## Meeting of the Oakland Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission (PRAC) Special Meeting Wednesday, October 13, 2021 4:30 PM

**Zoom Webinar Information:** 

When: Oct 13, 2021 04:30 PM Pacific Time (US and Canada)
Topic: Special Meeting of the Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission (PRAC) October 13, 2021
Please click the link below to join the webinar:
https://us06web.zoom.us/j/87367278634
Or One tap mobile :
US: +14086380968,,87367278634# or +16699006833,,87367278634#
Or Telephone:
Dial(for higher quality, dial a number based on your current location):
US: +1 408 638 0968 or +1 669 900 6833 or +1 253 215 8782 or +1 346 248 7799 or +1
646 876 9923 or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 312 626 6799
Webinar ID: 873 6727 8634
International numbers available: https://us06web.zoom.us/u/kcMuHYmoOh

#### **How To Submit Public Comments:**

**1.** To comment by Zoom video conference, click the "Raise Your Hand" button to request to speak when Open Forum comments are being taken or on an eligible agenda item after it has been presented. You will be permitted to speak during your turn, allowed to comment, and after the allotted time, re-muted. Instructions on how to "Raise Your Hand" is available at: https://support.zoom.us/hc/en-us/articles/205566129 - Raise-Hand-In-Webinar.

**2.** To comment by phone, please call on one of the above listed phone numbers. You will be prompted to "Raise Your Hand" by pressing "\*9" to speak when Open Forum is taken or after an eligible agenda item has been presented. You will be permitted to speak during your turn, allowed to comment, and after the allotted time, re-muted. Please unmute yourself by pressing \*6.

**3**. To submit comments to the PRAC prior to the meeting, send an email to: **publiccomments2prac@oaklandca.gov** by 10:00 a.m. the day of the meeting. List the following information on the "subject" line of your email:

**Public Comments: PRAC meeting dd/mm/yy (date of the scheduled meeting)** >>>Replies will not be sent from this email address<<<

If you have questions, email Diane Boyd, Executive Assistant to the Director of Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development <u>dboyd@oaklandca.gov</u>. Thank you.

Pursuant to California Government Code section 54953(e). Parks Recreation Advisory Commission Board Members/Commissioners, as well as staff, will participate via phone/video conference, and no physical teleconference locations are required.



## PARKS AND RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION – PRAC Special Meeting Wednesday, October 13, 2021, 4:30 P.M. Agenda

- 1. CALL TO ORDER:
- 2. <u>ROLL CALL:</u> ALLEN, DUHE, HA, KOS-READ, MOORE, REILLY, D. SMITH, K. SMITH, TORRES, TRAN AND WALTON
- 3. **DISPOSITION OF MINUTES:** 
  - August 11, 2021 Minutes
  - September 8, 2021 Minutes
- 4. MODFICATION OF THE AGENDA:
- 5. <u>OPEN FORUM:</u>
- 6. <u>CONSENT NEW BUSINESS:</u>
- 7. <u>NEW BUSINESS:</u>
  - <u>Election of Commission Officers</u>
- 8. PLANNING AND CONDITIONAL USE PERMITS:
- 9. MEASURE Q:
  - Measure Q hiring update
  - Measure Q maintenance-of-effort documentation update
  - Measure Q Equity analysis update

#### 10. <u>UPDATE FROM DIRECTOR, COMMITTEES, RECREATION ADVISORY</u> <u>COUNCILS & ANNOUNCEMENTS & COMMUNICATIONS</u>

- Communication:
  - PRAC Priorities and Objectives
  - Brown and Sunshine Training

#### 11. CONTINUATION OF OPEN FORUM:

12. ADJOURNMENT:

<u>Next Meeting:</u> Wednesday, November 10, 2021, 4:30PM Via Zoom

This meeting location is wheelchair accessible. To request disability-related accommodations or to request an ASL, Cantonese, Mandarin or Spanish interpreter, please email <u>dboyd@oaklandnet.com</u> or call (510) 238-7532 or TDD/TTY (510) 238-3254 at least five working days before the meeting. Please refrain from wearing scented products to this meeting as a courtesy to attendees with chemical sensitivities.

Esta reunión es accesible para sillas de ruedas. Si desea solicitar adaptaciones relacionadas con discapacidades, o para pedir un intérprete de en español, Cantones, Mandarín o de lenguaje de señas (ASL) por favor envié un correo electrónico a <u>dboyd@oaklandnet.com</u> o llame al (510) 238-7532 o (510) 238-3254 por lo menos cinco días hábiles antes de la reunión. Se le pide de favor que no use perfumes a esta reunión como cortesía para los que tienen sensibilidad a los productos químicos. Gracias.

會場有適合輪椅出入設施。需要殘障輔助設施, 手語, 西班牙語, 粵語或國語翻譯服務, 請在 會議前五個工作天電郵 dboyd@oaklandnet.com 或致電 (510) 238-7532 或 (510) 238-3254 TDD/TTY。請避免塗搽香氛產品,參加者可能對化學成分敏感。

## PARKS AND RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION - PRAC Wednesday, August 11, 2021 - 4:30 P.M.

#### **Minutes and Recording Link**

http://oakland.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?publish\_id=2a9995fa-04fc-11ec-9f1e-0050569183fa

- 1. CALL TO ORDER:
- <u>ROLL CALL:</u> 4:30 PM ALLEN, DUHE, HA, KOS-READ, MOORE, REILLY, D. SMITH, K. SMITH, TORRES, TRAN AND WALTON Present: (8) Commissioners Allen, Duhe, Kos-Read, Moore, Reilly, Torres, Tran, and Walton Excused: (2) Commissioners Ha, K. Smith Absent: (1) Commissioner D. Smith
- 3. **DISPOSITION OF MINUTES:**

July 14, 2021

Motion: Commissioner Reilly entertained a motion to recommend approval of the July 14, 2021, meeting minutes including changes as requested. Moved by: Commissioner Allen. Second by: CommissionerTran. Vote: 6 - Yes: Commissioners Allen, Duhe, Kos-Read, Reilly, Tran and Walton. 2 - Abstain: Commissioners Moore and Torres. Motion: Pass.

