



PARKS AND RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION - PRAC

Wednesday, September 8, 2021, 4:30 P.M.

Minutes

Recording Link:

http://oakland.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?publish_id=8a893113-217c-11ec-9f1e-0050569183fa

1. CALL TO ORDER: 4:32PM

2. ROLL CALL:

ALLEN, DUHE, HA, KOS-READ, MOORE, REILLY, D. SMITH, K. SMITH
TORRES, TRAN AND WALTON

PRESENT: (6) Commissioners Allen, Kos-Read, Moore, Reilly, Torres, Tran

EXCUSED: (2) Commissioner Walton and Ha

ABSENT: (1) Commissioners Ha and D. Smith

LATER ARRIVALS: (2) Commissioners Duhe and K. Smith

3. DISPOSITION OF MINUTES:

Minutes for the August PRAC minutes will be reviewed at the October PRAC meeting.

4. MODIFICATION OF THE AGENDA:

5. OPEN FORUM: There were 6 speakers

6. CONSENT NEW BUSINESS:

7. NEW BUSINESS:

A. BROOKLYN BASIN PROJECT MODIFICATIONS PROPOSAL:
MARINA EXPANSIONS.

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the staff report presented by Catherine Payne Development Planning Manager for the City of Oakland and the Development Planning Division.

Planned Project

Staff requested that PRAC provide input on a specific aspect of a current proposal related to Brooklyn Basin. The Commission was informed that the Brooklyn Basin Master Developer proposed expansion of planned Marina facilities in the Oakland Estuary fronting the Brooklyn Basin specific to the Township Commons Park. The already approved planned project does not include Marina facilities fronting Township Park. Where the proposed project does include Marina facilities along most of the length of the park and a water taxi dock at the southeastern most end near the 9th Ave Terminal. The planned project was approved and entitled in 2009. Other elements of the planned project described included 3100 new dwelling units, 465 affordable units, up to 200,000 square feet of commercial space, parking and 30 additional acres of new parks. Staff announced that the project is currently being delivered.

The Commission was encouraged to review the staff report and offered to guide the members through the graphics showing that aspects of the project that have been delivered and the final entitlements under consideration.

Staff stated that all of the final development permits or final entitlements for the parks have been approved leaving the parks to be delivered on a phased in basis along with the residential development. The Commission was directed to review the staff report to see the location of the 167 slips approved in the planned project.

Proposed Project

In review of the proposed project, staff outlined the addition of 600 dwelling units, the relocation of 1 tower closer to 5th Avenue, the expansion and extension of Marina facilities from Clinton Basin along the entire length of Township Commons to include 158 slips. The proposed project also includes the relocation of planned slips from the northeastern side of Clinton Basin further out toward South Park, and the addition of a water taxi dock in front of the 9th Avenue Terminal.

Necessary Steps for Approval of the Proposal Improvement

- Receive PRAC comments on the Marina facilities adjacent to parks
- General Plan Amendment and Rezone
- Amendment to the Development Agreement for the entire project
(Currently under negotiation through Economic Workforce Development)
- Revision to the Planned Unit Development

Process and Next Steps

- Present the project to the Design Review Committee in September. In addition to facilities adjacent to parks, the discussion will also include the proposed relocation of towers.
- Presentation to the Planning Commission
- 2 meetings at City Council
 1. Project subject to a Resolution
 2. Project subject to an Ordinance
- Currently in the EIR process under CEQA – California Environmental Quality Act.
- Complete review of draft EIR comments and draft final document. Circulated and convene hearings before the Planning Commission for recommendations and decisions.
- Meetings with City Council

Ending their presentation, staff informed the Commission that applicant Eric Harrison was present to make a presentation and offered to share graphics from the staff report.

Applicant Eric Harrison

Mr. Harrison provided a visual presentation for the Commission which may be reviewed in its entirety via the following link at time-marker 27:01 / 2:59:40. He was joined by Jeff Pence from Pacific Marina Development and Jim Jacobs with Hart Howerton.

http://oakland.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?publish_id=8a893113-217c-11ec-9f1e-0050569183fa

The presentation reviewed the parameters of the planned and proposed projects as described in the staff report. Developers studied aspects of local and out of state venues for design ideas. These venues featured designs where marinas and open spaces interfaced. Locations included Jack London Square in Oakland, San Francisco, Washington, D.C., and Chicago's Lake Front Trail.

