



## City of Oakland

Mayor's Commission on Persons with Disabilities (MCPD)

Monday, January 27, 2020

5:30 p.m. – 7:30 p.m.

Sergeant Mark Dunakin Room, First Floor

One Frank H. Ogawa Plaza (City Hall), Oakland, CA 94612

<https://tinyurl.com/mcpd-home>

### Agenda

**Commissioners:** Karen Nakamura (Chair), Frank Sperling (Vice Chair), Reid Davenport, Sarah Garner, Thomas Gregory, Marjorie Lynne, Lester Meu, Karina Ryan, Noah Smith, and Howard Tevelson

**Commission staff:** Anh Nguyen, ADA Programs Division Manager; Hoang Banh, ADA Program Analyst

5:30 1. Roll Call and Determination of Quorum

2. Open Forum

*Any person may directly address the Commission on any items within the jurisdiction of this Commission not on the agenda for today. Speakers wishing to address a specific item on the agenda may do so at the time the item is being considered.*

5:35 3. Agenda Modification and Approval

4. Approval of December 16, 2019 Minutes (**Exhibit A**)

5:40 5. Chair Report; *Frank Sperling, Vice Chair*

6. Commissioner's Announcements

*Commissioners will provide brief updates and announcements (no discussion at this time).*

5:45 7. Annual Election of MCPD Officers (Chair and Vice Chair)

*Hoang Banh, ADA Program Analyst, will guide the election process.*

6:00 8. Shared Mobility Accessibility

*Kerby Olsen from Oakland Department of Transportation (OakDOT) and Jean Crowther from Alta Planning will present results of their Shared Mobility Accessibility study.*

**(Exhibit B)**

6:45 9. Update on Equitable Climate Action Plan

*Shayna Hirshfield-Gold, Sustainability Analyst from the Environmental Services Division of Oakland Public Works, will present an update on the draft Equitable Climate Action Plan (ECAP): <https://www.oaklandca.gov/projects/2030ecap>*

**(Exhibit C)**

7:20 10. Staff Updates and Announcements

*Anh Nguyen, ADA Programs Division Manager*

7:25 11. Future Agenda Items

*Staff will briefly update on agenda items confirmed for upcoming meetings. Suggestions for future agenda items are also welcome.*

A. February: To be determined

B. March: To be determined

C. April: To be determined

7:30 12. Adjournment

(Meeting shall end no later than 7:30 p.m., unless extended by majority vote of the Commission)

Note: The Commission May Take Action on Any Item on the Agenda

Agenda item start times are approximate and are provided as a courtesy guide only. Timing and order of items may change as part of Agenda Modification and Approval and/or as needed based on staff and time availability during the course of the meeting.



This meeting location is wheelchair accessible. To request disability-related accommodations or to request American Sign Language (ASL), Cantonese, Mandarin, or Spanish language interpreter, please email [adaprograms@oaklandca.gov](mailto:adaprograms@oaklandca.gov) or call (510) 238-5219 (V) or 711 (California Relay Service) at least five (5) business days before the meeting. Please refrain from wearing scented products to this meeting as a courtesy to attendees with chemical sensitivities.

Esta reunión es accesible para sillas de ruedas. Si desea solicitar adaptaciones relacionadas con discapacidades, o para pedir un intérprete de en español, Cantonés, mandarín o de lenguaje de señas (ASL) por favor envíe un correo electrónico a [adaprograms@oaklandca.gov](mailto:adaprograms@oaklandca.gov) o llame al (510) 238-5219 (V) o al 711 para servicio de retransmisión (Relay service) por lo menos cinco días hábiles antes de la reunión. Se le pide de favor que no use perfumes a esta reunión como cortesía para los que tienen sensibilidad a los productos químicos. Gracias.

