden: National sort of rule of thumb is typically about 15% of cases are sustained, so in that regard, that's way ahead of where we normally are. I am cautious about drawing any significant conclusions from such a small sample size, but since I'm asked about that often, I thought I would point out that statistics right upfront. In this set of cases, you'll notice that some of the sustained allegations like these two here that you see on the first page are in bold. That means that those are allegations that CPRA brought forward itself or discovered and so I think there's also an added value there. We're finding allegations that would not have been investigated otherwise and moving those forward to the point which they're sustained. So I think that's a real added value that we have here. There is another case on here to which I'd like to draw your attention.
- John Alden: I'll just preview this is not a happy one, but near the end of our report here... we have this case here, which is on page eight of nine. And as you can see here, we flagged this, the finding as 33/34 violation. I think that's probably the most concise way to say. In this case, the 33/34 day elapsed before we were done with the case. Obviously that's not an acceptable outcome, so we took a deep look at why that happened. And here's in a nutshell without providing any confidential personnel information about this particular case, I can tell you this. So as you see this is a case that happened way back in 2018 and so we had set it aside before I even came on board full time, because the one year deadline would have resolved back in April 2019. And the reason we did that was that the officer was medically unavailable, or so we were told by the police department.
- John Alden: They have a particular unit within their personnel division that helps us understand when officers are medically unavailable and that's important for two reasons. One is, I think there's a very strong argument to be made that when an officer is placed on medical leave, we probably cannot, as a matter of law, interview them or at least not without them consenting to come in, even though they're still on leave. We can't order them to come in when they're on medical leave, it's a protected form of leave. That said, one of the things that fortunately state law allows us to do, is put a case like that on hold, to delay it and extend that one-year period until the officer's available again. So our past practice has been to just stay very closely in touch with OPDs personnel folks, know when the officer's come back onto duty, and then make sure that we're then proceeding forward, once they come back. That also means that the clock starts back up again, our ability to delay the case ends once the officer's back at work.
- John Alden: So in this case, back in roughly early 2019, this case hadn't been finished yet, a lot of cases during that time period were being finished right at the last minute. And so the clock was stopped, and the case was stalled, with only just a little tiny bit of time left in the case. Now that's obviously suboptimal, we avoid that currently. We have some processes internally for making sure that doesn't happen. But our investigator did a diligent job of making sure that we're still in touch with OPD. Unbeknownst to us, and unbeknownst to the personnel folks at OPD, somehow this officer ended up being invited to an interview at Internal Affairs about an entirely separate case. Once that happens, he then had a really good argument that the tolling had ended for him. This didn't get communicated back to us, and so we've been having some conversations with Internal Affairs about making sure that doesn't happen in the future. We think that's a one-time error, we've



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

created some procedures to communicate between Internal Affairs, OPD, personnel folks, and CPRA to make sure that doesn't happen in the future, but that is what happened here.

John Alden: So, I think we have fixed the problem structurally, so we're not going to see a violation of that sort again, because naturally we're very unhappy that that occurred, and we want to make sure that it never happens again. But since that's in here, I wanted to make sure I flagged it for you straight away at the beginning. We do have here a series of training recommendations you made on the last page of the post report. We've been trying to make sure we pass these on to you, just so you have some idea of the kinds of training recommendations we're making in our cases. Certainly we could talk in more detail about a number of things here, but I recognize I've already gone on for about 12 minutes, and it's almost 11:30, so I feel like I've probably overrun my time. If any of you have questions, I'd be happy to answer them, or roll this to another day, if we need to talk about these things in more detail.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Mr. Alden, I am deeply disturbed at that lack of communication that arguably cost us the opportunity to complete that case. And the only way that know for certain that you have fixed it is to keep an eye on it moving forward, is that correct? [crosstalk 05:59:15]

John Alden: Yeah, that's right.

Regina Jackson: Okay.

John Alden: Yeah, that's exactly right, Madam Chair. We do a couple of things now that are different from when this case was originally told back in 2019. One is that we have our investigators write up exactly why a case is being tolled and what evidence there is in support of that tolling and have that reviewed by a supervisor and by me and by our counsel. And then only if we're all convinced that the tolling is a good idea, do we allow the case to toll. So we're being much more cautious about which cases we toll and why. Another thing that we're doing is making sure that investigators are starting to figure out these things about their cases much earlier, so we don't start tolling a case with only a month left. Instead if we're going to toll a case, you want to make sure we have six or eight months left on the clock, so we don't get surprised.

