

West
Oakland

TRUCK
MANAGEMENT
PLAN

APPENDIX F

Public Engagement Program

A joint plan by the
City of Oakland and
Port of Oakland



PORT OF OAKLAND



**CITY OF
OAKLAND**



MEMORANDUM – PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT PROGRAM

West Oakland Truck Management Plan

To: Amy Tharpe/Port of Oakland
From: Laura Arreola/Port of Oakland
Date: November 1, 2018

This memorandum describes the City and Port’s strategies and public participation activities to engage, seek input and advice, and respond to input from West Oakland residents, workers, businesses, community groups/neighborhood/business organizations, trucking businesses, under-represented community members, and other stakeholders regarding the impact of trucks serving the Port and the former OAB on local streets and neighborhoods and potential solutions to avoid, minimize, or mitigate those impacts.

OVERVIEW

At the inception of the planning process, beginning in July 2017, City and Port staff envisioned that West Oakland community, residents, workers, businesses, and other stakeholders, including trucking businesses, would participate in the planning process to help create and inform the West Oakland Truck Management Plan (TMP). A draft public engagement plan (see Attachment A) was prepared to help guide the public participation process in using best practices and to provide a road map for involving stakeholders in the planning process from the beginning and to provide multiple ongoing opportunities for input in the decision-making process including on the final TMP document. As part of this process, stakeholders receive direct feedback from the City and the Port on how their input helped to influence the TMP. To support public participation in the West Oakland TMP, the Port and the City have retained a professional communications strategy and community engagement consultant, Envirocom Communications, LLC (Envirocom), to facilitate the community meetings and to assist in the design and implementation of public participation and outreach.

PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT APPROACH

The overall approach for public engagement is based on a series of large community meetings or workshops. The first set of meetings provided a level of education about the TMP and a planning framework, and each meeting served to build on the next with the idea that creating the Plan is a continual process to further refine TMP goals, objectives, and strategies until the Plan is developed. The desired outcome of engagement methods is for the TMP to be informed by community input as well as to have a more educated and informed community base who are willing and prepared to participate and inform relevant public agencies.



The following is a summary of each workshop and the overall objectives of each one. Meeting materials and summaries are available on the project website: www.oaklandca.gov/topics/west-oakland-truck-management-plan.

- Workshop #1: "Learning"
 - Description: The meeting included a brief overview of the issues at hand, followed by a breakout session where participants gathered in smaller groups to discuss their views, raise issues and questions.
 - Time and Location: Wednesday, October 11, 2017, 6:00 p.m. – 8:30 p.m. at Taylor Memorial United Methodist Church, 1188 12th Street, Oakland.
- Workshop #2: "Observing and Exploring"
 - Description: This was a mobile workshop. We drove participants around West Oakland in minivans looking at problems and issues related to trucks that were identified in the first community workshop.
 - Time and Location: Saturday, December 2, 2017, 10:00 a.m. – 1:00 p.m. at City Slicker Farms, 2847 Peralta Street, Oakland.
- Workshop #3: "Sharing"
 - Description: Discussed and prioritized as a community the issues, reviewed survey results and technical data.
 - Time and Location: Saturday, April 7, 2018, 10:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m. at West Oakland Senior Center, 1724 Adeline Street, Oakland.
- Workshop #4: "Co-Creating"
 - Description: Presentation of draft solutions for public discussion. Further defined the elements of the TMP.
 - Time and Location: Wednesday, July 18, 2018, 6:00 p.m. – 8:30 p.m. at West Oakland Senior Center, 1724 Adeline Street, Oakland.
- Workshop #5: "Joining Together"
 - Description: Presentation of draft Plan and Implementation Actions.
 - Time and Location: Proposed for November 2018. The specific day and time to be determined; tentatively assumed to be a weeknight approximately 6:00 p.m. – 8:00 p.m. at a location in West Oakland to be determined.

Prior to launching the series of workshops, between July through October 2017, the TMP community engagement consultant, Envirocom, held one-on-one consultations with stakeholders representing resident, business, community-based organizations (“CBOs”), and trucking interests to obtain their input on the design of the engagement process, to identify issues and topics of concern, and to incorporate their recommendations into the engagement process (see Attachment B).

In addition to the large format community workshops, there have been consultations with CBOs, existing community advisory forums, regulatory and public agencies, and other stakeholders throughout



the process by the TMP project team. This type of outreach serves to build on the input received through the public workshops and increase participation of West Oakland residents, workers, and businesses.

List of Community Based organizations and advisory forums that TMP project staff conducted outreach:

- West Oakland Commerce Association/Biz Alert
- West Oakland Community Advisory Group
- West Oakland Community Collaborative
- West Oakland Health Council
- Truckers Work Group
- Seaport Air Quality 2020 & Beyond Task Force
- City of Oakland Quarterly Stakeholder Meetings

Additionally, Port and City staff are conducting outreach to members of the public using the following best practices.

- Using a wide range of media, including e-mail, newsletters, social media platforms (Oakland City Facebook and Twitter, and Port Facebook);
- Electronic newsletters from District 3 Councilmember, City's Oakland Economy Now, and Port of Oakland;
- Advertisements in local and ethnic publications and their social media platforms;
- Providing information that is easy to understand through announcements, posters, postcards, information sheets, and related project materials; and
- Providing information that is easy to access at public libraries, neighborhood community centers, and on the City's public website.

