



## *MEMORANDUM*

**TO:** Honorable Mayor & City Council

**FROM:** Katano Kasaine  
Director of Finance

**SUBJECT:** FY 2019-21 Budget Development  
Questions/Responses #1

**DATE:** April 26, 2019

---

### PURPOSE

The purpose of this memorandum is to transmit to the full City Council and public, responses to questions raised by City Councilmembers related to the Fiscal Year (FY) 2019-21 Proposed Biennial Budget. To the extent additional information becomes available on any of the responses below, updates will be provided.

### QUESTIONS AND RESPONSES

**1) Who in the Administration is responsible for enforcing implementation of the budget as legally adopted? [Kaplan]**

Per the City Charter, the City Administrator, "shall have the power and it shall be his duty [...] to control and administer the financial affairs of the City."

**2) What specific steps are being taken to remedy the non-compliance of the one department which is overspending its current budget by over \$19 million? By what date is compliance expected to be achieved? Will that unauthorized expenditure be remedied in time for the Q3 update? Will it be remedied in time for those funds to be restored for the FY 2019-2021 budget? Who is overseeing the remedy of this unauthorized over-spending? [Kaplan]**

Both OPD and OFD have provided City Council with an analysis of overtime expenditures along with the quarterly revenue and expenditure report since the Fiscal Year 2016-17 Fourth Quarter Revenue and Expenditure report was presented to the Finance and Management Committee on October 24, 2017. OPD has taken the following specific actions to reduce its overspending (as outlined in those reports): issued a patrol staffing directive; substantially altered tactical squad deployment in patrol, changed the way that mandatory training is scheduled; implemented a city-wide minimum staffing mandate that requires time off request to be approved on a city-wide basis rather than just the bureau or division level; and, formed an overtime working group.

OPD staff will be bringing an overtime report to the Finance and Management Committee on May 28, 2019. This report will detail the actions they are taking to reduce overtime overspending and other key considerations. As outlined previously, several factors contribute to OPD's overtime overspending such as the service-levels established by the City Council, unanticipated events (e.g., sideshow response), negotiated MOU provisions as approved by the City Council, backfill for vacancies and leaves, and historical under-budgeting of overtime. OPD overtime issue cannot be addressed without first addressing the above listed issues.

**3) What is the status of implementation of Oakland's adopted law prohibiting leaving guns loose, such as unsecured in unattended vehicles? How many enforcement actions thus far have been brought under this Ordinance? [Kaplan]**

Below are the 2017 and 2018 statistics for stolen guns (OMC Sections 9.39 and 9.37).

**2017**

- 59 guns reported stolen
  - 30 guns taken from vehicles
  - 28 guns taken from residences
  - 1 gun taken from a business
- 26 of 59 guns taken were properly stored
  - Many of the remaining reports did not contain enough information to determine whether the guns were properly stored
- Two citations issued for three stolen guns
- One case was forwarded to the City Attorney after charges were declined by DA

**2018**

- 45 guns reported stolen
  - 30 guns taken from vehicles
  - 8 guns taken from residences
  - 5 guns taken from businesses
  - 1 taken during a home invasion robbery and 1 taken as petty theft
- 35 of 46 guns taken were properly stored
  - Some of the remaining reports did not contain enough information to determine whether the guns were properly stored.
- 2 guns have since been recovered
- No citations issued

**4) What is the status of deployment of neighborhood beat officers? How many FTEs are supposed to be in this role? What percentage is actually being provided? [Kaplan]**

There are 35 Community Resource Officer (CRO) positions. As of April 12, 2019, all 35 positions are filled with the officers deployed to their assignments. There are an additional five Community Resource Officer (CRO) supervisor positions (Sergeants) and all five positions are currently filled.

**5) What percentage of ShotSpotter alerts receive an immediate police deployment?  
[Kaplan]**

The median time for OPD to respond to the exact location is seven (7) minutes based on the last three months of data. It is important to note that response times can be impacted by the following:

- Officers have SST Alerts on their phones and they don't always have to wait for a dispatched call to respond to the alert, leading to shorter response times;
- Officers are given the exact coordinate location (address) as opposed to circling several blocks based upon where a caller says the shots may have come from;
- Based upon being given the exact coordinates, casings are being consistently recovered as evidence to be submitted to the crime lab which downloads the casing profile within 48 hours;
- The casings link gun violence incidents locally and throughout the region;
- The process increases the solvability of cases and through this method, it leads to more recovery of guns with subsequent search warrants and arrests;
- SST trends lead to better deployment of resources as the alerts become a "tell" or precursor of where there might be an ongoing feud;
- ATF just came to the crime lab for a mandatory audit and reported we are recovering casings and entering more casing profiles into the computer system (IBIS) at a rate faster than most agencies throughout the nation they have audited in recent months

**6) Fire prevention inspection fees (wildfire prevention), how much are we charging, and at what stage of inspection (second time? Third?) are we charging? What would we need to charge to fully cover costs? [Kaplan]**

As of FY 2018-19 wildfire prevention inspection fees are currently \$330.27 per property. This fee is charged only on a failed re-inspection (i.e., second inspection). Property owners who are compliant on an initial inspection or re-inspection are not charged. In the FY 2019-20 Master Fee Schedule, OFD is proposing to increase this fee to \$409.04 per property for cost recovery.