- 4. MODFICATION OF THE AGENDA:
- 5. <u>OPEN FORUM:</u>
- 6. <u>CONSENT NEW BUSINESS:</u>

A. REOUEST FROM OAKLAND EAST BAY GARDEN CENTER, INC. AND FRIENDS OF THE GARDENS AT LAKE MERRITT (FGLM) TO COLLECT FUNDS ON SITE AT THE ANNUAL AUTUMN LIGHTS FESTIVAL/FUNDRAISER AT LAKESIDE PARK GARDEN CENTER AND THE GARDENS AT LAKE MERRITT ON THURSDAY, OCTOBER 14, 2021 - SATURDAY, OCTOBER 16, 2021 FROM 6:00PM-11:00PM

**B.** REOUEST FROM SOOAKLAND LLC APPROVAL TO COLLECT ON-SITE ENTRY FEES AND DONATIONS FOR SOOAKLAND DAY IN THE PARK EVENT TO BE HELD AT JOAOUIN MILLERPARK ON SUNDAY, SEPTEMBER 26, 2021, 1:00PM-7:00PM.

C. REQUEST FROM OAKLAND LGBTO COMMUNITY CENTER FOR APPROVAL TO COLLECT FUNDS ONSITE THROUGH VENDOR SALES OF MERCHANDISE, CRAFTS AND DONATIONS ATPRIDE IN THE PARK HELD AT LAKESIDE PARK (EDOFF MEMORIAL BANDSTAND) ON SATURDAY, SEPTEMBER 11, 2021, FROM 12:00PM-6:00PM.

## D. REOUEST FROM DOPEONLY (DO) PERMISSION FOR APPROVAL TO COLLECT ONSITE ENTRY FEES, SALES OF ALCOHOLIC BEVERAGES, SALES OF FOODS AND MERCHANDISE AT THEIR COOL WATER EVENT TO BE HELD AT LAKESIDE PARK GARDEN CENTER ON SATURDAY, SEPTEMBER 4, 2021 FROM 2:00PM -8:00PM.

Commissioners held a discussion regarding Consent Item events including PRAC approval and staff vetting of applications. Oakland Parks and Recreation Central Reservations staff assured the body that items placed on Consent are from applicant organizers of events in good standing with the department, and that each event has been held three times without incident, all documentation and permits provided, and compliance with park rules have been observed.

Chair Reilly will continue the discussion at a future meeting to explore PRAC's scope of approval and possibly changing the Consent qualification requirements to accommodate the Commission's growing substantive calendar.

Motion: Commissioner Reilly entertained a motion to recommend approval of Consent Items 6A – 6D. Moved by: Commissioner Allen. Second by: Commissioner Duhe. Vote: 8 - Yes: Commissioners Allen, Duhe, Kos-Read, Moore, Reilly, Torres, Tran, and Walton. Motion: Pass.

#### 7. <u>NEW BUSINESS:</u>

A. Not Used

**B.** Not Used

## C. REOUEST FOR THE PARKS AND RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION TO RECEIVE AND PROVIDE COMMENT ON AN INFORMATIONAL REPORT AND UPDATE ON OAKLAND'S URBAN FOREST MASTER PLAN AND TREE INVENTORY.

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the staff report on Item 7C presented by Gordon Matassa, Administrative Analyst and Certified Arborist.

The Commission was informed that in 2018 Oakland Public Works, received a grant from the California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection to carry-out a three-part project which included conducting 1) a tree inventory, 2) developing an Urban Forest Master Plan (UFMP), and 3) plantings 700 trees in disadvantaged communities through Oakland.

The City contracted with Davey Resource Group to complete the inventory and develop the UFMP. The inventory included the physical inspection, tree species identification, size, health and condition of street trees in public areas, landscaped parks and City facilities. Trees in open parks were not included. The inventory was completed in April of 2021 and included a final total of 68,867 trees. A potential of 29,006 vacant sites were identified for future planting. The result of the tree inventory will inform staff of the health and condition of Oakland's urban forest and the environmental, health benefits provided to the community.

Staff shared that the Urban Forest Master Plan is poised to answer 4 questions including:

- What is the distribution and condition of Oakland's urban forest?
- What are our future goals for Oakland's urban forest?
- What are the strategies to achieve these goals?
- How do we implement these strategies and monitor progress?

Staff further informed the Commission that, community outreach for the UFMP will be equity focused toward reaching black, brown and indigenous communities in coordination by Oakland Public Works, the Department of Race & Equity, and the Davey Resource Group. Plans are underway to develop a Request for Proposal (RFP) for community groups to submit proposals for engaging community members. Staff encouraged the community to visit www.publicinput.com/Oaklandtrees.com for more information on regarding the RFP.

Public Comments: There were 7 speakers.

#### **Commission Comments:**

Staff confirmed for the Commission that the health of those trees surveyed will be included in the UFMP and that future grants could be written for planting more trees beyond the 700in the UFMP. The PRAC Tree Committee requested updates and that the same be provided to the Oakland Parks and Recreation Foundation.

The staff presentation was made via Power Point.

**Motion:** Commissioner Reilly entertained a motion to recommend PRAC accept the informational report regarding Oakland's Urban Forestry Project. **Moved by**: Commissioner Moore. **Second by**: Commissioner Duhe. **Vote: 8 - Yes**: Commissioners Allen, Duhe, Kos-Read, Moore, Reilly, Torres, Tran, and Walton. **Motion**: Pass.

#### D. REQUEST FOR THE PARKS AND RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION TO RECEIVE AN INFORMATIONAL REPORT FROM OAKLAND-RESIDENT, MEGAN PALSA, ON THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS TO JOAOUIN MILLER PARK AS A RESULT OF THE CURRENT USE IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE ABSENCE OF ADEQUATECITY MONITORING.