Mr. Harrison stated that in addition to Brooklyn Basis's various housing levels and retail opportunities, developers were exploring ways to make the project multi-modal to support residency without dependency of a vehicle as the reduction in parking requirements is being considered. The implementation of free shuttle services has been provided and will transport residents and visitors to and from local BART stations.

Developers are studying the possible implementation of a water taxi service as a second way of activating the waterfront and estuary. Watercraft with the capacity of 20 to 50 passengers is recommended as an additional means of transporting users around the waterfront, Alameda and other points of access of the Bay. Conversations are being held with water taxi operators.

The Commission was informed that after a study of the sea floor near the Clinton Basin, it was determined in the best interest of the project to build within existing environment where dredging

would not be needed. Four viewpoint simulations from around Marina were shared. The fourth viewpoint included the 9th Street Terminal where an existing public access ramp could be used for water taxi service. Locations for parking and dock area off-loading accommodations concluded the presentation.

PUBLIC COMMENTS: There were 11 speakers.

COMMISSION COMMENTS:

Chair Reilly clarified that the Commission's role was to receive public comments and provide individual comments on the item. And that the body would not vote to approve or disapprove the project, but that staff would take project for further review by the Planning Commission and City Council.

Commissioner Allen:

- Will the number of affordable housing units be increased and will low income housing units be included in the plans?
- Will parking be increased for non-residential users?
- Inquired if the OSCAR has been reviewed. It provides 11 areas which address marina improvements, boat slips, open spaces and shoreline access.
- The PRAC meeting does not provide sufficient time needed to provide adequate feedback on the proposal.

Planning Staff: Affordable housing is not related to any specific required findings for parks and it was not included in the report, however, staff can provide that information to the Commission.

Applicant has indicated the additional 600 units they are proposing would comply with the current requirements regarding the affordable housing impacts. Either they would provide the units as required under the ordinance or they would pay the impact fee.

The applicant is not proposing any additional parking at this time. Right sizing the residential parking to conform with City's codes that were updated few years ago. Plan on having public parking that's publicly accessible as cited for parcels G and parcel H. Residents would not park there. Off street parking will increase after construction clears.

Regarding OSCAR - Staff's specific responsibility is to identify the regulatory findings that have to be made. Staff are not aware of any specific findings and are relying on PRAC to help determine if anything is missed.

Mr. Harrison provided the Commission with housing allocation levels required and added information regarding the creation of an endowment to establish housing in other neighborhoods.

Commissioner Duhe:

- How does the team forecast what parking will be available for new residents and then the influx of new visitors?
- What are the numbers and the data?
- Public comments today have been negative. Was community feedback received? Was there a poll? If so, what was the feedback received that indicated moving forward with the project as presented? When were community comments and feedback received?
- Where is the support from the community that will be impacted the most?

Staff informed the Commission that the comment period on a draft supplemental EIR including an analysis regarding parking has closed. The draft will be made available to the Chair and staff. Eric Harrison offered information regarding parking demands, and that an outreach meeting was held 4 years ago at the Jack London Aquatic Center (JLAC). At that time, the team received concerns from residents, and they are looking to receive comment during the current review process.

The Commission recommended and encouraged the developers go back to the community for comments on the project.

Commissioner Kos-Read:

- Does not want to utilize limited urban space for more parking
- The water taxi idea better ideas out of all that has been put forward.
- The visuals presented in the staff report were underwhelming. Would like to see the presentation by Mr. Harrison made public. receive copy of the presentation by Mr. Harrison and placed on the website.
- Some of the boat slips could be helpful and can contribute to the livelihood of the overall neighborhood.
- The current visualization looks to be more than is ideal to preserve more direct water access.
- The project does not feel focused on public access.
- Would not look to Jack London Square as a model for the Brooklyn Basin. It is a challenge to activate. The lay out for gaining access to the water impacts the viability in usability and friendliness of the space.
- Requested clarification on an image in Mr. Harrison's presentation depicting a bike pedestrian bridge along the Estuary linking to the development.

Staff informed the Commission that at one point the bridge in question was a project sponsored by Public Works and is not a part of the current development. The Commission will be provided with a status update.