會場有適合輪椅出入設施。需要殘障輔助設施, 手語, 西班牙語, 粵語或國語翻譯服務, 請在會議前五個工作天電郵 [adaprograms@oaklandca.gov](mailto:adaprograms@oaklandca.gov) 或致電 (510) 238-5219 或 711 (電話傳達服務)。請避免塗搽香氛產品, 參加者可能對化學成分敏感。

**City of Oakland**  
Mayor's Commission on Persons with Disabilities (MCPD)  
Monday, December 16, 2019  
**Draft Minutes**

- 5:39 1. Roll Call and Determination of Quorum
2. Open Forum
- None
- 5:41 3. Agenda Modification and Approval
- Motion to approve agenda: Commissioner Gregory  
Seconded by Sperling  
Ayes - 7: Davenport, Gregory, Meu, Nakamura, Ryan,  
Sperling, Tevelson
4. Approval of November 18, 2019 Minutes
- Vice Chair Sperling pointed out error in columns on commissioner roll call sheet. Staff will edit to indicate absent and excused, rather than leave early and absent.
  - Motion to approve minutes as amended: Commissioner Gregory  
Seconded by Sperling  
Ayes - 7: Davenport, Gregory, Meu, Nakamura, Ryan,  
Sperling, Tevelson
- 5:43 5. Chair Report
- Chair Nakamura and Vice Chair Sperling sent a letter to AC Transit and BART staff in charge of accessibility regarding East Bay Paratransit service data and survey results that BART staff presented in October 2018 to MCPD:
    - The letter expressed that the survey results on customer satisfaction did not seem to reflect how unhappy riders are with East Bay Paratransit service.
    - The letter also asked them to consider a pilot program with Uber and Lyft using vouchers like the Taxi Scrip program that some cities have.

- In January 2020, there will be elections for MCPD Chair and Vice Chair. Chair Nakamura will be traveling more in 2020, so she is encouraging others to run for Chair.

## 6. Commissioner's Announcements

- None

## 5:50 7. Equitable Climate Action Plan

Shayna Hirshfield-Gold, Sustainability Analyst from the Environmental Services Division of Oakland Public Works presented the following regarding the 2030 Oakland Equitable Climate Action Plan (ECAP):

- Oakland has a target to reduce greenhouse gas emissions by 56 percent by 2030 to slow down climate change.
- 2030 ECAP values:
  - Equitable: Prioritize actions that benefit frontline communities and minimize burdens.
  - Ambitious: Responsive to Climate Emergency
  - Realistic: Actionable, measurable, and verifiable
  - Balanced: Mitigation and adaptation, immediate and moonshot actions, local and lifecycle emissions
  - Adaptive: Flexible to accommodate technological, political, and cultural shifts over 10 years
- ECAP sections:
  - Transportation and Land Use: Active mobility, public transit, and vehicle electrification
  - Buildings and Energy: Eliminate fossil fuels
  - Material Consumption and Waste: Support circular economy, minimize single-use plastics (while understanding the need for plastic straws for members of the disability community), eliminate organics in landfill, reduce food insecurity
  - City Leadership: Reduce fossil fuel dependence, recognize community leadership

- Adaptation: Increase community resilience, increase green infrastructure, understand vulnerabilities
- Carbon Removal: increase urban forestry and carbon farming, explore other opportunities
- Port Leadership: Reduce direct and indirect emissions
- Timeline:
  - January – December 2019: Community engagement and technical analysis
  - October – December 2019: Public review draft
  - December 2019 – February 2020: Racial equity impact analysis, Financial analysis, final revisions
  - April 2020: Final draft to City Council
- Ms. Hirshfield-Gold responded to commissioner questions and feedback as follows:
  - The diverging lines on the graph on slide four shows that 2012 is the baseline year because good data was available then.
  - Another example besides urban forestry for carbon control are direct air capture, e.g. huge fans that suck up carbon, or compost and mulch for greater root growth to store carbon. Eel grass and kelp are other examples.
  - Free public transit is a proposed action in the draft.
    - However, AC Transit is having funding held back by the federal government.
    - At the last ECAP Advisory Committee, there was a discussion of getting more people on transit, e.g. greater frequency of service, zero-emission buses while trying to reduce fares, etc., instead of free transit.
  - 100 percent of the City of Oakland's diesel fleet is renewable diesel.
  - A financial analysis was not in the 2010 ECAP, so it is being done for the 2030 ECAP.
  - The ECAP is being drafted in partnership with all City departments as well as agency partners such as AC

Transit, BART, Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD), and Oakland Unified School District (OUSD).