John Alden: And then another is that we're communicating more directly with both Internal Affairs and OPD personnel to make sure all three of us are on the same page. I think in this case, there was an investigator in Internal Affairs, who just simply wasn't aware of this officer had been out on medical leave and talked to the officer's rep to set up an interview and got it to move forward, not realizing that there are whole other sets of cases that would be implicated by that. So I think that process is going to be improved moving forward, so you don't have that problem. Certainly if we had that problem again, that would be something we should talk about here probably another time.

Regina Jackson: Absolutely. It is now 11:30 and I do believe that we can finish up the meeting if we extend for another 30 minutes, but we will need to extend. So if you just hold on for a moment Mr Alden, can I get a motion to extend the meeting 30 more minutes please?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

Jose Dorado: Moved.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Dorado, I can second that.

Brenda Harbin Forte: [inaudible 06:01:13]

Regina Jackson: Oh, go ahead, Harbin Forte, you want to second it?

Brenda Harbin Forte: I seconded it, yes I will.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. So we'll go ahead and vote. Commissioner Harbin Forte?

Brenda Harbin Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you.

Harbin Forte: Sorry.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Singleton?

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado.

Jose Dorado: All right.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, commissioner Garcia.

Sergio Garcia: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, commissioner Smith.

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. I, for myself, Lee, we'll go to midnight. Commissioner's what is your pleasure as it relates to Mr. Alden's report? Seems to me like we might want to go a little deeper, especially the sheer numbers of cases that we're reviewing right now, but I don't know what your pleasure is.

Jose Dorado: I move we place this item on the next meeting's agenda. [inaudible 00:12:29] [crosstalk 06:02:29]



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Okay, very good is there a second? [crosstalk 06:02:33] Commissioner Gage?
- Henry Gage, III: Thank you, chair. Given that we may want to have more substantive discussion for a number of these cases. I do believe there's precedent for us to agendize such a review that will allow us to discuss with a bit more detail [inaudible 06:02:55] .
- Regina Jackson: Okay. That's fine, thank you. So we will go ahead and agendize that and with that, does anybody else have any more questions or should we go on to public comment? Okay, let me see none, Mr. Ruse?
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. Madam chair. If any member of the public would like to make comment on item 12 on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the zoom queue and you'll be called in the order in which your hands are raised. At this time I see one hand in the queue belonging to Ms. Assata Olugbala. Good evening Ms. Olugbala, can you hear us?
- Assata Olugbala: Yeah, I was in a meeting last night of the city, Oakland school board. They had interpreters in Spanish, Mandarin, Arabic and Mam. We got an interpreter that's in Spanish. You have an ever-growing community of Arab, Mam peoples and you do not have the capacity to deal with them. That needs to be fixed. Second, it's not the number of cases, it's the cases that have excessive force over and over again that do not get any sustained or we get exonerated or unfounded. The cases that are usually performance of duty cases, and you need to get a copy of the letter that the ethics commission sends out once a case is finished. How it extensively explains to the public, the investigative process how it came to a conclusion.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Ms. Olugbala, your time has expired.
- Juanito Rus: Madam Chair, as a quick point of privilege, would you allow me to make a brief explanation with respect to the language issues?
- Regina Jackson: I actually would like to finish hearing Ms. Olugbala comments because they were very clear-
- Juanito Rus: She had actually finished talking when I... I didn't cut her off mid-sentence.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. So the last point was the public ethics commission and getting the letter that clarifies the explanation for how they come to the conclusion. I thought that was an excellent suggestion. So yes, you may go ahead and address the [inaudible 06:05:42]
- Juanito Rus: I was just going to say, because I am the agency's spark, at least for now at the single point of contact on language access issues. We have within the office speakers of Chinese and Spanish. We also have an intake tech who does American sign language, but also through the equal access department of the city, we have 24/7 access through the phone system to, I think the last I looked at the list is over 75 languages if we need simultaneous phone translation. And we also are able to, when we're conducting interviews in other languages to get a transcription service and interpreters, and we have in the past for interviews as well and in several other languages. So the



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

staff size limits us as to the number of languages that we can have on staff, but we have access to translation too. Last I checked like I said, I think it's somewhere around 75 different languages for people who call in or who need to access our services. So I just thought I would clarify that.