Commission Moore:

- A marina will completely change the waterfront experience for people and wildlife especially due to the estuaries and marshes proximity, and the constant rise of the sea level.
- Marshes and estuaries are extremely important to the health of the existing wildlife
- Motorized watercraft are detrimental to the health of wildlife and are dangerous to kayakers and folks on non-motorized craft.
- Waterways and wildlife are environmental impacted by motorized watercraft as petroleum products are released into the water as a function of the motor.
- The Viewshed will be completed impacted. Public marinas that are publicly accessible have locked gates. One must be a marina holder to get through. Access to the waterfront will be taken away and will heavily impact wildlife trying to pass safely through the sides versus the channel where boats from surrounding marinas operate.
- Supports fellow Commissioner's recommend to review the OSCAR.
- The BCDC (San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission) will most likely have an issue with the project due to sea level rise and their goal of preserving marshes and estuaries in the Bay. The BCDC monitors what is happening around the Bay to the Golden Gate Bridge.
- One meeting 4 years ago for public comments is unacceptable. Highly recommends a community engagement process just including the marina since it was not included in the original plan 10- 15 years ago.

Commissioner Tran:

- Why is this project being proposed now?

Planning staff deferred to Eric Harrison as the proposal was made by the Master Developer.

Eric Harrison informed the Commission that the proposed project has been in progress for three and a half years. Changes in the California building codes in 2013, allowed for the additions in the proposed project including housing units and partnership with Pacific Marina Development.

Chair Reilly

- Supports the addition of housing and parking based on new regulations. Oakland needs low-income, free and affordable housing.
- Agrees visuals on the report could be construed as misleading.
- Not a fan of privatization of public spaces or the private encroachment into Oakland public spaces. For that belief, does not see a good reason to have a Marina here. Does not want to cede public space in favor for a place for people to make money and for rich people to park their boats.

- Has voted many times against having advertising or logos on Oakland public spaces even when those organizations are giving money.
probably the most important thing here and I would like to see that as both
- Public access to this water is the most important aspect here. Would like to see that bolstered as much as possible with access points that are affordable or free.
- Leaning in favor of the water taxi proposal. Would support the use of private water taxi as a form of transportation. It would be better for traffic congestion and greenhouse gas emissions. Would support 30 to 40 people in a private water taxi for their commute to work and not in individual cars.
- Can elements of the project be separated or is it all in one? Specifically related to the waterfront, can the marina be removed, but keep the water taxis and public access?

Planning staff informed the Commission that the Planning Commission and City Council are being asked to make discretionary decisions, so they can elect to approve parts of the project and not the entire project. Whether the applicant would agree to that or not is a separate question.

You see this information reports commissioner do it right pressure but thank you so OK
seconded by cost free if there is no further discussion

Motion: Commissioner Reilly entertained a motion to recommend PRAC receive the informational report. **Moved by:** Commissioner Duhe. **Second by:** Commissioner Kos-Read. **Vote: 7 Yes:** Commissioners Allen, Duhe, Kos-Read, Moore, Reilly, Torres, and Tran. **1 Abstain:** Commissioners K. Smith. **Motion:** Pass.

B. NOT USED

C. REQUEST FOR THE PARKS AND RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION TO REVIEW, PROVIDE COMMENTS AND RECOMMEND ACCEPTANCE OF A GIFT FROM PROJECT BACKBOARD, IN PARTNERSHIP WITH ARTIST ADIA MILLETT, FOR THE LOWELL PARK BASKETBALL COURT RENOVATION PROJECT.

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the report for Item 7C presented by Myka Hammock Sports Coordinator.

Staff requested the Commission approve the renovation of the Lowell Park basketball court as gifted in partnership by Project Blackboard. In relationship to Lowell Park's softball field, baseball field and the newly installed fitness court, the renovation of the basketball court will round out the neighborhood sport complex.

The Commission confirmed that the total amount of the gift, \$92,700.00, equals the total amount of the project.

PUBLIC COMMENTS: There were no speakers.

COMMISSION COMMENTS:

Commissioner Allen:

Staff confirmed for the Commission that artist Adia Millet is a local artist and will be engage in a community meeting to receive ideas and feedback on the design for the surface of the court. The artist will be responsible the maintenance of the artwork for 6 months. Staff offered to invite the Commission to the community engagement meeting and to view samples of her work online at the link referenced in the staff report. Director Williams informed the Commission that because the proposed art project is a maintenance activity, a presentation before the Public Art Commission is not necessary.

