



**City of Oakland, ECAP ad hoc Community Advisory Committee
Meeting Minutes from Thursday, December 12, 2019 Special Meeting
150 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, 2nd Floor, Classroom 2**

Item 1. Call to Order

Meeting called to order at 6:13 PM by Co-Chair Nicole Bratton.

Item 2. Roll call / Determination of Quorum

Committee Members	Present	Excused
Najee Amaranth		
Nicole Bratton	X	
Ryder Diaz		
Anne Olivia Eldred		X
Margaret Gordon		
Barbara Haya	X	
Navina Khanna	X	
Jody London	X	
Ryan Schuchard	X	
Susan Stephenson	X	
Tyrone "Baybe Champ" Stevenson Jr.		X
Dominic Ware		X
Jacky Xu		X

Alternates	Present	Excused
Brian Beveridge	X	
Bruce Nilles		X

Staff attendees: Daniel Hamilton (Sustainability Program Manager), Shayna Hirshfield-Gold (ECAP Project Manager), Danielle Makous (Sustainability Fellow), Sooji Yang (Sustainability Fellow)

Item 3. Approval of draft meeting minutes (attached)

→ **Motion to adopt minutes made by Nicole; Susan seconds**

- No objections

Item 4. Public comment

- Kari Hamerschlag from the Friends of the Earth (FOE) shared the organization's recommendations for the 2030 ECAP:
 - The 2030 ECAP should address food and agricultural emissions as well as the consumption impacts of the City's own food procurement.
 - The 2030 ECAP should include the priority actions outlined in **Attachment A: Letter from Friends of the Earth to Daniel Hamilton and Shayna Hirshfield-Gold, 12/12/2019.**
- Ember Kraus from the Neighborhood Leadership Cohort (NLC) shared:
 - What community voted on doesn't seem to be adequately reflected in the plan, such as public banks and local financing, and land trusts and cooperative-owned businesses.

- Concern about the timeline for many of the actions (should be sooner).
- City should provide grants to neighborhoods so they can make their own resiliency hubs, and those funds should prioritize the residents who've been here the longest.
- The City should act like this is an emergency.
- Keneda Gibson from the Neighborhood Leadership Cohort (NLC) shared:
 - The City should consider more regional, reliable, and frequent transit service in Oakland; maps that show needed routes and buses like along Hegenberger; free transit by 2030; development fees on housing projects to fund transit passes for low-income residents; tiny house villages on unutilized public lands; municipal-level anti-displacement strategy; tenant relocation assistance that is paid by landlords; inclusionary zoning policies; increased impact fees and accountability for developers to pay their impact fees; fees on all new developments (not just on housing); local clean energy (i.e., community-owned solar); non-mandatory retrofits; City-supported worker-owned cooperatives; acknowledgment that Oakland sits on stolen Ohlone land; and support for the Sogorea Te' Land Trust.
- The Committee discussed process for community input in ECAP implementation:
 - Navina: There's concern about the plan's implementation and how we're going to make sure community voices are a part of the implementation process. For this to be implemented in a way that really works for the community, there needs to be an ongoing process of how community is involved.
 - Nicole: We need to implement a commission of community leaders to see the plan implemented.
 - Navina: Something that the commission can explore is participatory budgeting so folks can make decisions around how our budgets are set as it relates to climate.
- The Committee discussed prioritization of actions in the ECAP:
 - Jody: We have to be realistic about what people can do because not everything can be a top priority. Part of our responsibility as an advisory committee is to help the City prioritize.
 - Brian: How does the administration propose to implement this plan itself? We don't know how we fit into the implementation. How does the community influence the priorities, the budget, and funding?
 - Shayna: In terms of prioritization within the ECAP, we've been focused on a smaller number of actions because including 175 actions in the last ECAP made it not fully actionable by 0-2 full-time staff. After learning from the last ECAP, we're trying to keep the 2030 ECAP limited to around 40 actionable items, and the idea is that all of this is done by the end of 10 years. We're working with the climate and equity consultants to look at the top community priorities, going back and forth on how the current draft addressed those. Perhaps this is something we can present to the Committee in January on how the priorities show up in the current draft.
 - Co-Chair Nicole: Are the two consulting teams on the same page?
 - Shayna: They bring different toolsets to the process, and we're all working together well.
 - Brian: How does the ECAP become a policy driver? How many ECAPs are there under different names and are related to each other? How are they not tied into a master vision? Where does the ECAP land in City priorities?
 - Daniel: When we receive suggestions or concerns from the NLC, committee, community, or internal stakeholders, we hear different perspectives on priorities, and then we explore how those might relate to what's already in the plan and just isn't