- Due to time constraint, Ms. Hirshfield-Gold will return with more information and discussion on the following:
  - Natural gas, especially during power shutoff
  - Weatherization programs
  - Volatile organic chemicals (VOCs) are highly problematic for persons with disabilities
  - Wood burning
  - City programs for solar energy
  - Readily achievable and long-range actions by specific departments, e.g. building code updates, EV public charging stations, zoning in sea level rise susceptible areas
- One comment from the public:
  - With a growing aging population, the diverse population of seniors and persons with disabilities need to be considered frontline communities as well.

#### 6:30 8. Update on Sidewalk Repair Ordinance

Reginald Bazile, Assistant to the Director from Oakland Department of Transportation (OakDOT), updated on the sidewalk certification program:

- After a slow start in July 2019, compliance permits climbed to over 300 per month, on average, for a total of more than 1,500 since passed by City Council in July. Owners were surprised but pleased to find out when they came to the permit counter that there was a sidewalk repair permit fee holiday during summer 2019.
- OakDOT also expanded the types of contractors eligible for the sidewalk certification program.
- Improvements have been made to the process along the way based on stakeholder feedback and OakDOT staff daily experience with sidewalk certification standard operating procedures.

- One of the stakeholders, a realtors group, met with OakDOT and a City Council Member about suspending the sidewalk certification program.
- Commissioner feedback was as follows:
  - Commissioner Tevelson stated that he thinks OakDOT is doing a good job with sidewalk repairs. He tripped and fell on a damaged sidewalk while walking his dog. He submitted a complaint via 311, and OakDOT contacted the owner, who fixed it immediately. Commissioner Tevelson informed the property owner of the fee holiday.
  - Vice Chair Sperling stated that there was unanimous support for the sidewalk certification program when Sarah Fine presented to MCPD in the spring. It seems that OakDOT is gradually making its way to effectiveness.
  - In response to Commissioner Gregory's question about whether there is a penalty if someone refuses to repair, Mr. Bazile stated that OakDOT does issue a Notice to Repair. The property owner must comply within 30 days. Otherwise, OakDOT will repair the sidewalk and send the property owner a bill. If the bill is not paid, then the City will place a lien on the property.
  - Commissioner Ryan asked how to support OakDOT to make sure the sidewalk certification program is not suspended. Mr. Bazile asked for letters of support prior to City Council Public Works Committee in late January 2020.
  - Commissioner Meu expressed concern about the expanded types of licensed contractors that can repair and inspect sidewalks; such work requires experience and compliance with standards, especially cross-slope. Thus, a photo at the permit counter is not enough.
    - Mr. Bazile stated that they record contractor numbers to hold them accountable. OakDOT sidewalk inspectors also conduct surprise inspections. Still, Commissioner Meu expressed concern about complications of a property owner having to possibly sue a contractor.

- Commissioner Meu added that he submitted a 311 request a few months ago for sidewalk repair at the Rose Garden, but it has not been repaired.
- There were no comments from the public.

7:02 9. Strategic Planning Update

- Commissioner Tevelson requested an update to be added for Objective 2.1, per October retreat, that Oakland Police Department policies and training do include a range of disabilities.
- Strategic Plan will be reformatted to reflect a reduction to four goal areas.
- Strategic Plan approved unanimously  
Ayes: Davenport, Gregory, Meu, Nakamura, Ryan, Sperling, Tevelson

7:16 10. MCPD Meeting Schedule for 2020

- Motion to approve meeting schedule: Commissioner Tevelson  
Seconded by Gregory  
Ayes: Davenport, Gregory, Meu, Nakamura, Ryan, Sperling, Tevelson

7:22 11. Staff Updates and Announcements

*Anh Nguyen, ADA Programs Division Manager*

- Mr. Nguyen updated that the Programmatic Access Coordinator position, vacant for 25 months, has been posted. Applications are due December 30.
  - Chair Nakamura asked about experience as a substitute for those without a bachelor's degree. That is a question for Human Resources.
- City Council passed the scooter sharing ordinance earlier in 2019, and Oakland Department of Transportation (OakDOT) staff have been working with the five permitted operators to refine their proposals.