As the planning and public participation process was underway, new community-based research related to truck activities in West Oakland was made available. The West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project (WOEIP) requested that TMP project staff incorporate the newly available research to inform the plan document. As a result, TMP project staff participated in an Earth Day educational workshop led by WOEIP on the new research. Additionally, staff from the City and the Port are participating in the West Oakland Steering Committee associated with the Community Air Protection Program (Assembly Bill 617) for the purpose of providing information and input related to the TMP into the proposed Community Air Protection Program being led by WOEIP and the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD).

PUBLIC INPUT

TMP project staff logged input received throughout the planning process in a spreadsheet (see the Stakeholder Comments Spreadsheet appendix to the TMP) and categorized them by their issue area and corresponding potential solution(s). The spreadsheet includes written and verbal comments received at the workshops, as well as comments received from other engagement approaches (for example, following a presentation at the Biz Alert meeting in August, 2018). The spreadsheet is a tool



for building the initial draft plan document and related implementation program. Additionally, it is used to communicate with participants on how their input was used to inform the TMP. At each workshop, a summary of the community input to date was provided to participants.

OUTCOMES OF THE TMP OUTREACH

Key data on the outcomes of the outreach efforts are provided below.

West Oakland TMP Workshops				
	Workshop 1	Workshop 2	Workshop 3	Workshop 4
Attendance	RSVP: 67 Attendees: 37	RSVP: 56 Attendees: 39	RSVP: 52 Attendees: 33	RSVP: 42 Attendees: 31
Attendee Affiliation	54% of survey respondents are residents Other affiliations include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Work or own a business in W.O. • Truck Driver/Trucking entity • Public agency representative 	65% of survey respondents are residents Other affiliations include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Work or own a business in W.O. • Truck Driver/Trucking entity • Public agency representative 	39% of survey respondents are residents Other affiliations include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Work or own a business in W.O. • Truck Driver/Trucking entity • Public agency representative 	42% of survey respondents are residents Other affiliations include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Work or own a business in W.O. • Truck Driver/Trucking entity • Public agency representative
Demographic Percentage of Attendees	68% of survey respondents identify in the category of People of Color	61% of survey respondents identify in the category of People of Color	42% of survey respondents identify in the category of People of Color	32% of survey respondents identify in the category of People of Color
Primary Languages of Attendees	English & Spanish*	English & Spanish*	English, Spanish, Japanese, Russian*	English, Japanese, Arabic*
*Staff received no requests for interpretation, translation, or language services for this meeting.				

Challenges in our outreach:

- Consistent resident-based participation in the planning process



Achieving our targets:

- As an outcome of outreach and public participation process, we received a large number of comments regarding the scope of the TMP and desired solutions.
- A diverse range of stakeholders participated in the planning process.
 - Diversity of stakeholders: participation from residents, business owners, workers, community organizations, public sector organizations

Listing of workshop participants (by entity):

Alameda County Public Health Department
Bay Area Air Quality Management District
BayPorte Village Neighborhood Watch
Cal EPA
Caltrans District 4
Capella Space
City Slicker Farms
CTS Tires & Recycling
Ditching Dirty Diesel
DockTime
EarthJustice
East Bay Times
Environmental Defense Fund
Flexi-Van Leasing, Inc
Hodo Soy
Jennifer Webber Public Affairs
Marcus & Lillichap, local developer
Meals on Wheels of Alameda County
Mutual Express Company
NCTAT
O2AA
Office of Alameda County Supervisor Keith Carson, D5
Office of Congresswoman Barbara Lee, D13
Office of Oakland City Councilmember McElhane, D3
Oakland Maritime Support Services (OMSS)
Prescott-Oakland Point Neighborhood Association
West Oakland Neighborhood Career Center
Schnitzer Steel
State Farm Insurance
The Labor Compliance Managers
Thermo Fisher Scientific



Union Street Studio
US EPA
Viridis
West Oakland Commerce Association
West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project
West Oakland Health Center
West Oakland Jobs Resource Center
West Oakland Neighbors

ADJUSTMENTS TO OUTREACH ACTIVITIES

The TMP team evaluated stakeholder participation on an ongoing basis to identify opportunities to improve outreach. Specific adjustments made include the following activities.

- Increased outreach to existing community forums (WOCAG, WO Biz Alert, West Oakland Community Collaborative) by providing mini-versions of TMP public workshops.
- Launched surveys to reach more trucking/truck driver stakeholders.
- Published editorials in ethnic and local publications (Oakland Post, Vision Hispana, Sing Tao Daily) to continue to inform stakeholders and reach new ones. Editorials are an alternative to the traditional methods (e.g. meeting announcements, email, advertisements).
- Launched surveys to reach more West Oakland based residents and businesses, in association with the editorials.



Public Engagement Plan **for Development of the West Oakland Truck Management Plan**

Prepared by: Patricia McGowan, City of Oakland
Environmental Coordinator for the Oakland Army Base project;
Laura Arreola, Port of Oakland, Community Affairs;
and Andrea Gardner, Port of Oakland, Environmental Programs and Planning
July 31, 2018

1.0 Introduction

This Public Engagement Plan for Development of the West Oakland Truck Management Plan (“PEP”) has been prepared by the City of Oakland (“City”) and the Port of Oakland (“Port”) in order to: inform and consult with the public for development of a West Oakland Truck Management Plan (“TMP”); enhance the City’s and the Port’s dialogue with residents, businesses, and truck drivers; provide effective ways to receive and incorporate input and recommendations regarding the effects of trucks on local streets, residential neighborhoods, and businesses in West Oakland; and comply with Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 which states that “no person in the United States shall, on the grounds of race, color, or national origin, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance.”