communicated well. If the suggestion is to something new, we have to think about what would get bumped as a result. We have to ask the hard questions about prioritization if we want staff to respond to what's in the plan. We're trying to balance out what everybody's saying. The equity and climate consultant teams are providing input into that, and their recommendations don't always align. We try to balance that out, and there's nothing wrong about having conflicting opinions. The City is presenting to senior staff next week on where we are on the draft and what it's looking like to the extent that the department heads take ownership of this and influence what they do. A big part of this is that Shayna and I go out and convince these departments on why ECAP should be a guide in their work, and that's largely dependent on how well they think ECAP reflects on their existing priorities. We have many conflicting priorities, but ultimately Council gives direction and our job is to implement what Council adopts.

- Navina: We should name the community priorities that we don't have the resources to do in the plan because somebody can/should. We should name it, include it, and not ignore community items. There can also be a column that looks at the disparities impact/equity impact. And who is the community that benefits?

→ Motion to agendaize implementing an oversight commission for the ECAP implementation process in the January meeting by Co-Chair Nicole; Ryan seconds.

Item 5. Agenda Modification

- No modification

Item 6. Committee Resolution: Port Leadership

The Committee discussed these proposed modifications:

- Add action that the City will advocate with the Port to be significantly more ambitious with the electrification of the vehicle fleet.
- Port targets should be accelerated and updated annually consistent with market trends and changes. Identify an appropriate percentage increased based on market.

→ Co-Chair Nicole moves to adopt these modifications into the Port Leadership section of the ECAP.

- No objections; Brian was not present in the room (no quorum)

Item 7. Committee Resolution: Carbon Removal

The Committee discussed these proposed modifications:

- Incorporate the Friends of the Earth recommendations into this section – particularly on the City's food procurement.
- Needs clarity on what kind of carbon farming.
 - Navina will get language to staff about carbon farming.

→ Motion to vote on Navina's comments.

- No objections; Brian was not present in the room (no quorum)

Item 8. Committee Discussion: Adaptation

The Committee discussed these proposed modifications:

- Recommends using animals for vegetation control in fire-prone areas.
- Recommends using a parcel tax to establish the LLAD
- Green jobs should be stated, not only shown with the hard hat logo.
- Include language about people using gas generators during PSPS.
- Accelerate timeline of resilience hub development.
- Define resilience hubs and the community process of identifying what they should look like.

→ **Co-Chair Nicole moves to adopt these modifications into the Adaptation section of the ECAP.**

- No objections

Item 9. Committee Discussion: City Leadership

The Committee discussed these proposed modifications:

- Implement a community commission to advise the City on ECAP implementation.
- Explore participatory budgeting.
- Include advocacy call-outs.
- Include climate consideration in all city expenditures.
- Accelerate targets and deadlines for Actions 1 & 3.
- Place Sustainability in the City Manager's office.
- Create an interdepartmental task force that implements and enforces ECAP throughout different City departments.

→ **Co-Chair Nicole moves to adopt these modifications into the City Leadership section of the ECAP.**

- All in favor except for Barbara and Jody on the "interdepartmental task force" item

Item 10: Committee Discussion: Material Consumption & Waste

The Committee discussed these proposed modifications:

- Add Good Food Procurement Policy
- Use the most climate-friendly paving materials in construction and in all purchasing

→ **Motion to extend meeting by 10 minutes by Co-Chair Nicole; Brian seconded.**

- Specify consumer goods.
 - Shayna to talk with Brian about language on consumer goods and waste.
- Change "Support and Expand" to "Formalize and Regulate"

→ **Co-Chair Nicole moves to adopt these modifications into the Material Consumption & Waste section of the ECAP.**

- No objections

Item 11: Committee Discussion: Buildings

The Committee discussed these proposed modifications:

- Develop metrics to evaluate environmental impact on development overall (not just on individual development projects)

- **Motion to extend meeting by 7 minutes by Co-Chair Nicole; Navina seconded.**
- City should not sell public lands to private developers without oversight from the community.
- **Co-Chair Nicole moves to adopt this modification into the Buildings section of the ECAP.**
 - All in favor except Barbara and Ryan.
- Increase and collect impact fees to reallocate and reinvest to affordable housing, ECAP funding, schools, low-income homeowners and renters, and educators.
- **Co-Chair Nicole moves to adopt this modification into the Buildings section of the ECAP.**
 - All in favor except Brian.

