

# Howard Terminal Waterfront Ballpark Community Benefits Agreement

*Leveling the Playing Field with Equity, Engagement and Economy*



## Initial CBA Recommendations

from the

Howard Terminal  
Topic Cohorts

**August 14, 2020**

### **Steering Committee Topic Cohort Representatives:**

#### **Community Health / Safety**

Angie Tam  
Marjorie Wolf

#### **Education**

Denisha DeLane  
Phyllis Hall

#### **Housing**

Elaine Brown  
Jabari Herbert

#### **Culture & History**

Eric Arnold  
David Peters

#### **Environment**

Victoria Harris  
Alvina Wong

#### **Transportation**

Steve Lowe  
Mercedes Rodriguez

#### **Economic Dev/ Employment**

Saabir Lockett  
Derrick Muhammad

## Table of Contents

<i>Introduction</i> .....	
<i>Community Health and Safety Topic Cohort Recommendations</i> .....	2
<i>Culture Keeping and History Topic Cohort Recommendations</i> .....	3
<i>Economic Development / Employment Recommendations</i> .....	6
<i>Education Topic Cohort Recommendations</i> .....	15
<i>Environment Topic Cohort Recommendations</i> .....	20
<i>Housing Topic Cohort Recommendations</i> .....	23
<i>Transportation Topic Cohort Recommendations</i> .....	26
<i>Notes</i> .....	30

## Introduction

The following recommendations were developed by community members from the West Oakland, Old Oakland, Jack London and Chinatown communities, which were identified as impacted areas due to their proximity to Howard Terminal. The discussions focused on seven topic areas by working groups that were defined as Topic Cohorts. Members of the general public were invited to participate and become members of the Topic Cohorts. Each Topic Cohort has two lead representatives: one as a resident representative from one of the four impacted areas previously identified, and one who represented that topic area through service or professional work in Oakland about the topic.

The Topic Cohorts met from January – August 2020 to develop the proposed recommendations, which are grounded in racial and social equity for consideration to be included in the Community Benefits Agreement.

The recommendations are being presented now (August 2020) for the Topic Cohort Representatives to join with other members of the Steering Committee for the preliminary review and discussion of specific attributes, benefits and components of the CBA. The final draft of the CBA term sheet from the Steering Committee is anticipated for delivery in September 2020.

*Veronica Cummings, Stakeholder Engagement Lead, City of Oakland*  
*Surlene Grant, Lead Facilitator, Envirocom Communications Strategies, LLC*

Facilitation Team:

Janice Adam, Charleton Lightfoot, Alicia Parker, Tamara Moore and Debbie Schechter

## Community Health and Safety Recommendation

**Commitment:** Develop racial and economic equity centered positive outcomes built through education, creating sustainable resources, and assuring the most vulnerable communities have access. All Recommendations are subject to further research, and community engagement for the most effective results.

<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Education and Resources to address Medical and Mental Health Disparities</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Prevention/Awareness</li> <li>• Air quality remediation</li> <li>• Kitchen Stove/top Exhaust</li> <li>• Most Vulnerable Population</li> <li>• Access to all income levels Quality Food (shuttle)</li> <li>• Mental Health</li> <li>• Parks and Recreation - Fitness and Mental Health</li> <li>• West Oakland Walks</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Education of indoor/outdoor quality</li> <li>• Appliances and Ventilation/HVAC</li> <li>• Support for Formerly incarcerated (adult/Juveniles)</li> <li>• Food Quality - food and education</li> <li>• Case Management for Homeless</li> <li>• Cultural Training (Competency)</li> </ul>
<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Homeless Mental Health</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Farming educations / food sustainability</li> <li>• Mental Health general disorder experienced by homeless</li> <li>• Unsheltered Support</li> <li>• Fund the gap in case management</li> <li>• Safety</li> <li>• Parks- Improvements and Mental Health 25th Street Park North of West Grand</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Substance Abuse Recovery Support</li> <li>• Job Readiness Development</li> <li>• Violence Reduction</li> <li>• Park acquisition/ Improvement</li> </ul>
<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Neighborhood Beautification and Improved Services Delivery</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Community Ambassadors for non-criminal event (fully funded)</li> <li>• Police Reform Community Engagement</li> <li>• (NCPC minimal funding/snacks/Flyers, etc. for mtg)</li> <li>• Funded Project Manager to CBA for evaluation of implementation and effective</li> <li>• Park Improvement and Mental Health</li> <li>• Public Safety: Fire Station/Police Sub-station (Services Funded by Port, A's)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Illegal Dumping</li> <li>• Violence Prevention/Reductions</li> <li>• Economic Equity (most vulnerable)</li> <li>• West Oakland Walks</li> </ul>

# Culture Keeping and History Recommendations

*“History is the foundation and culture is the river that links the past through the present to the future.”*

*David Peters, Co-Lead*

<p><b>RECOMMENDATION</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The cultural center should prioritize collaboration with existing community organizations and projects throughout West Oakland, including, but not limited to, supporting the building of the Hoover Durant Branch Public Library.</li> <li>• The cultural center should provide spaces to house existing West Oakland culture and history organizations including, but not limited to Attitudinal Healing Connection, Elena Museum, Lower Bottom Playaz, and the Huey P. Newton Foundation.</li> <li>• Explore the possibility of collaborative partnerships with existing institutions including but not limited to OMCA, AAMLO, MoJA, and Oakland libraries.</li> <li>• Acquire a Pullman Railroad Car</li> <li>• Include the baseball history of West Oakland’s Chinese American and African American populations.</li> <li>• Be a potential repository for oral history/storytelling initiatives.</li> <li>• Establish a Cultural Preservation Fund to cultivate and facilitate ongoing projects benefiting populations of concern.</li> </ul>
<p><b>WEST OAKLAND CULTURAL AND HISTORY CENTER (WOCHC)</b></p>	
<p><b>RECOMMENDATION</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Addresses neighborhoods most-impacted by historic and current inequity.</li> <li>• Need funds independent of the City budget to ensure long-term sustainability.</li> <li>• Purpose to overcome blight, address short-term displacement of small businesses, maintain diversity and neighborhood history through seeding of culturally-relevant projects, and for hardscape improvements such as trees and pedestrian ways to retain and grow culturally-relevant commerce in perpetuity.</li> <li>• Annual contribution by A’s Port, City from dedicated funding sources.</li> <li>• Projects would be determined through community-developed criteria and selection process</li> <li>• Study existing models such as CAST, CCED, Akonadi, SF Foundation, etc.</li> </ul>
<p><b>NEIGHBORHOOD CULTURAL STABILIZATION FUND</b></p>	