- Regina Jackson: Okay. That is helpful, thank you very much. So since that was the only comment on that item, why don't we move ahead? Okay. Meeting minutes approval, thank you. So if everybody's had an opportunity to take a look at the minutes, please identify if there are any corrections and I will accept the motion to approve or to accept the minutes.
- Brenda Harbin Forte: So Harbin Forte.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you and Commissioner Gage you're un-muted.
- Henry Gage, III: Second.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. It has been properly moved and seconded. Well, we call for the vote Harbin forte.
- Brenda Harbin Forte: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Gage.
- Henry Gage, III: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Mr. Dorado.
- Jose Dorado: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia.
- Sergio Garcia: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Smith.
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton.
- Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you and aye for myself. Motion passes 7-0. So I think, let's see.
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Dru Jackson, can I interject?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

Regina Jackson: I'm sorry, yes?

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Did we vote on the movement of the cases to the next meeting agenda? Did we take a vote on that?

Regina Jackson: I don't know that we did. Thank you for sharing.

Juanito Rus: We didn't. I thought you just went ahead and did it [crosstalk 06:09:07]

Regina Jackson: I think we're okay.

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Okay.

Regina Jackson: What I didn't do on the meetings minutes that I presume that the movement was for October 8th. So we need to do it again for October 15th. Meeting minutes, if someone else has any edits or wishes to move.

Jose Dorado: Don't move.

Regina Jackson: Okay. So that's for October 15th and Commissioner Gage, his hand is up.

Jose Dorado: Second.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. is in properly moved and seconded, we will call for the vote. Commissioner Harbin Forte?

Brenda Harbin Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Okay Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Oh my goodness. Commissioner Singleton?

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Aye.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Thank you, commissioner Smith?
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes and just to Commissioner Dorado's point, I don't know, you may want to revisit it or ask council because I think you had a motion and a second on commissioner Dorado's motion. So you may want to vote even though you technically probably could have just done the agenda without one, but as a question for council, I think.
- Regina Jackson: Connor, are you there somewhere? Yes. Mr. Kennedy? I have muted you. I think I have unmuted you.
- Conor Kennedy: Madam Chair can you hear me?
- Regina Jackson: Yep I can, thank you.
- Conor Kennedy: Is the question on whether, what was moved and seconded related to the meeting minutes or is there a question is whether it was moved and seconded as to whether to push certain items to the next meeting's agenda?
- Regina Jackson: Yes. The push of items to the next meeting's agenda.
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Commissioner Dorado made a motion, I seconded it and so then commissioner Dorado raised a valid point, which was since he made the motion and I seconded it, we should have taken the vote, which is totally valid. But It's just for your consideration, whether we should go back and do that.
- Regina Jackson: No, I think we should I just... I missed it.
- Conor Kennedy: Yeah and it sounds like everyone's agreed. I do think that would be a best practice. Thanks Commissioner Smith for flagging that and chair I think that you would want to go back and take up the motion that was seconded before moving on to all the remaining motions that you proceeded with. I'm going to go back on muted if that's okay with you.
- Regina Jackson: That's just fine. So I think I had already completed the vote for the October 15th. So now we will go back to Commissioner Dorado's initial motion and my apologies, and we will take a vote on moving the report from CPRA to the next agenda for further discussion. Commissioner Dorado, your vote.
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Madame chair.
- Regina Jackson: Yes.
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Briefly there was also a friendly amendment from Commissioner Gage to take some of it into closed session. I don't know if you want to consider that as part of this.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

Regina Jackson: Yeah, thank you. I had already considered that, but thank you, Commissioner Dorado, you said yes right?

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Aye, thank you. Commissioner Garcia? Commissioner Singleton?

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Smith?

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Harbin Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you and aye for myself. So that motion passes, we will make sure that it's both reviewed in closed session and reported out. Okay so if we have any public comment on the meeting minutes Mr Ruse.

Juanito Rus: Any member of the public would like to comment on item 13 on tonight's agenda. Please raise your hand in the queue. I see one public speaker on this item. Mrs Olugbala you've been unmuted.

Assata Olugbala: Yes, it is the practice to have public comment before you take the vote. Also it is the practice that if a individual was not in attendance at a meeting for which you're voting on the minutes, that person usually abstains from a vote.