Item 12: Committee Discussion: Transportation + Land Use

The Committee discussed these proposed modifications:

- Quantify the next generation active transportation targets and the ZEV Action Plan targets in the ECAP.
- **Co-Chair Nicole moves to adopt this modification into the Transportation + Land Use section of the ECAP.**
 - No objections
- Explore options for subsidizing transit and alternative transit.
- **Co-Chair Nicole moves to adopt this modification into the Transportation + Land Use section of the ECAP.**
 - All in favor except Barbara and Brian.
- Accelerate timeline on free transit.
- **Co-Chair Nicole moves to adopt this modification into the Transportation + Land Use section of the ECAP.**
 - All in favor except Brian, Barbara, and Jody.

Meeting adjourned at 8:33 PM.



December 12, 2019

Mr. Daniel Hamilton,
Acting Environmental Services Division Manager
250 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza
City of Oakland, CA

Ms. Shayna Hirshfield-Gold
Acting Sustainability Program Manager

Dear Mr. Hamilton and Ms. Hirshfield-Gold,

As Oakland residents and supporters of Friends of the Earth, we commend Oakland for implementing a robust consultation process to create an Equitable Climate Action Plan to combat our climate crisis and build resilience in the city's frontline communities. We greatly appreciate Oakland's commitment to creating an equitable transition to a low-carbon economy focused on green jobs, opportunity, health and equity, especially for Oakland's most disenfranchised residents.

However, in order to effectively curb Oakland's GHG emissions, and help Oakland residents better cope with the impacts of climate chaos, ECAP must do a better job of addressing a key contributor to our climate crisis — our industrial food system. Our food system accounts for at least a quarter of global greenhouse gas emissions, with animal agriculture emitting an astounding ~14.5 percent — more than the entire transportation sector. Research shows that global emissions from food consumption alone by 2050 could nearly exceed the 2°C limit established in the Paris Agreement. Furthermore, overconsumption of emissions-intensive animal products — especially red and processed meats — is associated with increased risks of heart disease, diabetes and some cancers, while plant-based diets can help decrease the risks of all three.

With global demand for animal products projected to increase 70% by 2050, **numerous studies have shown that we cannot avert climate chaos if we don't support a rapid transition toward plant-forward diets and diversified, regenerative, and organic food production systems.**

To help accelerate this transition, 14 large global cities have recently committed to the C40 Good Food Cities Declaration, an accord that harnesses the power of cities to promote a "planetary health diet." Under the agreement, mayors will use their procurement powers to reduce carbon-intensive food purchases and increase sourcing food from organic producers. The city signatories also commit to work with citizens, businesses, public institutions and other organizations to develop policies, including Climate Action Plan strategies for reducing food waste and making low-carbon food affordable and accessible for all. We urge Oakland to join these 14 cities in adopting forward-looking, climate-friendly food policies as part of its ECAP.

As a large population center with vast purchasing power, Oakland must do more to help shift consumption patterns toward foods that generate fewer greenhouse gas emissions. While the ECAP plan rightly recognizes the "urgent need" to reduce indirect, lifecycle emissions and the "global impact of each and every purchasing decision within Oakland," it fails to acknowledge the urgent need to reduce the high emissions associated with food purchases, in particular, which are among the biggest sources of consumption-based emissions. Traditional climate action strategies, like increasing energy efficiency in buildings and shifting to electric vehicles won't be sufficient to halt climate change if large cities like Oakland do not also slash emissions embedded in the food we eat and the food that is purchased by large food establishments.

Shifting institutional food purchasing can in fact be a relatively simple, cost-effective way to fight climate change. A [Friends of the Earth report](#) documented how Oakland Unified School District has already cut its carbon footprint 14 percent by buying less meat and dairy and offering more plant-based proteins, fruits, and vegetables. This not only saved the carbon emissions equivalent to driving 1.5 million fewer miles annually or planting 15,000 trees, it also saved \$42,000 and allowed the school to buy more local and organic food.

Individual shifts are also critical. Based on the World Resources Institute's estimates of the [GHG emissions associated with an average US diet](#), food purchases by Oakland residents generate roughly 600,000 tons of Co2eq. This is equivalent to the emissions generated by 121,000 cars on the road each year. By cutting animal product consumption in half, WRI found that individuals could reduce their food related emissions by 43%. As a city, this would amount to taking more than 60,000 cars off our roads.