- Lime has been awarded a permit to launch their Adaptive Scooter program on January 8 and would like to invite MCPD to the launch event.
  - Commissioner Gregory commented that at a small group meeting with Lime, he gave feedback on the reservation system stating that it should not be a substitute for the spontaneity. Also, it does not allow for one-way trips. Parallel programs need to be as good as integrating into the existing fleet.
  - The launch primarily includes a seated scooter, and there are opportunities to provide feedback on the reservation system and more as they roll it out.

7:28 12. Future Agenda Items

- A. January: Annual Election of MCPD Officers, Census 2020, and possibly Update on Equitable Climate Action Plan
- B. February: Annual Update on Methods for Addressing Access and Functional Needs During Emergency and Natural Disasters
- C. To be determined: Oakland Police Department Crisis Intervention Training (CIT)

7:30 13. Adjourned

**EXHIBIT A.1 for Attachment to Minutes of Event Date**  
**City of Oakland Mayor's Commission on Persons with Disabilities**  
**Meeting for December 16, 2019**

**COMMISSIONERS ROLL CALL**

Quorum Established: <b>Yes</b>							
Number Voting Members Present: <b>7</b>	<b>Present</b>	<b>Excused Late</b>	<b>Arrive Late</b>	<b>Leave Early</b>	<b>Absent</b>	<b>Excused</b>	<b>Non-voting status</b>
Chairperson Karen Nakamura	<b>X</b>						
Vice Chair Frank Sperling	<b>X</b>						
<b>COMMISSIONERS</b>							
Reid Davenport	<b>X</b>						
Sarah Garner					<b>X</b>		
Thomas Gregory	<b>X</b>						
Marjorie Lynne					<b>X</b>	<b>X</b>	
Lester Meu	<b>X</b>						
Karina Ryan	<b>X</b>						
Noah Smith					<b>X</b>	<b>X</b>	
Howard Tevelson	<b>X</b>						
Vacant							
Staff: Anh Nguyen, ADA Programs Manager Hoang Banh, ADA Program Analyst							
Interpreters: none							

**EXHIBIT A.2 for Attachment to Minutes of Event Date**

**SIGN IN SHEET**

**Mayor's Commission on Persons with Disabilities  
Meeting for December 16, 2019**

**Subscribe to  
MCPD Notices  
(Y/N)**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Agency</b>	<b>Email</b>	<b>Phone</b>	<b>Address</b>
Steve Lau, Y				
Helen Walsh				
Cristina Moraes, Creative Growth, crishakti@gmail.com, Y				



# Oakland Shared Mobility Accessibility Study -Update-

Mayors Commission on Persons with Disabilities  
January 27, 2020

# AGENDA

1. Project Purpose and Process
2. Major Findings
3. Draft Recommendations
4. Discussion
5. Next Steps

# PROJECT PURPOSE AND PROCESS

- Study the accessibility of shared mobility options operating within the City of Oakland
- Recommend actions that the City can take to improve access in the future.

# PROJECT PURPOSE AND PROCESS

- Specifically, include:
  - Bay Wheels Bike Share
  - Adaptive Bike Share Pilot Program
  - Scooter Share Pilot Program
  - Ride Hailing (TNC) Services
  - Car Share Services (including peer to peer)

# PROJECT PURPOSE AND PROCESS



Scooter Share



Car Sharing



Ride Hailing



Bike Sharing

# PROJECT PURPOSE AND PROCESS

- ✓ Bike Share Station Assessment
- ✓ Shared Mobility Accessibility Survey
- ✓ Shared Mobility Accessibility Focus Groups
- ✓ Shared Mobility Needs Assessment
  - Recommendations & Final Report (in progress)

# FINDINGS

## ✓ Bike Share Station Assessment

### Bike Share Parking:

- Most common barrier to pedestrian access route were tree wells and lighting posts
- Adjusting station orientation can improve accessibility
- Most stations installed as permitted

### Scooter Share Parking:

- Designated parking can reduce incidence of blocked access
- Opportunities for allocating space identified at 15 priority locations

# FINDINGS

## ✔ Shared Mobility Accessibility Survey

### Overall Survey

- 41 Respondents
- Type of disability:
  - 62% Mobility
  - 41% Other
  - 14% Vision
  - 14% Cognitive
  - 3% Hearing
  - 3% Prefer Not to Answer

