



City of Oakland

Equitable Climate Action Plan (ECAP) Community Advisory Committee [ad hoc]

Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, June 23, 2019

6:00 p.m. – 8:00 p.m.

Via Teleconference

Committee Members: Najee Amaranth (Co-Chair), Nicole Bratton (Co-Chair), Ryder Diaz, Anne Olivia Eldred, Barbara Haya, Jhamere Howard, Navina Khanna, Jody London, Ryan Schuchard, Susan Stephenson, Tyrone “Baybe Champ” Stevenson Jr., Dominic Ware, Jacky Xu. Alternates: Brian Beveridge, Bruce Nilles

Pursuant to the Governor's Executive Order N-29-20, members of the Committee, as well as City staff, will participate via phone/video conference, and no physical teleconference locations are required. Public participation instructions were provided in the Meeting Agenda.

1. Call to order, Roll call / Determination of quorum 6:00 – 6:05

- Meeting called to order at 6:00 PM by Co-Chair Najee Amaranth. Susan Stephenson joined in at 6:10 PM, and Brian Beveridge joined in at 6:27pm.

Committee Members	Present	Excused
Najee Amaranth	X	
Nicole Bratton		X
Ryder Diaz	X	
Anne Olivia Eldred	X	
Jhamere Howard		
Barbara Haya	X	
Navina Khanna	X	
Jody London	X	
Ryan Schuchard	X	
Susan Stephenson	X	
Tyrone “Baybe Champ” Stevenson Jr.		X
Dominic Ware		X
Jacky Xu		X

Alternates	Present	Excused
Brian Beveridge	X	
Bruce Nilles	X	

2. Approval of draft meeting minutes (Attachment A) 6:05 – 6:08

Seek motion to adopt the February 25, 2020 ECAP ad hoc Community Advisory Committee Meeting minutes

➔ **Motion to adopt the February 25 minutes made by Jody; Anne Olivia seconds**

- *Roll call: All in favor.*

3. Public comment

6:08 – 6:20

- Carrie Ramirez, of Youth vs. Apocalypse, read statements from youth in the organization.
- David Ralston, a member of Brower Dellums Institute and city planner, commended all efforts on the ECAP and the journey thus far. Ralston said that there are critical gaps that committee should consider in the ECAP:
 - Community priorities have not been fully incorporated (i.e. public bank, no deliverables or targets on food systems, not enough resilience hubs, lack of land use maps)
 - ECAP should be an element in General Plan
 - Oversight Equity Council to see across implementation of ECAP
 - Connect to ‘Defund OPD’ budget for funding stream to implement the ECAP

4. Agenda modification

6:20 – 6:23

➔ **Motion to move Youth vs. Justice (prev. Agenda Item 8) to the beginning of the meeting made by Anne Olivia; Najee seconds**

- *Roll call: All in favor.*

5. Youth vs. Apocalypse

6:23 – 6:28

- Anne Olivia introduces Carrie and Carolyn from Youth vs. Apocalypse who read a statement/resolution
- ➔ **Motion to support the Youth vs. Apocalypse resolution made by Anne Olivia; Navina seconds.**
 - *Roll call: All in favor except Jody and Barbara who abstained, and Brian who was present but was not called to vote. Motion passes.*

6. Changes to Port of Oakland section in the ECAP

6:28 – 6:50

- Daniel explained direction from the City Administrator to remove Port actions and only reference the Port’s two existing plans: Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond Plan and the West Oakland Community Action Plan (WOCAP). Shayna discussed with the EF team and leadership at WOEIP prior to the Committee meeting, and explained that the rewritten Port section affirms the City’s commitment to pursuing WOCAP implementation in alignment with ECAP goals and principles.
- Committee asks whether there is time to update the ECAP?
 - No more chances to change draft before committee consideration.
- Committee asks whether there is timetable for future updates to the ECAP?
 - Plan doesn’t specify regular updates, will be direction of Council or City Administration.
- Brian Beveridge explained WOCAP, and encouraged the Committee to become engaged with the Port’s decision-making due to the significant climate and GHG emissions impact of the Port’s activities. Encouraged Committee members to look at WOEIP and WOCAP for Port-specific items, and overlap between Port strategies and the ECAP. Stressed that there is now a window of opportunity because the Port Commission has been

sympathetic to West Oakland climate impacts. Brian feels that City cannot reach GHG goals without reducing emissions at the Port.