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the informational report on Item 7D presented by Oakland resident, Megan Palsa.

Ms. Palsa informed the Commission of her concerns and observations of Joaquin Miller Park during her daily visits over a two-year period. She sited rapid deterioration of the park, specifically on the multi-use trails and the extensive introduction of new rogue trails. She asserted that Joaquin Miller Park is a multi-use park frequented by visitors from all over the Bay Area from as far as Gilroy and Watsonville. On a weekly and monthly basis, she has witnessed it used by camping programs, City schools, and racially and economically diverse users.

She noted that stakeholder users function separately and without coordination. On a Saturday, Ms. Palsa conducted an informal tally of people visiting Joaquin Miller Park and noted 500 bikers, 1000 hikers and 0 equestrian on the premises with little signage, almost nonexistent trail maintenance or application of forest rules and regulations. Ms. Palsa further asserted the lack of City presence.

Ms. Palsa made 4 several recommendations:

- That the Commission support an assessment on the current state of Joaquin Miller Park, including a physical visit with an environmentalist/naturalist and
- Focus on sanctioned and unsanctioned trails and the environmental effects (
- Conduct a formal weekend tally of hikers, bikers and equestrian users
- Conduct an investigation of agreements between the City and stakeholders, determine if they are being followed and make revisions to avoid conflict of interest.
- Draw on the methodology and examples of the numerous local regional and state entities that are currently in California balancing excessive use of Redwood parks with strict regulations

The Cinderella and Chaparral Trails were identified as single tract trails popular among bikers and reported to be worn down to bedrock.

Ms. Palsa requested the Commission review the studies referenced in her report. Public Comments: There were 4 speakers.

**Commission Comments:** 

Chair Reilly acknowledge appreciation for the report and the initial process of addressing concerns at Joaquin Miller Park and would rely on staff's guidance for taking steps on the recommendations presented.

Clinton Pugh Park Supervisor II with Oakland Public Works welcomed the report and acknowledged OPW's role under maintenance and Parks and Rec for programming. He further acknowledged the unprecedented usership of the park due to COVID and encouraged a collective effort would be needed to find solutions and plan development.

Chair Reilly questioned staff on the effects of funding and resources to Joaquin Miller Park based on its designation as an open space versus a city park.

OPW staff informed the Commission that the departments workforce level does not Services are focused on

The Commission and staff engaged in a discussion regarding the effects on funding and resources to Joaquin Miller Park based on its designation as an open space park versus a city park. OPW staff informed the Commission that the department directs services to those Parks and Recreation areas where there are developed children, youth sports programming, and that more staff is need to service open space areas. Redesignating the Joaquin Miller to a city park would not change the need for funding and staffing the 500 acres and trails. Parks and Recreation Assistant Director Dana Riley offered that the open space categorization of the parks offers more protection and greater opportunity for grant funding.

Chair Reilly acknowledge not having a dedicated PRAC liaison to Joaquin Miller was an oversight and sought a volunteer for the post. Adding that have a point person to begin the engagement process would be a good start, and that the Commission is not in a position to accept all of the recommendation without knowing the full impact of implementation. Chair offered an ad hoc committee could be formed once the liaison gathered more information. Commission Torres volunteered to be the PRAC liaison to Joaquin Miller Park and welcomed support from other members. The Chair established that it was not necessary to make a motion on the assignment as Joaquin Miller Park's liaison.

Presenter Palsa confirmed her support the Commission's action to have a PRAC liaison to Joaquin Miller Park and offered support to Commissioner Torres.

Motion: Commissioner Reilly entertained a motion to recommend accept the Joaquin Miller Informational Report but not the recommendations at this time. Moved by: Commissioner Tran. Second by: CommissionerKos-Read. Vote: 8 - Yes: Commissioners Allen, Duhe, Kos-Read, Moore, Reilly, Torres, Tran and Walton. Motion: Pass.

## E. REOUEST FOR THE PARKS AND RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION TO APPROVE THE CONTINUED USE OF PARK SPACE ADJACENT TO EL EMBARCADERO FOR A VENDING PILOT ON SATURDAYS AND SUNDAYS

At the July 14, 2021 Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission, made a motion to: Extend the Vending Pilot Program for one month as is and in its current state, at its current location and current frequency to allow staff and the Lake Merritt Taskforce and Mobile Vending Pilot Program subcommittee to meet with the enforcing bodies as well as City representative to discuss a long-term plan whether it is until the end of November 2021 or in perpetuity.

Greg Minor with Special Activity Permit Division - Department of Economic and Workforce Development presented the report for Item 7E.

The recommendation to continue for the Pilot Vending program through November 2021 remain the same as from the previous month for 3 primary reasons:

- Since fall of 2020 to last spring 2021, the program helped local vendors impacted economically by COVID-19 continued to make a living while the City emerges from the pandemic.
- The program has provided a pathway to compliances and assists staff in curbing unpermitted activity at the Lake Merritt.
- The City Council has allocated funding to cover the management of the program through November of 2021.

Staff welcomed PRAC's input with framing the program for the coming months and exploring locations. It was suggested that continued unpermitted activities at Lake Merritt is a citywide issue to be addressed by enforcement departments, and that those issues may be exacerbated if restrictions are placed on the program or if it is eliminated.

Staff introduced Aurice Guyton Associate with the Black Vendors Association to provide information regarding program participants.

- As of August, there were roughly 50 vendors the LA vendor will no longer participated in the program at that time
- During the previous weekend 35 vendors were from Oakland,
   1 San Leandro, 2 San Francisco, 2 Sacramento, 2 Walnut Creek, 4 Vallejo,
   Berkeley (no number provided)
- I merchant opened a small store front in Oakland (started selling merchandise and t-shirts through the Pilot Vending program in 2020).
- A majority of the participating vendors received a seller permits and business licenses.
- Vendors living outside of Oakland received a City of Oakland business tax license.