Juanito Rus: Mrs Olugbala can you hear us?

Assata Olugbala: I'm finished.

Juanito Rus: Okay thank you very much.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Thank you, definitely my error. It's a little late for me, so thank you very much for the reminder. Let's see, Mr Ruse I see-
- Juanito Rus: I'm seeing a second hand that just went up.
- Regina Jackson: Okay.
- Juanito Rus: My apologies I was switching screens. The next person in the queue is Kevin Cantu. Good evening, Mr Cantu can you hear us?
- Kevin Cantu: Good evening. So very last minute thought, there's an ongoing Twitter conversation just now about somebody using a bear cat in Oakland to do a traffic stop and that's on the deescalation policy. That's fascinating to me. Goodnight everyone.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr Cantu and now there are no further speakers in the queue Madam Chair. Can we turn the meeting?
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. We will. I have been advised that we'll go to the agenda setting and we have a lot of things to schedule, but obviously one of them is the closed session on the Alden on the CPRA. Are there any other recommendations from the commission on items to go on the agenda?
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Well, I certainly have a laundry list, so I will work that out since there are no other suggestions. Why don't we go to public comment and see if there are suggestions there. Mr. Rus.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Madam Chair. Any member of the public wishes to speak on item 14, please raise your hand in the zoom queue. This time I see one hand in the queue and now there are more. First person in the queue is a Mrs. Assata Olugbala. Good evening Mrs. Olugbala, you have one minute.
- Assata Olugbala: Yes. I want to make reference to your interest in the Boogaloo. There, according to the Southern poverty law center, there are 940 active hate groups in the United States of America. While you choose to deal with white supremacy and one group and out of that 940, there are 155 white supremacists groups in this country. There are 32 hate groups in California. To say one officer wears an Hawaiian shirt and you immediately say that's a Boogaloo shirt, it reminds me of Trayvon Martin and when George Zimmerman said, because he had a hoodie on, he probably was a criminal. You have to be very careful. I remember wearing dreadlocks. I was always assumed to be a Rasta and smoking marijuana. Please be careful about addressing people because of what they wear.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mrs. Olugbala, your time has expired. The next speaker in the queue is Megan Steffen. Good evening, Mrs. Steffen, you have one minute.
- Megan Steffen: Good evening. Thanks so much. I've said this before, but I'll say it once more, I'm interested to find out if there's currently a policy for OPDs public information officer and regarding in general,



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

October 22, 2020

their public information policies. I understand that there's a missing persons policy ad hoc. I think after what I've seen from what's proposed from the community policing policy, I'm concerned that if OPD has a public information officer policy, that it might be a little bit absurd. Right now in the community policing policy it explicitly states that NSCS aren't permitted to share any negative stories. They must only share positive stories and I'm worried that if there is prescriptive language like that in the PIOs policy as well, that's just going to undermine trust because it means we cannot talk about reality with the police department. Thank you.

- Juanito Rus: Thank you Mrs. Stephen. This time seeing no for the Hands in the queue Madam Chair.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. I believe that we will follow up on the public information officer policy. So Chief Manheimer if you can let me know tomorrow what policies that might relate to that, that will be helpful. Well, moving forward to a Adjournment. Thank you everyone for your patience. Can I get a motion to adjourn the meeting?
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. It's properly moved. Can I get a second?
- Jose Dorado: Second.
- Regina Jackson: Excellent, thank you. Seconded by commissioner Dorado. Let's vote. Mr. Dorado.
- Jose Dorado: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Garcia. Mr. Garcia? Commissioner Harbin Forte?
- Brenda Harbin Forte: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Singleton?
- Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Gage?
- Henry Gage, III: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Smith.
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Garcia? Aye for myself.
- Sergio Garcia: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. It is now 11:50. We are adjourned. Thank you very much. Be safe.

From: [Elise Bernstein](#)
To: [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)
Subject: Today's Police Commission meeting
Date: Thursday, October 22, 2020 4:17:46 PM

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

Greetings Commissioners,

I want to welcome the two new Commissioners to be seated today. Having followed their Selection Panel process, I look forward to their providing strong teamwork experience as well as professional skills developed in their wide-ranging experience as members of impacted communities.

Welcome, Commissioner Singleton and Commissioner Garcia.

Thank you,

Elise

[REDACTED]

D6

[REDACTED]