<p><b>RECOMMENDATION</b></p> <p><b>WEST OAKLAND WALK-FUNDING THE COMPLETION OF DESIGN DEVELOPMENT.</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Mile-long walk promotes cultural place keeping, the history of West Oakland, environmental and health benefits, pedestrian safety, and housing preservation, among other things.</li> <li>● Could link to the Bay Trail, which is planned to run along the water's edge, and to Chinatown (Harrison St.).</li> <li>● We encourage other topic cohorts to also consider this project's benefits for their areas of concern.</li> </ul>
<p><b>RECOMMENDATION</b></p> <p><b>MURAL INITIATIVE/PUBLIC ART/STREETSCAPES/WAYFINDING IN AREAS TO INCLUDE CHINATOWN, BAMBD, AND SPARC</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Creative place-keeping benefits of murals, including blight abatement</li> <li>● Creates sense of destination and cohesion around cultural district, enables cultural tourism, supports community-led economic development, employs local artists of color, part of West Oakland Cultural Preservation Initiative</li> <li>● Aligns with "Cultural Equity" objective of Cultural Plan</li> <li>● Need signage to Chinatown to attract ballpark patrons and other users of Howard Terminal Ballpark Village to Chinatown businesses. Also addresses current lack of City investment in BAMBD and need to identify the physical location of the District.</li> <li>● Mural initiative upholds cultural history and promotes creation and documentation of current and future culture creation and addresses loss of neighborhood identity due to population shift.</li> <li>● QR codes should be included in all mural sites allowing access to information about the artists and cultural significance in conjunction with the creation of an online resource for further information.</li> <li>● Should be locally driven in design, development of aesthetic criteria, and selection of artists.</li> <li>● Call out Black Panther history as well as other historically and culturally-significant developments which reflect West Oakland's history of diverse populations. Needs a robust community engagement process in place.</li> </ul>

<p><b>RECOMMENDATION</b></p> <p><b>WEST OAKLAND AND CHINATOWN ORAL HISTORY PROJECT. ONLINE AS WELL AS PHYSICAL COMPONENTS W/QR CODES IN MULTIPLE LOCATIONS</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cultural historians will be identified once the project gets going.</li> <li>• Programs will feature historical figures such as Jerri Lange – grew up in West Oakland (Spencer Wilkinson has video interviews with Lange and Ruth Beckford; William Wong, and Roy Chan – Chinatown history. Synergy with the West Oakland Cultural Preservation Initiative and WOCHC.</li> <li>• Potential for synergy with West Oakland Walk and Mural Initiative</li> </ul>
<p><b>RECOMMENDATION</b></p> <p><b>ANNUAL WEST OAKLAND MUSIC AND CULTURAL FESTIVAL TO INCLUDE ART, THEATER AND YOUTH ACTIVITY. MULTI-DAY EVENT. SUPPORT, YOUTH, CULTURE, ARTS.</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Possibly in Lowell Park-answers need to utilize underused public spaces</li> <li>• Free, possibly 2 days to feature West Coast Blues; for example, Ronnie Stewart and Bay Area Blues Society, Fantastic Negrito, Sugar Pie DeSanto, Faye Carol, etc.</li> <li>• involve vendors, artisans, multidisciplinary artists, youth activities, etc.</li> <li>• Study Malcolm X Jazz Fest and similar models</li> <li>• This recommendation supports economic development as well. Should be recommended to that topic cohort. A's/City/Port should be ongoing primary sponsors. Consider whether to encourage A's to adopt this as an independent marketing initiative, so that the program is not part of the CBA.</li> <li>• Identify other potential sponsors.</li> </ul>
<p><b>RECOMMENDATION</b></p> <p><b>DONATION TO SOGOREA TE LAND TRUST</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Also consider plaque or other commemoration of the former site of Ohlone shellmound.</li> <li>• Ohlone history should also be considered in public art/storytelling initiatives.</li> <li>• Other TCs strongly encouraged to add this to their list of recommendations.</li> </ul>

# Economic Development / Employment Recommendations

Organized as follows:

**Part 1** – Economic Development Recommendations and Benefits

**Part 2** – Operations / Applicable to All Businesses / Employers

**Part 3** – Construction Jobs / Construction Contractors

**Part 4** – CBA Instructions

\*Please note – All specific numbers related to percentages, participation, etc. to be determined. Regard numbers and percentages as place holders.

## **Part 1 -- Economic Development**

Economic Development includes concepts related to business development *and* activities that contribute to building individual wealth.

### 1) *Profit-sharing:*

- The amount could be based on % of gross revenues
- Establish a community-managed fund or distribute to residents of the impacted areas
- Guaranteed Basic Income (UBI) for Oakland residents (esp. low-income/POC) partially funded by a percentage of sales by A's and other for-profit tenants. Burden to businesses would be offset by lower municipal taxes negotiated with the City of Oakland.
- Provide for community members to have an equity stake through Oakland A's organization paying dividends to its shareholders.
- The Oakland A's create opportunity for community ownership / stock participation in their current ownership configuration. The mechanism of community shareholders / community stock in Oakland Athletics will be created within a year of approval of CBA agreement.

### 2) *2-1) Establishment of a Community Fund:*

- The Oakland A's structure or work with a Community Development Finance Institution (CDFI) to leverage funds from the A's.
  - Identify a funding source or mechanism to lend money to Black owned businesses based in the impacted areas. Structured at "no-cost" (i.e. minimum fees), grant or forgivable loan could be options. An agreed upon annual contribution ratified / supported by the community

representatives for the CBA process. Tied to the outcome of supporting small BIPOC businesses in the project area. The amount should be an appropriate amount to capitalize the fund and maintain it as a sustainable source from the Oakland A's.