## Public Comments: There were 16 Speakers.

## **Commission Comments and Questions:**

Chair Riley invited Council President Bas and Councilmember Fife to make comments. Both representatives support the efforts of the Vending Pilot program and its continuance through November while a more permanent sustainable path forward utilizing area across the city and addressing the various stakeholder concerns.

The PRAC subcommittee reported that efforts are underway to receive more detailed information from the Cultural Affairs Commission regarding rules for use of public space beyond Lake Merritt.

Meetings were held with community and staff stakeholders to discuss the El Embarcadero site, Council President Bas and staff, and the Farmer's Market organizer at Splash Pad Park. The Committee reported Council President Bas' office support of the Vending Pilot program being extended to the end of the year. The Farmer's Market organizer was in support of the program, but not its relocation to Splash Pad Park because of their own ongoing maintenance issues and concerns for support by the City, thereby making the site non-viable for the purpose of the Pilot. OPD suggested a brochure highlighting City park rules and ordinances would be helpful with the efforts to reduce illegal activities and educate the public. City Vending program staff and the Black Vendors Association, with guidance from the PRAC, will draft long-term plans for the Vending program for review and consideration.

Commissioner Allen made a motion to:

Move to approve the continued use of park space adjacent to El Embarcadero for a Vending Pilot on Saturdays only, and until the current funding runs out in November 2021. After which time, City staff and the Oakland Black Vendors Association will need to present a long-term plan to PRAC. Second by: Commissioner Walton.

Directors Williams made an amendment to the motion to include the professional opinion of the Parks Department. Commissioner Allen excepted the amendment.

The Commission engaged in a discussion regarding the Director's amendment and revised the discussion on the Vending program to reach clarity on the motion.

#### **Commission Allen made a motion to:**

Move to approve the continued use of park space adjacent to El Embarcadero for Vending Pilot on Saturdays and Sundays until the current funding runs out in November 2021. After which time, City staff, the Oakland Black Vendors Association, and Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development will need to present a long-term plan to PRAC. Second by: Commissioner Walton.

Commissioner Kos-Read made a friendly amendment to: (1) replace *City staff with Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development* - as leadership must be owned by a specific department which would include other departments to be involved

(2) with their guidance, that there is a potential way to reduce the intensity of use in that space and continued to be explored in the interim.

Commissioner Kos-Read also recommended not naming a specific external organization in the motion and referred the inclusion of relevant external parties to the decision of the Parks and Recreation Director.

Director Williams reminded the Commission that the Vending Pilot program was presented to PRAC because it takes place on park property, and that it is not a Parks and Recreation lead program.

Chair Reilly approved naming the external organization in the motion.

Commissioner Allen clarified the reference in the motion to City staff was to Greg Minor and that the Vending Pilot program falls under the leadership of the Economic and Workforce Development Department and offered to amend or restate the motion to... *this is with the economic and workforce development department partnering with Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development to create a long-term plan.* 

Greg Minor made a recommendation to include in the language the City Administration which encompasses all City departments because the Vending program is a highly interdepartmental effort.

Commissioner Allen made a motion to:

Approve the continued use of park space adjacent to El Embarcadero for a Vending Pilot on Saturdays and Sundays until the current funding runs out in November 2021, After which time, Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development and other necessary City Administration, as well as Oakland Black Vendors Association will need to present a long-term plan to PRAC. Second by Commissioner Walton. The item was moved to a vote.

**Motion:** Commissioner Reilly entertained a motion to approve the continued use of park space adjacent to El Embarcadero for a Vending Pilot on Saturdays and Sundays until the current funding runs out in November 2021. After which time, Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development, and other necessary City Administration, as well as the Oakland Black Vendors Association, will need to present a long-term plan to PRAC. **Moved by**: Commissioner K. Allen. **Second by**: Commissioner Walton. **Vote: 8 - Yes**: Commissioners Allen, Duhe, Kos-Read, Moore, Reilly, Torres, Tran and Walton. **Motion**: Pass.

#### 8. PLANNING AND CONDITIONAL USE PERMITS:

- 9. MEASURE Q: Oakland Public Works (OPW)
  - Hiring Matrix
  - Deliverables Tracking
  - Race and Equity Analysis
  - Final Budget

Oakland Public Works (OPW) staff provided the Commission a brief report on the latest outcomes related to Measure Q.

#### Hiring Matrix:

Clinton provided a status update on Measure Q hiring related to over 40 positions and 15 different classifications including hires, vacancies and referrals to OPW for review and interview scheduling and ongoing recruitment. In some areas, the Department of Human Resource Management is moving to written performance examinations due to the lack or raters.

#### **Deliverables Tracking:**

Sean Maher reported that the department is making progress organizationally as a number of services in Public Works are receiving Measure Q Funding that. The agency is working on internal tracking differences to simplify the reporting in a consistent manner. They anticipate a report for the September meeting.

#### Race Equity Analysis:

The team anticipate providing the Commission with a timeline for the Race Equity analysis at the September meeting. Stakeholders including the Race and Equity Department are being identified and gathered to participate in the process.

Since the July meeting, Harold Duffy has been installed as the Director of Oakland Public Works.

He brings to the organization some three decades of public administration and public works experience. Director has instructed staff to develop a website for Measure Q.

Final Budget: Brook Levin – Co Chair of Measure Q

A couple outstanding around the budget that you know are still kind of out there one is that

- Wording on the Measure Q ballad does not include major capital improvement projects. One was added late in the budget process for Union Point Park. A public records request has not been filled.
- Public works is working matrix system for managing deliverables.

Public Comments: There were 2 speakers.