- Jody London calls for focus on practical aspect of the committee’s advisory role given the City administration direction.
- ➔ **Motion to write a Committee letter to the City Council, Mayor, City Administrator, Port Commission, and the Port Executive Director expressing disappointment that Port Actions were removed from the ECAP, and expectation that the Port continues to work with the City on alleviating its impact on surrounding communities made by Jody London; Anne Olivia seconds.**
- Committee discussion followed on overall disappointment and need for explanation from the City Administrator on the decision to omit Port Actions from the ECAP. The Committee further asked:
 - About the legal authority of bypassing the public comment process,
 - Daniel answered that staff will find out and report back to the Committee.
 - Whether the existing Port plans fall short of the removed ECAP Port Actions,
 - Daniel confirms Port plans likely fall short of original ECAP goals.
 - And whether the Committee’s objection to the process that took place and the content of the Port section of the ECAP can be included in the staff report.
 - Daniel answered the staff report has already been finalized, but staff can request that the ad hoc Committee be included in the presentation.
- ➔ **Motion to write the letter discussed above before the Council meeting, and include that the Committee objects to the handling of the situation in the Staff PowerPoint presentation to Council made by Najee. No Committee member seconded the motion.**
 - **Roll call: All in favor.**
 - The Committee designated members who will write the letter: Jody, Ryan, Barbara, Anne Olivia, and Brian. Jody will send an email.
- ➔ **Motion to schedule a special meeting made by Navina; Anne Olivia seconds.**
 - **Roll call: All in favor.**
 - Shayna will send out a doodle poll to schedule the special meeting and the link to the Port Task Force meeting this Friday at Brian’s request.

7. Committee Discussion: 2030 Equitable Climate Action Plan (final draft)

Discussion and possibly vote. See Attachment B, available at

<https://wettransfer.com/downloads/5e52ee810d945a04e24b4b5c5cdf9eb120200616234322/ef52bf>

- Shayna noted that formatting is still in process, and Appendices have yet to be formatted and included, but narrative content is final. Staff intends to have full document completed by end of this week, and still need to add 4 appendices. Expresses gratitude to Committee.
 - Many priorities and concerns from the Committee are incorporated in the final document, including crosscutting equity sections (Public Health, Housing Security, Food security); incorporation of food security and urban agriculture considerations into Action items A-6, CR-4, and CR-3; expanding the scope of T-4 (public transit) beyond just cost; incorporating energy efficiency and energy resilience in B-2 and A-2.
 - New Action: City Leadership 5: Establish Oakland Climate Action Network

- ➔ **Motion that the Committee writes to Council to support the adoption of the REIA and its recommendations/direction in entirety made by Anne Olivia; Najee seconds**
 - *Roll Call: All in favor*

- ➔ **Motion to send a letter to Council that says to explicitly state creation of public bank in the ECAP made by Najee; Anne Olivia seconds with Amendment to include that Council gives direction to staff to include all of the community priorities that were removed from the ECAP.**
 - *A complete roll call vote did not ensue; no vote was held.*
 - The Committee discussed its role in prioritizing actions to be included in the ECAP, acknowledged limited City staff capacity to rewrite the Plan, and reaffirmed its commitment to highlighting only the major priorities that the Committee considered valuable by the community but that the ECAP was unable to incorporate. Brian stressed the importance of focusing the letter on the need for the Port to be held accountable for progress under the ECAP. Committee members agreed.

~~7. **Racial Equity Impact Analysis** ~~7:15 7:40~~
See Attachment C~~

8. Next Steps: Discussion **7:50 – 8:00**

- Najee recommended that the Committee members show up to the Council meeting. Shayna will send out a link that explains how to join a Council meeting as an attendee. The Committee members interested in writing the letter to Council should get in contact with Najee.

9. Adjourn **8:05**

- Meeting adjourned at 8:07 PM.

Attachment A



City of Oakland, ECAP ad hoc Community Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes from Tuesday, February 25, 2020 Regular Meeting Oakland City Hall, 1st Floor, Hearing Room 3

1. Call to order, Roll call / Determination of quorum

6:00 – 6:05

Meeting called to order at 6:31 PM by Co-Chair Najee Amaranth. Jhamere Howard was introduced as the replacement for Ms. Margaret. Jody London arrived at 6:53 PM.