Chair Reilly confirmed that the Commission would have the opportunity to view the proposed artwork and design at a later meeting, and that the purpose of the staff report was to seek the body's recommendation to receive the gift from Project Blackboard.

Note: Commissioner Kos-Read was excused before the motion on Item 7C. was made.

Motion (1)

Motion (1): Commissioner Reilly entertained a motion to accept the gift and receive the art design review on another agenda. **Moved by:** Commissioner Duhe. **Second by:** Commissioner Allen. **Vote: 5 Yes:** Commissioners Allen, Duhe, Moore, Reilly, and Tran. **Motion:** Failed due to insufficient quorum.

Motion was Suspended:

After the motion and votes were tallied on item 7C, Chair Reilly determined that all Commissions participating on Teleconference were not present during motion. At 6:35pm, the meeting was suspended for 5 minutes

The meeting reconvened at 6:40pm and a second vote was taken on the item:

Motion (2)

Motion (2): Commissioner Reilly entertained a motion to accept the gift and receive the art design review on another agenda. **Moved by:** Commissioner Duhe. **Second by:** Commissioner Allen. **Vote: 7 Yes:** Commissioners Allen, Duhe, Moore, Reilly, K. Smith, Torres, and Tran. **Motion:** Passed.

8. PLANNING AND CONDITIONAL USE PERMITS:
9. MEASURE Q:

The practice is the oversight committee for the measure Q funds for parks and for water and so we do have a number of items that we were going to be discussing tonight

- Measure Q website
- Hiring Matrix
- Performance Reporting
- Budget

Measure Q Website: Sean Maher

The Measure Q website is activated. Reports made to the PRAC Commission will be posted for public review. Staff screen shared the view of the website and review various aspect of the funding represented by the Measure Q including adopted budgets and funds allocations. To access the website, the public may Google *City of Oakland Measure Q*. The page is titled Measure Q at Work. Contact: Sean Maher @ smaher@oaklandca.gov.

Measure Q Ad Hoc Committee – Brooke Levin

The Measure Q website is a portal where the community can receive information about the budget, park maintenance budget, equity analysis and review the quality of park maintenance the clean water program and tree maintenance. Homeless funding allocation will be managed by two other departments and phased into the website. Under Public Works, performance measures including restroom cleaning, mowing, litter pickup will be available.

Hiring Matrix: Sean Maher

Staff shared the hiring matrix via the Measure Q website and reviewed scheduled interviews, exams and hiring across various classifications.

Performance Reporting Update:

At the last ad hoc meeting, staff shared ad hoc Commissioners and community members initial work being done to pulled together the ways Public Works already tracks the services and monitors the services that are funded by Measure Q. The priority is marrying those two the explicit performance requirements of the measure itself. The goal is to provide a one at a glance resource. Hope to provide draft reporting next month.

Inequity Analysis:

The next immediate priority is an equity analysis. A number of annual reports or annual analysis are required of Measure Q. This is a relatively new requirement that is the responsibility of all City departments across all agenda reports brought to City Council and to other oversight bodies. The City's Department of Race and Equity's model for change is building internal capacity and

charging departments with the responsibility for building equities and being responsible for implementing equity change principals.

Budget Update: Sean Maher

The ad hoc committee will invite the Budget Office into the next meeting.

Brooke Levin: Will review documents to ensure all projects track well. The One-Time funding column needs to be clarified.

PUBLIC COMMENT: There was 1 speaker.

10. UPDATE FROM DIRECTOR, COMMITTEES, RECREATION ADVISORY COUNCILS & ANNOUNCEMENTS:

Director Williams:

- In response to the rising COVID-19 numbers, OPYRD's Afterschool program was suspended for two weeks. There have been minimal incidents with COVID-19 at the recreation centers. All have been managed well.
- 420 kids are participating in the Afterschool program.
- Youth Sports and Basketball programs continue to operate. 1500 kids participated in the citywide program.
- Aquatics and Adult Sports are operating.
- On August 29th. Lions Pool celebrated its 92nd birthday. The facility originally opened on August 29th 1929.

