



**Privacy Advisory Commission**  
**February 1, 2018 5:00 PM**  
**Oakland City Hall**  
**Hearing Room 1**  
**1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, 3rd Floor**  
***Meeting Minutes***

---

**Commission Members:** *District 1 Representative: Reem Suleiman, District 2 Representative: Vacant, District 3 Representative: Brian M. Hofer, District 4 Representative: Lou Katz, District 5 Representative: Raymundo Jaquez III, District 6 Representative: Clint M. Johnson, District 7 Representative: Robert Oliver, Council At-Large Representative: Saied R. Karamooz, Mayoral Representative: Vacant*

---

*Each person wishing to speak on items must fill out a speaker's card. Persons addressing the Privacy Advisory Commission shall state their names and the organization they are representing, if any.*

1. 5:00pm: Call to Order, determination of quorum

*The meeting was called to order at 6:05; members present: Hofer, Johnson, Jaquez, Katz, Karamooz, Oliver.*

2. 5:05pm: Review and approval of November and January meeting minutes

*The November and January Minutes were approved unanimously.*

3. 5:10pm: Open Forum
- 4.

*There were no public speakers.*

5. 5:15pm: Presentation by Oakland Police Department - Annual Report on Cellular Site Simulator Use

*Chairperson Hofer introduced the report as a game changing moment in privacy rights in that it is the first known annual report from a City about this type of device. He noted the County also recently released its first annual report and that this is an example of good public policy.*

*Tim Birch reviewed the report's key elements. Noting that no recording of data occurred and there were no costs associated.*

*Member Jaquez asked about the cost of training for officers who use the device; Mr. Birch answered that the training was done in house and at no cost to the department but that any future training costs would be reported. Member Katz asked about the efficacy of the device based on the success rate listed in the report (1 out of 3 arrests). Chairperson Hofer added a little more detail would help in regard to whether it was the suspect or the phone that was located. Mr. Birch offered to get more details and add them to the report, bringing it back to the PAC before going to City Council.*

6. 5:35pm: Presentation by Oakland Police Department - Private Video Camera Registry

*Bruce Stoffmacher with OPD presented a PowerPoint about the program which is an online registry that private citizens can voluntarily use to register their camera with the police department. He demonstrated the website and explained the protocols in place to avoid any release of people's personal information. He also explained that this does NOT give OPD live access to any private camera but merely tells officers where they are located so that they could approach camera owners after-the-fact when investigating a crime. This will save countless hours of time for investigators because they will be aware of where cameras are located without having to conduct door-to-door canvassing.*

*Some questions arose regarding data and he explained that all of the data is held internally and stored on OPD servers. Outside vendors were only used to develop the GIS mapping function. Only OPD staff with a certified email account will have access to the database.*

*Two Public Speakers:*

*Michael Katz-Lacabe raised some concerns about officers installing the application on their personal versus city-issued mobile devices' encryption of the data, and how a user's info is validated; noting that a hacker could distort the data in the system and add a bunch of non-existent cameras to confuse OPD.*

*J.P. Masser supported the concern about authentication raised by the previous speaker and raised a concern about how much footage an officer would collect from a particular camera.*

7. 5:55pm: Annual election of Chair, Vice-Chair

*Both Chairperson Hofer and Vice Chair Johnson were reelected unanimously.*

8. Adjournment

*The meeting adjourned at 5:45.*