Committee Members	Present	Excused
Najee Amaranth	X	
Nicole Bratton		X
Ryder Diaz	X	
Anne Olivia Eldred	X	
Jhamere Howard	X	
Barbara Haya	X	
Navina Khanna	X	
Jody London	X	
Ryan Schuchard		X
Susan Stephenson	X	
Tyrone "Baybe Champ" Stevenson Jr.		X
Dominic Ware		X
Jacky Xu		X

Alternates	Present	Excused
Brian Beveridge		X
Bruce Nilles		X

2. Approval of draft meeting minutes (attached)

6:05 – 6:08

Seek motion to adopt the December 12, 2019 ECAP ad hoc Community Advisory Committee Meeting minutes

→ **Motion to adopt minutes made by Najee; Anne Olivia seconds**

- All in favor, except Navina and Susan who abstained due to their absence.

- The Committee discussed Support for shortening the length of the meeting minutes to allow for brevity and accuracy.

3. Public comment

6:08 – 6:20

Comments were made by members of several local community organizations: Public Bank East Bay, California Resilience Network, Local Clean Energy Alliance, West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project, Communities for Better Environment, Cypress Mandela Training Center, Climate Caucus, and the Oakland Climate Action Coalition.

City staff answered questions on the ECAP timeline:

- Legal review on action items is now complete.
- At this time, substantive comments on the Action item language will be difficult to incorporate, but overall narrative writing is still ongoing, responsive to feedback from Town Halls, Konveio, redlines from the Equity Facilitator, City staff, and others.
- Overall content, including formatting, is expected to be complete by mid-April.
- The final draft ECAP is expected to come before Public Works Committee on May 26 and the full City Council on June 2.

4. Agenda modification

6:20 – 6:23

5. Review Current Draft Actions & Community Priorities

6:23 – 7:30

Full Committee – Discussion (possibly vote) – See attachments A-F

The Committee discussed:

- Whether the EF team’s redlined version was incorporated into the narrative
 - Shayna explained that the EF team reviewed the community comments and submitted a redlined version to City staff a few days ago. The redlines were mostly wording changes, and all have been incorporated into the draft.
- Whether there is language that specifies that the ECAP will be incorporated into the City’s general plan
 - Daniel explained that the action items on alignment indicate that policies included in the General Plan must be consistent with the ECAP, but there is no language about an exact method per direction from the Planning and Building Department.
- Whether language about local food systems and worker co-ops is sufficiently included
 - Shayna indicated the “Food Security” overview is almost complete, and the “Green Economy” overview is complete.
- Concern over whether language about energy-sourcing and energy efficiency without risk of displacement is included
 - Daniel explained that there is no specific language about energy-sourcing at this point as it only came up recently with the topic of nuclear energy potentially being in the EBCE power mix; language about energy efficiency is already included with specific language

about displacement risks.

- Support to change “community solar” to “community-owned solar”
 - City staff will make this change.
- Concern over accessibility of resilience hubs to all neighborhoods
 - City staff will emphasize language in the A1 narrative about ensured access to resilience hubs for every neighborhood.
- Establishing a structure for community oversight, e.g. community advisory committee
 - City staff will include language about a community advisory committee or similar community engagement and oversight in the ECAP.
- Concern over building electrification language that should include preventing landlords from passing costs to tenants as many pay a flat-rate rent
 - City staff will emphasize language about avoiding risk of electrification cost-burdens onto tenants.
- Support to change language in the Port section to “carbon-free and nuclear-free energy”
 - City staff will make this change.

6. Action Prioritization

7:30 – 7:45

Shayna Hirshfield-Gold – Presentation – See attachment G

Shayna presented the ECAP matrix as a brief overview document of the timeline and City departments associated with each action item. Shayna also spoke on the substantial role that the Racial Equity Impact Analysis Report will play in the ECAP’s implementation phase.

7. Committee Discussion: Next Meeting content

7:45 – 8:00

The Committee generally empowered individual expert Committee members to review specific sections of the ECAP, specifying that Navina will review “Food Security” and provide feedback. City staff reiterated that incorporating major changes to the ECAP Actions will be difficult at this point.

Several Committee members made closing announcements:

- Upcoming vote on nuclear energy will take place at EBCE board meeting
- The MTC recently seated an immigration subcommittee, which provides an opportunity to advocate for free transportation, among other things
- Next ECAP Committee meeting will take place on the fourth Tuesday of March
- Jhamere Howard welcomed into ECAP Ad Hoc Advisory Committee

Items to be on the next agenda:

- Review of final narrative (also to be posted online)
- Overview of the Racial Equity Impact Analysis Report

8. Adjourn

8:00

Meeting adjourned at 8:11 PM