*Note: Fund could be developed in consultation with other organizations which have specific recommendations and applied successes to aiding in the growth of black-owned businesses and contractors.*

2-2) *Community Resource Fund:*

- Business Resource Development -- a group of professionals available to residents of the impacted areas for business incubation purposes. Available free of charge to residents and small business owners. Fund pays for professional services based on market rates.
- Establishment of a business incubator program to assist BIPOC with the following: (The following is not intended as a definitive list but some preferred services.)
  - Commercial leases on a sliding scale based on revenue in Howard Terminal development.
  - A portion of space in both the stadium and project area set aside for local businesses.
  - "Back office", administrative and professional services and coaching available free of charge to residents and small business owners to assist with securing business opportunities, winning bids, etc.

3) *Small Business Participation and Development:*

- A's contracts to be broken into groups of small contracts to realistically allow smaller-sized African American contractors and businesses to be able to participate and receive contracts for services, vendors, beverage service, printing, supplies, etc.
- A number / percentage of involvement of BIPOC businesses as an on-going sustainable program.

4) *Vendors/ Supplier Involvement:*

4-1a) **Stadium Vendor /Supplier Involvement**

- Local Black and Local Indigenous-owned food and beverage vendors, printers, promotional materials (t-shirts, trinkets, etc.) to be given



priority for stadium contracts. (Need a realistic list of vendor and supplier needs for Stadium to expand the list).

- Vendor advancement / mentoring program to assist with capacity building of businesses.
- 50% of supplier contracts in stadium to be awarded to local East Bay vendors
- A's to provide discounted or free advertising for new and/or small local businesses in stadium during games

#### 4-1b) **Project Area Vendor /Supplier Involvement**

- Local Black and Local Indigenous owned food and beverage vendors, and other suppliers to be given priority for contracts to provide services and products within the project area.
- Vendor advancement / mentoring program to assist with capacity building of local businesses.
- 30%\* of commercial/retail space in Project Area be sold/contracted to local business
- A's to provide discounted or free advertising for new and/or small local businesses in stadium during games
- A's to invest in # local Black and indigenous owned start-ups from area of impact of the development per year
- Minimum #\* locally owned food vendors to be awarded low-cost leases to in-stadium vending outposts.

## **Part 2 -- Operations**

### *Employment and Participation Actions for All Companies/Employers*

#### 5) *Target hire*

- Target Area:
  - Mandates for companies and employers to make priority hires for West & East Oakland residents from zip codes 94607; 94601; 94621; 94603 and 94605. The purpose is to identify neighborhoods where the most impacted ethnic groups live.
  - Adjustments may be made to accommodate demographic shifts (people moving) or changing legislation (such as Proposition 16)
- Individuals for Target Hire:
  - People who lived in one of these zip codes in the past 5 years (to account for displaced people) Currently lives or, for a period of at least

4 years within the past 10 years, did live within (a) West Oakland, (b) Old Oakland, (c) Chinatown, (d) Jack London, (e) East Oakland below I-580.

- Formerly incarcerated or having other involvement with the criminal justice system
  - Chronically unemployed
  - Homeless or paying more than 50% of income for shelter/rent
  - Formerly in foster care
  - Lacking GED or HS diploma
  - Receiving public assistance
  - A US veteran.
  - This should apply to all jobs across the board with some exception for very small businesses with a stated limit of employees (example, 10 employees or less).
- Unions and employers will work with the West Oakland Jobs Resource Center, Civic Corps, Rising Sun and/or other designated workforce centers to identify, refer, assess skills, train and place Targeted Workers.
  - Employers will provide notice to the designated workforce centers (and any appropriate union) of all openings for On-Site Jobs and will exclusively consider Targeted Workers (for a period of time before considering all Oakland workers, then any worker)
  - No fewer than 50% of the annual work hours in all On-Site Jobs at a given employer must be completed by Targeted Workers (summarized).

6) *“Fair Work Week Ordinance”*

Fair scheduling provisions similar to those in the City of Emeryville’s “Fair Work Week Ordinance”. Once people are working, the conditions are such that they will not have back-to-back shift schedules. (An example, of such considerations are a shift ending at 10 p.m. and then a new one for the same person beginning at 8 a.m. the next day; and also, the requirement that employers paying workers if workers’ schedule changed on short notice or give them the option to decline such changes).

7) *Training and Services*

Modeled after the concepts of “lost wages” from other types of employment interruptions. In addition, based on the outcomes of private nuisance and incompatible land use.

- Displaced maritime workers to be retrained/provided educational opportunities for career change, outplacement services, job re-training programs/services, opportunity for employment in new Howard Terminal facilities, and bridging income during retraining.
- Make whole displaced maritime workers for lost wages should the stadium project have an adverse effect on their earning capacity. Assistance to those being impacted by possible negative impacts of the development.
  - Establish a mechanism for assessment. Determine a mechanism to determine who has lost a job because of the Howard Terminal Development. Establish a process to analyze and determine the impact/ outcomes.
- Other (re)-training for workers and residents impacted, in addition to maritime workers. Increase coordination, connecting with direct services and public awareness with local schools and resource/training centers to provide opportunities for impacted to become re-skilled.

8) *Non-Construction Internships and Apprenticeships*

- A's to fund internships for the bottom 10% of at-risk population for career shadowing opportunities that do not impact local business bottom line (payments to interns for time, payments to businesses for overhead costs).
- Paid non-construction apprenticeship/internship programs.
- Create or support program(s) that prepare people for advancement such as interview skills, work place assessments, etc.

9) *Wages/ Compensation*

- Commitment to pay all workers a living wage
- All workers employed in the Howard Terminal site, by the Oakland Athletics or its subsidiaries, contracted businesses, vendors, or consultants, are to be paid a living wage +\$5.00 over the state or local mandated minimum, whichever is higher.

10) *Fair Chance*

- Apply Fair Chance policies and practices across the board.
- Limits set regarding background checks.