COMMITTEE UPDATES –

Tree Committee - Commissioner Tran: Comments received via email due to connectivity issues:

Questions and recommendations that the Tree Committee had on the Oakland Canopy and Land Cover Assessment Report, 2020

Questions

- Increasing tree canopy in all areas of Oakland is seen as a good/desirable outcome in the report. What about the role of tree canopy in wildfires?
- Tree inventory of street, public trees was part of this effort.
 - What came out of it and can the public access this information?
- What is the reasoning for organizing by district and other ways it was organized? Will this be tied to any funding allocation?
- Any need to outline what the historic tree canopy coverage was and how tree canopy is adapted for current conditions?

Recommendations

- Are there any peer cities or models that Oakland should be looking at, especially if any other jurisdictions have strong equitable methods of improving tree canopy coverage?
- Much of the city's tree canopy is on privately owned property. Can we provide incentives and education for private property owners, such as:
 - o Develop an approved trees list for the public to use when they decide to plant trees on their property
 - o Design guidelines that have to do with trees for new development

Rules Committee – Chair Reilly

The Rule Committee is looking to rewrite the Oakland Municipal Code (OMC) that pertains to parks. The process has been going on for five years. The Committee will review with PRAC before moving to the Life Enrichment Committee and ultimately the City Council for adoption.

The Committee also met with the Cultural Affairs Commission comments. Looking toward planning public engagement. Consideration inviting OPD to review the areas related to sound and noise as the enforcement agency. The Department of Race Equity and the City Attorney's Office will be invited to review. Time will be needed to make edits. A townhall will be planned.

Chair Reilly announced that he will be terming out after two more meeting but has offered to continue working on the project.

Commissioner Allen:

- Brookdale Recreation Center: On August 22, approximately 50 kids received backpacks and donated items for the Golden State Warriors and the Oakland A's.
- On August 31st attended the renaming celebration of Castle Canyon in honor of Dick Spees.
- The Mosswood Recreation Center's Bay to Creek celebration is scheduled for September 18th beginning at 9:30AM.
- The Thompson Bliss Family awarded Mosswood \$1,550,00 in scholarships for children participating in the Afterschool Program.
- Construction on the new Community Center at Mosswood is set to begin in the Spring of 2022.
- Arroyo Viejo Recreation Center will hold its Creek to Bay event on October 9th at 9:30AM.

ANNOUNCEMENTS:

Commissioner Allen:

- There will be a town hall meeting for the community regarding Lake Merritt on September 29th 6 to 8 30 PM. It will be a conversation about conflict resolution and community building at the Lake. The meeting is a collaborative effort between Councilmembers Bas and Fife as well as several community groups.

Chair Reilly:

- There is State legislation that allows public meetings to take place over virtual means. The legislation will be sunsetting at the end of the month We will let everyone know when and where and how we will be meeting.

OPEN FORUM: There was 1 speaker.

11. CONTINUATION OF OPEN FORUM:

12. ADJOURNMENT: 7:29pm

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ J. Nicholas Williams
J. Nicholas Williams
Secretary

/s/ Diane Boyd
Diane Boyd
Acting Recording Secretary

Next Meeting:

Wednesday, October 13, 2021

Via Zoom

This meeting location is wheelchair accessible. To request disability-related accommodations or to request an ASL, Cantonese, Mandarin or Spanish interpreter, please email dboyd@oaklandnet.com or call (510) 238-7532 or TDD/TTY (510) 238-3254 at least five working days before the meeting. Please refrain from wearing scented products to this meeting as a courtesy to attendees with chemical sensitivities.

Esta reunión es accesible para sillas de ruedas. Si desea solicitar adaptaciones relacionadas con discapacidades, o para pedir un intérprete de en español, Cantones, Mandarín o de lenguaje de señas (ASL) por favor envíe un correo electrónico a dboyd@oaklandnet.com o llame al (510) 238-7532 o (510) 238-3254 por lo menos cinco días hábiles antes de la reunión. Se le pide de favor que no use perfumes a esta reunión como cortesía para los que tienen sensibilidad a los productos químicos. Gracias.

會場有適合輪椅出入設施。需要殘障輔助設施, 手語, 西班牙語, 粵語或國語翻譯服務, 請在會議前五個工作天電郵 dboyd@oaklandnet.com 或致電 (510) 238-7532 或 (510) 238-3254 TDD/TTY。請避免塗搽香氛產品，參加者可能對化學成分敏感。