## 10. <u>UPDATE FROM DIRECTOR, COMMITTEES, RECREATION ADVISORY</u> <u>COUNCILS (RAC) & ANNOUNCEMENTS:</u>

### COMMITTEES

Rules: Kos-Read:

- The PRAC Committee has met with Cultural Affairs Commission which has extensively reviewed the last draft regulations
- Districts 2 and 3 are planning town hall meetings think those are important and i'm i really do hope that as we heard on the best practices from you know we've done some research on bending and mark bending rules in Los Angeles and you know anyways so it's a it's
- The project is a work in progress wants to be prepared for next year with updated enforceable rules for the whole City

Commissioner Allen: Lake Merritt Committee

• 4-part series town hall meeting are being planned to discuss community agreements for the Lake and Park Ambassadors.

## RAC's

Commissioner Allen: Mosswood

- The RAC resumed in August
- Town Camp concluded August 6. Campers received backpack give-aways from Comcast including school supplies and laptops
- Off leash-dogs concerns are being addressed

• Afterschool begins 8/16

## DeFremery

• In communication with the Recreation Center Director – so success in reaching the OPD resource officer regarding off leash dogs and cars parked on the lawn

Brookdale

• Planned backpack school supplies give-a-way on 8/22, 11:30am

Announcements: Commissioner Allen:

September is Creek to Bay month. Parks will have activities that are going to be scheduled to do park cleanups and park beautification.

## CONTINUATION OF OPEN FORUM:

## 11. ADJOURNMENT:8:15

Commissioner Reilly adjourned the meeting in memory of Commissioner Kensie Smith's Aunt, Ms. Ruth Jordan. Services for Ms. Jordan will be held on August 20th 11:00 am at the Pilgrim Missionary Baptist Church at 831 S 43rd St in Richmond. Masks will be required. If you are unable to attend the funeral, there will be a viewing for Ms. Jordan on Thursday, August 19th from 1:00 to 5:00 at Fuller Funeral Home located at 3100 Cutting Blvd in Richmond.

<u>Next Meeting:</u> Wednesday, September 8, 2021 Via Zoom

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ J. Nicholas Williams J. Nicholas Williams Secretary

<u>/s/ Diane Boyd</u> Diane Boyd Acting Recording Secretary



## PARKS AND RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION - PRAC Wednesday, September 8, 2021, 4:30 P.M. Minutes

#### **Recording Link:**

http://oakland.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?publish\_id=8a893113-217c-11ec-9f1e-0050569183fa

- 1. CALL TO ORDER: 4:32PM
- 2. <u>ROLL CALL:</u>

ALLEN, DUHE, HA, KOS-READ, MOORE, REILLY, D. SMITH, K. SMITH TORRES, TRAN AND WALTON

PRESENT: (6) Commissioners Allen, Kos-Read, Moore, Reilly, Torres, Tran
EXCUSED: (2) Commissioner Walton and Ha
ABSENT: (1) Commissioners Ha and D. Smith
LATER ARRIVALS: (2) Commissioners Duhe and K. Smith

3. **DISPOSITION OF MINUTES:** 

Minutes for the August PRAC minutes will be reviewed at the October PRAC meeting.

- 4. <u>MODFICATION OF THE AGENDA:</u>
- 5. <u>OPEN FORUM</u>: There were 6 speakers
- 6. <u>CONSENT NEW BUSINESS:</u>
- 7. <u>NEW BUSINESS:</u>
  - A. <u>BROOKLYN BASIN PROJECT MODIFICATIONS PROPOSAL:</u> <u>MARINA EXPANSIONS.</u>

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the staff report presented by Catherine Payne Development Planning Manager for the City of Oakland and the Development Planning Division.

#### Planned Project

Staff requested that PRAC provide input on a specific aspect of a current proposal related to Brooklyn Basin. The Commission was informed that the Brooklyn Basin Master Developer proposed expansion of planned Marina facilities in the Oakland Estuary fronting the Brooklyn Basin specific to the Township Commons Park. The already approved planned project does not include Marina facilities fronting Township Park. Where the proposed project does include Marina facilities along most of the length of the park and a water taxi dock at the southeastern most end near the 9th Ave Terminal. The planned project was approved and entitled in 2009. Other elements of the planned project described included 3100 new dwelling units, 465 affordable units, up to 200,000 square feet of commercial space, parking and 30 additional acres of new parks. Staff announced that the project is currently being delivered.

The Commission was encouraged to review the staff report and offered to guide the members through the graphics showing that aspects of the project that have been delivered and the final entitlements under consideration.

Staff stated that all of the final development permits or final entitlements for the parks have been approved leaving the parks to be delivered on a phased in basis along with the residential development. The Commission was directed to review the staff report to see the location of the 167 slips approved in the planned project.

#### Proposed Project

In review of the proposed project, staff outlined the addition of 600 dwelling units, the relocation of 1 tower closer to 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, the expansion and extension of Marina facilities from Clinton Basin along the entire length of Township Commons to include 158 slips. The proposed project also includes the relocation of planned slips from the northeastern side of Clinton Basin further out toward South Park, and the addition of a water taxi dock in front of the 9th Avenue Terminal.

#### Necessary Steps for Approval of the Proposal Improvement

- Receive PRAC comments on the Marina facilities adjacent to parks
- General Plan Amendment and Rezone
- Amendment to the Development Agreement for the entire project (Currently under negotiation through Economic Workforce Development)
- Revision to the Planned Unit Development

#### Process and Next Steps

- Present the project to the Design Review Committee in September. In addition to facilities adjacent to parks, the discussion will also include the proposed relocation of towers.
- Presentation to the Planning Commission
- 2 meetings at City Council
  - 1. Project subject to a Resolution
  - 2. Project subject to an Ordinance
- Currently in the EIR process under CEQA California Environmental Quality Act.
- Complete review of draft EIR comments and draft final document. Circulated and convene hearings before the Planning Commission for recommendations and decisions.
- Meetings with City Council

Ending their presentation, staff informed the Commission that applicant Eric Harrison was present to make a presentation and offered to share graphics from the staff report.

#### Applicant Eric Harrison

Mr. Harrison provided a visual presentation for the Commission which may be reviewed in its entirety via the following link at time-marker 27:01 / 2:59:40. He was joined by Jeff Pence from Pacific Marina Development and Jim Jacobs with Hart Howerton.