- Background checks performed if required by law. Only background checks where a nexus can be demonstrated and only after a conditional offer of employment. Conditions of background check do not automatically disqualify the applicant.
- A background check may be conducted only after a conditional offer of employment has been made
- Employers may only consider the information in a background check that is directly related to the job functions
- Job application informs applicants that a background check will be conducted but that does not automatically disqualify the applicant
- Employers must present a list of crimes with nexus directly related to job functions that exclude applicants

**Part 3 – Construction Contractor / Construction Jobs and Related Employment**  
*Applicable to all construction on stadium and in project area*

11). *Contractor Requirements:*

- Any contract, CBA, and / or PLA requires that the contracting workforce consist of at least 50% Black workers (with passage of Prop 16) or target hires (if not passed).
- A's construction contracts to be broken into groups of small contracts to allow smaller-sized African American contractors and businesses to be able to participate and receive contracts
- Third party review of contract to be conducted (either by City Agency or full-time professional hired to do so and compensated by the Community Fund)
- General Contractors to be required to award 50%\* of subcontracts to Minority Owned Businesses
- Direct Hire of pre-apprentices to be permitted on any Howard Terminal construction project
- Creation of on-site apprenticeship training center to be established for life of project to provide local access to state certified apprentice training requirements
- Oakland A's to provide through technical assistance for -
  - centralized business services (such as accounting, marketing, etc.) to help businesses “tell their financial story and get access to funding”.
  - data collection/research, constructed in such a way that provides value to participating organizations that are providing the data (perhaps in the form of industry reports, workforce trends, etc.)

12) *Targeted Construction Workforce:*

Mandates for companies and employers to make priority hires of people from the following geography and characteristics.

- Target Area:
  - West & East Oakland residents from zip codes 94607; 94601; 94621; 94603 and 94605. The purpose is to identify neighborhoods where the most impacted ethnic groups live.
  - Adjustments may be made to accommodate demographic shifts (people moving) or changing legislation (such as Proposition 16)
- Individuals for Target Hire:
  - People who lived in one of these zip codes in the past 5 years (to account for displaced people) Currently lives or, for a period of at least 4 years within the past 10 years, did live within (a) West Oakland, (b) Old Oakland, (c) Chinatown, (d) Jack London, (e) East Oakland below I-580.
  - Formerly incarcerated or having other involvement with the criminal justice system
  - Chronically unemployed
  - Homeless or paying more than 50% of income for shelter/rent
  - Formerly in foster care
  - Lacking GED or High School diploma
  - Receiving public assistance
  - A US veteran.
  - This should apply to all jobs across the board with some exception for very small businesses with a stated limit of employees (example, 10 employees or less).
- A's provide an incentive fund to recruit and maintain people or implement direct hire as a provision to respond to "when they can't find someone for the positions".
- No fewer than 50% of the annual work hours in all On-Site Jobs at a given employer must be completed by Targeted Workers (summarized).
- Unions and employers will work with the West Oakland Jobs Resource Center, Civic Corp, Rising Sun, and/or other designated workforce centers to identify, assess and refer Targeted Workers.
- Employers will provide notice to the designated workforce centers (and any appropriate union) of all openings for On-Site Jobs and will exclusively consider Targeted Workers
- Workforce development funding for training local and disadvantaged residents in industries represented on the development; funding amount in

alignment with that needed to fulfill the targeted hiring requirements; funding for MC3.

13) *Apprenticeship Programs*

- Identify and select participants based on the Target Hire guidelines stipulated above.
- The building trades must agree to implement a self-imposed consent decree in order to cause the recruitment of blacks into their apprenticeship programs.
- Funding to local MC3-certified pre-apprenticeship training programs sufficient to train twice as many individuals as the projected number of apprentices on all construction
- A's marketing and PR team to partner with National Association of Minority Contractors and others with such expertise to create an informational campaign about the career possibility of working in the construction industry, including but not limited to how it can lend itself to a 4yr degree program, how technology is shaping daily work, and current industry R&D. information campaign to be distributed on social media networks and to be featured in a career day at each Oakland High school yearly for the entirety of the CBA
- A's to have Construction Industry theme day at the stadium, where local contractors of color are spotlighted, networking is encouraged, and booths are organized for construction businesses to recruit workers and provide career information to students

14) *Pre-Apprenticeship Program*

- Identify and select participants based on the Target Hire guidelines stipulated above.
- Pre-apprenticeship programs to compensate the participants through salary, stipend, or other means that lends economic support during the training period.
- Any pre-apprenticeship should not be offered as a substitute, or at the expense of an apprenticeship.
- Pre-apprenticeships should have a paid job opportunity connected to the "pre-apprentice" opportunity.
- Direct Hire of pre-apprentices to be permitted on any Howard Terminal construction project.
- Creation of on-site apprenticeship training center to be established for life of project to provide local access to state certified apprentice training requirements

## Part 4 -- CBA Instruction

### 15) *Effectiveness / Enforcement -*

- On-going funding for an implementation advocate to follow items down to details specific to this Economic Development / Employment cohort.
- The CBA shall be enforced by representatives of the four impacted communities: West Oakland, Old Oakland, Chinatown, Jack London, and representatives of various organizations representing vulnerable communities citywide.
- Recommend the creation and ongoing funding for the CBA enforcement panel. This should involve all relevant stakeholders and contain clear definitions of desired outcomes and processes to be successful - in part to provide the justification of liquidated damages in the event of non-compliance.
- Third party review of all construction contracts to be completed prior to award
- Use of outcome-oriented contracting to tie payments to measurable metrics of success (program participation, certification achievement, job placement, median salary after completion of program, etc.)

### 16) Ongoing data collection

- Contingent on Prop 16 being successful in overturning Prop. 209, a disparity study will be done that disaggregates the high disparity communities and includes the mostly highly impacted small communities.