# FINDINGS

## ✓ Shared Mobility Accessibility Survey

### Bike Sharing (Bay Wheels)

- 11% have used
- 50% not able to use because of disability
- Ways to improve access: Staff/Volunteers; Voice-activated; Geographic reach + 7-days a week; No Smartphone or Wi-Fi required
- Top 3 design features that would help:
  - Electric-assist
  - Three-wheeled
  - Adaptive manual

# FINDINGS

## ✓ Shared Mobility Accessibility Survey

### Scooter Sharing

- 19% have used
- 69% not able to use due to disability
- Top 3 design features that would help:
  - More than 2 wheels
  - Seated
  - Wheelchair add-on ability

# FINDINGS

## ✓ Shared Mobility Accessibility Survey

### Ride Hailing

- 66% of respondents have used Ride Hailing
- 39% used Uber WAV or Lyft ACCESS
- Barriers: drivers cancelling rides, chemical sensitivities, untrained drivers

# FINDINGS

## ✔ Shared Mobility Accessibility Survey

### Car Sharing

- 67% of respondents have not tried car sharing
- Ways to improve access:
  - Automation of fold ramps
  - Ability to reserve wheelchair accessible vehicle further in advance
  - A preference for Wi-Fi/Bluetooth free options
  - Low standing vehicles
  - Better geographic distribution

# FINDINGS

## ✔ Shared Mobility Accessibility Survey

### Adaptive Bike Share

- 60% knew about the program
- Top 3 reasons person had not used program:
  - Can not use cycles offered (26%)
  - Interested but has not had time/opportunity (22%)
  - Not interested (22%)

# FINDINGS

## ✔ Shared Mobility Accessibility Focus Groups

### Priority Concerns:

- Barriers to sidewalk access
- Inability to access ridehailing services

### Areas of Opportunity:

- Adaptive bike share program is valued, but limited
- Carshare is not a focus

# FINDINGS

## ✔ Shared Mobility Needs Assessment

### Context:

- Users have individualized needs
- Services managed through different schemes
- Companies reaching limits to markets
- Local governments trending towards incentives and partnerships
- Oakland is pioneering, with few “best practices” to look to

# FINDINGS

## ✓ Shared Mobility Needs Assessment

### Digital App Assessment:

Platform	Elements	Elements Passing Standards	Elements Failing Standards	Total Score (out of 100%)
Uber	223	206	19	92%
Lyft	346	283	64	82%
Turo	477	403	75	84%
Getaround	205	167	38	81%

### Micromobility

Lyft	293	231	63	85%
Lime	215	116	99	55%
Bird	111	97	14	88%

# DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS

The project team will discuss draft recommendations based on the Study findings.



# Questions

Jean Crowther, AICP

Principal, New Mobility Group Leader

[jeancrowther@altaplanning.com](mailto:jeancrowther@altaplanning.com)

# Oakland's 2030 Equitable Climate Action Plan (ECAP)

January 27, 2020

**Follow-Up Presentation to the Mayor's Commission on  
Persons with Disabilities**

Shayna Hirshfield-Gold, City of Oakland Sustainability Program

# ECAP Content: Questions from December

---

- **Where is Climate Action \$ best spent: *Local vs. global action?***
  - Local action drives local opportunity and spurs broader regional action
- **Natural Gas: *Cost, redundancy, resilience***
  - Public health, safety, technology availability, distributed generation, energy storage, efficiency & weatherization

# Questions from December Continued

---

- **Solar:** *Where is it in the plan?*
  - The role of distributed generation in a modern, resilient electricity grid
- **VOC and air pollution:** *Disproportionate impacts*
  - Truck electrification, green infrastructure
- **Electric Vehicles:** *Need more charging*
  - Included in ZEV Action Plan

# Questions from December Continued

---

- **Sea Level Rise:** *Land use planning*
  - Adaptation: Vulnerability assessment, creation of resilience hubs
- **Seniors and Equitable Planning**
  - Role of public transit, resilient homes & buildings

# Revised Timeline

---

- **January – March 2020:** Racial equity impact analysis, Financial analysis, final revisions
- **April 2020:** Final draft available, community presentations
- **June 2, 2020:** Final draft to Council