Beyond reducing food-related consumption emissions, the ECAP must incorporate strategies to build climate resiliency and increase healthy food access through the expansion of urban agriculture and sustainable food businesses. Too many Oakland families are living in food swamps, with very little access to healthy food that is affordable and nutritious. While the draft ECAP features a picture highlighting the good work of City Slicker Farms, it lacks specific actions to expand [community gardens](#), urban organic food production, community kitchens and climate-friendly food businesses. By increasing the availability of land, resources, capital and training aimed at encouraging more urban agriculture and climate-friendly food businesses, Oakland can increase community resiliency in the face of potential food shocks from climate chaos, while improving community health and creating green jobs. Creating economic opportunity through sustainable, climate-friendly food businesses should be part of the city's green jobs vision.

Specifically, we urge Oakland to include the following priority actions in its Equitable Climate Action Plan:

- Set a meaningful target (at least 40% by 2030) for reducing the emissions associated with the food purchased by the city of Oakland and food establishments that operate on city property (e.g. Oakland Zoo, Park concessions, etc.).
- Adopt climate-friendly, values-based food procurement policies that will drive sustainable supply chains and shift food purchases of municipally-owned institutions as well as food establishments operating on city property away from emissions-intensive animal foods towards plant-based options and organically produced food (see Friends of the Earth's [Municipal Guide to Climate Friendly Food Purchasing](#) for model policies, including the [Good Food Purchasing Program](#));
- Reduce Oakland's food related consumption based emissions by: a) Launching creative outreach and advertising campaigns, utilizing city property, to drive residents, restaurants, and institutions to reduce the carbon footprint of their food purchases and participate in the city sanctioned [Meatless Monday Program \(a resolution was passed in 2014\)](#); b) Using Oakland's business permitting process to incentivize restaurants, food trucks and other food establishments to adopt [climate-friendly menus](#), including more plant-based entrées and organic food; c) Ensuring that food vendors operating at Oakland city supported events serve climate-friendly food.
- Increase community resilience and food related green jobs by significantly expanding urban organic food production and climate-friendly food businesses by: a) Doubling the number of community gardens over 5 years and expanding technical assistance and culturally appropriate education for youth, elderly, disabled, new immigrant, and low-income populations through increased funding for Oakland's Community Garden Program and NGO partnerships; b) Creating an inventory of open public lots, private lots, tax-forfeited properties, and public parks that are available for community gardens and urban agriculture; c) Creating tax incentives and water pricing mechanisms to encourage private land use for urban agriculture and community gardens; d) Providing support for climate-friendly food businesses through Sustainable Oakland's Green Jobs, Climate and Energy, Health and Safety and Economic Prosperity programs.

- Create zoning, land use and housing development regulations and permitting processes that incentivize new and/or existing/expanding housing developments to: a) Set aside land and other resources for community gardens and fruit tree plantings; b) Incorporate healthy food retail outlets into their development designs.
- Incorporate fruit trees into Oakland’s climate action strategies around increased tree plantings.

Thank you for your consideration,

Signed:

First name	Last name	Postcode	City	State
benson	hausman	94611	Oakland	CA
Shirley	Golub	94602	Oakland	CA
Marilyn	Tiaven	94605	Oakland	CA
Robyn	Krieger	94610	Oakland	CA
Rondi	Saslow	94618	Oakland	CA
Lisa	Archer	94609	Oakland	CA
Charlotte	Hennessy	94602	Oakland	CA
Brian	Smalley	94605	Oakland	CA
Amit	Shoham	94619	Oakland	CA
Amy	Zink	94606	Oakland	CA
Joan	Kiley	94611	Oakland	CA
Michael	MacLafferty	94707	Oakland	CA
Susan	Harris	94609	Oakland	CA
Robert	Cheeks	94610	Oakland	CA
A	Corbet	94610	Oakland	CA
Cynthia	Gecas	94611	Oakland	CA
Jean	Oakley	94611	Oakland	CA
Dr A	Gardner	94602	Oakland	CA
Roberta	Schear	94618	Oakland	CA
Claudia	Bowman	94610	Oakland	CA
Sergi	Goldman-Hull	94601	Oakland	CA
Karen	Krongold	94618	Oakland	CA
Anita	Watkins	94611	Oakland	CA
Beate	Lohser	94619	Oakland	CA
Janet	Parkins	94611	Oakland	CA
Allison	Jones	94612	Oakland	CA
Denya S	Jur	94619	Oakland	CA
James	Carpenter	94611	Oakland	CA
Billy	Trice	94621	Oakland	CA
Michael	Blodgett	94601	Oakland	CA
Ann	Harvey	94609	Oakland	CA
Amanda	BLoom	94601	Oakland	CA