## **RECOMMENDATION / REQUEST from Economic Development / Employment to Environment and / or Community Health and Safety -**

### *Employment and Participation Actions for All Companies / Employers:*

- Minimize HEALTH impacts to existing workforce in West Oakland during construction of new stadium and buildings (air quality). Make accommodations for vulnerable workers with underlying health conditions (ex. asthma)

# Education Topic Cohort Recommendations

## Preface

The following recommendations were developed by community members from the West Oakland and Chinatown communities. To ground the recommendations in racial and social equity, the group began by evaluating data showing significant [disparities in educational outcomes](#) with African American and Latinx generally experiencing the highest disparities relative to their White and Asian counterparts. The group also spent time uncovering the root cause of the disparities. The [root cause analysis](#) enabled a more nuanced approach to recommendation development. For example, children from mono-lingual households were identified as a “root-cause” of the disparities in preschool enrollment, as was lack of interest in assimilation to the dominant (white) culture. Thus, the recommendation for an on-site child development center at the A’s includes provisions for multi-lingual instruction, staff reflective of the community they serve and a culturally relevant approach to education.

The A’s organization must implement a **Racial Equity Department within the Oakland A's** focused on anti-racism and ending anti-black practices within their organization. This should include professional development workshops and training that includes cultural diversity/anti-white supremacy/anti-bias/humility training for ALL A's employees, partners & affiliates.

## Comprehensive Sports Program

### High Priority Recommendations

Comprehensive “sports” program that focuses on the athletic industry in school that could become a "track" in school or follow a cohort model beginning in kindergarten and continuing through 12<sup>th</sup> grade and beyond. Details to include:

- Kindergarten - begin with workouts and nutrition which expands to elementary school, middle school, and high school (connect to internships/training)
- Fund for youth career pathways in sports
- Program at A's that gives students (middle & high school) exposure to upper mgmt. careers across multiple disciplines: financial managers, personal bankers, (beyond traditional sports fields: ball player, coach...), etc.
- Fund for program with focus on exposing students to careers (such as SPARC and Yes Neighbors to Nature, etc.)
- Funding for life skills program (middle schools: cooking, food, finance, etc.)
- Program to have a special emphasis on GIRLS / non-binary individuals



## Low Priority Recommendations

A's sponsor a little league franchise / Babe Ruth league

- Police/public safety officers contribute to little league / sports program (coaching, etc.)

## Workforce Training & Childcare

### High Priority Recommendations

- Fund to provide workforce development training for young people that age out of school or are returning for new skills, and high school graduation completion opportunities
  - funding to include free childcare for trainees
- Fund for vocational training in "tech": coding, internet security
  - keep w/ trends over 66 years, continue to create opportunities for young people in new industries
  - funding to include free childcare for trainees
- Childcare Center at stadium (for ALL staff & employees): initial funding for the build out of dedicated space and ongoing funding for maintenance, operations & programming throughout the 66-year CBA; center to be managed by CBO (see below)
  - instructional/structured play (not like Kid's Zone)
  - childcare center staffing reflects City's racial population, culturally relevant to the community/racial group it serves
  - Oakland CBO/committee to create the childcare curriculum
    - culturally relevant
    - multi-lingual instruction/opportunities
    - free & affordable (sliding scale with salary cap)
- Childcare Center at the residential development (open to residents and all of West Oakland - priority to residents & those living in 94608/94607 zip codes): initial funding for the build out of dedicated space and ongoing funding for maintenance, operations & programming throughout the 66-year CBA; center to be managed by CBO (see below)
  - instructional/structured play (not like Kid's Zone)
  - childcare center staffing reflects City's racial population culturally relevant to the community/racial group it serves
  - Oakland CBO/committee to create the childcare curriculum
  - culturally relevant
  - multi-lingual instruction/opportunities; free & affordable (sliding scale with salary cap)

## Teacher and Support Staff Housing

### High Priority Recommendations

Affordable workforce housing specifically for teachers & all school staff (custodians, social workers, nurses –early childhood, pre-k through 12); rent/lease to ownership program

## Support Programs & Extra Curricular Opportunities

### Medium Priority Recommendations

- Fund an arts and environmental program
- Funding for socio-emotional support/programs offered by CBOS & other service providers for schools (reflective of the students they serve); funding for counseling centers in schools to meet the recommended 1:200 ratio of students to counselors

## Internships & Scholarships

### High Priority Recommendations

- A's franchise provide PAID internship w/ A's & A's ballpark management company (targeted to low-income students, with moderate-income students qualifying as well)
  - develop "fellowships" within the franchise
  - offer pathways for career advancement among the organization
  - A's business program (to address the preceding bullets)
  - during summer / school year for students that meet academic qualifications
- A's partner with employers in enterprises involved in (1) the stadium development process (construction, environmental remediation, etc.), and (2) enterprises involved in the operation of the A's franchise and stadium development to advance (paid) training opportunities (all internships/training: must be mandatory to attend school as well):
  - Example exposure to A's Franchise:
    - "tech" jobs: videography (sports broadcasting), etc.
    - sports medicine / nutrition
    - financial management, etc.
  - Example exposure to businesses occupying stadium development:
    - small businesses (entrepreneurs)
    - arts organizations, etc.

- A's summer job program (across all A's departments)
- College scholarships

## Medium Priority Recommendations

Scholarship for classwork related to early child development such as at Laney College

## Hoover Durant Library & Resource Center

### High Priority Recommendations

Hoover Durant Public Library & Resource Center (initial funding for either the construction of new library or renovation of existing building in West Oakland, and ongoing funding for building maintenance, operations and programming throughout the 66-year CBA):

- “hub” for literacy center: science/art/math
- a Book Mobile program (serve W. Oakland)
- literacy program (including for older students/adults) & w/ volunteers)
- innovative program for ESL diverse language learners
- fund for non-English speaking parental support to help guide their kids through puberty/life transition/high school & beyond “readiness”
- a Food Mobile program (serve W. Oakland)

## Broadband Wifi Infrastructure & Utility Upgrades

### High Priority Recommendations

A's contribute to broadband Wifi infrastructure and utility upgrades & in W. Oakland

### Medium Priority Recommendations

- Fund program to mend the Digital Divide
- Partnership w/ City (or Internet Service Providers, etc.) to provide internet access to all (e.g., program: Oakland UnDivided)