#### http://oakland.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?publish\_id=8a893113-217c-11ec-9f1e-0050569183fa

The presentation reviewed the parameters of the planned and proposed projects as described in the staff report. Developers studied aspects of local and out of state venues for design ideas. These venues featured designs where marinas and open spaces interfaced. Locations included Jack London Square in Oakland, San Francisco, Washington, D.C., and Chicago's Lake Front Trail.

Mr. Harrison stated that in addition to Brooklyn Basis's various housing levels and retail opportunities, developers were exploring ways to make the project multi-modal to support residency without dependency of a vehicle as the reduction in parking requirements is being considered. The implementation of free shuttle services has been provided and will transport residents and visitors to and from local BART stations.

Developers are studying the possible implementation of a water taxi service as a second way of activating the waterfront and estuary. Watercraft with the capacity of 20 to 50 passengers is recommended as an additional means of transporting users around the waterfront, Alameda and other points of access of the Bay. Conversations are being held with water taxi operators.

The Commission was informed that after a study of the sea floor near the Clinton Basin, it was determined in the best interest of the project to build within existing environment where dredging

would not be needed. Four viewpoint simulations from around Marina were shared. The fourth viewpoint included the 9<sup>th</sup> Street Terminal where an existing public access ramp could be used for water taxi service. Locations for parking and dock area off-loading accommodations concluded the presentation.

PUBLIC COMMENTS: There were 11 speakers.

#### COMMISSION COMMENTS:

Chair Reilly clarified that the Commission's role was to receive public comments and provide individual comments on the item. And that the body would not vote to approve or disapprove the project, but that staff would take project for further review by the Planning Commission and City Council.

Commissioner Allen:

- Will the number of affordable housing units be increased and will low income housing units be included in the plans?
- Will parking be increased for non-residential users?
- Inquired if the OSCAR has been reviewed. It provides 11 areas which address marina improvements, boat slips, open spaces and shoreline access.
- The PRAC meeting does not provide sufficient time needed to provide adequate feedback on the proposal.

Planning Staff: Affordable housing is not related to any specific required findings for parks and it was not included in the report, however, staff can provide that information to the Commission.

Applicant has indicated the additional 600 units they are proposing would comply with the current requirements regarding the affordable housing impacts. Either they would provide the units as required under the ordinance or they would pay the impact fee.

The applicant is not proposing any additional parking at this time. Right sizing the residential parking to conform with City's codes that were updated few years ago. Plan on having public parking that's publicly accessible as cited for parcels G and parcel H. Residents would not park there. Off street parking will increase after construction clears.

Regarding OSCAR - Staff's specific responsibility is to identify the regulatory findings that have to be made. Staff are not aware of any specific findings and are relying on PRAC to help determined if anything is missed.

Mr. Harrison provided the Commission with housing allocation levels required and added information regarding the creation of an endowment to establish housing in other neighborhoods.

### **Commissioner Duhe:**

- How does the team forecast what parking will be available for new residents and then the influx of new visitors?
- What are the numbers and the data?
- Public comments today have been negative. Was community feedback received? Was there a poll? If so, what was the feedback received that indicated moving forward with the project as presented? When were community comments and feedback received?
- Where is the support from the community that will be impacted the most?

Staff informed the Commission that the comment period on a draft supplemental EIR including an analysis regarding parking has closed. The draft will be made available to the Chair and staff. Eric Harrison offered information regarding parking demands, and that an outreach meeting was held 4 years ago at the Jack London Aquatic Center (JLAC). At that time, the team received concerns from residents, and they are looking to receive comment during the current review process.

The Commission recommended and encouraged the developers go back to the community for comments on the project.

Commissioner Kos-Read:

- Does not want to utilize limited urban space for more parking
- The water taxi idea better ideas out of all that has been put forward.
- The visuals presented in the staff report were underwhelming. Would like to see the presentation by Mr. Harrison made public. receive copy of the presentation by Mr. Harrison and placed on the website.
- Some of the boat slips could be helpful and can contribute to the livelihood of the overall neighborhood.
- The current visualization looks to be more than is ideal to preserve more direct water access.
- The project does not feel focused on public access.
- Would not look to Jack London Square as a model for the Brooklyn Basin. It is a challenge to activate. The lay out for gaining access to the water impacts the viability in usability and friendliness of the space.
- Requested clarification on an image in Mr. Harrison's presentation depicting a bike pedestrian bridge along the Estuary linking to the development.

Staff informed the Commission that at one point the bridge in question was a project sponsored by Public Works and is not a part of the current development. The Commission will be provided with a status update.

Commission Moore:

- A marina will completely change the waterfront experience for people and wildlife especially due to the estuaries and marshes proximity, and the constant rise of the sea level.
- Marshes and estuaries are extremely important to the health of the existing wildlife
- Motorized watercraft are detrimental to the health of wildlife and are dangerous to kayakers and folks on non-motorized craft.
- Waterways and wildlife are environmental impacted by motorized watercraft as petroleum products are released into the water as a function of the motor.
- The Viewshed will be completed impacted. Public marinas that are publicly accessible have locked gates. One must be a marina holder to get through. Access to the waterfront with be taken away and will heavily impact wildlife trying to pass safely through the sides versus the channel where boats from surrounding marinas operate.
- Supports fellow Commissioner's recommend to review the OSCAR.
- The BCDC (San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission) will most likely have an issue with the project due to sea level rise and their goal of preserving marshes and estuaries in the Bay. The BCDC monitors what is happing around the Bay to the Golden Gate Bridge.
- One meeting 4 years ago for public comments is unacceptable. Highly recommends a community engagement process just including the marina since it was not included in the original plan 10- 15 years ago.

Commissioner Tran:

• Why is this project being proposed now?

Planning staff deferred to Eric Harrison as the proposal was made by the Master Developer.

Eric Harrison informed the Commission that the proposed project has been in progress for three and a half years. Changes in the California building codes in 2013, allowed for the additions in the proposed project including housing units and partnership with Pacific Marina Development.