This PEP outlines the City’s and the Port’s strategies and actions to engage minority and limited-English proficient (“LEP”) populations and all others who live or work in West Oakland so that they have full, fair, and meaningful access to authentically participate in the preparation of the TMP. Authentic participation means that the engagement is two-way and meaningful. At times, the community members will be engaged in a manner to provide input to the TMP; at other times, they will be engaged to receive information.

This PEP has been developed by the City and the Port with input from: community based organizations and businesses in West Oakland; the US Department of Transportation Office of Civil Rights; and Envirocom Communications Strategies, LLC. In addition, input has been obtained from interviews and meetings with numerous City and Port departments, including: the Mayor’s Office of Community

Engagement; City Administrator's Department of Race and Equity; City Council District 3; Oakland Department of Planning and Building; Oakland Department of Economic and Workforce Development; Project Delivery of Oakland Public Works; and Port of Oakland departments of Environmental Programs and Planning, Social Responsibility, and Government Affairs. Finally, this PEP was influenced by the City's and the Port's review of PEPs from other public agencies.

2.0 Background of the West Oakland Truck Management Plan

2.1 Scope of the West Oakland Truck Management Plan

The scope of the West Oakland TMP is described in Mitigation Measure 4.3-7 of the Standard Conditions of Approval/Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program ("SCA/MMRP") for the Oakland Army Base (OAB) Redevelopment Project, adopted by the Board of Port Commissioners in 2012 and the Oakland City Council in July 2013. It states: ***The City and the Port shall continue and shall work together to create a truck management plan designed to reduce the effects of transport trucks on local streets.*** In this case, "transport trucks" means the trucks serving the Port of Oakland and the trucks that will serve the facilities that will be built at the former Oakland Army Base.

The TMP is intended to: reduce the effects from circulation and parking by trucks serving the Port and the former OAB on local streets, residential neighborhoods, and businesses in West Oakland; improve communication with the trucking community about where trucks are and are not allowed to drive and park; increase safety near truck routes; and build community knowledge about trucks serving the Port, the former OAB, and the industrial businesses in West Oakland. The TMP will build on the Comprehensive Truck Management Plan ("CTMP") developed by the Port in 2009.

The TMP will contain a planning framework and an implementation approach.

- Planning framework: Identification of issues, analysis, options, and recommendations for the following:
 - Truck Movement and Safety
 - Truck Parking
 - Signage and Communication
 - Enforcement
- Implementation approach: Strategies will be identified along with specific actions, general costs, funding options, responsible agency(ies), and timing.

In addition to Mitigation Measure 4.3-7, the SCA/MMRP adopted by the City Council contains Mitigation Measure Public Outreach 1 (MM PO-1), which outlines a public review process for certain plans, including the TMP. MM PO-1 requires a 45-day announcement prior to release of the draft TMP and a minimum 17-day review period of the draft TMP. The requirements of MM PO-1 will be adhered to and integrated into the overall project schedule for the TMP.

2.2 Guiding Principles and Goals of this Public Engagement Plan

Public participation for the TMP will involve stakeholders in the planning process from the beginning and will provide multiple ongoing opportunities for input in the decision-making process. Public participation principles include the following.

- The Port and the City will consult with community-based organizations, including the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project, on outreach activities related to new research and data on trucks in West Oakland. Additionally, new research and data will serve to inform the TMP.
- The desired outcome of engagement methods is for the TMP to be informed by community input as well as to have a more educated and informed community base who are willing and prepared to participate and inform relevant public agencies.
- The public will have access to the decision process and decision makers; will be provided the opportunity to give input throughout the process, including on the final TMP document; and will receive direct feedback on how their input helped to influence the TMP.

The goals of the PEP are derived directly from the guiding principles:

- To be inclusive: to actively facilitate the involvement of the West Oakland community, especially racial and ethnic groups and people that are traditionally hard to reach.
- To consult: to work jointly with the community throughout the development of the TMP; to receive input on priorities, issues, concerns, opportunities, and possible solutions from the people who live or work in the areas most impacted by trucks; and to discuss options, test out ideas, and find solutions.
- To be responsive: to use public input to develop an effective TMP which contains specific actions to address the problems.
- To disseminate: to build a common baseline of knowledge among the community and policy makers about trucks serving the Port and the former OAB; to share with the public the scope and rationale for the TMP and how it fits into the City's and the Port's mitigation program for development of the OAB.

3.0 Approach for Public Engagement Plan for the development of the Truck Management Plan

The overall approach for public engagement is based on a series of public information, consultation, and public participation activities to engage, seek input and advice, and respond to input from West Oakland residents, workers, businesses, community groups/neighborhood/business organizations, trucking businesses, under-represented community members, and other stakeholders regarding the impact of trucks serving the Port and the former OAB on local streets and neighborhoods and potential solutions to avoid, minimize, or mitigate those impacts. City and Port staff will organize and oversee this process.

Consultation with community based organizations (“CBO’s”) and other stakeholders will occur throughout the process to promote equity and reach out to under-represented communities; to help design the public engagement process before and during public workshops; to advise on revising the public engagement if needed during the process; and to develop draft recommendations.