**END OF RECOMMENDATIONS**

## *Education Continued*

### **Opportunity for Future Partnership with Oakland Unified School District (Not Part of CBA Recommendation)**

- Fund professional development workshop/training that includes cultural diversity/anti-white supremacy/anti-bias/humility training for ALL OUSD employees, partners & affiliates: school administrators / teachers / counselors/ all staff
- Fund for OUSD diverse curriculum dept
- Supplement Current OUSD Programs:
  - Fund for mandatory summer school (b/f high school) need LOW RATIO so instructor can identify actual issues 3:1, 5:1
  - Invest in 1) “green academies” (Oakland High, Oak Tech, Skyline High, etc. create this at McClymonds) intentionally guide students to environmental fields as viable career pathways 2) community organizing and social justice work; expands A’s business program based on their experience with CBA
  - Fund for vocational training curriculum
  - Fund existing programs: Oakland’s Restorative Justice and Health & Safety Programs; YEP high school for older youth, etc.
  - Fund Innovative programs to make education relevant and hiring teachers that bring special skills
  - Fund for field trips! nature to nature-type program/camping, etc.
  - Fund Social workers (contract social workers) in the schools (in addition to guidance counselors)
- Assist with the clean-up of groundwater contamination at McClymonds High School (in conjunction with Environmental Cohort)

# Environment Topic Cohort Recommendations

## Categories:

AQ=Air Quality

CC=Climate Change

WO=Walkability and Open Space

\*\*Note that many ideas address more than one category of equity issues.

## Other Topic Cohorts:

T=Transportation

EC=Economic Development

CH=Culture Keeping and History

CH&S=Community Health & Safety

ED=Education

H=Housing

## Group A Proposals (Most Important)

### **Healthy Homes and Healthy Community Organizations Programs (AQ,CC)**

Work with Alameda County to fund expansion of existing Healthy Homes program to improve indoor air quality and energy efficiency of existing homes and address lead exposure issues in the four impacted areas with opportunities for tenant engagement and preventative displacement measures. In addition, provide funding for community organizations and small businesses to replace stationary sources of pollution, improve energy efficiency and conduct community outreach and education. (CH&S, H)

### **Increased Air Quality Monitoring (AQ)**

Fund air quality monitoring in Chinatown and other prime locations in and around the four neighborhoods, particularly near high-pollution areas and/or high density housing and sensitive populations (schools, senior centers). Include high quality air quality monitors at the stadium site and funding to train and employ local people to install and maintain monitoring equipment (EC)

### **Increasing Tree Canopy (AQ,CC,WO)**

Implement the West Oakland Reforestation Plan. Fund a plan of similar scope for the other three neighborhoods. Funds would cover creating/updating the plans, planting and tree maintenance and community engagement in the four neighborhoods for the life of the lease. In addition, establish or support an existing arborist training program in Oakland. (EC, CH&S, ED))

### **Asthma Prevention and Treatment Programs (AQ,CC)**

Provide funding to expand Alameda County Dept. of Public Health's [Asthma Start](#) program to reduce asthma exacerbations, ER visits and hospitalizations. Fund increased outreach and health promotion programs in the four areas and contribute to a community fund to which local organizations working to reduce asthma could apply to support their efforts. Example: [BreatheMobile](#) at [Prescott Joseph Center](#); (CH&S)

### **Climate Resilience Hubs: (CC)**

Build and invest in climate resilience hubs to support residents and provide services during a climate-related crisis. This would include having the A's stadium serve as a publicly accessible facility for emergency response and creating a fund accessible to the four impacted areas to be used in creating a new community facility as a resilience hub and/or upgrading existing facilities in the four impacted areas that otherwise operate daily as community serving facilities.(CH&S, H)

### **Vegetated Buffer Installation (AQ,CC)**

Fund assessment, a pilot project and installation of vegetative buffers in the four neighborhoods adjacent to 880/580/980 (pilot in Prescott/880) to filter and remove air pollution and provide funding to support training and employment of locals to install and maintain the buffers.(EC)

### **Pedestrian Underpass Improvements (WO, AQ, CC)**

Fund the redesign and upgrading of underpasses (in addition to Broadway and Market) to provide safe, well lit, attractive passages for pedestrians to encourage walking. Redesign can include improved lighting, wider sidewalks, pedestrian and cyclist safety improvements, bike lanes, art and murals celebrating cultural history, trash bins and consistent maintenance. The specific underpasses would be determined by local community organizations and Business Improvement Districts. (T, CH)

## **Group B Proposals (Important)**

### **Park Maintenance and Programming (WO)**

Fund needed maintenance, capital improvements and programming at public parks in West Oakland, Old Oakland, and Chinatown, as designated by local community organizations in those neighborhoods.

### **West Oakland Walk (WO, AQ,CC)**

Fund the design of the West Oakland Walk. WOW is a community-generated urban design initiative of proposed pedestrian/bicycle/vehicular/landscaping improvements along a 4.5 mile loop of existing city streets extending from West Oakland's Central Station to the shore of Lake Merritt in Downtown Oakland, reuniting two sectors of the City previously divided by the 980 Freeway. Incorporate some streets/parks in Chinatown. (T, CH&S, CH)

### **GHG Emission Reductions/Offsets (CC,AQ)**

Prioritize required greenhouse gas reductions/offsets in the four neighborhoods. This could include solar installation on rooftops, solar electric vehicle charging stations, West Oakland

bikeshare, tree planting/vegetated buffers, and a community-owned solar grid. (T)

### **Sidewalks and Pedestrian Infrastructure (WO, AQ,CC)**

Improve inadequate sidewalks and pedestrian infrastructure in the four areas to increase walkability. Fund pedestrian safety improvements to the most dangerous streets in the four neighborhoods as determined by the High Injury Network, as well as fund any additional research and community engagement needed to determine the best solutions to protect pedestrians and bicycles. The A's should contribute to funding the City of Oakland's Pedestrian Plan that outlines a strategy for complete streets and targets Communities of Concern. (T, CH&S)

### **Support Port Zero Emission Goals (AQ,CC)**

Funding to support Port Strategy #3 - Infrastructure to Support Zero Emissions, with a focus on creating sufficient charging capacity to support an entirely electrified fleet .Also fund Strategy #5 - stakeholder engagement. (T)

## **Group C Proposals (Less Important)**

### **Mitigate Impacts of Sea Level Rise (CC)**

Address sea level rise impacts on low lying areas including: design stormwater and sewage systems to not impact existing neighborhoods; invest in sewer infrastructure upgrades; build protective infrastructure (seawall, etc.) as a part of the new development area; promote home & Insurance that covers water damage; invest in wetland restoration and preservation.