Victoria	Buchwald	94611	Oakland	CA
CLIFFORD	ROBINSON	94605	Oakland	CA
Susan	Schacher	94619	Oakland	CA
David	McCord	CA	Oakland	CA
Laura	Condominas	94609	Oakland	CA
Carol	Griffin	94619	Oakland	CA
joan	Iohman	94602	Oakland	CA
Greg	Ratkovsky	94619	Oakland	CA
scott	richie	94602	Oakland	CA
Nancy	Ahuna	94611	Oakland	CA
Greg	Cover	94611	Oakland	CA
Patrick	Twomey	94611	Oakland	CA
Satya	Velagapudi	94602	Oakland	CA
Margaret	Hodges	94605	Oakland	CA
Heidi	Peters	94611	Oakland	MI
April	Parkins	94601	Oakland	CA
Richard	Phelps	94605	Oakland	CA
Fred	Finkelstein	94611	Oakland	CA
Leslie	Smith	94611	Oakland	CA
Nancy	Paskowitz	94609	Oakland	CA
Laura	Centorrino	94602	Oakland	CA
Kathleen	Tandy	94611	Oakland	CA
Martha	Lowe	94601	Oakland	CA
lisa	johnson	94609	Oakland	CA
Sarah	Harvey	94606	Oakland	CA
Ggisela	Nass	94605	Oakland	CA
Sue	Honey	94611	Oakland	CA
Paul	Jokelson	94606	Oakland	CA
Judith	Levin	94602	Oakland	CA
Gwen	Weil	94610	Oakland	CA
Roberta	Stern	94618	Oakland	CA
Paula	Simon	94605	OAKLAND	CA
Ashley	Rockett	94605	Oakland	CA
Hope	McDonnell	94609	Oakland	CA
Karen	Crum	94611	Oakland	CA
Judith	Smith	94601	Oakland	CA
Casey	Fisher	94605	Oakland	CA
KATHY	CARROLL	94611	Oakland	CA

Sara	Usher	94602	Oakland	CA
Patty	Garcia	94610	Oakland	CA
Claudia	Leung	94606	Oakland	CA
Richard	Steiger	94611-1444	Oakland	CA
Jeff	Rose	94602	Oakland	CA
Marsha	Balian	94618	Oakland	CA
Kari	Hamerschalg	94605	Oakland	CA
Renate	Rand	94610	Oakland	CA
Karin	Hansen	94609	Oakland	CA
Eileen	Chieco	94611	Oakland	CA
Frank	Hale Jr.	94611	Oakland	CA
Shelly	Burrola	94602	Oakland	CA
Tricia	McGillis	94610	Piedmont	CA
Trent	Gaylord	94619	Oakland	CA
Rebecca	Dixon	94602	Oakland	CA
Carol	Crooks	94608	Oakland	CA
Aaron	Pedroni	94605	Oakland	CA
Marcia	Flannery	94609	Oakland	CA
Axel	Meier	94606	Oakland	CA
Donna	Canali	94601	Oakland	CA
Aria	White	94611	Oakland	CA
Christine	Berger	94610	Oakland	CA
Michael	Kilivris	94606	Oakland	CA
Miranda	Helly	94612	Oakland	CA
biggi	vinkeloe	94609	OAKLAND	CA
Irene	Kane	94605	Oakland	CA
Amy	Dewey	94610	Oakland	CA
Albert	Chiu	94606	Oakland	CA
Michele	Tusinac	94609	Oakland	CA
Leslie	Lethridge	94618	Oakland	CA
james	selvi	94612	Oakland	CA
Omar	Osorio	94602	Oakland	CA
Alison	Parmer	94610	Oakland	CA
John	Sullivan	94602	Oakland	CA
Claudia	Wornum	94605	Oakland	CA
Andrew	Friedman	94612	Oakland	CA
Brie	Gelinas	94601	Oakland	CA

Cc Honorable Members of the Oakland City Council

Jason Mitchell, Director of Public Works

Najee Amaranth and Nicole Bratton, Co Chairs ECAP ad hoc Community Advisory Committee