The following sections provide more detail on the approach to be used to implement the PEP.

3.1 Project Area and Affected Communities

- a. Based on public input throughout the numerous planning processes regarding Port and OAB development since 2000, the area impacted by trucks on local streets is defined geographically as: West Oakland between I-880 and I-980 to the west and east, respectively, and I-580 and I-880 to the north and south, respectively; plus, the industrial portion of Jack London Square (“JLS”) between I-880 and the Embarcadero, west of Martin Luther King Jr. Way.
- b. Demographic data for West Oakland is shown in Table 1 below, along with demographic data for the City of Oakland and Alameda County. The data is from the 2015 American Community Survey for Alameda County, Oakland, and West Oakland. The West Oakland data is composed of the following 13 census tracts: 4014, 4015, 4016, 4017, 4018, 4022, 4024, 4025, 4026, 4027, 4105, 9819, and 9820.

Table 1. Demographic Data for West Oakland (13 Census Tracts) and Surrounding Areas

2015 Census Estimates	West Oakland 2015 Estimates	Oakland 2015 Estimates	Alameda County 2015 Estimates
Population:	26,061	408,073	1,584,983
Race			
Caucasian	19.8%	26.9%	33.0%
African American	45.3%	25.4%	11.3%
Asian	12.6%	16.0%	27.5%
Hispanic	16.1%	26.1%	22.6%
Pacific Islander	0.5%	0.6%	0.8%
Native American	0.7%	0.4%	0.3%
Two or more races	5.0%	4.6%	4.4%
Housing Units	11,495	171,087	589,858
Owner-occupied	20.6%	36.8%	50.0% 294,644
Renter-Occupied	69.7%	55.8%	44.8% 264,263
Vacant	9.6%	7.4%	5.2% 30,951
Median Income	\$18,589	\$56,589	\$75,619
% of families at or below poverty	32.90%	19.8%	12.5%
Educational Attainment for residents age 25+			
High School	17,659 38.6%	255,467 27.7	1,013,784 16.8%

Table 1. Demographic Data for West Oakland (13 Census Tracts) and Surrounding Areas

2015 Census Estimates	West Oakland 2015 Estimates	Oakland 2015 Estimates	Alameda County 2015 Estimates
College w/o degree	33.7%	21.7	12.9%
College with degree	27.7%	50.6	34.2%
Language Spoken ¹			
English Only	69.4%	60.5%	56.5%
Spanish Only	6.1%	10.8%	7.4%
Chinese	5.8%	5.3%	4.9%

1. Primary language spoken at home

3.2 Racial Impact Analysis

- a. The census data for West Oakland show that approximately 80% of the population of West Oakland is comprised of people of color, including African Americans, Hispanics, and Asians, compared to approximately 73% in Oakland and 67% in Alameda County.
- b. The census data show that approximately 70% of West Oakland residents are renters, which is a notably higher percentage than throughout the City of Oakland and Alameda County.
- c. The census data show that the median income of residents of West Oakland is approximately one-third of the median income for City of Oakland residents and about one-quarter of the median income for Alameda County residents.
- d. Based on this census data, the outreach will be designed to prioritize reaching the African American, Hispanic, and Asian residents of West Oakland. It will also be focused on effectively reaching low income residents and renters.

3.3 Racial and Social Equity Outcomes

- a. The public engagement process will help strengthen relationships, understanding, and respect between the City and the Port and the West Oakland communities.
- b. The TMP will improve the physical environment in West Oakland by reducing the physical effects on the community of trucks serving the Port and serving the facilities to be built on City and Port property at the former OAB. To do this, the existing physical conditions will be documented to the extent data is readily available and input about these impacts will be sought from the people who live and work in West Oakland, especially from African American, Hispanic, and Asian residents/workers.
- c. The public engagement process will inform how the TMP will prioritize action items for reducing impacts from Port and OAB trucks on the areas of West Oakland where the impacts are the most significant on African American, Hispanic, and Asian residents/workers.

3.4 Best Practices to be used in this Public Engagement Process

A range of best practices are available that can be used in the public engagement process; some of these options are listed below. The Port and the City will identify and implement applicable and appropriate public engagement practices at each stage of the development of the TMP. The public engagement processes could include some of the following practices.

- a. Clearly identify the problems/issues the community is coming together to solve.
- b. Clearly identify the decisions that community insights will influence.
- c. Consult with CBOs regarding the design of the engagement process and incorporate their recommendations into the engagement process.
- d. Use outreach strategies that are varied and tailored to meet the needs of the area by meeting people where they are and when they are available and using outreach staff that can communicate effectively with the various communities of the area.
- e. Use a variety of potential methods to get the word out; for example, online/social media; through publications; through public repositories (e.g., libraries and community centers); through CBOs and their outreach methods; and attending CBO meetings and other public meetings.
- f. Use newspapers that are specific to the cultural groups and LEP populations of the affected area.
- g. Use a variety of engagement methods: public meetings and events, individual meetings with community leaders and groups, targeted interviews, and surveys.
- h. Start the broad range of engagement methods early; do not wait for the public meetings. Start early with multiple ways for communicating and for providing input.
- i. Provide a variety of methods to accept input, such as online, email, telephone, letters, and meetings.
- j. Remove barriers to participating in the engagement process and create a welcoming environment. This includes accommodating the languages of the stakeholders and removing barriers to participation, such as location, time, transportation, childcare, inaccessibility, and power dynamics.
- k. Informational materials should have graphics, use minimal text, and use simple language.
- l. Informational materials should be distributed at locations frequented by local residents and businesses.
- m. Use technology (e-mail, social media, apps, and websites) appropriately and as a supplement to other outreach.
- n. Ensure that outreach to CBOs includes a broad range of groups representing diverse participants and viewpoints.

