



Privacy Advisory Commission
May 3, 2018 5:00 PM
Oakland City Hall
Hearing Room 1
1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, 3rd Floor
Meeting Minutes

Commission Members: *District 1 Representative: Reem Suleiman, District 2 Representative: Chloe Brown, District 3 Representative: Brian M. Hofer, District 4 Representative: Lou Katz, District 5 Representative: Raymundo Jacquez III, District 6 Representative: Clint M. Johnson, District 7 Representative: Robert Oliver, Council At-Large Representative: Saied R. Karamooz, Mayoral Representative: Heather Patterson*

Each person wishing to speak on items must fill out a speaker's card. Persons addressing the Privacy Advisory Commission shall state their names and the organization they are representing, if any.

1. 5:00pm: Call to Order, determination of quorum

Members Present: Suleiman, Brown, Hofer, Katz, Jacquez, Karamooz, Patterson

Members Absent: Oliver, Johnson

2. 5:05pm: Review and approval of April meeting minutes

The April Minutes were approved unanimously.

3. 5:10pm: Open Forum

There were no Open Forum speakers.

4. 5:15pm: Surveillance Equipment Ordinance – discuss methodology and department outreach for survey of existing equipment.

Joe DeVries noted he would be drafting a memo to all Department Heads explaining the critical points of the ordinance and the need to develop a list of possible items that need to be considered. He also anticipated attending upcoming Senior Staff/Department Head meetings to brief them all and answer their questions.

Member Hofer suggested that the definition included in the ordinance be sent out with the memo but that the memo ask for a broad list of potential items, allowing the PAC to narrow it down as opposed to having each department make that decision. There was agreement on this approach. The memo will likely be drafted in the next few weeks (after final passage of the ordinance).

5. 5:25pm: Streetline Status Report. Review and take possible action on report.

Michael Ford Parking Services Manager for the Department of Transportation provided a brief update on the Streetline project, explaining that there has been a delay in implementation but that staff anticipated it would be back on track in the next few months. The firm is investing resources in creating a “mesh network” to better display where parking spaces are available.

6. 5:30pm: Vehicle-mounted Automated License Plate Recognition (ALPR) for Parking Enforcement. Review and take possible action on use policy.

Michael Ford Parking Services Manager for the Department of Transportation presented on this issue as well and explained that the City’s current 70 Parking Enforcement Technicians currently conduct enforcement of rules such as two-hour parking limitations by hand which is very time consuming. By implementing an ALPR system, the ALPR will indicate whether a car is in violation automatically while the technician drives down the street.

The PAC reviewed the draft impact statement and made some recommendations regarding the retention of and access to data by third party vendors and/or OPD. Chairperson Hofer noted that SB34 has provisions that DOT will need to incorporate into a Use Policy as well.

There were two public speakers:

Ken Pratt is opposed to the use of this technology and believes it is solely to generate more revenue for the City.

J.P. Masser raised concerns about the potential for a disparate impact on certain populations based on deployment of the devices and on how the city would handle out-of-state license plates.

It was agreed upon to have a small ad hoc group work with DOT staff on a modified impact assessment and use policy and return to the full PAC in June.

7. 6:10pm: Oakland Department of Transportation/Vendor use of UAV/Drones. Review and take possible action on use policy.

Nicole Ferrara with the Department of transportation’s Great Streets Division presented on the item, explaining the purpose of using drones to track transportation projects in a safer more efficient way. Currently, to take overhead pictures of projects, the department relies on a staff member in a cherry-picker elevated several feet above often heavily travelled thoroughfares.

During the presentation PAC members offered suggestions about blurring of faces and license plates, and posting signs noting filming in progress for passersby. It was agreed upon to have a small ad hoc group work with DOT staff on a modified impact assessment and use policy and return to the full PAC in June.