## Chair Reilly

- Supports the addition of housing and parking based on new regulations. Oakland needs low-income, free and affordable housing.
- Agrees visuals on the report could be construed as misleading.
- Not a fan of privatization of public spaces or the private encroachment into Oakland public spaces. For that belief, does not see a good reason to have a Marina here. Does not want to cede public space in favor for a place for people to make money and for rich people to park their boats.

- Has voted many times against having advertising or logos on Oakland public spaces even when those organizations are giving money. probably the most important thing here and I would like to see that as both
- Public access to this water is the most important aspect here. Would like to see that bolstered as much as possible with access points that are affordable or free.
- Leaning in favor of the water taxi proposal. Would support the use of private water taxi as a form of transportation. It would be better for traffic congestion and greenhouse gas emissions. Would support 30 to 40 people in a private water taxi for their commute to work and not in individual cars.
- Can elements of the project be separated or is it all in one? Specifically related to the waterfront, can the marina be removed, but keep the water taxis and public access?

Planning staff informed the Commission that the Planning Commission and City Council are being asked to make discretionary decisions, so they can elect to approve parts of the project and not the entire project. Whether the applicant would agree to that or not is a separate question.

You see this information reports commissioner do it right pressure but thank you so OK seconded by cost free if there is no further discussion

**Motion:** Commissioner Reilly entertained a motion to recommend PRAC receive the informational report. **Moved by**: Commissioner Duhe. **Second by**: Commissioner Kos-Read. **Vote: 7 Yes**: Commissioners Allen, Duhe, Kos-Read, Moore, Reilly, Torres, and Tran. **1 Abstain:** Commissioners K. Smith. **Motion**: Pass.

B. <u>NOT USED</u>

## C. REQUEST FOR THE PARKS AND RECREATION ADVISORY <u>COMMISSION TO REVIEW, PROVIDE COMMENTS AND</u> <u>RECOMMEND ACCEPTANCE OF A GIFT FROM PROJECT</u> <u>BACKBOARD, IN PARTNERSHIP WITH ARTIST ADIA MILLETT, FOR</u> <u>THE LOWELL PARK BASKETBALL COURT RENOVATION</u> <u>PROJECT.</u>

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the report for Item 7C presented by Myka Hammock Sports Coordinator.

Staff requested the Commission approve the renovation of the Lowell Park basketball court as gifted in partnership by Project Blackboard. In relationship to Lowell Park's softball field, baseball field and the newly installed fitness court, the renovation of the basketball court will round out the neighborhood sport complex.

The Commission confirmed that the total amount of the gift, \$92,700.00, equals the total amount of the project.

#### PUBLIC COMMENTS: There were no speakers.

#### COMMISSION COMMENTS:

#### Commissioner Allen:

Staff confirmed for the Commission that artist Adia Millet is a local artist and will be engage in a community meeting to receive ideas and feedback on the design for the surface of the court. The artist will be responsible the maintenance of the artwork for 6 months. Staff offered to invite the Commission to the community engagement meeting and to view samples of her work online at the link referenced in the staff report. Director Williams informed the Commission that because the proposed art project is a maintenance activity, a presentation before the Public Art Commission is not necessary.

Chair Reilly confirmed that the Commission would have the opportunity to view the proposed artwork and design at a later meeting, and that the purpose of the staff report was to seek the body's recommendation to receive the gift from Project Blackboard.

# Note: Commissioner Kos-Read was excused before the motion on Item 7C. was made.

Motion (1)

Motion (1): Commissioner Reilly entertained a motion to accept the gift and receive the art design review on another agenda. Moved by: Commissioner Duhe. Second by: Commissioner Allen. Vote: 5 Yes: Commissioners Allen, Duhe, Moore, Reilly, and Tran. Motion: Failed due to insufficient quorum.

#### Motion was Suspended:

After the motion and votes were tallied on item 7C, Chair Reilly determined that all Commissions participating on Teleconference were not present during motion. At 6:35pm, the meeting was suspended for 5 minutes

#### The meeting reconvened at 6:40pm and a second vote was taken on the item:

#### Motion (2)

Motion (2): Commissioner Reilly entertained a motion to accept the gift and receive the art design review on another agenda. Moved by: Commissioner Duhe. Second by: Commissioner Allen. Vote: 7 Yes: Commissioners Allen, Duhe, Moore, Reilly. K. Smith, Torres, and Tran. Motion: Passed.

- 8. PLANNING AND CONDITIONAL USE PERMITS:
- 9. MEASURE Q:

The practice is the oversight committee for the measure Q funds for parks and for water and so we do have a number of items that we were going to be discussing tonight

- Measure Q website
- Hiring Matrix
- Performance Reporting
- Budget

#### Measure Q Website: Sean Maher

The Measure Q website is activated. Reports made to the PRAC Commission will be posted for public review. Staff screen shared the view of the website and review various aspect of the funding represented by the Measure Q including adopted budgets and funds allocations. To access the website, the public may Google *City of Oakland Measure Q*. The page is titled Measure Q at Work. Contact: Sean Maher @ smaher@oaklandca.gov.

Measure Q Ad Hoc Committee - Brooke Levin

The Measure Q website is a portal where the community can receive information about the budget, park maintenance budget, equity analysis and review the quality of park maintenance the clean water program and tree maintenance. Homeless funding allocation will be managed by two other departments and phased into the website. Under Public Works, performance measures including restroom cleaning, mowing, litter pickup will be available.

#### Hiring Matrix: Sean Maher

Staff shared the hiring matric via the Measure Q website and reviewed scheduled interviews, exams and hiring across various classifications.

## Performance Reporting Update:

At the last ad hoc meeting, staff shared ad hoc Commissioners and community members initial work being done to pulled together the ways Public Works already tracks the services and monitors the services that are funded by Measure Q. The priority is marrying those two the explicit performance requirements of the measure itself. The goal is to provide a one at a glance resource. Hope to provide draft reporting next month.