- o. Evaluate periodically if the public engagement is working by assessing, not only the number of participants, but also their diversity; adjust the engagement as necessary.
- p. Summarize input and key themes and share them with decision makers.
- q. Acknowledge receipt of input and comments, ask follow-up questions, give input serious consideration and follow-up, and respond to suggestions by showing how input and comments were incorporated or explaining why they were not.
- r. Build relationships and maintain contact with the community and report back throughout the process, for example by maintaining a list of stakeholders who have made comments or expressed interest and ensuring they receive information on an ongoing basis.

3.5 Public Outreach Tools/Activities & Engagement Methods

There is no simple solution or one size fits all approach to identifying an effective engagement method. The project team is consulting with CBOs and with key stakeholders regarding the best ways to engage, communicate with, and receive input from the people affected by transport trucks. To be most effective, there will be a range of complementary methods so that we engage a wide range of stakeholders and make the planning efforts as accessible as possible. The Port and the City will identify applicable and appropriate outreach methods for the TMP, which may include the following.

- a. Public workshops.
- b. Community and business surveys, questionnaires, and polls.
- c. Community forums and events, such as CBOs and other local neighborhood, resident, and business associations.
- d. Internet-based engagement.
 - i. Dedicated webpage for the TMP, including schedule of events
 - ii. Announcements via City and Port websites and social media
 - iii. Use of social media and e-mail to encourage people to go to the City's and the Port's websites, to attend public meetings, and to provide their input
 - iv. Online community surveys and polls
- e. Printed materials that are user-friendly.
- f. Use of maps and photographs of the project area to solicit input on issues, concerns, and improvements people would like to see. Post these maps and graphics on-line.
- g. E-mailed public meeting/workshop announcements to each CBOs standard e-mail address, to representatives of each CBO, and to all others who request such notification.
- h. Use of e-mail as an educational tool and to encourage attendance at public meetings/other events.
- i. Development of short surveys/questionnaires to targeted stakeholder groups.

- j. Posting notices of public meetings with information on other ways to participate at community centers and public buildings in West Oakland.
- k. Repositories of information housed in public places like community centers and libraries.
- l. Materials distributed to CBOs to encourage them to announce the TMP meetings at their upcoming meetings and post the meeting notices and informational materials on their websites.
- m. City Council newsletters, electronic outlets, and list serves.
- n. Use of local newspapers and other media to announce public meetings, provide background information, and spread the word on ways to participate.
- o. Use of multiple easy ways to provide input, including an email address, a phone number with voicemail, and a mailing address.

3.6 Stakeholders in This Process

- a. The general public in the affected area, including residents and business owners, plus citizens who interact with the affected area such as users of the public library, senior center, schools, and other public and private facilities in the area.
- b. Racial and ethnic groups who live or work in the affected area, use the public facilities in the area, and patronize or work at the businesses in the affected area.
- c. CBOs, including neighborhood groups, business groups, advocacy groups, and non-profit agencies. To date, the list of identified CBOs includes the following.
 - i. West Oakland Community Advisory Group (“WOCAG”) (Generally meets on the 4th Thursday of each month, 6-8pm, West Oakland Senior Center; group has a specific charge regarding the OAB project.)
 - ii. West Oakland Commerce Association
 - iii. West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project (“WOEIP”)
 - iv. West Oakland Business Alert group
 - v. West Oakland Economic Development Working Group
 - vi. Jack London Improvement District
 - vii. Jack London District Association
 - viii. West Oakland Merchants
 - ix. West Oakland Neighbors
 - x. Prescott Neighborhood Council
 - xi. Lower Bottoms Neighborhood Association
 - xii. Village Bottoms Neighborhood Association
 - xiii. South of the Nimitz Improvement Council (“SONIC”)
 - xiv. EBALDC/Mandela Gateway Tenants, California Hotel, San Pablo Area Revitalization Collaborative (“SPARC”)
 - xv. Oak Center Neighborhood Association

- xvi. Hoover Resident Action Council
- xvii. Acorn Tenants Association
- xviii. City Towers Tenants Association
- xix. Sylvester Rutledge Tenant Association
- xx. Neighborhood Crime Prevention Council (“NCPC”) Five on the West Side Beat 2X/5X Lowell/Acorn
- xxi. NCPC Beat 7X and West Oakland Neighbors
- xxii. NCPC Beat 2Y/5Y Prescott
- xxiii. Acorn Safety Meeting
- xxiv. West Oakland Core Team
- xxv. Oakland Housing Authority
- xxvi. St. Mary’s Center
- xxvii. Port of Oakland Trucker Work Group
- xxviii. The official Stakeholder list from MM PO-1 of the SCA/MMRP
- xxix. West Oakland Senior Center
- xxx. Center for Independent Living of Oakland
- xxxi. West Oakland Green Initiative
- xxxii. Green for All
- xxxiii. Ella Baker Center
- xxxiv. Attitudinal Healing Connection
- xxxv. Prescott Joseph Center
- xxxvi. West Oakland Community Collaborative
- xxxvii. West Oakland Teen Center
- xxxviii. St. Vincent de Paul
- xxxix. West Oakland Urban Farm and Park (City Slicker Farms)
- xl. Civicorps
- xli. People’s Community Market
- xlii. West Oakland Jobs Resource Center
- xlili. Rose Foundation for Communities and the Environment
- xliv. Oakland Climate Action Coalition

d. Private sector businesses in the affected area, including but not limited to:

- i. Truck drivers, trucking companies, and licensed motor carriers registered with the Port
- ii. Trucking businesses in West Oakland and JLS
- iii. Companies in the affected area that use trucks for their operations
- iv. Lease holders and current and future tenants at the Port and OAB, including Prologis, CCIG, Oakland Maritime Support Services (“OMSS”), Custom Alloy Scrap Sales (“CASS”), California Waste Solutions (“CWS”), Dreisbach, and CenterPoint.
- v. Employers in the area

- vi. Businesses in the area that serve the Port, serve customers of the Port, or serve residents of the area
- e. Public sector agencies located in the affected area that use trucks for their operations, including but not limited to:
 - i. East Bay Municipal Utility District (“EBMUD”)
 - ii. US Postal Service (West Oakland offices)
 - iii. U.S. Customs
 - iv. Pacific Gas & Electric (“PG&E”)
 - v. California Department of Transportation
- f. Public agencies or public entities that interact with the affected area, including but not limited to:
 - i. City of Oakland, City Council District 3
 - ii. Office of Alameda County Supervisor District 5
 - iii. City of Oakland Planning Department, Public Works Department, Police Department, and Department of Transportation
 - iv. Port of Oakland Environmental Programs and Planning Division, Maritime Division, Social Responsibility Division, and Government Affairs Division
 - v. Bay Area Air Quality Management District (“BAAQMD”)
 - vi. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (“EPA”)
 - vii. California Air Resources Board (“CARB”)
 - viii. Alameda County Department of Public Health
 - ix. Places of worship and religious organizations
 - x. Senior centers and community centers
 - xi. Local schools, including:
 - 1. West Oakland Middle School, Hoover School, MLK Jr. School, PLACE at Prescott School, Lafayette Elementary
 - 2. Student Program for Academic and Athletic Transitioning (“SPAAT”) at McClymonds High School
 - 3. Ralph Bunche Academy (High School)
 - 4. Vincent Academy

3.7 Public Workshops

A minimum of five community workshops, sponsored and led by the City and the Port, have been planned; more will be held if it is determined that they are needed. In addition, the City and the Port may participate in meetings and workshops held by the stakeholders listed above. The City and Port will consider the following in planning the workshops.

- Consider having the workshops be sponsored by elected officials or CBOs.

- Announce workshops approximately four weeks prior to the workshop date with reminder announcements closer to the workshop date.
- Consider using polling at public workshops as a way of getting input from all attendees.
- Use visualization techniques, such as maps, charts, and table-top displays.
- Offer language interpretation services for public workshops upon request.
- Use interactive methods to engage meeting attendees and build relationships.
- Incorporate stakeholder feedback from prior workshops.

Community Workshop 1: Establish objectives, provide information (including visuals) about the basics of the TMP, provide some technical background, and identify key issues and impacts. Topics to be covered include the following:

- OAB redevelopment and Mitigation Measure 4.3-7
- Truck management actions underway since 2005, including Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan (“MAQIP”) and CTMP
- Explanation of the scope of the TMP
- Outline of the public process and the timing
- What the TMP will cover and will not cover, in order to manage expectations
- Background/context of the issues, using maps, charts, etc.
- Public identification of community strengths, concerns about trucks in West Oakland, and ideas for solutions
- Follow-up questions to evaluate understanding of identified key issues, suggestions, and concerns
- Summary of key issues, suggestions, and feedback

Community Workshop 2: Review background from Community Workshop 1 for participants who did not attend the first workshop; then undertake a site visit (a mobile workshop) to look at key issues directly in the community. Discuss the key issues observed and possible solutions.

Community Workshop 3: Provide an opportunity for out-brief and learning. Show how the public input from Workshops 1 and 2 was used to guide data gathering and technical analysis. This workshop will begin with a brief presentation on the first two workshops, followed by information stations using graphics and maps designed for direct interaction between planners and stakeholders regarding the preliminary results of the analysis to date. The desired outcome of the workshop and the input provided will help further refine the elements of the TMP.

Community Workshop 4: Present draft solutions based on input from previous workshops for public discussion, input, and prioritization. Photos, maps, and similar graphics will be used to illustrate solutions.

Community Workshop 5: Presentation and discussion of the Draft TMP.

3.8 Meeting Places, Times, and Communication Strategy

Through input from CBOs and other key stakeholders, along with knowledge of the area, the City and the Port will consider the following when planning workshop places and times.

3.8.1 Workshop Logistics

Key aspects of the workshop logistics are listed below. These elements of workshop planning will help create successful events that support the PEP goals.

- a. Hold workshops on weekday evenings or Saturday mornings. Sunday afternoons can be considered. This will be discussed with CBOs and key stakeholders to pick dates and times which are convenient for as many people as possible.
- b. Coordinate dates with other key events: Council meetings, Board of Port Commissioners meetings, major public events like holidays, public school calendar, and large sporting events.
- c. Address Americans with Disabilities Act accessibility, convenience for residents and businesses to attend, language accessibility including interpreters if needed and translation of key documents, if requested. Languages for announcement of public meetings and interpreters will be determined based on community demographics. Information will be translated, based on requests. If material is not printed in a particular language, there will be, for example, a statement in the predominant languages that says, "If you would like this information in (language XX) please contact (510) ###-####."
- d. Notify participants on meeting announcements about the availability of disability and language services.