**7) Parks and Rec fees, especially for aquatic center/boathouse, can we charge higher fees for non-Oakland residents? What would the amounts need to be to enable cost-recovery? [Kaplan]**

The City's 2018-19 Master Fee Schedule (MFS) for OPRYD's rental facilities provides for non-resident and resident rates. OPRYD's facility rental fees for non-resident are set at cost recovery with resident rates at a 20 percent discount from the non-resident rates. The Jack London Aquatic Center (JLAC) and the Lake Merritt Sailboat House facility rental rates include non-resident and resident rates. Please see the Adopted FY 2018-19 MFS OPRYD's Rental Facilities beginning on page I-4 (<https://www.oaklandca.gov/documents/fy-2018-19-adopted-master-fee-schedule>). Specifically, please see page I-13 for JLAC and I-5 for Sailboat House non-resident and resident rates.

**8) How many hours per year of police time are used for special events/parades etc? What is the cost of this service? How much of it is reimbursed? Where in the budget**

**do those reimbursements appear? What would be the cost to provide this service with civilian personnel? [Kaplan]**

In FY 2017-18 (the most recent full fiscal year), approximately 81,801 hours of overtime were used for special events. It cost the City approximately \$6,596,317 in direct sworn personnel costs, all of which was reimbursed. The reimbursements are reported as GPF (1010) revenues in the "service charges" category.

OPD provides security services for special events at the request of event organizers. Civilian staff cannot provide security services for most of the special event requests, however, there are some events that can have additional civilian staff and less sworn personnel. The cost to provide the service depends on the request of the event organizers. Generally, the cost would be the number of hours worked at top step for the classification.

OPD finds great value in staffing events with sworn personnel. The presence of sworn OPD personnel at an event – ranging from a small party to a large sporting event – provides an opportunity for OPD to prevent problems from occurring. If a problem at a special event does develop, OPD personnel assigned to the event on special event overtime can address the problem immediately and effectively without draining extremely limited patrol resources.

**9) Status report on budget vs. actual for last budget cycle. Which of past things have/have not been done. [Kaplan]**

Budget versus actuals are provided in the City's Comprehensive Annual Financial Report (CAFR). The CAFR for the year-ending June 30, 2018, can be found on the City's website: <https://www.oaklandca.gov/documents/2018-comprehensive-annual-financial-report>. The FY 2018-19 Second Quarter Revenue and Expenditure report was delivered to the Finance and Management Committee on February 26, 2019. The FY 2018-19 Third Quarter Revenue and Expenditure report will be presented to the Finance and Management Committee on May 28, 2019. This report will include comparisons of projected revenues and expenditures against budgeted revenues and expenditures. Audited data for the current fiscal year (FY 2018-19) will not be available until December 2019.

**10) Please provide racial demographic breakdown of proposed budget expenditures and explanation of equity analysis of the proposed budget. [Kaplan]**

The Budget does not track expenditures by race. However, key programs (e.g., 3-Year Paving Plan, Measure KK) require that an equity framework be used as part of an evaluation.

**11) What is the proposed annual cost for the additional security measures that are proposed for the city hall complex, such as the metal detectors and related systems? One-time startup costs? [Kaplan]**

The one-time startup costs for the equipment related to the proposed enhanced security measures is approximately \$76,000. This includes the purchase of walk-through metal detectors, x-ray machines, scanners, stanchions, delivery, set-up and calibration and training for maintenance staff and equipment operators.

The annual or ongoing costs for equipment is approximately \$10,000 this includes a 12-month maintenance plan after the one year warranty period expires. The annual costs for security personnel to operate the equipment and OPD personnel to provide a higher level of authority and support to the security officers, these costs are provided below in the response to question #12.

**12) Who is going to staff/secure the metal detector system? What is the cost for the staffing? [Kaplan]**

The metal detectors and scanners will be operated by security personnel, there will be three unarmed security guards at each entrance (14th Street and 15th Street/ Plaza side). OPD officers will provide an armed presence and higher level of authority and support to the unarmed security officers.