### **Green Building Standards (CC,AQ)**

Meet green building priorities/standards in the project area by including greywater systems & water conservation in the design and going beyond LEED certification at the Stadium and the whole project area. (H)

### **Air Quality Research (AQ)**

Talk to experts about what air quality research is needed that can benefit the four areas and fund the most pressing needs. Fund community engagement research.

### **Trash/Litter Clean Up (WO)**

Hire or fund a full-time team of "ambassadors" (similar to Business Improvement District teams) -- prioritizing local hiring -- to clean parks, sidewalks, and public places in the four neighborhoods away from the immediate stadium area. Require A's to pick up trash within ¼ mile of stadium on game/event days. (EC, CH&S)

### **Increased Street Sweeping (AQ)**

Provide funding to upgrade Public Works street sweeping trucks to increase efficacy of removing toxic air contaminants and fund increased street sweeping on the most affected streets in the four area. (CH&S)

# Housing Topic Cohort Recommendations

*Results of Consensus Building Process, July 29-August 5, 2020*

## **Goal of Housing:**

1. The overall desire of affordable housing for HT is to develop as many affordable units as possible.

## **Onsite/Offsite**

2. The HT developers should seek to provide the most affordable units possible in conjunction with this project. Any onsite housing should have a minimum 35% of units reserved as affordable housing. Additional housing off-site will be supported through the investment fund [mentioned below].

## **Affordability**

3. Of the total affordable units, 20% shall be reserved for households earning 20-30% AMI, while the rest of the units shall be reserved for households earning 60% AMI or below.

## **Unit Mix**

4. The unit mix will consist of 25% of the units should be 3-bedrooms and at least 50% should be studios and 1-bedrooms

## **Preservation of Housing for Low Income Populations to Remain in Existing Housing**

5. Howard Terminal developers should fund an investment fund for land trusts or nonprofits to purchase non-regulated, housing to stabilize these properties as permanent affordable housing.

## **Longevity/Commitment**

6. All affordable units, whether in stand-alone developments or included within market-rate projects shall be regulated at the defined income levels for at least 55 years.

## **Location**

7. Affordable housing to be constructed in close proximity to Howard Terminal, within the Areas of Focus as defined for the Community Benefits Agreement.

## **Prioritize Build**

8. Affordable housing be built concurrently with the market rate housing.



## **Home Ownership/Affordability**

9. Affordable homeownership of onsite units targeting 60-100% AMI.

## **City/Port/Oakland A's Participation**

10. The City, Port, and the As will designate a minimum \$50 Million dollar investment fund to design, purchase, construct, expand, improve, seismically retrofit, or rehabilitate single or multi-family homes to provide ownership opportunities for long-time West Oakland residents and a "right of return" for displaced long-time West Oakland residents.

## **Tenant Protections:**

11. Howard Terminal developers should honor all existing and future tenant protection measures such as just cause eviction, nondiscrimination on criminal background or Section 8 program.

12. Howard Terminal developers should fund tenant protection services such as legal aid, and tenant support centers.

## **Supportive Services:**

13. There should be supportive services for special populations who have experienced or are currently experiencing homelessness and mental health/substance abuse issues.

## **Priority Populations**

14. All of the populations below are identified as priority.

- longtime and displaced West Oakland residents (full consensus)
- Older black men and single black mothers
- disabled
- formerly incarcerated
- foster youth
- working low income
- seniors
- Undocumented

## **HT and Other Developers**

15. Howard Terminal developers (successors and partners) should provide assistance to low income homeowners to stay in their homes. *(Note – also a reference in the CBA Principles document.)*

## **Blacks in Housing Construction**

16. The Housing Cohort shall include in its recommendations that Developer shall employ black general contractors, subcontractors, and workers for housing construction at the maximum level and/or develop programs to guarantee such contracts and jobs for and by blacks. In addition, Developer shall employ black-

owned management, maintenance, grounds, and other relevant companies upon completion of the housing to maintain the development, as well as hiring blacks for other, related jobs.

**Green Building Standards**

17. The Developer shall guarantee that the design and construction of housing shall be at the highest environmental standard, with LEED (Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design) Platinum certification.

# Transportation Topic Cohort Recommendations

PEDESTRIAN SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS	
Weight	Recommendation
2.6	<b>Pedestrian Experience Improvement:</b> Improve the pedestrian experience from City Center to HT, from Chinatown to HT, etc.; for example, the Chinatown Gate, by improving underpasses along Broadway as a priority and the others as secondary. Improvements may include providing tree canopies, well-lit underpasses, and murals while ensuring hostile architecture is not incorporated into design.
2.2	<b>Traffic Studies Funding:</b> Fund study of how to redirect traffic in the impacted areas, starting with the highest number of pedestrian fatalities.
2.1	<b>Additional Pedestrian Walkway(s):</b> Add at least one more pedestrian walkway near railroad tracks
2.0	<b>Pedestrian Scrambles:</b> Pedestrian scrambles at intersections with highest pedestrian fatalities.
1.7	<b>Slow Streets Funding:</b> Fund a Slow Streets study for pilot and long-term implementation.
1.6	<b>Road Diet Implementation:</b> Implement a road diet/reduction of the number of lanes on streets that are parallel to freeways.

RESIDENTIAL PARKING PERMITS & ENFORCEMENT	
Weight	Recommendation
2.4	<b>Residential Parking Permits:</b> Pay for RPPs within ~1.5 mile radius (within impacted areas) from HT
2.4	<b>Parking Enforcement Funding:</b> Pay for robust parking enforcement of cars and trucks who park in residential areas. The enforcement officers should be non-police traffic enforcement officers.
2.3	<b>Additional Enforcement Non-Police Officers:</b> If TMP is inadequate then CBA provides funding for additional enforcement officers.