3.8.2 Possible Workshop Locations

Choose locations which are accessible to people with disabilities, are close to and easy for the stakeholders to get to, are convenient to public transportation, are large enough for the expected turnout, have good acoustics, and have an appropriate layout and equipment to meet as one large group and in smaller breakout groups. Potential locations include the following.

- a. West Oakland Public Library Auditorium
- b. West Oakland Teen Center
- c. West Oakland Senior Center
- d. Oakland Housing Authority meeting room
- e. DeFremery Center
- f. Sullivan community center
- g. Mt. Zion Missionary Baptist Church
- h. Taylor Memorial United Methodist Church
- i. West Oakland Urban Farm and Park

- j. Lincoln Family Center
- k. Oakland City Hall

3.8.3 Increasing Workshop Participation

The Port and the City will make use of multiple strategies to advertise the workshops and encourage participation. Applicable strategies from among the following will be considered.

- a. E-mail meeting announcements/flyers to CBOs, other stakeholders, anyone who requests receiving such announcements, and the official “Stakeholder list” per MM PO-1.
- b. Attend the recurring meetings of CBOs.
- c. Direct outreach to CBOs to encourage their attendance at the workshops.
- d. Post workshop notices on the TMP website hosted by the City.
- e. Post notices on approved social media outlets.
- f. Provide outreach through the Port’s Trucker Work Group, including the bi-monthly meetings and e-mail list.
- g. Place newspaper announcements, including in minority-language papers.
- h. Distribute materials at locations in the area that residents and businesses frequent.
- i. Announce the workshops through Council District 3 newsletter.

4.0 Staff Resources

Implementation of the PEP for the TMP will require support and participation from both City and Port staff as well as specialized consultant resources. Specific staff and roles are listed below.

- a. Port of Oakland Staff:
 - i. Andrea Gardner: Associate Environmental Planner/Scientist, Environmental Programs and Planning; lead Port planner for TMP
 - ii. Diane Heinze: Supervisor, Environmental Programs and Planning; senior planner
 - iii. Ralph Reynoso: Wharfinger, Maritime Division; trucking industry subject matter expert
 - iv. Laura Arreola: Community Engagement Liaison, Social Responsibility Division; Port community engagement lead
 - v. Richard Sinkoff: Director, Environmental Programs and Planning; management and oversight
- b. City of Oakland Staffing:
 - i. Patricia McGowan: Environmental Coordinator, Department of Planning & Building; lead City planner for the TMP
 - ii. Joe Wang: Supervising Transportation Engineer, Department of Transportation; transportation subject matter expert
 - iii. Officer Stephen Hewison, Oakland Police; commercial enforcement division

- iv. William Gilchrist, Director, Department of Planning & Building; management and oversight
 - v. Elizabeth Lake, Deputy City Administrator of Real Estate & Major Projects; management and oversight
- c. Consultants:
- i. Surlene Grant, Envirocom Communications Strategies, LLC: communications and community engagement consultant
 - ii. Aaron Elias, Senior Engineer, Kittelson and Associates: transportation consultant
 - iii. Alex Garbier, Transportation Analyst, Kittelson and Associates: transportation consultant

5.0 Schedule for Public Engagement

- a. Refinement of this PEP with City and Port staff, using input from CBOs and key stakeholders: initially June-September 2017, and ongoing as needed.
- b. Implementation of the initial steps of this PEP, including: initial outreach to key stakeholders; developing an e-mail list; determining the first meeting location and date; preparing the meeting announcement; developing the first meeting agenda, background information, and other materials; and developing the website: June-September 2017.
- c. Hold public workshops. The schedule of public workshops will be refined, but is expected to occur October and December 2017, and April, July, and October 2018.
- d. Engagement specifically defined in MM PO-1 requires: updates regarding the development of MM PO-1 subject plans, including the TMP, at “quarterly stakeholder meetings” (see definition in SCA/MMRP); 45-day announcement to specified “stakeholder” list prior to release of the Draft TMP; a minimum 17-day public comment period on the Draft TMP; and informational presentation to the City Council within 90 days of the City Administrator’s approval of the final TMP.

6.0 Performance Measures and Evaluation of Public Engagement

The Port and the City will evaluate public engagement to assess outcomes of outreach in terms of number of people attending, geographic areas, diversity including race and ethnicity, language of attendees, disability, and other factors. After each public engagement, be it a small group meeting or the larger community meetings, the Port and City team will take notes of what went well and what needs improvement (if anything) and make adjustments accordingly. An evaluation will be done to assess the effectiveness of the engagement process and methods prior to the release of the draft TMP. The assessment will: report on implemented methods of outreach and engagement; identify the areas in which we are achieving our targets; and identify areas where there are gaps. Public engagement methods will be refined to address areas of outreach deficiency prior to the proposed Community Workshop 5, when City and Port staff will present and discuss the draft TMP.

Specific performance evaluation techniques may include one or more of the following.