**Security Personnel** costs for two entry points with three guards at each from 8am - 5pm; and additional security personnel to cover evening meetings (one evening per week) is estimated at: \$374,353 for 8am - 5pm and \$23,643 for evening meetings for a total annual cost of \$397,996

**OPD Personnel** costs are estimated at: \$460,000

**13) What is the cost of 24-hour security for the city hall complex? What hours/days are currently provided? [Kaplan]**

**Current Days/Hours:** Dalziel Building has 24/7 coverage currently. City Hall has Monday through Friday coverage from 7 am - 11 pm. Lionel Wilson has Monday through Friday coverage from 7 am – 7 pm.

**Cost of 24/7:** The additional cost to provide 24/7 security (88 hours per week / 4,576 hours annual) at City Hall is: \$115,589 The additional cost to provide 24/7 security (108 hours per week / 5,616 hours annual) for Lionel Wilson is: \$141,860. The total annual cost to add 24/7 coverage to Civic Center Complex is \$259,449.

**14) What hours/days do we currently have security outside in Ogawa plaza? What would be the cost for doing this 24/7? [Kaplan]**

FHOP has Monday through Friday coverage from 7 am - 11 pm. The additional cost to provide 24/7 security (88 hours per week / 4,576 hours annual) at FHOP is: \$115,589.

**15) Measure Z - CRO and CRTs are being pulled to other things – need to know how often this is happening and options to remedy it. [Kaplan]**

The Department is currently evaluating how best to track CRO and CRT time and productivity. Past results are not uniformly documented or retained in a way that can be easily produced, compared and evaluated.

Community Resource Officer (CRO) and Crime Reduction Team (CRT) work is generally spent addressing violence through proactive directed patrol, focused operations, and performing follow-up investigation and related arrests associated with serious or violent crimes. This specialized work is firmly geared toward defined Measure Z goals even though the work may pull a CRO or CRT from their assigned geographic area at various times.

Time may be spent away from an assigned geographic area to support citywide crime reduction operations, including operations to address serious and violent offenses, known suspects, search warrants, and surveillance operations. CROs are often needed to supplement CRT work so that operations can be completed safely. Time may be spent “off beat” to support the work of neighboring CRO where a strategy or response requires surveillance officers, arrest teams, search warrant services, or any other activity that is beyond the capabilities of an individual CRO. These operations – and the time necessary by all to safely complete them - are not typically evenly dispersed across all beats. Higher crime beats require more officers, more time, and higher prioritization. Even so, we often find that the resulting crime reduction and efforts positively impact other beats because crime trends and offenses may overlap and affect the health and safety of all beats citywide.

CROs and CRTs may also spend time away from their beat for any unstaffed and unplanned crowd management or crowd control event, or any planned crowd management event that is short of staffing (e.g., sideshows, permitted or unpermitted protests or marches, sports parades or celebrations, or supplementary staffing for permitted events with inadequate staffing.)

**16) Why is our vacancy rate so high and how do we create solutions for faster hiring, who has been tasked with this issue? [Kaplan]**

There is intense competition for public sector talent. The nation’s unemployment rate is 3.8%, the California unemployment rate is 4.2% and the unemployment rate for San Francisco, Oakland and Richmond region is 2.8%. These are 50 year lows. The City’s budgeted vacancy factor is 0% to 4%.

The Human Resources Management Department, working in conjunction with City Departments, is tasked with filling vacancies. The recruitment process is subject to the rules of the Civil Service Board and agreements in labor contracts. Solutions to hiring faster include regulatory relief that requires agreement with labor groups. There have been occasional agreements but nothing significant that would provide a competitive advantage in this tight labor market. HR has streamlined recruitment processing, expanded marketing efforts and hired a recruitment consultant to increase capacity.

The City has done well in its retention efforts. Voluntary resignations for non-sworn, full-time employees are down from 110 last fiscal year to a projected 91 for this fiscal year, which is a 4.01% resignation rate. A typical resignation rate for local government during normal economic times ranges between 4.5% to 5.5%. Given the historically low unemployment, it would be anticipated that the rate would be significantly higher, perhaps 6% to 8% percent. A key strategy to reduce the vacancy rate is to improve retention rates.

HRM continues to focus on identifying efficiencies, proposing changes to the labor agreements, improving marketing and working with departments to more efficiently fill vacancies.

**17) What is the cost for TPT conversions for any roles which are not genuinely short-term? [Kaplan]**

The cost of converting a Temporary Part-Time will vary based upon a number of factors, including: 1) whether it is being converted to a full-time position or permanent part-time position; 2) the job classification being converted; and, 3) the step in the salary schedule.

For questions, please contact Adam Benson, Budget Administrator, at (510) 238-2026.

Respectfully submitted,

*/s/*

---

KATANO KASAINÉ  
Director of Finance