#### Inequity Analysis:

The next immediate priority is an equity analysis. A number of annual reports or annual analysis are required of Measure Q. This s a relatively new requirement that is the responsibility of all City departments across all agenda reports brought to City Council and to other oversight bodies. The City's Department of Race and Equity's model for change is building internal capacity and

charging departments with the responsibility for building equities and being responsible for implementing equity change principals.

Budget Update: Sean Maher

The ad hoc committee will invite the Budget Office into the next meeting.

Brooke Levin: Will review documents to ensure all projects track well. The One-Time funding column needs to be clarified.

PUBLIC COMMENT: There was 1 speaker.

## 10. <u>UPDATE FROM DIRECTOR, COMMITTEES, RECREATION ADVISORY</u> <u>COUNCILS & ANNOUNCEMENTS:</u>

Director Williams:

- In response to the rising COVID-19 numbers, OPYRD's Afterschool program was suspended for two weeks. There have been minimal incidents with COVID-19 at the recreation centers. All have been managed well.
- 420 kids are participating in the Afterschool program.
- Youth Sports and Basketball programs continue to operate. 1500 kids participated in the citywide program.
- Aquatics and Adult Sports are operating.
- On August 29<sup>th</sup>. Lions Pool celebrated its 92nd birthday. The facility originally opened on August 29th 1929.

## COMMITTEE UPDATES -

Tree Committee - Commissioner Tran: Comments received via email due to connectivity issues:

## Questions and recommendations that the Tree Committee had on the Oakland Canopy and Land Cover Assessment Report, 2020

Questions

- Increasing tree canopy in all areas of Oakland is seen as a good/desirable outcome in the report. What about the role of tree canopy in wildfires?
- Tree inventory of street, public trees was part of this effort.
  - What came out of it and can the public access this information?
- What is the reasoning for organizing by district and other ways it was organized? Will this be tied to any funding allocation?
- Any need to outline what the historic tree canopy coverage was and how tree canopy is adapted for current conditions?

Recommendations

- Are there any peer cities or models that Oakland should be looking at, especially if any other jurisdictions have strong equitable methods of improving tree canopy coverage?
- Much of the city's tree canopy is on privately owned property. Can we provide incentives and education for private property owners, such as:
  - o Develop an approved trees list for the public to use when they decide to plant trees on their property
  - o Design guidelines that have to do with trees for new development

#### Rules Committee – Chair Reilly

The Rule Committee is looking to rewrite the Oakland Municipal Code (OMC) that pertains to parks. The process has been going on for five years. The Committee will review with PRAC before moving to the Life Enrichment Committee and ultimately the City Council for adoption.

The Committee also met with the Cultural Affairs Commission comments. Looking toward planning public engagement. Consideration inviting OPD to review the areas related to sound and noise as the enforcement agency. The Department of Race Equity and the City Attorney's Office will be invited to review. Time will be needed to make edits. A townhall will be planned.

Chair Reilly announced that he will be terming out after two more meeting but has offered to continue working on the project.

Commissioner Allen:

- Brookdale Recreation Center: On August 22, approximately 50 kids received backpacks and donated items for the Golden State Warriors and the Oakland A's.
- On August 31st attended the renaming celebration of Castle Canyon in honor of Dick Spees.
- The Mosswood Recreation Center's Bay to Creek celebration is scheduled for September 18<sup>th</sup> beginning at 9:30AM.
- The Thompson Bliss Family awarded Mosswood \$1,550,00 in scholarships for children participating in the Afterschool Program.
- Construction on the new Community Center at Mosswood is set to being in the Spring of 2022.
- Arroyo Viejo Recreation Center will hold its Creek to Bay event on October 9<sup>th</sup> at 9:30AM.

#### ANNOUNCEMENTS:

Commissioner Allen:

• There will be a town hall meeting for the community regarding Lake Merritt on September 29th 6 to 8 30 PM. It will be a conversation about conflict resolution and community building at the Lake. The meeting is a collaborative effort between Councilmembers Bas and Fife as well as several community groups.

Chair Reilly:

• There is State legislation that allows public meetings to take place over virtual means. The legislation will be sunsetting at the end of the month We will let everyone know when and where and how we will be meeting.

OPEN FORUM: There was 1 speaker.

- 11. CONTINUATION OF OPEN FORUM:
- 12. ADJOURNMENT: 7:29pm

Respectfully submitted,

<u>/s/ J. Nicholas Williams</u> J. Nicholas Williams Secretary

/s/ Diane Boyd Diane Boyd Acting Recording Secretary

<u>Next Meeting:</u> Wednesday, October 13, 2021 Via Zoom

This meeting location is wheelchair accessible. To request disability-related accommodations or to request an ASL, Cantonese, Mandarin or Spanish interpreter, please email <u>dboyd@oaklandnet.com</u> or call (510) 238-7532 or TDD/TTY (510) 238-3254 at least five working days before the meeting. Please refrain from wearing scented products to this meeting as a courtesy to attendees with chemical sensitivities.

Esta reunión es accesible para sillas de ruedas. Si desea solicitar adaptaciones relacionadas con discapacidades, o para pedir un intérprete de en español, Cantones, Mandarín o de lenguaje de señas (ASL) por favor envié un correo electrónico a <u>dboyd@oaklandnet.com</u> o llame al (510) 238-7532 o (510) 238-3254 por lo menos cinco días hábiles antes de la reunión. Se le pide de favor que no use perfumes a esta reunión como cortesía para los que tienen sensibilidad a los productos químicos. Gracias.

會場有適合輪椅出入設施。需要殘障輔助設施, 手語, 西班牙語, 粵語或國語翻譯服務, 請在 會議前五個工作天電郵 dboyd@oaklandnet.com 或致電 (510) 238-7532 或 (510) 238-3254 TDD/TTY。請避免塗搽香氛產品, 參加者可能對化學成分敏感。