- a. Outputs (e.g. number of meetings held; number of ads placed; number of publications in which notices are distributed; number of language and disability access requests honored; number of comments acknowledged; number of comments summarized and raised with decision makers; number of comments incorporated)
- b. Inputs (e.g. number of comments; quality of comments; number of new commenters/attendees)
- c. Numbers of participants (e.g. workshop attendees, commenters)
- d. Representativeness (e.g. participation from residents, business owners, workers, community organizations, public sector organizations)
- e. Diversity of participants (e.g. age, race, language, disability, income, geography)
- f. Which types of outreach reached people and encouraged them to attend (how they heard about it; which venue they attended; how they submitted input)
- g. Which methods people used to submit input (in person, email, online, phone, individual meeting)
- h. Whether community input corresponded to, and was coordinated with, key milestones and phases in the planning process
- i. Whether potential stakeholders were fully identified, especially those with key equities in the TMP, and whether their interests became known and were acted upon
- j. Whether the role of public involvement in the TMP is clearly known by stakeholders and includes mechanisms for ongoing, rolling feedback to the City and the Port
- k. Participant satisfaction (e.g., with convenience [location, time, accessibility, etc.] of meetings/communications; effectiveness [clarity, adequacy, timeliness] of communications; variety of communications; ease of input; respect for input demonstrated; level of consideration of and responses to input; fairness), evaluated potentially through paper and/or online surveys
- l. Whether the results of public participation are communicated to people who were involved in public planning process and to relevant decision-makers, to demonstrate how public input is used



Attachment B

Public Engagement Activities
Meetings & Outreach Activities by City and Port in addition to five Public Workshops
for development of the West Oakland Truck Management Plan

November 15, 2018

TMP Public Engagement	Date	Forum	Team Lead(s)	Handouts/Materials	Attendance	Summary/ Notes
Soft outreach	July 17, 2017	Truckers Work Group (TWG)	Ralph Reynoso & Patricia McGowan	Described that the City and Port would start a public process to develop the TMP	Recorded by Ralph Reynoso	
Soft Outreach	July 19, 2017	West Oakland Business Alert	Patricia McGowan	Described that the City and Port would start a public process to develop the TMP	+15 people	Biz Alert Summary (click here)
Soft Outreach	July 27, 2017	West Oakland Community Advisory Group (WOCAG)	Patricia McGowan & Laura Arreola	1. WOCAG Agenda 2. Handouts: “What is the TMP and Why are we doing it?” & Port of Oakland Maritime Facilities Map	Recorded by John Monetta	See TMP Outreach – Report Template
Soft Outreach	August 23, 2017	Stakeholder Quarterly Meeting Per PO-1	Patricia McGowan	Described that the City and Port would start a public process to develop the TMP	+25	
Soft Outreach	September 20, 2017	West Oakland Business Alert	Patricia McGowan	Announced the date of the first public workshop to develop the TMP	+15 people	
Publicized meeting Announcement	September 25, 2017	TWG	Ralph Reynoso & Patricia McGowan	Described that the City and Port would start a public process to develop the TMP		Meeting information was shared



Attachment B

TMP Public Engagement	Date	Forum	Team Lead(s)	Handouts/Materials	Attendance	Summary/ Notes
Publicized meeting announcement	September 25, 2017	Council Member Lynette McElhaney, D3 Office	Patricia McGowan & Laura Arreola	Shared Social Media file for event –D3 Facebook	n/a	Posted on LGM Facebook on 9/21 & 9/25
Publicized meeting announcement	September 20, 2017	CM Lynette McElhaney, D3 Office	Patricia McGowan & Laura Arreola	Shared event flyer and announcement for D3 newsletter	n/a	n/a
Publicized meeting announcement	September 25, 2017	City Administrator Office	Patricia McGowan	Shared event flyer and announcement for Weekly City Administrator newsletter (announcements)	n/a	n/a
Publicized meeting announcement	September 25, 2017 (WOSC)	CARB West Oakland Workshop on Minimizing Community Impacts from Freight	Laura Arreola	Shared event postcards and event announcement at the Workshop		Trucks were one of the major topics of the workshop
Publicized meeting announcement	September 26, 2017	Annie Sloan, City of Oakland NSC-NCPC West Oakland	Laura Arreola	Shared event announcement and flyer for email distribution		
Publicized meeting announcement	September 28, 2017	WOCAG	Laura Arreola	Handed out event postcard and shared event announcement		
Soft Outreach	October 3, 2017	WOEIP & Biz Alert	Patricia McGowan & Surlene Grant	Meeting to discuss previous planning efforts and their relationship with the joint TMP		Ms.Margaret Gordon, Lauren Westreich, Brian Beveridge
Soft outreach	January 22, 2018	TWG	Ralph Reynoso &	Provided update about the	Recorded by Ralph Reynoso	



Attachment B

TMP Public Engagement	Date	Forum	Team Lead(s)	Handouts/Materials	Attendance	Summary/Notes
			Patricia McGowan	development of the TMP		
Soft Outreach	March 15, 2018	Stakeholder Quarterly Meeting Per PO-1	Patricia McGowan	Provided update about the development of the TMP	+25	
Soft Outreach	August 15, 2018	West Oakland Biz Alert	Patricia McGowan & Andrea Gardner	Meeting to discuss potential solutions for the TMP	+15 people	
Soft Outreach	September 19, 2018	West Oakland Biz Alert	Patricia McGowan & Andrea Gardner	Meeting to discuss and receive input on potential solutions for the TMP	+15 people	