



Privacy Advisory Commission
April 5, 2018 5:00 PM
Oakland City Hall
Hearing Room 1
1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, 3rd Floor
Meeting Minutes

Commission Members: *District 1 Representative: Reem Suleiman, District 2 Representative: Chloe Brown, District 3 Representative: Brian M. Hofer, District 4 Representative: Lou Katz, District 5 Representative: Raymundo Jacquez III, District 6 Representative: Clint M. Johnson, District 7 Representative: Robert Oliver, Council At-Large Representative: Saied R. Karamooz, Mayoral Representative: Heather Patterson*

Each person wishing to speak on items must fill out a speaker's card. Persons addressing the Privacy Advisory Commission shall state their names and the organization they are representing, if any.

1. 5:00pm: Call to Order, determination of quorum

The meeting was called to order at 6:05. Members present: Hofer, Brown, Katz, Jaquez, Karamooz, Patterson. Members Absent: Suleiman, Johnson, Oliver.

2. 5:05pm: Review and approval of February meeting minutes

The minutes were approved with one minor correction to item 6.

3. 5:10pm: Open Forum

There were no Open Forum Speakers.

4. 5:15pm: Introduction of new commissioners

Members Chloe Brown who is the new appointee for District 2 and Heather Patterson who is the new appointee for the Mayor's Office had the opportunity to introduce themselves and share their motivation to be part of the Commission.

5. 5:20pm: Presentation by UC Berkeley School of Information – CRIMS Privacy Assessment. Possible Action – Accept report; make recommendations to the City Council.

Kimberly Fong and Steve Trush presented an overview of their report which carefully studied the Consolidated Records Information Management System maintained by Alameda County. Their findings indicated two major areas of concern: data sharing and the governance structure of CRIMS. The recommendations (included in the report in full) include developing a closer collaboration with Alameda County to determine data access issues, an assessment of the City's own Records Management System and how it interacts with CRIMS, and adding MOUs regarding data sharing to the soon to pass Surveillance Technology Ordinance.

6. 5:45pm: Review and take possible action on Sanctuary City Contracting Ordinance

The Commission reviewed the revised draft ordinance and approved it to be recommended to the City Council unanimously.

7. 5:55pm: Review and take possible action on Cell Site Simulator Annual Report

The Commission adopted a motion to accept the annual report and found the current uses to be valid.

8. 6:10pm: Community Inquiry into Landlord Tax Audit/Business Revenue Data Requests (presentation by Strauss, Keenan). Possible Action – make recommendations to the City Council.

Jonah Strauss of the Oakland Warehouse Coalition and David Keenan of Make Safe DIY Spaces presented their concern with a Citywide Audit of Commercial Landlords that was being conducted. The provided documentation displaying that the audit asks landlords to provide information about their commercial tenants that they find to be a violation of the tenants' privacy. They are concerned that in the wake of the Ghostship Fire, this effort is designed to cause the eviction of artists living in unpermitted commercial warehouses. They also raised concern that the City was not willing to provide them with a list of all landlords who received such a notice.

Joe DeVries told the Commission that the audit was developed in the wake of the Ghostship Fire but was one of several actions taken by the City after realizing that systems were not necessarily communicating with each other and there were gaps in information. Specific to this audit; it was sent to landlords who were paying taxes on commercial property but no business license existed on file for the address. This indicates a business operating without a license which is a violation. He also stated that the City would not provide the list of audited businesses as that information is protected.

The Commission decided to table any action on this item to a future meeting where a staff member from the Treasury Department could answer operational questions.