TRANSIT ROUTES	
Weight	Recommendation
2.9	<b>Preferred Shuttle:</b> Build preferred shuttle route and pick-up points from West Oakland Walk at 14th & 18th points that cross 980 year-round
2.6	<b>Transit Routes Funding &amp; Implementation:</b> Fund \$200k for transit only routes in Oakland. Funding should cover a study/analysis to determine where transit only lanes should be and their implementation. Transit and protected bicycle only lanes should be on Washington & 9th to the Lake Merritt station.
2.3	<b>Transit and Protected Bicycle-Only Lanes:</b> Provide for transit and protected bicycle-only lanes beyond what is required on Broadway.
2.1	<b>Transit Routes Designations:</b> Designate commercial transit routes from public routes.
1.6	<b>Raised Transit Routes:</b> Northern transit routes that cross over the railroad tracks should be raised (the same way 9th St was raised over Broadway many years ago)

BICYCLES	
Weight	Recommendation
2.4	<b>Bicycles, Maintenance, and Repairs:</b> Provide free bicycles, maintenance and repairs, to at least 1,000 families who reside in the impacted areas that have a need for them but are financially challenged.
2.3	<b>Bicycle Entrepreneurialism:</b> Provide support/capital/seed money to entrepreneurial hubs for local residents to provide bike repairs/etc. services.
2.2	<b>Bicycle Lockers:</b> Provide bicycle lockers
2.1	<b>Bicycle Repair Classes:</b> Provide free bike repair classes for women, queer, non-gender conforming, elder, etc.
2.1	<b>Bicycle Accessories:</b> Provide bike accessories, such as bike trailers, repair tools, helmets, etc.
1.8	<b>Bicycle Education:</b> Provide free bike education in schools and libraries with a dedicated curriculum, such as Bike for Life

TRUCKS	
Weight	Recommendation
2.8	<b>Truck Parking Structures Designation:</b> Provide permanent truck parking by Designating specific parking structures for trucks. (Port of Oakland).
2.7	<b>Truck Electrification:</b> Provide electrification for trucks and provide charging stations for trucks.

PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION	
Weight	Recommendation
2.7	<b>Free or Subsidized Public Transportation:</b> Provide free or subsidized public transportation for all residents from the impacted areas (Chinatown, Jack London District, Old Oakland, West Oakland) by offering monthly \$200 Clipper cards
2.7	<b>Public Transportation Investments:</b> Support existing public transportation and increase the frequency and efficiency of public transit to achieve a maximum of 15-minute headways for all transit routes, starting with increased public transportation on Adeline by providing an area-wide shuttle service to get around WO better and complement/enhance AC Transit's routes where there may be gaps; connect shuttle routes to bus routes; connector routes;
2.7	<b>Continuous Transportation Benefits Development:</b> Fund and develop transportation studies and an ongoing community-oriented task force that will use the studies to create and implement a megahood plan that focuses on integrating transportation systems in WO, OO, JL, and Chinatown by continuously developing transportation benefits in response to changing circumstances and new data that captures transportation safety, equity, and efficiency within the impacted areas. Studies may include analyzing alternative transportation modes that reduce the existing traffic and parking demand in the region so that the community will not be adversely impacted by the traffic and parking that spills out anyway.
2.6	<b>Electrified On-Demand Mini-Shuttle:</b> Fund and develop electrified on-demand mini-shuttle service and offer subsidies for low-income residents.
2.5	<b>Year-Round WO Bart Shuttle:</b> Provide a free year-round shuttle from WO Bart (see Transit Route Item #4)
2.44	<b>Emery Go-Round Extension:</b> Extend the Emery go-round to West Oakland and Jack London
2.4	<b>Public Transportation for Ticket Holders:</b> Public transportation covered for ticket holders
2.3	<b>AC Transit Revamp:</b> Fund ACT fleet revamp to all electric vehicles, beginning with the service routes in impacted areas
2.3	<b>Real-time Transit Website and App:</b> Offer a website and app that lists real time transit options to get to the ballpark and a data service/(API) that is publicly available. Display the data on real-time signage at shuttle stops, WOW, etc.

TRASH	
Weight	Recommendation
3.0	<b>Community Beautification and Maintenance:</b> Provide funding to maintain and enhance the beautification of the neighborhood by community members, organizations, and/or existing agency operations.
2.6	<b>Additional Trash Receptacles:</b> The A's shall provide additional trash receptacles in the vicinity of the project, including receptacles located in nearby residential areas and the cost to retrieve the trash on designated days. Receptacles can be branded/sponsored. Trash picked up after every game by _____
2.1	<b>"No Litter" Campaign:</b> Have a "No Litter" Campaign, which will address security issues and the concerns of trash disposal and community safety in residential areas surrounding the Project.

MISCELLANEOUS	
Weight	Recommendations
2.8	<b>Community Benefits Improvement District:</b> Fund the creation of a Community Benefits Improvement District (transportation, parking, etc.) to which the A's and the City would contribute to existing local parking structures whose revenues would supplement A's funding for aforementioned items
2.5	<b>Community Task Force Funding:</b> Fund task force for ongoing community engagement regarding transportation improvements and ensure they are given tools to make educated decisions.
2.5	<b>Residential Electrical Vehicle Upgrade Program:</b> Fund an electric vehicle upgrade program for residents in the impacted areas
2.3	<b>West Oakland Walk:</b> Provide financial support to finalize the West Oakland Walk design.
2.1	<b>Transportation Economic Incubator:</b> Add economic development incubator that provides seed money for transportation improvements
2.1	<b>Pedi-Cabs:</b> Sponsoring pedi-cabs and other community entrepreneurial transportation innovations
2.0	<b>Sound-Proof Tube Wrapping for WO BART Station:</b> Fund sound-proof tube wrapping for WO BART station
2.0	<b>Satellite Container Storage:</b> Provide satellite container storage and truck (and rail) loading areas connected to the Port with automated rail, to reduce the parking and <b>pollution burden</b> on West Oakland. This could be aided by a joint venture Regional Port Authority with the Port Authorities of Oakland, Richmond, and Stockton.

# ***NOTES***